

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: April 14, 2022 REPORT NO. HRB 22-011

HEARING DATE: April 28, 2022

SUBJECT: ITEM #2 – Jasper Writer Spec House #1

RESOURCE INFO: <u>California Historical Resources Inventory Database (CHRID) link</u>

APPLICANT: Asher Cohen and Kaitlin Bernstein represented by Urbana Preservation &

Planning

LOCATION: 3611 Hyacinth Drive, Peninsula Community, Council District 2

APN 449-680-27-00

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Jasper Writer Spec House #1 located at 3611

Hyacinth Drive as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Jasper Writer Spec House #1 located at 3611 Hyacinth Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1929 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the two partially enclosed porches located on the north and west elevations constructed outside of the period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1929 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a combined flat and side gable clay tile roof; stucco cladding; large rectangular focal windows, round clay tile vents; asymmetrical primary façade; arched entry wood door; and fenestration primarily of multi-lite and single-lite wood windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject resource is a one-story, single-family residence constructed in 1929 in the Spanish Eclectic Style on the west side of Hyacinth Drive in the Plumosa Park subdivision of the Peninsula Community.

The property was identified by the Quieter Homes Program (QHP) and was determined to be a contributor to the National Register eligible Plumosa Park Historic District.

The historic name of the resource, the Jasper Writer Spec House #1, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Jasper Writer, who constructed the property as a speculation house.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Urbana Preservation & Planning which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C and B. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C, but not HRB Criterion B. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

The applicant asserts that the subject resource is eligible for designation under Criterion B with a period of significance of 1947 and 1952 due to its association with civil engineer, Joseph Burkholder; however, staff disagrees.

Joseph Burkholder and his wife purchased the property located at 3611 Hyacinth Drive in 1947, where he lived until his death in 1953. His wife remained at the residence until 1960. During this time, Mr. Burkholder was the General Manager and Chief Engineer for the San Diego County Water Authority from 1944-1953. Burkholder oversaw and facilitated several big projects through his position including the San Diego Aqueduct. While, the construction of the San Diego Aqueduct is important to San Diego as it helped to alleviate mass water shortages by bringing in over 60 million gallons of water to the San Diego area; Burkholder's involvement in this project does not rise to the level of local historical significance. Per the City's *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria* "a person would not be considered historically significant simply by virtue of position/title, association, affiliation, race, gender, ethnicity or religion." In order to be considered historically significant, Burkholder would need to have demonstrable achievements beyond the duties of his job and that information is not provided in the consultant report.

Joseph Burkholder was not performing any unusual duties in his position and there is no documentation that substantiates his residence has a connection to his professional work. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The subject resource is a one-story Spanish Eclectic style residence with detached garage built in 1929 and features a combined flat and side gable clay tile roof. The building maintains its original horizontal orientation and asymmetrical configuration. The primary façade faces east towards Hyacinth Drive. The front entry has a small, arched stucco surround that extends out slightly, with a recessed wood front door that is accessed via a tile walkway and steps. The structure is clad in a

stucco with decorative round clay tile vents under the side gable. On either side of the entrance are cypress trees, which most likely date to the 1929 date of construction.

To the north of the front entry is a large eight-lite rectangular focal window with flanking four-lite casement windows and decorative stucco detailing. A set of three-lite casement windows is located to the south of the front entry. Fenestration is primarily of multi-lite and single-lite wood windows with a variety of operations. Two Cypress trees can be found on either side of the front entrance, both trees appear to be original date to the 1929 date of construction. The structure is attached to the original detached garage along the north elevation by a stucco wall with tile trim that was constructed circa 1950. The stucco wall includes a central wood door and small opening with a decorative iron grill along the front elevation.

Modifications to the property include: construction of a stucco clad wall with clay tile trim that connects the main house to the garage, circa 1950; construction of two partially enclosed porches with clay tile roofs, one on the north elevation and the other on the west elevation behind the garage, circa 1950; in-kind window and door replacements in 2009 as a part of the QHP program; replacement of the original side gate in 2019 with a wood door; and solar panels were added in 2021. Other modifications to the property include tile added to the front porch, steps and walkway, and an aluminum garage door were completed at an unknown date. These modifications do not significantly impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling and the building retains integrity as it relates to architectural significance.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style, which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, an unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The resource continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style including a combined flat and side gable clay tile roof; stucco cladding; large rectangular focal windows, round clay tile vents; asymmetrical primary façade; arched entry wood door; and fenestration primarily of multi-lite and single-lite wood windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to

restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that Jasper Writer Spec House #1 located at 3611 Hyacinth Drive be designated as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1929 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Spanish Eclectic style architecture and retains integrity. The designation excludes the two partially enclosed porches located on the north and west elevations constructed outside of the period of significance.

Shannon Anthony Senior Planner

Suzanne Segur

Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison

Development Services Department

SA/ss

Attachments:

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER ADOPTED ON 4/28/2022

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 4/28/2022, to consider the historical designation of the **Jasper Writer Spec House #1** (owned by Asher Cohen & Kaitin R. Berstein, 3611 Hyacinth Drive, San Diego, CA 92106) located at **3611 Hyacinth Drive**, **San Diego**, **CA 92106**, APN: **449-680-27-00**, further described as BLK M LOT 28 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as $\bf Site$ $\bf No.$, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Jasper Writer Spec House #1on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1929 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a combined flat and side gable clay tile roof; stucco cladding; large rectangular focal windows, round clay tile vents; asymmetrical primary façade; arched entry wood door; and fenestration primarily of multi-lite and single-lite wood windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No.**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude two partially enclosed porches located on the north and west elevations constructed outside of the period of significance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:		
	BY:	
		DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair Historical Resources Board
APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,		
CITY ATTORNEY	BY:	
		LINDSEY SEBASTIAN, Deputy City Attorney