



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: January 11, 2024 REPORT NO. HRB-24-003

HEARING DATE: January 25, 2024

SUBJECT: **ITEM #2 – Robert and Addie Lane House**

RESOURCE INFO: [California Historical Resources Inventory Database \(CHRID\) link](#)

APPLICANT: Warnick-Housh Trust 11-07-19; represented by Ginger Weatherford

LOCATION: 3640 Utah Street, North Park Community, Council District 3
APN 453-241-02-00

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Robert and Addie Lane House located at 3640 Utah Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Robert and Addie Lane House located at 3640 Utah Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1912 under HRB Criterion C as an example of the Craftsman style. The designation excludes the pre-1962 rear addition, 1999 addition, and 1999 detached garage. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style architecture and retains architectural integrity from its 1912 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a one-story massing, partial-width front porch supported by square posts, front gable roof, gable dormer, overhanging eaves with exposed angled rafter tails, triangular knee braces, decorative attic vents, horizontal wood siding, and wood frame and sash double hung, casement, fixed, and tripartite windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The property consists of a one-story residence and a garage.

The property was located within the boundary of the [2016 North Park Community Plan Area Historic Resources Survey](#) but was not identified in the survey because it was not evaluated.

The historic name of the resource, the Robert and Addie Lane House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Robert D. Lane and Addie L. Lane, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

In order to be eligible for designation and listing on the City's Register, a resource must meet one or more of the City's designation criteria as specified in the Historical Resources Guidelines of the Land Development Manual and retain integrity as it relates to the significance of the resource. Integrity is the ability of a property to convey its significance, which requires an understanding of the physical features and characteristics that existed during the resource's period of significance. The National, California, and City of San Diego Registers recognize location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association as the seven aspects of historical integrity.

Although not all seven aspects of integrity need to be present for a property to be eligible for designation, the record must demonstrate that the property retains enough physical and design characteristics to reflect and convey the significance of the property. Each resource depends on certain aspects of integrity, more than others, to express its historic significance. Determining which of the aspects are most important to a particular property requires an understanding of the property's significance and its essential physical features. The [Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria](#) provide information regarding the City's designation criteria, as well as guidance on their application and how to evaluate the integrity of a resource.

ANALYSIS

The property located at 3640 Utah Street is a one-story, Craftsman style single-family residential building constructed in 1912 in the North Park Community Planning Area. Other buildings and structures present on site include a one-story garage. The property is located within a residential neighborhood surrounded by similarly scaled structures. The property is in its original location.

Since its construction in 1912, the property has been modified as follows: construction of a rear addition prior to 1962, construction of a rear addition including a covered patio deck and pergola in 1999, demolition of the 1912 garage and construction of a new garage in 1999, construction of a vinyl fence in 2010, and the addition of solar panels in 2019. Undated changes include the front door replacement and front step handrail addition.

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Ginger Weatherford, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C, and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property is a Craftsman style single-family dwelling built in 1912 and clad in horizontal wood siding. It features a front, east-facing gable with a composition shingle roof, overhanging eaves, and exposed angled rafter tails. The covered, partial-width front porch is centered and supported by two square wood columns and no piers.

The front gable face is decorated with a basketweave pattern vent, and two triangular knee brackets are also located on this primary elevation. A tripartite "Chicago-style" wood window set and a wood picture window with a single-lite transom flank the front door. The building's north elevation features single and paired one-over-one double hung wood windows. The south elevation faces the driveway and garage and features a pair of double hung windows, tripartite windows, and paired casement windows, all wood, as well as an exposed brick chimney with stepped shoulders. A gabled dormer with horizontal slatted vents is present above the eaves. This elevation also reveals a 1999 rear addition. The rear elevation gable face contains an original gable vent matching that of the front elevation.

The original 1912 garage was demolished, and the existing garage was constructed in 1999. Because this garage does not date to the period of significance and does not contribute to the resource's significance under HRB Criterion C as an example of the Craftsman style, staff recommends excluding this structure from the designation. Similarly, a pre-1962 rear addition and a 1999 rear addition postdate the period of significance and are excluded from the designation.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, which was born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

Of the seven aspects of integrity, design, materials, and workmanship are the most critical to the property's ability to convey significance under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Craftsman style. The property, which has been modified as detailed in the beginning of the analysis section of this report, retains overall integrity of design, materials and workmanship despite the modifications. The additions are located at the rear of the property, are not readily visible and did not impact significant character defining features. The demolition of the garage, which is an accessory structure to the residence, does not significantly impair the resource's significance as a Craftsman residence, and the 1999 garage is sited and designed in a manner that is consistent with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The other modifications, including the fence and solar panels, are minor in nature. Therefore, the property does retain integrity to its 1912 period of significance under HRB Criterion C.

Significance Statement: The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style architecture and retains architectural integrity from its 1912 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a one-story massing, partial-width front porch supported by square posts, front gable roof, gable dormer, overhanging eaves with exposed angled rafter tails, triangular knee braces, decorative attic vents, horizontal wood siding, and wood frame and sash double hung, casement, fixed, and tripartite windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject property at 3640 Utah Street was built by George R. Horton. George R. Horton has not been established by the Historical Resources Board as a Master Architect, Designer or Builder, and there is insufficient information to designate him as such at this time. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion D. As the property is not significant under Criterion D, an evaluation of integrity as it relates to Criterion D is not relevant or required.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and the staff's field check, it is recommended that the Robert and Addie Lane House located at 3640 Utah Street be designated as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1912 under HRB Criterion C as an example of the Craftsman style. The designation excludes the pre-1962 rear addition, 1999 addition, and 1999 detached garage.



Alvin Lin
Assistant Planner
City Planning Department



Suzanne Segur
Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison
City Planning Department

al/SS

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 1/25/2024

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 1/25/2024, to consider the historical designation of the Robert and Addie Lane House (owned by Warnick-Housh Trust 11-07-19, 775 Normandy Road, Encinitas, CA 92024) located at **3640 Utah Street, San Diego, CA 92104**, APN: **453-241-02-00**, further described as BLK 16 LOT 2 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Robert and Addie Lane House on the following finding:

The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style architecture and retains architectural integrity from its 1912 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a one-story massing, partial-width front porch supported by square posts, front gable roof, gable dormer, overhanging eaves with exposed angled rafter tails, triangular knee braces, decorative attic vents, horizontal wood siding, and wood frame and sash double hung, casement, fixed, and tripartite windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the pre-1962 rear addition, 1999 addition, and 1999 detached garage.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY: _____
TIM HUTTER, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
LINDSEY SEBASTIAN,
Deputy City Attorney

RECORDING REQUESTED BY
CITY OF SAN DIEGO
DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT

WHEN RECORDED MAIL TO

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
ATTN: HRB SECRETARY
1222 FIRST AVENUE, MS 501
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

SPACE ABOVE THIS LINE FOR RECORDER'S USE

RESOLUTION NUMBER **N/A**

HISTORICAL DESIGNATION OF PROPERTY ON

3640 Utah Street, San Diego, CA 92104

ASSESSOR PARCEL NUMBER **453-241-02-00**

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD NUMBER **0**