



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: September 14, 2023 REPORT NO. HRB-23-028

HEARING DATE: September 28, 2023

SUBJECT: **ITEM #2 – Robert and Marion Hill House**

RESOURCE INFO: [California Historical Resources Inventory Database \(CHRID\) link](#)

APPLICANT: Andrea and Corey Elliott Revocable Trust 10-4-2019; represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

LOCATION: 3104 Lytton Street, 92110, Peninsula Community, Council District 2
APN: 450-386-03-00

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Robert and Marion Hill House located at 3104 Lytton Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Robert and Marion Hill House located at 3104 Lytton as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1929 under HRB Criterion C. This designation excludes the 2021 laundry room addition constructed outside of the period of significance. The designation includes the original courtyard wall and portico. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Colonial Revival style and retains integrity from its 1929 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a hipped, cross gable, and shed roof with Mission half barrel tiles, an asymmetrical façade, fine grain stucco cladding, a wooden paneled entry door, front porch with arches, attached courtyard wall, decorative stucco window screens, stucco chimneys, large focal windows, and fenestration primarily consisting of wood frame windows of various lite patterns and groupings.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource.

The subject resource is a three story, single-family residence with an attached garage located in the Loma Portal Neighborhood on the Northwest corner of Lytton and Locust Streets in the Peninsula Community.

The property was previously surveyed by the Quieter Homes Program in 2009 and was determined to be a contributor to the National Register eligible Loma Portal Historic District.

The historic name of the resource, the Robert and Marion Hill House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Robert and Marion Hill, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research was prepared by Legacy 106 Inc., which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria A and C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C, but not HRB Criterion A. This determination is consistent with the [Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria](#), as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

The consultant report asserts that the subject property is eligible under Criterion A for being the largest of the two houses constructed in the Bayside Country Club Estates, which was never completed. The subject property was one of two houses built for the proposed subdivision of the Bayside Country Club in 1929. The construction of the Bayside Country Club Estates was halted due to multiple financial issues including the stock market crash of 1929, and subsequent Great Depression. The Bayside Country Club closed in the early 1930s, which subsequently ended any future plans to revive construction of the Bayside Country Club Estates subdivision.

Since the development of the Bayside Country Club Estates was never completed there is not sufficient evidence to indicate that 3104 Lytton Street possesses any significance that is distinct among others of its kind or that surpasses the usual in significance, whether at a subdivision level, at the neighborhood level, or at the city level, as required under HRB Criterion A. Staff did not find evidence to suggest that the subject property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's, or a neighborhood's, historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject resource is a three-story, single-family residence with an attached garage constructed in 1929 in the Spanish Colonial Revival architectural style. The house features a hipped, cross gabled, and shed style roof with Mission half barrel tiles, an asymmetrical façade, and fine grain stucco cladding. Fenestration consists primarily of wooden casement and fixed windows of various lite patterns, sizes, and groupings.

The primary elevation faces south onto Lytton Street and a curving flagstone walkway and steps leads from the sidewalk to the wood entry door. A front porch features two arches on the south and west and has a shed style roof. The front gable to the west of the entryway projects out from the house with three large fixed focal windows with leaded stained-glass. The front facing focal window is arched and the windows on the sides of the gable are square. To the left of the gable is the original courtyard wall and portico which connects to the neighboring house. To the right of the entry are three, four-lite casement windows. The second story is stepped back and features a false chimney parapet and stucco window screens.

The East elevation faces Locust Street and features two single-story gables flanking an inset patio screened by a tall stucco wall and attached garage. Other features include the staircase and one of two stucco chimneys located on the rear elevation. The second chimney, an internal chimney with an elaborated top, is located on the Southwest elevation.

There have been several modifications to the structure since its 1929 date of construction. In 2012 the windows were replaced in-kind consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards through the Quieter Homes Program. There was a permit in 2021 for the addition of a deck, laundry room, interior remodel, window and door modifications, and roof repair. Between 2021 and 2022 a stucco and cast-iron site wall was added to the perimeter of the property on Lytton and Locusts streets. Additionally, in 2021 the roof was replaced in-kind. In 2022 there was a permit to replace the original flagstone walkway, steps, front and side porches in-kind, with new additions differentiated. The 2021 and 2022 projects were reviewed by historical resources staff and determined to be consistent with the Standards. At an unknown date decorative ironwork was added around several of the first-floor windows, and a perimeter stucco and wrought iron site wall was added circa 2022. These modifications do not significantly impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling as it relates to HRB Criterion C.

The Spanish Colonial Revival style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. Its vocabulary is influenced by Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic or Renaissance precedents. The style became popular after the Panama-California Exposition of 1915 and reached its height in the 1920's and early 1930's before rapidly declining in the 1940's. Identifying features include a low-pitched roof with little or no eave overhang, red tile roof covering, stucco exterior wall finishes, an asymmetrical façade and arches above doors and principle windows. Common decorative details are patterned tiles, carved stonework, large focal windows, wooden or iron window grilles, decorative vents and balconies.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Colonial Revival style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a hipped, cross gable, and shed roof with Mission half barrel tiles, an asymmetrical façade, fine grain stucco cladding, a wooden paneled entry door, front porch with arches, attached courtyard wall, decorative stucco window screens, stucco chimneys, large focal windows, fenestration primarily consisting of wood frame windows of various lite patterns and groupings. The modifications that have occurred have not significantly impaired integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling, which are most important to conveying significance under HRB Criteria C. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS


Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended the Robert and Marion Hill House located at 3104 Lytton be designated with a period of significance of 1929 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of Spanish Colonial Revival style of architecture. This designation excludes the 2021 laundry room constructed outside of the period of significance. The designation includes the original courtyard wall and portico.



Megan Walker
Associate Planner
City Planning Department



Suzanne Segur
Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison
City Planning Department

MW/sa/ss

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 9/28/2023

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 9/28/2023, to consider the historical designation of the **Robert and Marion Hill House** (owned by Andrea and Cory Elliott Revocable Trust 10-04-19, 3104 Lytton Street, San Diego, CA 92110) located at **3104 Lytton Street, San Diego, CA 92110**, APN: **450-386-03-00**, further described as BLK 1 LOT 6 LOTS 3 & 4 & SWLY 7.50 FT in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Robert and Marion Hill House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Colonial Revival style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1929 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a hipped, cross gable, and shed roof with Mission half barrel tiles, an asymmetrical façade, fine grain stucco cladding, a wooden paneled entry door, front porch with arches, attached courtyard wall, decorative stucco window screens, stucco chimneys, large focal windows, and fenestration primarily consisting of wood frame windows of various lite patterns and groupings. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall include the original courtyard wall and portico.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 2021 laundry room addition constructed outside of the period of significance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY: _____
TIM HUTTER, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
LINDSEY SEBASTIAN,
Deputy City Attorney

RECORDING REQUESTED BY
CITY OF SAN DIEGO
DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT

WHEN RECORDED MAIL TO

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
ATTN: HRB SECRETARY
1222 FIRST AVENUE, MS 501
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

SPACE ABOVE THIS LINE FOR RECORDER'S USE

RESOLUTION NUMBER **N/A**

HISTORICAL DESIGNATION OF PROPERTY ON

3104 Lytton Street, San Diego, CA 92110

ASSESSOR PARCEL NUMBER **450-386-03-00**

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD NUMBER **0**