



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: September 9, 2021 REPORT NO. HRB-21-050

HEARING DATE: September 23, 2021

SUBJECT: **ITEM #03 – Mary Hyde House**

RESOURCE INFO: [California Historical Resources Inventory Database \(CHRID\) link](#)

APPLICANT: Aaker Family Trust 06-26-20; represented by Johnson & Johnson Architecture

LOCATION: 3446 Elliott Street, Peninsula Community, Council District 2
APN 450-134-2300

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Mary Hyde House located at 3446 Elliot Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Mary Hyde House located at 3446 Elliott Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1925 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 1988 shed dormer addition on the west façade, the 1988 rear addition and the 1978 shed addition to the garage constructed outside of the period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Tudor Revival style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1925 period of significance. Specifically, the resource displays a stucco exterior with half timbering, tall wood windows, steeply pitched roof with front facing gables, Tudor arched front door and double gabled garage.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject resource is a one-and-a-half story Tudor Revival style home located on the north side of Elliott Street in the Loma Portal neighborhood of the Peninsula Community.

The property was identified by the Quieter Homes Program and was determined to a contributor to the National Register eligible Loma Portal Historic District.

The historic name of the resource, the Mary Hyde House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Mary Hyde, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Johnson & Johnson Architecture, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject resource is a one-and-a-half story, single family residence and garage constructed in 1925 in the Tudor Revival style. The exterior of the house is clad in stucco with half timbering surrounding the main entrance. The house is approached by way of a curvilinear concrete path that leads to a small brick stoop and a front door shaped in a Tudor arch. The steeply pitched roof features two front facing gables on the primary façade. A set of fifteen, nine lite casement windows is a unique focal point on the first floor of the street facing façade which also features a set of three tall, thin, multi-lite windows on the opposite side of the entrance. Additional fenestration includes wood windows in a variety of functions, shapes and sizes. The driveway adjacent east façade features a three-part arched window and a portion of the house with a flat roof and half timbering. At the rear of the house is a modern stucco addition and deck which are clearly differentiated from the original historic structure. The west façade features a long dormer shed addition. Usually a character defining feature of the Tudor Revival style, the house lacks a chimney. The original double gabled stucco garage is visible from the street.

Several modifications have been made to the subject resource since its 1925 date of construction. In 1942 the original wood roof was replaced with composite shingle and in 1978 a shed addition on the west side of the garage was constructed. In 1988 the shed dormer addition on the west façade was constructed, as well as the rear bedroom addition and deck. In 2004 the Quieter Homes Program replaced the existing historic windows with wood windows in the same lite pattern and operation but with dual glazing for sound attenuation. Additionally, the window in the larger dormer on the front façade was enlarged for egress, consistent with standard protocol for the Quieter Homes Program. These window modifications were reviewed and approved by historical resources staff. In 2018 a project that included a new window and skylight was reviewed by historical resources staff and determined to be consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. These modifications do not significantly impact integrity of design, material, workmanship and feeling as it relates to HRB Criterion C.

Popular in the 1920s and 1930s, Tudor Revival architecture is loosely based on a variety of late Medieval English styles and influences, but unlike some English prototypes, Tudor Revival style houses exhibit steeply pitched gable roofs that dominate the facades. Other character defining features include decorative half-timbering; tall, narrow windows, usually appearing in multiple groups and with multi-lite glazing; massive chimneys, sometimes with decorative chimney pots; entry porches with round or Tudor arches; and gable dormers. Relatively uncommon before World War I, widespread adoption of masonry veneering techniques in the 1920s accompanied a dramatic rise in the style's popularity as even the most modest examples began to closely mimic the brick and stone veneers of their English prototypes. Tudor Revival style houses usually include the use of stucco as well as wood cladding and brick or stone veneer, depending upon the subtype.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Tudor Revival style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including stucco exterior with half timbering, tall wood windows, steeply pitched roof with front facing gables, Tudor arched front door and double gabled garage. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - *Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.*

The applicant's request for designation for the property located at 3446 Elliott Street did not include information to support a determination under HRB Criterion D; therefore, staff has not made a determination regarding eligibility under Criterion D at this time. Eligibility under this criterion may be reevaluated at a future date pending submittal of additional information and analysis.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Mary Hyde House located at 3446 Elliott Street be designated with a period of significance of 1925 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of the Tudor Revival style. The designation excludes the 1988 shed dormer addition on the west façade, the 1988 rear addition and the 1978 shed addition to the garage constructed outside of the period of significance.



Suzanne Segur
Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison
Development Services Department

ss/SS

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 9/23/2021

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 9/23/2021, to consider the historical designation of the **Mary Hyde House** (owned by AAKER Family Trust 06-26-20, 3446 Elliott Street, San Diego, CA 92106) located at **3446 Elliott Street, San Diego, CA 92106**, APN: **450-134-23-00**, further described as BLK 19 LOTS 1 & 2 SELY 1/2 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Mary Hyde House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Tudor Revival style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1925 period of significance. Specifically, the resource displays a stucco exterior with half timbering, tall wood windows, steeply pitched roof with front facing gables, Tudor arched front door and double gabled garage. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 1988 shed dormer addition on the west façade, the 1988 rear addition and the 1978 shed addition to the garage constructed outside of the period of significance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY: _____
DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
LINDSEY SEBASTIAN,
Deputy City Attorney

RECORDING REQUESTED BY
CITY OF SAN DIEGO
DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT

WHEN RECORDED MAIL TO

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
ATTN: HRB SECRETARY
1222 FIRST AVENUE, MS 501
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

SPACE ABOVE THIS LINE FOR RECORDER'S USE

RESOLUTION NUMBER **N/A**

HISTORICAL DESIGNATION OF PROPERTY ON

3446 Elliott Street, San Diego, CA 92106

ASSESSOR PARCEL NUMBER **450-134-23-00**

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD NUMBER **0**