

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF OCTOBER 26, 2023
HYBRID HEARING**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

Chairperson Tim Hutter called the meeting to order at 1:09 p.m. Chairperson Tim Hutter adjourned the meeting at 4:31 p.m.

ATTENDANCE DURING THE MEETING:

Chairperson Tim Hutter – present
Vice-Chairperson Kristi Byers – present
2nd Vice-Chairperson Michael Taylor – present
Boardmember Ann Woods – present
Boardmember Bruce Abrams – absent
Boardmember Carla Farley – absent
Boardmember Courtney Ann Coyle – present
Boardmember David McCullough – absent
Boardmember Dr. Li-Rong Lilly Cheng – present
Boardmember Mathew Winter – present - *Left at 3:07pm*
Boardmember Rammy Cortez – present

City Staff

Lindsey Sebastian, Deputy City Attorney – present
Kelley Stanco, City Planning Department – present
Suzanne Segur, City Planning Department – present
Shannon Anthony, City Planning Department – present
Alvin Lin, City Planning Department – present
Megan Walker, City Planning Department – present
Caroline Garcia, Legislative Recorder – present

Note: All decision makers attended the meeting in person. Staff and members of the public attended both in person and virtually.

ANNOUNCEMENTS/PUBLIC COMMENT

Jennifer Machian with time ceded to her from Susan Dean and Kirk Burgamy. Asked the HRB to use its authority to amend its procedural rules and policies to create a streamlined path to local designation for historic districts already on the National and California Registers.

BOARDMEMBERS COMMENT

NONE

CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

Boardmember Coyle recused herself from Item 2 – 9530 La Jolla Shores Drive since she assisted in the preparation of the National Register nomination.

EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

None

FAILURE TO

VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

None

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FOR SEPTEMBER 28, 2023

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER WOODS TO APPROVE THE MINUTES WITH CORRECTIONS. Seconded by Boardmember Coyle. The motion passed by a vote of 8-0-0 with Boardmembers Coyle, Winter, Woods, Taylor, Byers, Cortez, Cheng, and Chair Hutter voting yea, and with Boardmembers McCullough, Abrams, and Farley absent.

STAFF REPORT

Suzanne Segur, Senior Planner from the Planning Department reported that the appeals of the historical designation of the Fred Rohr/ Ralph L. Frank House (HRB Site #1492) located at 555 San Fernando Street, and the Mamie and Oliver Evans/ William Templeton Johnson House (HRB Site #1493) located at 4388 Ampudia Street will be heard by the city council on November 7th. The appeals of the historical designation of the Donald and Gladys Clitsome/Lloyd Ruocco House (HRB Site #1491) located at 2228 33rd Street and the Velma Prichard Spec House #1 (HRB Site #1503) located at 4321 Alder Drive are tentatively scheduled to be heard by city council on November 14th. Appeals were also filed after the September 28, 2023, HRB meeting of the Lucile Hamilton/Robert Mosher House, located at 485 San Gorgonio Street and the Robert and Marion Hill House located at 3104 Lytton Street. Staff will be actively working on bringing these properties forward to the council for resolution in the new year.

Suzanne Segur, Senior Planner from the Planning Department reported that the next Policy Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, November 13th at 3pm. For information regarding the Archaeological and Tribal Cultural Resources Subcommittee, please visit the Development Services website.

Shannon Anthony, Senior Planner from the Planning Department reported that the Design Assistant Subcommittee for November has been canceled. The next Design Assistant Subcommittee (DAS) will be held on Wednesday, December 6, 2023.

REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE CONTINUED AND/OR WITHDRAWN

Clint Daniels submitted a public comment requesting that Item 3 – 4201 Palmetto Way be continued. The Board did not make a motion to continue the item.

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Item 2 – Walter and Judith Munk House. located at 9530 La Jolla Shores Drive was pulled from the Consent Agenda and was heard as the first discussion item.

Item 3 – Morris and Ida Irvin Spec House #3 located at 4201 Palmetto Way was pulled from the Consent Agenda and was heard as the second discussion item.

Item 4 – Dr. Paula Libby House located at 7846 Esterel Drive was pulled from the Consent Agenda and was heard as the third discussion item.

Item 5 – Robert and Clara West Spec House #1 located at 3441 Cooper Street was pulled from the Consent Agenda and was heard as the fourth discussion item.

Item 1 – Report from the Office of the Independent Budget Analyst was heard last as the discussion item.

BOARD ACTION: MOTION BY CHAIR HUTTER TO HEAR ITEMS 2 THROUGH 5 IN ORDER, AND ITEM 1 LAST. Seconded by Boardmember Coyle. The motion passed by a vote of 8-0-0 with Boardmembers Cheng, Cortez, Byers, Taylor, Woods, Winter, Coyle, and Chair Hutter voting yea, and with Boardmembers McCullough, Abrams, and Farley absent.

DISCUSSION ITEMS**ITEM-1 REPORT FROM THE OFFICE OF THE INDEPENDENT BUDGET ANALYST
(INFORMATIONAL ITEM ONLY)**

Staff: Ruixin Chen, Fiscal & Policy Analyst, Office of the Independent Budget Analyst

Public testimony in favor on this item received from David Moty and Cameron Lindsay-Hewett

Public testimony in opposition of this item received from Charles Kaminski, Peter Kempson, Diane Kane, Alena Coons, Ione Stiegler, Susan Dean, Bruce Coons, Donna Alexander, Gail Garbini, Bre Adair, Linda Fitts, Sharon Gehl, Lu Rehling, Janet O'Dea, Allen Hazard, Kristin Harms, and Priscilla Ann Berge.

Speaker slips in favor received on this item from Anna Palmer, Anne Farrell, Howard Blackson III, Laura Dennison, Liisa Beckman, Michael Tristani, Patricia Desrosiers.

Speaker slips received in opposition from Alana Coons, Alex Zukas, Allen Hazard, Arnie Schoenberg, Barbara Gatti, Barrie Staenberg, Bjorn Palenius, Brook Empey, Bruce Coons, Bryan Auerbach, Carol Emerick, Cecelia Conover, Charles Kaminski, Christie Dunning, Chuck Dunning, Daniel Soderberg, David Marshall, David Swarens, Dean Glass, Deirdre Lee, Diane Kane, Don Wood, Dorothy Patterson, Douglas Scott, Gail Maher, George Machian, Heather Crane, Helen Ofield, Jack Van den Akker, Jacoba Dolloff, Janet O'Dea, Jennifer Macdonald, Jennifer Machian, Jennifer Wright, Joan Telkes, Judith Machian, Juliana GarciaDelgado, Julius Brent, Kara Dotter, Kenneth Perilli, Kesler Randall, Kirk Burgamy, Kristin Harms, Laura Henson, Laurel Schwartz, Laurie McLaughlin, Linda Canada, Linda Fitts, Linda Korb, Lisa Mortensen, Lisa Stone, Louise Rehling, Maggie McCann, Mary Brown, Mary Johnson, Mat Wahlstrom, Melinda Myer, Patty Carlson, Penelope Perryman, Priscilla Ann Berge, Rebecca Grossenbacher, Richard Bentley, Richard Phillips, Robert Jassoy, Robin Lakin, Ronald Telkes, Ronald V. May, Rosalie Northeimer, Sande Lollis, Sandy Burgamy, Shelly Petersen, Sherri Schottlaender, Soo Hom, Stephanie Pfaff, Susan Bugbee, Susan Dean, Susan Floyd, Susanne Friedrich, Teresa Vessels, Vance Chan, Victor Scavarda, and Vivian Bradley.

BOARD ACTION:

NO ACTION TAKEN, INFORMATION ITEM ONLY.

Note: This item was heard as the last discussion item.

ITEM-2 DR. WALTER AND JUDITH MUNK/SEICHE HOUSE

City Council District: 1

Plan Area: La Jolla

Staff: Alvin Lin

Public testimony in support of the designation received from lone Stiegler, Peter Kempson and Diane Kane.

No public testimony received in opposition on this item.

No speaker slips received in support of this item.

Speaker slips received in opposition on this item from Clint Daniels.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY VICE-CHAIRPERSON BYERS TO DESIGNATE THE DR. WALTER AND JUDITH MUNK/SEICHE HOUSE LOCATED AT 9530 LA JOLLA SHORES DRIVE AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE UNDER HRB CRITERION B AS A RESOURCE IDENTIFIED WITH DR. WALTER MUNK FOR SIGNIFICANCE AT THE NATIONAL LEVEL WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1954-2019. SPECIFICALLY, THE PROPERTY SERVED AS DR. MUNK'S OFF-CAMPUS OFFICE FROM CONSTRUCTION IN 1954 UNTIL HIS DEATH IN 2019. DR. MUNK WROTE THE MAJORITY OF THE OVER 275 ACADEMIC PAPERS AT HIS HOME OFFICE ALONG WITH HOSTING NUMEROUS SCIENTIFIC GATHERINGS AND SOCIAL EVENTS THAT WERE PIVOTAL TO THE GROWTH AND SUCCESS OF SCRIPPS INSTITUTION OF OCEANOGRAPHY, UCSD, AND THE FIELDS OF GEOPHYSICS AND OCEANOGRAPHY. DR. MUNK'S MANY GROUNDBREAKING SCIENTIFIC CONTRIBUTIONS HAVE BEEN RECOGNIZED BY THE SCIENTIFIC, MILITARY, AND ACADEMIC COMMUNITIES AT THE NATIONAL LEVEL. ADDITIONAL SUPPORTING DETAIL IS FOUND IN NRHP FORM SECTION 8 PAGES 25 TO 31; UNDER CRITERION B AS A RESOURCE IDENTIFIED WITH JUDITH HORTON MUNK FOR SIGNIFICANCE AT THE LOCAL LEVEL WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1953-2006. SPECIFICALLY, THE PROPERTY IS THE WORK OF THE REGIONALLY PROMINENT ARTIST AND ARCHITECTURAL DESIGNER WHO DESIGNED THE BUILDING, LANDSCAPE DESIGN, AND ASSOCIATED WORKS OF ART WHICH SERVE AS A SPRINGBOARD FOR HER NUMEROUS OTHER CONTRIBUTIONS TO THE SCRIPPS AND UCSD CAMPUS, COMMUNITY ADVOCACY, AND COMMUNITY VENUES. ADDITIONAL SUPPORTING DETAIL IS FOUND IN NRHP SECTION 8 PAGES 32 THROUGH 35; AND UNDER HRB CRITERION E WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1953-1971. THE DESIGNATION INCLUDES THE GUEST HOUSE, THE LANDSCAPE INCLUDING TWO GARDENS DESIGNED BY JUDITH MUNK, A SWIMMING POOL, AND TWO EXTANT SCULPTURES CONSTRUCTED BY JUDITH MUNK. Seconded by Boardmember Winter with amendment to specify that only two extant sculptures is to be included in the designation. The motion passed by a vote of 7-0-1 with Boardmembers Winter, Woods, Taylor, Byers, Cortez, Cheng, and Chair Hutter voting yea, with Boardmember Coyle recusing, with Boardmember McCullough, Abrams, and Farley absent.

Note: This item was pulled from the Consent Agenda and was heard as the first discussion item.

ITEM-3 MORRIS AND IDA IRVIN SPEC HOUSE #3

City Council District: 3

Plan Area: Uptown

Staff: Megan Walker

Public testimony in support of the designation received from Dustin Quint, Caitlin Thomas, Victor Quint and Menda Quint.

No public testimony received in opposition on this item.

No speaker slips received in support of this item.

Speaker slips received in opposition on this item from Clint Daniels.

BOARD ACTION:

CONSENT MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER WINTER TO DESIGNATE THE MORRIS AND IDA IRVIN SPEC HOUSE #3 LOCATED AT 4201 PALMETTO WAY AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1920 UNDER HRB CRITERIA C AND D. THE DESIGNATION INCLUDES THE ORIGINAL DETACHED GARAGE. Seconded by Boardmember Cortez. The motion passed by a vote of 8-0-0 with Boardmembers Coyle, Winter, Woods, Taylor, Byers, Cortez, Cheng, and Chair Hutter voting yea, and with Boardmembers McCullough, Abrams, and Farley absent.

Note: This item was pulled from the Consent Agenda and was heard as the second discussion item.

ITEM-4 DR. PAUL LIBBY/LLOYD RUOCCO HOUSE

City Council District: 1

Plan Area: La Jolla

Staff: Alvin Lin

Public testimony in support of the designation received from Charles Kaminski and Lone Stiegler.

No public testimony received in opposition on this item.

No speaker slips received in support of this item.

Speaker slips received in opposition on this item from Clint Daniels.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO DESIGNATE THE DR. PAUL LIBBY/LLOYD RUOCCO HOUSE LOCATED AT 7846 ESTEREL DRIVE AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE UNDER HRB CRITERION B WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1967-2017; UNDER HRB CRITERION C FOR THE CONTEMPORARY STYLE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1967; AND UNDER HRB CRITERION D AS A NOTBLE EXAMPLE OF LLOYD RUOCCO'S WORK ESPECIALLY BECAUSE IT IS A AN EXAMPLE OF HIS LATE WORK IN THE CONTEMPORARY STYLE. THE RESIDENCE CARRIES ELEMENTS ASSOCIATED WITH RUOCCO'S DESIGN, SUCH AS EXTENSIVE USE OF GLASS, RELATIONSHIP TO THE LANDSCAPE, SLIDING WINDOWS, WIDE EAVE OVERHANGS, AND RETAINS INTEGRITY. THE FINDINGS ARE SUPPORTED BY THE HRRR AND THE LETTER FROM TODD PITMAN, A FORMER HRB COLLEAGUE AND SUBJECT MATTER EXPERT AND IN LLOYD RUOCCO, AND ARCHITECTS KAMINSKI AND STIEGLER'S TESTIMONY, AND FOR THE CLOSE COLLABORATION THAT THIS PROJECT SHOWED BETWEEN THE OWNERS AND ARCHITECT AT THE TIME OF DESIGN AND CONSTRUCTION, WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1967. Seconded by

Boardmember Taylor. The motion passed by a vote of 8-0-0 with Boardmembers Cheng, Cortez, Byers, Taylor, Woods, Winter, Coyle, and Chair Hutter voting yea, and with Boardmembers McCullough, Abrams, and Farley absent.

Note: This item was pulled from the Consent Agenda and was heard as the third discussion item.

ITEM-5 ROBERT AND CLARA WEST SPEC HOUSE #1

City Council District: 3

Plan Area: North Park

Staff: Suzanne Segur

Public testimony in support of the designation received from Kiley Wallace and Ben Segebartt.

No public testimony received in opposition on this item.

No speaker slips received in support of this item.

Speaker slips received in opposition on this item from Clint Daniels.

BOARD ACTION:

CONSENT MOTION BY VICE CHAIR BYERS TO DESIGNATE THE ROBERT AND CLARA WEST SPEC HOUSE #1 LOCATED AT 3441 COOPER STREET AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1929 UNDER HRB CRITERION C. THE DESIGNATION EXCLUDES THE 2020 REAR ADDITION CONSTRUCTED OUTSIDE OF THE PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE. Seconded by Boardmember Cheng. The motion passed by a vote of 8-0-0 with Boardmembers Coyle, Winter, Woods, Taylor, Byers, Cortez, Cheng, and Chair Hutter voting yea, and with Boardmember McCullough, Abrams, and Farley absent.

Note: This item was heard as the fourth discussion item.

BREAK: 2:32 p.m. – 3:45 p.m.