



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: February 9, 2024 REPORT NO. HRB-24-006

HEARING DATE: February 22, 2024

SUBJECT: **ITEM #4 – RALPH HURLBURT/ALEXANDER SCHREIBER SPEC. HOUSE #5**

RESOURCE INFO: [California Historical Resources Inventory Database \(CHRID\) link](#)

APPLICANT: Troy and Lauren Kurz; represented by BFS Environmental Services

LOCATION: 3560-3562 Utah Street, North Park Community, Council District 3
APN 453-244-08-00

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of Ralph Hurlburt /Alexander Schreiber Spec. House #5 located at 3560-3562 Utah Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Ralph Hurlburt/Alexander Schreiber Spec. House #5 located at 3560-3562 Utah Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1919 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the rear detached two-story ADU with an attached laundry room at 3560 Utah Street constructed outside the period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

1. The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character-defining features of Craftsman style architecture and retains integrity from its 1919 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits low-pitched, gable roofs with wide eave overhanging eaves, exposed beams, decorative attic vents, wood clapboard siding with distinct board pattern, partial width front porch with square stucco columns, stucco chimney, and fenestration consisting of wood double hung and fixed windows.
2. The resource is representative of a notable work of Master Builder Alexander Schreiber and reflects his original design and aesthetic. Specifically, the resource is a notable example of his work in the Craftsman style, featuring a high-quality design that retains integrity as it relates to the original 1919 design.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource.

The property was located within the boundary of the [2016 North Park Community Plan Area Historic Resources Survey](#) but was not identified in the survey because it was not evaluated.

The historic name of the resource, the Ralph Hurlburt/Alexander Schreiber Spec. House #5, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Ralph Hurlburt, who constructed the house as a speculation house and the name of Alexander Schreiber, a Master Builder.

In order to be eligible for designation and listing on the City's Register, a resource must meet one or more of the City's designation criteria as specified in the Historical Resources Guidelines of the Land Development Manual and retain integrity as it relates to the significance of the resource. Integrity is the ability of a property to convey its significance, which requires an understanding of the physical features and characteristics that existed during the resource's period of significance. The National, California, and City of San Diego Registers recognize location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association as the seven aspects of historical integrity.

Although not all seven aspects of integrity need to be present for a property to be eligible for designation, the record must demonstrate that the property retains enough physical and design characteristics to reflect and convey the significance of the property. Each resource depends on certain aspects of integrity, more than others, to express its historic significance. Determining which of the aspects are most important to a particular property requires an understanding of the property's significance and its essential physical features. The [Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria](#) provide information regarding the City's designation criteria, as well as guidance on their application and how to evaluate the integrity of a resource.

ANALYSIS

The property located at 3560-3562 Utah Street is a single-story, Craftsman-style single-family residential building constructed in 1919 in the North Park Community Planning Area. Other buildings and structures present on site include a detached two-story ADU with an attached single-story laundry room addition with a second-story deck. The property is on the east side of Utah Street in a residential neighborhood surrounded by similarly scaled and styled homes. The property is in its original location.

Since its construction in 1919, the property has been modified as follows: a metal railing and lattice wood panel were added to the front porch at an unknown date and then removed prior to 2007. The original concrete driveway was replaced with pavers between 2004 and 2007, a new wood fence was added to the primary façade, and a wood pergola was added to the south façade between 2011 and 2014. A rear door on the west façade was replaced between 2012 and 2014, and ceramic tile was added to the rear porch steps at an unknown date. In 2023, gutters were installed on the house, and permits were issued for a foundation replacement and photovoltaic system.

The rear detached two-story ADU with an attached laundry room at 3560 Utah Street was originally built in 1919 as a detached garage with a storage room. The structure has gone through multiple unpermitted modifications over the years, including additions, window and door modifications, and a change in its use from a garage to an ADU. In 2019, to rectify the code enforcement issues, a

combination building permit, Project No. 614768 and Approval No. 2182133, was issued for the unpermitted companion unit conversion of the detached 2-story garage and expansion of the existing 1st-floor laundry room with a deck above. The ADU is clad in vinyl siding, and fenestration consists of a combination of wood and vinyl windows in various operations and sizes. The application to convert the garage and the associated construction was reviewed and approved by Heritage Preservation staff.

A Historical Resource Research was prepared by BFA Environmental Services, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C and D, and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the [Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria](#), as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The resource is a one-story, single-family residence constructed in 1919 in the Craftsman style. The house features low-pitched, gable roofs with wide eave overhanging eaves, exposed beams, decorative attic vents, wood siding with a wide and narrow board pattern, and a stucco chimney. The house has a rectangular floor plan with an asymmetrical primary façade fronting Utah Street. The partial-width front porch is accessed via steps leading from the sidewalk and is supported by stucco square columns that extend to the ground and features a 1:1 fixed wood window and a wood and glass entry door. Fenestration consists primarily of double-hung and fixed wood windows in their original openings. A detached two-story ADU with an attached single-story laundry room addition and a second-story deck is located at the rear eastern portion of the parcel.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, which was born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

Of the seven aspects of integrity, design, materials, and workmanship are the most critical to the property's ability to convey significance under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Craftsman style. The property, which has been modified as detailed at the beginning of the analysis section of this report, retains the overall integrity of design, materials, and workmanship despite the modifications. The rear door replacement and ceramic tile added to the rear steps are located at the rear of the property, are not readily visible and do not impact significant character-defining features. The modification of the original detached garage, which is an accessory structure to the residence and located at the rear of the lot, does not significantly impair the resource's significance as a Craftsman residence. Other modifications, including the foundation, trellis, gutters, fence, pavers, and solar panels, are minor changes that do not significantly impair integrity. Therefore, the property retains its integrity to its 1919 period of significance under HRB Criterion C.

Significance Statement: The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character-defining features of the Craftsman style and architectural integrity to its 1919 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits low-pitched, gable roofs with wide eave overhanging eaves, exposed beams, decorative attic vents, wood clapboard siding with distinct board pattern, partial width front porch with square stucco columns, stucco chimney, and fenestration consisting of wood double hung and fixed windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

Alexander Schreiber was born in Kansas in 1887 and moved to San Diego in 1912. Little is known of his early career in San Diego; however, he was listed as a carpenter in the 1912 San Diego City Directory. He became a contractor by 1916. In the mid-1920s, he operated a real estate office in Hillcrest, but his primary occupation was a contractor.

Schreiber was a prolific builder, designing and building houses and commercial buildings in North Park, South Park, University Heights, Loma Portal, Encanto and Mission Hills. Most of his house designs were in the Craftsman and Spanish Eclectic styles, though he did design at least two houses in Mission Hills in the Prairie style: 1866 Fort Stockton Drive (HRB #730) and the slightly higher-style house at 4205 Arden Way (HRB #618). Schreiber was also an early experimenter in using electricity in houses; his obituary credits him with building the first house in San Diego completely wired for electrical appliances.

At least 18 of Schreiber's works have been designated as historical resources by the City of San Diego Historical Resources Board. They include the Alexander Schreiber Spec House #1 (HRB #618/821-62), which established him as a Master Builder by the HRB in 2003, the Alexander Schreiber Spec House #3 (HRB #762) and the Alexander Schreiber Spec House #7 (HRB #1201/1276-145).

The subject property exhibits Alexander Schreiber's characteristic Craftsman style, and it retains a high degree of integrity to its 1919 date of construction, retaining all aspects of integrity. Although the property was owned by Master Designer Ralph Hurlburt when the original permits were pulled by Alexander Schreiber, there is no documentation to show that Hurlburt had anything to do with the design or construction of the property.

Of the seven aspects of integrity, design, materials, and workmanship are the most critical to the property's ability to convey significance under HRB Criterion D as a resource that represents the notable work of Master Builder Alexander Schreiber. The property, which has been modified as detailed at the beginning of the analysis section of this report, retains the overall integrity of design, materials, and workmanship despite the modifications. The rear door replacement and ceramic tile added to the rear steps are located at the rear of the property, are not readily visible and do not impact significant character-defining features. The modification of the original detached garage, which is an accessory structure to the residence and located at the rear of the lot, does not significantly impair the resource's ability to reflect the notable work of Schreiber. Other modifications, including the foundation, trellis, gutters, fence, pavers, and solar panels, are minor changes that do not significantly impair the integrity or the resource's ability to convey its

significance as a resource that represents the notable work of Master Builder Alexander Schreiber. Therefore, the property retains its integrity to its 1919 period of significance under HRB Criterion D.

Significance Statement: The subject resource is representative of a notable work of Master Builder Alexander Schreiber and reflects his original design and aesthetic. Specifically, the resource is a notable example of his work in the Craftsman style, featuring a high-quality design that retains integrity as it relates to the original 1919 design. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion D.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Ralph Hurlburt/Alexander Schreiber Spec. House #5 located at 3560-3562 Utah Street be designated with a period of significance of 1919 under HRB Criterion C as an example of the Craftsman style and Criterion D as a notable work of Master Builder Alexander Schreiber. The designation excludes the rear detached two-story ADU with an attached laundry room at 3560 Utah Street constructed outside the period of significance.


Shannon Anthony
Senior Planner


Suzanne Segur
Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison
City Planning Department

SA/ks/ss

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 2/22/2024

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 2/22/2024, to consider the historical designation of the **Ralph Hurlburt/Alexander Schreiber Spec. House #5** (owned by Troy and Lauren Kurz, 4475 Houghton Avenue, Riverside, CA 92501) located at **3560-3562 Utah Street San Diego, CA 92104**, APN: **453-244-08-00**, further described as BLK 25 LOT 5 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Ralph Hurlburt/ Alexander Schreiber Spec. House #5 on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character-defining features of Craftsman style architecture and retains integrity from its 1919 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits low-pitched, gable roofs with wide eave overhanging eaves, exposed beams, decorative attic vents, wood clapboard siding with distinct board pattern, partial width front porch with square stucco columns, stucco chimney, and fenestration consisting of wood double hung and fixed windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

(2) The property is historically significant under CRITERION D as a notable work of Master Builder Alexander Schreiber and reflects his original design and aesthetic. Specifically, the resource is a notable example of his work in the Craftsman style, featuring a high-quality design that retains integrity as it relates to the original 1919 design. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the rear detached two-story ADU with an attached laundry room at 3560 Utah Street constructed outside the period of significance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
TIM HUTTER, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
LINDSEY SEBASTIAN,
Deputy City Attorney

RECORDING REQUESTED BY
CITY OF SAN DIEGO
DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT

WHEN RECORDED MAIL TO

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
ATTN: HRB SECRETARY
1222 FIRST AVENUE, MS 501
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

SPACE ABOVE THIS LINE FOR RECORDER'S USE

RESOLUTION NUMBER **N/A**

HISTORICAL DESIGNATION OF PROPERTY ON

3560-3562 Utah Street, San Diego, CA 92104

ASSESSOR PARCEL NUMBER **453-244-08-00**

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD NUMBER **0**