



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

REPORT TO THE PLANNING COMMISSION

DATE ISSUED: September 13, 2007 **REPORT NO. PC-07-136**

ATTENTION: Planning Commission, Agenda of September 20, 2007

SUBJECT: 1905 SPINDRIFT REMODEL/ADDITION - PROJECT NO. 95885
PROCESS FOUR

**OWNER/
APPLICANT:** Brian C. Malk

SUMMARY

Issue(s): Should the Planning Commission approve a request to construct a 1,398 square foot, two-story addition, and remodel of the existing single-family residence, which includes the relocation of the garage and curb cut on the 0.12-acre site located at 1905 Spindrift Drive in the La Jolla Community Plan Area?

Staff Recommendation:

1. **CERTIFY** Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) No. 95885 and **ADOPT** the Mitigation, Monitoring and Reporting Program (MMRP); and
2. **APPROVE** Coastal Development Permit No. 310726; and
3. **APPROVE** Site Development Permit No. 313820.

Community Planning Group Recommendation: On June 1, 2006, the La Jolla Community Planning Association voted 12-0-2 to recommend approval with no conditions (Attachment 10).

Other Recommendations: On September 19, 2006, the La Jolla Shores Planned District Advisory Board voted 5-0-0 to recommend approval because the proposed project conforms to the criteria and design standards of the La Jolla Shores Planned District Ordinance (Attachment 11).

On May 24, 2007, the Historic Resources Board (HRB) designated the proposed site (HRB No. 813) under HRB Criterion A, reflecting special elements of the City's Historical,

archaeological, and cultural development. On August 23, 2007, the HRB recommended approval of the Supplemental Finding-Important Archaeological Sites and Traditional Cultural Properties, pursuant to the City's Land Development Code (LDC) Section No. 126.0504(f) for the proposed project. A recommendation by the HRB is required prior to the Planning Commission decision on a Process 4 Site Development Permit when a historical district or designated historical resource is present, pursuant to LDC Section 126.0503(b)(2).

Environmental Review: A Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) No. 95885 has been prepared for the project in accordance with State of California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) guidelines, which addresses potential impacts to Historical Resources (Archaeology). A Mitigation, Monitoring and Reporting Program (MMRP) would be implemented with this project to reduce the potential impacts to a level below significance.

Fiscal Impact Statement: None with this action. All costs associated with the processing of this project are paid from a deposit account maintained by the applicant.

Code Enforcement Impact: None with this action.

Housing Impact Statement: The project proposes to construct a 1,398 square foot, two-story addition, and remodel an existing single-family residence. Therefore, this project is exempt from the requirements of the Affordable Housing Requirements of the City's Inclusionary Housing Ordinance (Chapter 14, Article 2, Division 13 of the Land Development Code).

BACKGROUND

The project site is located at 1905 Spindrift Drive, northeast corner of Spindrift Drive and Saint Louis Terrace (Attachment 2), in the SF (Single-Family) Zone of La Jolla Shores Planned District (Attachment 3) within the La Jolla Community Plan Area (Attachment 4). The property falls within the Coastal Overlay Zone (Appealable Area and Non-Appealable Area 2) (Attachment 5), the Coastal Height Limitation Overlay Zone, the Transit Area Overlay Zone, Residential Tandem Parking, and the Parking Impact Overlay Zone within the La Jolla Community Plan and Local Coastal Program Areas. The La Jolla Community Plan designates the site and adjacent properties as low density residential (5-9 dwelling units per acre). The site is surrounded by single-family residential development, and the site and the surrounding properties are zoned SF.

The property is currently developed with a one-story with a basement, 3,048 square-foot, three-bedroom, single-family residence. The existing wood frame residence was constructed in 1925 in the Spanish Eclectic style with stucco, red tile roof and casement windows. Over the years substantial alterations have occurred which resulted in a tripling of the size of the house. The existing residence was found not to be significant in terms of architectural style, appearance, design, construction or association with important persons or events in history.

The property is located within the mapped boundaries of a regionally significant archaeological site known as the Spindrift Site (CA-SDI-39/17, 372, SDMM-W-1). The site encompasses a large

habitation area known to its Kumeyaay inhabitants as Mut kula xuy/Mut lah hoy ya (place of many caves). The area is composed of several large middens, temporary camps, pottery and lithic scatters, various shell scatters, and burials. The site is composed of multiple, consecutive layers representative of different cultural phases found in the San Diego region; and the Spindrift site area has undergone extensive development due to intensive grading for homes, streets, and utilities over the past 70 years.

DISCUSSION

Project Description:

The applicant proposes the construction of a 1,398 square foot, two-story addition, and remodel of the existing single-family residence, which includes the relocation of the garage and curb cut on the 0.12-acre site. The existing site retaining walls would remain except for those located at the new driveway (Attachment 7-Project Plans). The residential addition would incorporate the wood frame construction, stucco finish of the existing structure with wood-framed windows and shutters, stained-wood rafters, tile roofing, stone façade, wooden lintels, and decorative metal railing. The project is in conformance with the development regulations and design criteria of the La Jolla Shores Planned District Ordinance, and no deviations from the regulations are requested or needed for the proposed development.

The property is located within the mapped boundaries of a regionally significant archaeological site known as the Spindrift Site (CA-SDI-39/17, 372, SDMM-W-1). The Historic Resource Board's first designation of a portion of the Spindrift Site was for the property at 1900 Spindrift in 1999 (HRB No. 390), while another portion of the Spindrift Site at 1876 Torrey Pines Road was designated in 2003 (HRB No. 390). On May 24, 2007, the Historic Resource Board designated the proposed project site (HRB No. 813) under HRB Criterion A, reflecting special elements of the City's Historical, archaeological, and cultural development. The designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the site in accordance with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards and the City's Land Development Code.

Development of the proposed project requires the approval of a Coastal Development Permit, and a Site Development Permit for development within the La Jolla Shores Planned District and the presence of on-site cultural resources.

Community Plan Analysis:

The project site is located at 1905 Spindrift Drive, northeast corner of Spindrift Drive and Saint Louis Terrace, in the La Jolla Community Plan Area. The La Jolla Community Plan (LJCP) designates the site and adjacent properties as low density residential (5-9 dwelling units per acre). This density range is characterized as a single family residential dwelling unit on a 5,000- 7,000 square foot lots and approximately 20-percent of the community plan area is developed through this category.

The Residential Element of the LJCP identifies Community Character as common development patterns and streetscape themes throughout the neighborhood. Elements of character are illustrated through bulk and scale, street and site fixtures, and materials and colors used in pavement and in

structural design. One of the goals within the LJCP is to maintain the character of the residential areas by ensuring that redevelopment occurs in a manner that protects natural features, preserves existing streetscape themes, and allows a harmonious visual relationship to exist between the bulk and scale of new and older structures. Staff has determined that the proposed addition is not out of scale with the surrounding neighborhood and the addition does preserve the existing character of the home as the upper level is setback from the lower floors and away from the street.

The LJCP designates a portion of Spindrift Drive as an intermittent or partial vista and an alternative pedestrian access route. Therefore, the property is subject to policies in the community plan related to visual access, public access and pedestrian orientation. The project, as proposed, is not anticipated to impact views along Spindrift Drive since the property is located on the eastern side of the street, and the addition would be set back from the corner and street side yard.

Environmental Analysis:

A Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) has been prepared for the project in accordance with State of California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) guidelines, which addresses potential impacts; and a Mitigation, Monitoring and Reporting Program (MMRP) would be implemented with this project to reduce the potential impacts to a level below significant. The following Historical Resource issues were considered during review and determined to be significant:

Structural: The existing wood frame residence located on the parcel was constructed in 1925 in the Spanish Eclectic style with stucco, red tile roof and casement windows. Over the years substantial alterations have occurred which resulting in a tripling of the size of the house. “An Historical Significance Reevaluation of the 1905 Spindrift Drive Residence”(May 16, 2007), prepared by Brian Smith and Associates, which incorporates a previous study of 1905 Spindrift Drive by Brandes et al. in 1999, was prepared for this project. The existing residence was reevaluated, and additional research conducted to identify the age, location, context, any association with an important person or event, uniqueness, and integrity. Staff determined that the existing residence was found not to be significant in terms of architectural style, appearance, design, construction or association with important persons or events in history.

Archaeological: “An Archaeological Study for 1905 Spindrift Drive” (May 16, 2007) was prepared by Brian Smith and Associates, which integrated their previous archaeological study conducted at the location for CA-SDI-39/SDM-W-1 in 2000. According to the report, the property is located within the mapped boundaries of a regionally significant archaeological site known as the Spindrift Site (CA-SDI-39/17, 372, SDMM-W-1). Subsurface excavations were conducted in 2006, under a City approved testing plan, which resulted in the recovery of sparse deposits of lithic artifacts, marine shell, and fragments of cremated human remains. The historic/modern artifacts recovered included primarily ceramic and metal construction debris and indeterminate ceramic and glass fragments. Because of the association of the cultural materials within the 1905 Spindrift property with the surrounding areas of SDI-39, the character of this regionally significant site is reflected in the collection from the property.

Due to the rich and diverse deposit of artifacts and ecofacts, the site has the potential to yield important information, and is considered to be a significant archaeological site. In addition, the frequency of human remains found within Site SDI-39, some of which were recovered from the

1905 Spindrift property, also represent special elements of a prehistoric archeological site for its cultural and historic significance. On May 24, 2007, the HRB designated the proposed project site (HRB No. 813) under HRB Criterion A, reflecting special elements of the City's Historical, archaeological, and cultural development.

The only possibly intact portion of SDI-39 within the property was located in the front yard between the western edge of the house and the front gate along Spindrift Drive. Although only a small portion of the project contains possibly intact prehistoric deposits with additional research potential, the existence of human remains within the vicinity of the project has led the City of San Diego to list Site SDI-39/W-1 as significant in its entirety, regardless of integrity. The tentative construction plans for the structure call for the partial removal and reconstruction of portions of the house foundations and walls, and the removal, relocation, and recompaction of soil within the lot. This could result in impacts to any cultural resources located below and around the periphery of the house.

A Mitigation/Monitoring Program based on the results of an approved testing program was created in consultation with the Native American Most Likely Descendent specifically for the proposed project's new construction and the adaptation/rehabilitation of the existing foundations. The mitigation program flow chart is shown on page 7 of the MND. Implementation of the entire MMRP (See Section V of the MND), is required to reduce any potential impacts to subsurface deposits to below a level of significance. As part of the mitigation program intended to preserve the cultural resources, a conservation easement would be placed over the unbuilt portion of the site. The easement area would be capped with geogrid, and a minimum of one-foot of topsoil to protect the site's existing cultural resources.

During the review of the project the environmental issues for *Geology* and *Visual Quality* were considered in detail, but were determined not to be significant.

Critical Project Features to Consider During Substantial Conformance Review

- Archaeological - The building design and/or site design should be fully analyzed for any revisions to ensure the changes would not impact any archaeological and/or cultural resources located below and around the site.
- Height, Bulk and Scale - The building design and/or site design should be fully analyzed for any revisions to the building height and/or the bulk and scale of the building to ensure the changes would be in architectural harmony with the surrounding neighborhood and community.

Conclusion:


The project meets all applicable regulations and policy documents, and staff finds the project consistent with the recommended land use, design guidelines, and development standards in effect for this site per the adopted La Jolla Shores Planned District and the La Jolla Community Plan, the Local Coastal Program Land Use Plan, the Progress Guide and General Plan, and the Strategic Framework Element.

ALTERNATIVES

1. **CERTIFY** Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) No. 95885 and **ADOPT** the Mitigation, Monitoring and Reporting Program (MMRP); and **APPROVE** Coastal Development Permit No. 310726 and Site Development Permit No. 313820, **with modifications.**

2. **Do Not CERTIFY** Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) No. 95885 and **Do Not ADOPT** the Mitigation, Monitoring and Reporting Program (MMRP); and **DENY** Coastal Development Permit No. 310726 and Site Development Permit No. 313820, **if the findings required to approve the project cannot be affirmed.**

Respectfully submitted,



Mike Westlake
Program Manager
Development Services Department



Jeffrey A. Peterson
Development Project Manager
Development Services Department

WESTLAKE/JAP

Attachments:

1. Location Map
2. Aerial Photographs
3. Zoning Map
4. Community Plan Land Use Map
5. Coastal Overlay Zone Map
6. Project Data Sheet
7. Project Plans
8. Draft CDP/SDP Permit with Conditions
9. Draft CDP/SDP Resolution with Findings
10. Community Planning Group Recommendation
11. La Jolla Shores Planned District Advisory Board
12. Ownership Disclosure Statement
13. Project Chronology

Job Order Number 42-6040