CARMEL VALLEY COMMUNITY PLANNING BOARD MEETING MINUTES

7 p.m., 28 August 2014

Canyon Crest Academy Performing Arts Theater 5951 Village Center Loop Rd., San Diego, CA 92130

CALL TO ORDER AND ATTENDANCE

Board Member	Representing	Present	Excused	Absent
1. Rick Newman	Neighborhood 1	X		
2. Nancy Novak	Neighborhood 3	X		
3. Hollie Kahn	Neighborhood 4/4A	X		
4. Debbie Lokanc	Neighborhood 5	X		
5. Christopher Moore	Neighborhood 6	X		
6. Steven Ross	Neighborhood 7	X		
7. Frisco White, Chair	Neighborhood 8	X		
8. Anne Harvey	Neighborhood 8A & 8B	X		
9. Steve Davison	Neighborhood 9	X		
10. Laura Copic	Neighborhood 10	X		
11. Manjeet Ranu, Vice-Chair	Pacific Highlands Ranch,	X		
	District 11			
12. Jonathan Tedesco	Pacific Highlands Ranch,	X		
	District 12			
13. VACANT	Business Representative			
14. Victor Manoushakian	Business Representative	X		
15. Allen Kashani, Secretary	Developer Representative		X (Recused)	
16. Christian Clews	Investor Representative		X	
17. Brian Brady	Investor Representative		X (Recused)	

APPROVAL OF MINUTES — 24 July, 2014

Nancy Novak moved to approve the minutes with one correction. The draft minutes note that the Neighborhood 4/4A seat was vacant, but Hollie Kahn was seated at that meeting and was present. Laura Copic seconded the motion and the minutes were approved 14-0-0, as corrected.

COUNCIL DISTRICT 1 REPORT

Councilmember Sherri Lightner addressed the group. She thanked everyone for taking the time to make their voices heard, and stated that the number of attendees at the meeting speaks to how important the consideration of the One Paseo project is to Carmel Valley. She recognized Frisco White and the members of the Carmel Valley Planning Board for their service. She encouraged people to register to receive updates from her office on this project.

COUNTY SUPERVISOR'S REPORT

County Supervisor Dave Roberts addressed the group. He indicated that he has been following the One Paseo project closely. While the County will not have an opportunity to vote on the project, he indicated that his opinion has not changed about this project, and does not feel that we should allow something that is three times the size of existing zoning to be built.

ACTION AGENDA

1. One Paseo: Discussion of the FEIR for the proposed One Paseo

• Applicant: Kilroy Realty

Chair Frisco White indicated that Board Members Brian Brady and Allen Kashani would be recusing themself from the discussion and vote on One Paseo. He reviewed the format for the meeting: During the first hour organized presentations will be heard from the applicant, opposition, and Torrey Pines Planning Group. Public testimony will follow, and the board members would be afforded an opportunity for discussion.

Organized Presentations

• Steve Scott from Kilroy Realty introduced the One Paseo project. He shared that he and his team have been working hard for many years to collaborate with city staff and community to finalize the Draft Environmental Impact Report (EIR). Community engagement has been invaluable to them and hundreds of comments have been incorporated into the project. One Paseo will be a livable, sustainable and walkable community and a major unifying element for Carmel Valley. The project has reduced its density by 30 percent, increased open space by 10 acres, and reduced all building heights.

Mike Stepner addressed how the One Paseo project achieves regional planning goals. He indicated that, before joining the project team, he had many concerns about the project. Kilroy hired him to help redesign the project to better meet the vision or goals of community plan. Mr. Stepner shared information from the North City West Community Plan. This plan envisioned a town center that would be the major unifying element of the community. He shared that the One Paseo project can now be a model for how we develop communities like this.

Frank Wolden presented details about the design of the project. When the project was first conceived, it was an "island" in the community. Since then, the design has been changed to humanize the surrounding streets, turning Del Mar Heights Road into a gateway street with an enjoyable pedestrian environment. The design concept for El Camino Real turned a commercial street into a "string of pearls," connected with a series of public use areas. Mr. Wolden also shared information about how the architecture has been redesigned to address comments received from the community and city. Initially, Del Mar Heights Road was proposed with residential towers and hotels. It has been redesigned as a "garden street" with setbacks, reduced height and an inviting pedestrian experience. A town green has been added where a hotel was once proposed. The town green at the community's gateway provides a connection to Main Street, where the use goes from passive green space to active plazas to Main Street itself. The main plaza will serve as a "living room" for Carmel Valley. It was designed to host public events and gatherings, attractive tenants on plaza, and activity throughout the day.

John Leppert presented information about transportation and mobility for the project. He indicated that Kilroy will invest \$6 million in traffic improvements, and much of this investment will be made up front at the beginning of the development process. In addition to traffic improvements, the project will implement a comprehensive Transportation Demand Management (TDM) program, and plans to incorporate 21st century technology to create traffic solutions. Because of this state-of-the-art technology, travel times are projected to improve. He shared information about a "Total Systems Approach," which uses technology to update how cars are detected as they approach the signal and coordinates with other signals in the system. He shared videos of existing conditions on Del Mar Heights Road, as well as existing conditions on Carlsbad Village Drive. This technology is in use on Carlsbad Village Drive and he pointed out how many fewer stops there were on the Carlsbad Village Drive commute compared to the Del Mar Heights Road commute. The One Paseo project will optimize 40 traffic signals on five corridors in Carmel Valley. This optimization will also benefit emergency vehicles since they will have better control of signals when responding to an emergency. Projected travel time improvements in Carmel Valley with the One Paseo project are a 13 percent improvement on Del Mar Heights Road and a 21 percent improvement on El Camino Real.

Marcela Escobar-Eck presented information on key findings in the Draft EIR. She shared that the Draft EIR identified significant and unmitigable impacts in two areas – community character and traffic. The impacts to community character are due to the fact that the City of Villages strategy in the City's General Plan is a different strategy than the existing Carmel Valley Community Plan. She explained that of the eight traffic impacts that are considered unmitigable, six are within Caltrans' jurisdiction. The remaining two are going through an approval process with the City. While Kilroy is contributing its fair share, it cannot be considered mitigated until the projects

are approved. She summarized ten areas that have been identified by the community as needing attention that Kilroy will be implementing:

- 1. Signal coordination
- 2. Funding for traffic calming measures to help prevent cut-through traffic
- 3. An enhanced streetscape on Del Mar Heights Road
- 4. Enhanced landscaping and improved bike facilities
- 5. Enhanced pedestrian crosswalks on Del Mar Heights Road
- 6. A linear park experience on Del Mar Heights Road and El Camino Real
- 7. Seating areas and pocket parks
- 8. Advanced Architectural & Engineering funding to repurpose the Carmel Valley Community Center (can add two additional fields)
- 9. Funding new entry monuments on Del Mar Heights Road and El Camino Real
- 10. Completing bike trails (Kilroy will be funding completion of the SR 56 trail and contributing \$1.1 million to Caltrans so the I-5 bike trail can be completed in 4-5 years)

She also addressed issues related to transit. While Kilroy has no influence over increased transit and bus services, they have committed to a shuttle system providing transportation between One Paseo and the Coaster station in morning and afternoon peak periods to increase access to transit.

Steve Scott provided closing remarks, indicating that the One Paseo project fulfills community visions, provides traffic improvements, and will realize community benefits.

• Ken Farinsky, representing the What Price Main Street? coalition spoke in opposition to the One Paseo project. The coalition has 4,000 members, including residents and businesses in Carmel Valley. They are not against development, but support an appropriate sized development on this site. They support a mixed-used project, but feel that One Paseo is too big and the roads, parks, and schools in the community cannot handle the load.

Bob Fuchs, cofounder of "What Price Main Street?" coalition is a 40 year professional in the commercial real estate industry. He noted that One Paseo is three times larger than what is currently allowed. It will produce four times more traffic than is currently entitled for the property. He stated that the project will have overwhelming impacts on the community and the traffic mitigation will not be enough. Their traffic study and the results shown from their proposed mitigation assumes that I-5/SR-56 connectors will be completed by 2030. But the project will create more traffic than two connectors will alleviate when it is constructed 14 years later. Caltrans projects that traffic on Del Mar Heights will get worse even without the One Paseo project. He questioned the effectiveness of the proposed signal optimization, and indicated that it doesn't work well if the road is already at capacity and if it has to interact with Caltrans ramp meters.

Bob Freund also spoke on behalf of the coaltion. He is also a commercial real estate professional and indicated that he was initially enthusiastic about the project, but it is just too big. He questioned the traffic studies that said you can add 1.5 million square feet, two traffic lights, and four times the allowed traffic and still shorten your travel times. He indicated his support for a mixed-use project on that site that fits community scale and its ability to absorb traffic. He also shared that in his experience, a smaller project will still attract quality tenants because the demographics of the Carmel Valley community are very valuable. He encouraged the CVPB to reject this proposal and ask Kilroy to come back with a smaller scale mixed-use project.

Dennis Ridz addressed the CVPB on behalf of the Torrey Pines Planning Board. Their primary issue with the project is its potential impact on emergency response times. Station 24 is in the Carmel Valley community but also serves the Torrey Pines community. The Planning Board submitted a number of questions about this to the Draft EIR but were told that emergency response times were not a CEQA issue. They were told that emergency response times would not be significantly impacted because the vehicles have sirens, can control lights, and can drive on other side of street. However, when these questions were posed to a retired fire chief, he answered that the project would likely increase response times beyond the current response time of 8.5 minutes. This response time is already longer than recommended – the American Heart Association says a five minute response time is needed for heart attack and stroke victims. The Torrey Pines community has a significant senior population (one-third of the population is over 60), and we are concerned that any traffic increase will slow response.

Dee Rich, co-chair of the Torrey Pines Planning Board echoed the concerns of Mr. Ridz. She expressed disappointment that Kilroy refused to present to the Torrey Pines Planning Board since the project was not in their community planning area. She stated that while the project may be out of the planning area, the two planning areas are one community – they share schools, emergency services, and a public library. She also discussed that the community is in a high fire risk area. If response times are compromised, it could destroy the community.

Public Comment

The following is a list of people that spoke in support of the project. A list of key points raised follows the list of speakers. A complete list of people that submitted speaker slips in favor of the project (including those that did not speak) is included as Attachment A.

- Laurence Schreiber
- Jeff Betts
- Paul Dannigner
- Gabriella Stratton
- Tracy Aragon
- Dennis Glaser
- Janette Littler
- Stella Sung
- David Jaenisch
- Bill Lynch
- Steve Burton
- Charlie Sung
 - We want a Main Street environment instead of office park or strip mall.
 - We need to have the residential component to make it a true Main Street.
 - The quality of tenants is in direct proportion to density, so I think size is appropriate.
 - Any project will have traffic, but we have a developer willing to mitigate impact and improve technology, and pay for shuttles.
 - Impacts are far outweighed by the benefits of what is proposed.
 - This project is a model of what smart development looks like.
 - It will benefit the community by providing more jobs, shopping opportunities, and places to live.
 - I like the bike facilities they are proposing.
 - I lived in Silicon Valley where we had similar projects built that are very successful.
 - Carmel Valley needs more amenities to keep us here so we don't have to drive out of the community during peak times.
 - The applicant has made a lot of changes to respond to public input: they added pedestrian streets, greater setbacks, more open space, and lowered building heights.
 - This will be a walkable, bikable community.
 - Having a development like this with restaurants, movie theaters, and diversity nearby is a great opportunity to create family memories.
 - I like the idea of using technology in my community that is demonstrated to work in other communities.
 - Younger San Diegans desire this kind of urban density. One Paseo is a good venue for this type of market.
 - The density in San Diego County is too low. If you have young adults and want them to be able to afford to live here, we need more density.
 - Once you get past working hours, parking for offices can be used for retail and the community. This will allow people to stay in Carmel Valley and not have to drive outside the community to meet their needs.
 - This project will help strengthen the tax base so we can pay for infrastructure and amenities 20 years down the road.
 - We need the scale of this development to support the types of investments that Kilroy is making.
 - The property has remained vacant for 30 years. This is an opportunity we may not get again.

The following is a list of people that spoke in opposition to the project. A list of key points raised follows the list of speakers. A complete list of people that submitted speaker slips opposed to the project (including those that did not speak) is included as Attachment B.

- Lisa Ross, Del Mar Mesa Planning Board (neutral at this point group has not voted yet)
- Walter Carlin
- Arthur Hooper
- Betsy Viando
- Ray Raybel
- Karen Kelly
- Elizabeth Shriver, Del Mar Highlands Town Center
- John Ziebarth (consultant for Donohue Shriver)
- John Ponder (attorney for Donohue Shriver)
- Debra Zambianco
- Harvey Goldstein
- Mary Goldstein
- Gail Chatfield
- Ben Snyder
- Madhari Jarwala
- Mike Limber
- Jill Duoto
- Christy Walsh
- Willy Fajolik
- John Ball
 - We ask the Carmel Valley Planning Board to consider impacts to adjacent communities.
 - Once the entitlements are given, applicants can change the projects without additional review if they have "substantial conformance." This has caused problems in other communities. You need to make sure that they are held to their word about what they will build.
 - Traffic and its impacts are a concern, but I'm also concerned about the smell and impact of increased auto exhaust.
 - The developers say that they are adding 20,000 cars but my commute will be faster. This doesn't make sense.
 - There are a lot of apartments proposed in the middle of single family homes. I worry about crime and density. The project will bring in a lot of people and could create a ghetto in the middle of the neighborhood.
 - Kilroy bought the property knowing that it was entitled for 510,000 square feet. Let them build only what was originally in the plan.
 - I'm concerned how this project will affect the schools. Class sizes are getting bigger and it will get with this project.
 - This level of density is not appropriate for this community and it will impact all adjacent communities.
 - We have a wonderful downtown in San Diego. If you want to build this kind of density it should be downtown.
 - Carmel Valley is a planned community. Everyone agreed to abide by the rules when they bought property here, why should Kilroy be able to change them?
 - We want to see the site developed but not at this density. I am concerned about what this will do to traffic, parking, and community character.
 - This project is not creating a community village it is creating an urban village. Does the community desire a
 regional lifestyle center in Carmel Valley? This is the most intense zoning outside of downtown.
 - The city found that Kilroy had overstated the project's fiscal benefit to community.
 - The project will result in significant unmitigated traffic impacts with unacceptable congested conditions that are not currently experienced.
 - The project will degrade air quality.
 - With nine story buildings adjacent to two story residences, this project is inconsistent with the Carmel Valley community character.
 - The Carmel Valley Planning Board has obligation to deal with this issue based on what the people of Carmel Valley want.
 - If One Paseo is built, the adjacent neighborhoods will suffer from cut-through traffic when drivers try to take a shortcut around traffic congestion. I'm worried about what this will do to the safety in the neighborhood.

- Prior office development adjacent to neighborhoods has caused parking impacts to our community. We had to put in two-hour parking to prevent this. While it helps prevent employees from parking in the neighborhood, the two-hour limit puts a burden on neighbors.
- The board needs to honor the commitment of the community plan.
- Until I-5 is mitigated, nothing that is done with traffic lights will help.
- I don't know if we need more office space. There is a lot of vacancy in existing office buildings.
- This project will bottleneck everyone in Carmel Valley and I'm concerned about the impact to an aging population. We need to be able to get to hospitals and get out of the community.
- What are they going to do to increase police presence?
- Kilroy has not listened to community input. We've asked for a proposal for 510,000 square feet, but we
 haven't seen one.
- Increased pedestrian traffic will slow auto traffic.
- The project's impact on emergency services is a big concern.
- This project provides preferential spot zoning and up-zoning, which is not smart growth.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Chairman White closed public comment on this item, and indicated that the board would vote at a special meeting on September 11, 2014.

Due to the expiration of time for use of the facility Chair White indicated that the board will not be able to address questions to staff. He discussed assignments for the board members to review the various elements of the Final EIR. He asked board members to send him any questions they would like the applicant and city to address at the next meeting to him by September 2. He will then forward to city staff and the applicant so they can be prepared to answer them at the September 11 meeting.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 10:05 p.m.

ATTACHMENT A Speaker Slips in Support of One Paseo

Janelle Duff
Nick Schmidt
Matt Marcyan
Tushan Patel
Ken Copeland
Pete Dorazio
Virginia Partridge
Michael B. Williams
Andrea Brehm
Nick Psyllos
Mike Labelle
Jake Brehm
Daniel Graff

Mike Labelle
Jake Brehm
Daniel Graff
Xingting Zuhu
Bess Wakeman
Ali R. Ziaee
Amy Bridge
Rex McGuire
Anna Orlando
Jennifer Maxson
Ryan Maxson
Bernadette Blanco
Tracie Meas
Juli Bear

Yuqun Tao Mimi Ziaee Allen Wynar Melinda Wynar Dianne Bierman Steve Bierman Greg Drakos Art Robehuel Brian Driscoll Michael Yanicehl Jack Yang Michael Cassulato

Howard Bear

Kathy Ghio Kathy McClelland Michele Donnelly Bruce Kermott Scot Sandel Ray Varelia William Caldwell Dennis Glaser Sherry Esteban Terry Allbritain Aarti Mathur Tom Villella Gulzar S. Hunjan Manjeet Hunjan Linda Kermott Julia Rochford Rula Krikorian

Krikorian (no first name provided) Amelia Sanchez Nathan Moeser Gary London Conor Crowe Bryan Griffith Michael Nelson Brad Lenahan Tracy Aragon Jason Stack Dawn Norman Fang Lin

Robina Porras

Linda Katzman

Berrett Allen

M.P. Sherman, MD

Joseph dePorras Steve Likins Jamas Guilliam Brad LaMarche Demetri Golphshin Andy Ladow Lauren Moore Bobby Buchanan Sandra Wang Judy Sherman Janette Littler Dr. Stella Sung Steve Laverson Brian Epperson David Jaenisch

David Odmil

Lanfen Xu

Chong Ma
Peter Bridge
Jim Tuffield
Bill Lynch
Steve Burton
Charlie Synn
Anthony Fuster
Melissa Tu
Grace Abdo
Carol Klein
Laurence Schreiber

Ashley Sherman Bruce McIntyre Tony Dieli Kathi Riser Lenette Hewitt Sherm Harmer Frank Wolden Mike Stepner John Leppert Sue M. Gueldner Jeff Betts Gloria Limas John Schenk Julie McGuire Stephan Gaspar Tyler Sherer John Boarman Brent Collins Andy Schlaefli Gabriella Stratton Jacob Swim Paul Danninger Socorro Collins William Shobert

William Collins

Kim McNeil

Jeffrey Chine

Rich Miller

Heather Riley

Mike Orlando

Maxton McNeil

ATTACHMENT B Speaker Slips in Opposition to One Paseo

Irving Gold Tom Carpenter John Montague Iill Duoto Regina Reinhardt Gilbert Constorum Mike Lindberg Phoebe Telser Michelle Dannecker Andrea Brass Madhuri Jarwala David Dannecker Robin Mars Linda Adelson Barbara Cella Jennifer Greenberg Xonhong Zhong Kim Farinsky Gail Chatfield Raji Nathan Jeanne Nicole Marilyn Goldstein Lawrence Adelson Audrey Amaraz Harvey Goldstein Rona Dosick Dolores Antonio Deborah Zambianco Robert Pincur Joan Elliott Sara Hichborn Ray Vrabel Donald Freymith Lynwood Lary Elizabeth Hansen Matt Renner Ben Snyder Alan Ziegaus Farenc Cservenka Pat Whitt Jose Lau Norma Lucas Fred Schwartz John Ponder Rose Neuberger John Ziebarth Karen Snyder Warren Lang Elizabeth Schreiber Auzy Freund Karin Lang Caren Kelley Steven Shrock Fariba Farutaipan Yan Shrock Mary Mullen Bahrain Farutaipan Beth Hendershot J.H. Bechtel Tom McMullin Marissa Marsala Barbara Farrell Linda Martin Anna Wong Christina Boller Larry Byzi Florence Ross Rosanto Paramban Kerry Stark Judy Stack Jean Bechtel William Moody Iulie Union Kelly Richard Sharon Moody Shari Helsel Tanya Dory Betsey Biondo Arthur Hooper Deborah Ester Bob Gallarr Walter Carlin Henry Wlodkowski Leigh Kramer Missy Kresl Dennis Ridz Gerry Russell Veronica Moreno Jake Mumma Deanna Rich Grant Slawson Patti Ashton Christopher Alfonso Victoria McCaffery **Bob Fuchs** Elizabeth Prag Susan Nelson Robert Freund Sueh Rasekhi Andrea Peck Ken Farinsky Juerg Tschopp Sandy TaylorMerlyn Nelson Gabriele Prater Donna Campuza John Ball William Bibb Paulina Paul Lindsey Burroughs Kerry Key Ari Chevertbe Gene Helsel James Eppink Debra Schonfeld Ann Gardner Bill Chatwell Xing Xiong Felix Galasan Gil Field Dave Burchby Donald Cooper Emily Field Hallie Worsey Alan Chatfield Karen Dubey Michael Holst Michael Krems Adrienne Mark **Bud Emerson Jack Holtzman** William Fijolek Mark Warmbrowd Edward T. Walker Martin Haas Michael Palmieri Steve Simmonds Francisco Pinneli Michelle Carnevale Deborah Graf Kim McNealy David Carnevale Mark Kenry Leesa McNealy Judy Stack Andy Barnes Pam Naughton Kerry Stack Frederic Field Sandra Lory Amy Wright Irene Levinson Ellen Wadder Donna Goodman Phil Levinson Sarah Solon Marie Roll Donna Gallaher Jerry Mailhot Tricia DePinto

Greg Thompson Vera Kripalani Anil Kripalani John Carson Ruth Rauch Marvin Raush Cecile Powers **James Scott** Bob Forutampoar Fay Forutampoar Philip Shapiro Arlene Yang Sally Stipho Bryan Crane Caroline Murphy Kate Fitzsimmons Lauren McMullen Tom McMullen Latchezar Boyadjien Wayne Doyle Edward Epstein

Aaron Epstein Marlene Scheck Robert Scheck Christie Walsh Mike Walsh Kim Kruk Olve Nevelson Frank Winter Mike Majek Claire Schmidt Jean Johnson Scott Johnson Joan Rovegno Vicki Luger Julie Kajawski Meg Miller Tom Kajawski Vicky Gallagher Esther Gehrig Elster Steve Elster

Carol Lewis Penny Davis Ruth Klein Mildred Tenk Rene Cudahe Douglas Decker Roen McGuire

Phyllis Kenney

Diana Scheffler

Constance Sutter Kim Perl Wendy Lake

Frad Baron Jack Smith Dara Hensley Darrell Burns Jo Yearann Michelle Seda Diane Sparks Peter Kruk Danielle Smith Tim Smith Gil Armour Jeanne Decker Kevin McEntee Kyle McEntee Matt Perl, MD

Matt Perl, MD Judith Champ Cinda Kemper Rhonda Epstein Christie Walsh Sean Coughlin Igor Molchanon Steve Howe Rachel Fisher Doug Phillipson Richard Caterina Richard Stolz

Brenda Hegli Lillian Lashicotte Diana Hjermstad H.G. Hjermstad Pam varco Richard Gil Wendy Heilosky Jamie Burris A Wolfson

Dione Brenner Leonard Brenner Kit Leager Michael Busico Molly Busico Joyce Calvin Carol Gay

Lori Browne

David Chalkoff

Shannon Browne Vincenzo Peluso John Fiscella Michael Prestridge Brittany Pambakian

Jill Lamour Sherry Moseley Jeanne Shepler Jill Marsal

Bonnie Horstmann

Lee Elester Sundari Baru Scott Curry Rise Eany Bary Eany Vivian Olmos Robert Worf Jim Branson Maythe Sheff Jane Branchlett Veronika Atkinson Scott Phett

Scott Phett
Barbara Quinlan
Andra Davis
Kathy McClure
Debbie Kroner
Mary Von
Rick Kroner
Robert Del Cid
Cristiana Winter
Marilyn Torchia
Tim Torchia
Marianne Pickett
Patricia Hull
Robin Lipman
Mary Marshall
Maria Henry
Robert Henry

Robert Henry Mary-Anne Parker Fred Parker Mike Vairo Joseph Keith Douglas Jungneis Rebecca Ray Janet Segvich Alex Nevelson Avit Shaprut Stacy Silverwood Carol Alley P. Kregh Judy Kruse Herb Adelman Nancy Adelman Maxine Seltzer Susan Pelier

Barbara Schulz Charles Billitt Patricia Diller Barbara Diller David Whey John Griffin Elizabeth Meehan Stuart Miller

Julie Bell

10 additional names that were

illegible