

Old Town San Diego Design Review Board

**** SPECIAL MEETING ****

AGENDA

Monday, August 26, 2013 at 9:00am

CONFERENCE ROOM 5B
DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT BUILDING - 5TH FLOOR
1222 FIRST AVENUE, SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

Note: If a Sign Language Interpreter, aids for the visually impaired, or Alternative Listening Devices (ALD's) are required, please contact City Staff at 235-5200 at least five (5) working days prior to the meeting to insure availability. Those items with an asterisk (*) will include consideration of the appropriate environmental document.

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF April 25, 2013

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

ISSUES WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE OLD TOWN SAN DIEGO DESIGN REVIEW BOARD NOT PREVIOUSLY HEARD. REQUEST TO SPEAK SHOULD BE SUBMITTED TO THE SECRETARY AT THE TIME OF THE MEETING.

NOTE: THREE (3) MINUTES OF TIME PER SPEAKER

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

- A. Board Administrative Matters and General Information
- B. Subcommittee Reports
- C. Conflict of Interest Declarations
- D. Staff Report
- E. Requests for Continuance

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 4 – HILTON GARDEN INN

PTS #: 303795

Applicant: Rashik Patel, T2 Development (Owner); and Stephen Jones, Jones Ballard Architects

Location: 4200 Taylor Street, Old Town Planned District, Council District 2.

Description: The application currently in review is a Site Development Permit to demolish the existing hotel buildings and construct a new 4-story hotel on site.

Today's Action: Review and offer input on the materials, fixtures, details and colors proposed for the project for consistency with the Old San Diego Architectural and Site Development Standards and Criteria. The project will return to the Board at a later date for a formal recommendation to the decision maker.

NEXT MEETING DATE: Thursday, September 19, 2013

LOCATION: Conference Room 5D, Fifth Floor, Development Services Building

ENCLOSURES: none

Old Town San Diego Design Review Board

DRAFT MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, April 25, 2013 at 9:00am

CONFERENCE ROOM 5D
CITY OPERATION BUILDING - 5TH FLOOR
1222 FIRST AVENUE, SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER AT 9:10AM BY CHAIRPERSON CHUCK AMBERS

ATTENDANCE

OTDRB Members

Present Chuck Ambers (Chair); Conrado Gallardo; David McGuire; John Patterson

Absent Patrick Edinger

Recusals None

City Staff

DSD Kelley Stanco; Myra Herrmann

City Attorney None

Misc None

Guests

Item 4 Rashik Patel, T2 Development (Owner); Stephen Jones, Jones Ballard Architecture

Other None

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF December 6, 2012

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER PATTERSON TO APPROVE MINUTES AS SUBMITTED.

Seconded by Boardmember Gallardo

VOTE: 4-0-0

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

ISSUES WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE OLD TOWN SAN DIEGO DESIGN REVIEW BOARD NOT PREVIOUSLY HEARD. REQUEST TO SPEAK SHOULD BE SUBMITTED TO THE SECRETARY AT THE TIME OF THE MEETING.

NOTE: THREE (3) MINUTES OF TIME PER SPEAKER

- None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS**A. Board Administrative Matters and General Information**

- The new Mayor has placed an emphasis on volunteerism in the City. A new Director of Boards and Commissions has been appointed, and has been very busy filling vacancies on various Boards and Commissions. Staff will be working with the Mayor's office to fill the current vacancies and ensure that all required qualifications are satisfied. If Boardmembers have any suggestions for appointments, please let staff know.

B. Subcommittee Reports

- None

C. Conflict of Interest Declarations

- None

D. Staff Report

- None

E. Requests for Continuance

- None

ACTION ITEMS**ITEM 4 – HILTON GARDEN INN**

PTS #: 303795

Applicant: Rashik Patel, T2 Development (Owner); and Stephen Jones, Jones Ballard Arch

Location: 4200 Taylor Street, Old Town Planned District, Council District 2.

Description: The application currently in review is a Site Development Permit to demolish the existing hotel buildings and construct a new 4-story hotel on site.

Today's Action: Review the application and project design and provide preliminary input on the project's consistency with the Old San Diego Architectural and Site Development Standards and Criteria. The project will return to the Board at a later date for a formal recommendation to the decision maker.

Staff Presentation: This application is for a new 4-story hotel on the site of the Padre Trail Inn. The applicant has completed the first round of review by the City, and Planning staff has confirmed that the project complies with the Planned District Ordinance. Staff and the applicant are seeking early input from the Board on the project's compliance with the Old San Diego Architectural and Site Development Standards and Criteria (in particular the proposal for 4 stories) so that the Board's input can be incorporated into the project design going forward. The project will return the Board as needed for additional review, including a final review and formal recommendation to the decision maker once the project is ready to proceed to hearing.

Applicant Presentation: Prior to developing the project and submitting the current application, the applicant completed their due diligence work, including completion of historic resource review, a fault investigation, and soils investigation to determine the potential for liquefaction at the site. The project is located on the Padre Trail Inn site, which is surrounded by the new Caltrans building to the west, the I-8 freeway to the north, Morena Boulevard to east, and 2-story commercial developments across the street

to the south. The proposed building is 4 stories and 40 feet in height, and is sited within the maximum footprint for the setbacks, which include two front setbacks and one street side yard setback. The Rosecrans sub-district allows the proposed height and density. The project, which proposes surface and underground parking, is parked at 1 space per room in accordance with Old Town requirements.

The subject parcel is one of the last sites in Old Town where a hotel like this could be developed, and they want to be part of the community. The renderings show what they would like to do along Morena Boulevard, which is to incorporate more trees and gateway signage. However, the land is outside the project site and is controlled by CalTrans, which may not allow any improvements in this area. Along Sunset Street, the applicant is looking to reduce the width of the oversized street and incorporate an extra-wide sidewalk with a double row of trees to encourage connection back to the under-utilized CalTrans parking. This will be a separate process, and will not result in loss of any on-street parking. Along Taylor Street, the project proposes a plaza with an interpretive/public education component. Proposed landscaping is somewhat riparian in character and is intended to tie into the San Diego River setting/context.

In regard to the building design, it is intended to reflect development in the northern end of Old Town, which tends to be more Spanish in character. The building is articulated forward and back with use of balconies and varying roof planes. Architectural features include pitched red tile roofs; flat roofs with parapets; use of both exposed rafters and clipped eaves with a raised stucco cornice to create interest and variety; stucco; windows recessed into thick walls; balconies; a portico natural stones; limited use of polished materials (primarily tiled floors); wood accents (including trellises); and metals such as bronze and wrought iron. No tinted or reflective glass will be used. In regard to color, the applicant would like to use a darker, richer color than the standard San Diego cream stucco.

Public Comment: None

Q&A:

Boardmember Issue or Question	Applicant's Response
What is the slope of the pitched roof?	4.5:12
STAFF: What are the proposed window and door materials?	Wood multi-lite windows on the ground floor, and an alternative material on the upper floors.
STAFF: Are you working with any group in particular on the programming of the educational/interpretive component of the site?	It is just an idea at this point. Would like to get input from the Community, as well as local Tribes.

Boardmember Discussion and Comment:

Boardmember	Comments
Ambers	Would like to see a better identification/gateway sign. The gateway signage at the south end of Old Town near

Boardmember	Comments
	the Arco station is constructed of adobe and was designed by the community. Utilizing those materials would tie into existing signage created by the community. Likes the way the building is lit in the renderings. Has no issue with the proposed height, the Hacienda Hotel in Old Town is 5 stories tall on one side.
Gallardo	The project is very respectfully done. Would like to see more renderings from inside the site.
McGuire	The entryways should define the entry to the community of Old Town, not Old Town State Park, which has its own identity. Loves the portico element. The signage seems weak in comparison to the building itself. Old Town is trying to establish a visual identity through signage, and that should be reflected at the project site. Has some concerns regarding the height of the project; but understands that with the stepped massing it will be perceived differently in perspective. Additionally, the height will help to block the freeway. Wants to make sure it complies with the Community Plan, which appears to limit height to 30 feet. Believes that the argument can be made to defend the height of the structure and number of stories, but that argument needs to be presented. The building still has a lot of flat stucco wall space. Looking at historic buildings in Old Town, one unifying factor is the use of cobble at the foundation. This could be incorporate. Overall, believes it is a positive change for the site and Old Town.
Patterson	The site is not currently inviting. Once it is activated by an attractive design, it will draw more people. Has no issue with the use of 4 stories, especially within the surrounding context, which includes the new CalTrans building to the west and two story buildings to the south. The impact of the height is reduced because the building steps down to the street. In regard to colors, he prefers the darker, richer color shown in the rendering, but use of lighter colors traditionally used in Old Town won't hurt the project. The corner and plaza are nice features, and the applicant may want to remove some of the trees at the corner to open the plaza to the street. Concurs with Chair Ambers and Boardmember McGuire regarding signage, which should tie into existing gateway signage in Old Town. Thinks that the development is appropriate for the site, and is a good anchor for the north end of Old Town.

Staff Comment:

Staff Member	Comments
Herrmann	The applicant could incorporate any artifacts recovered during archaeological testing/monitoring into the proposed educational display. Any cobble recovered during grading could also be incorporated into the project.

Motion:

NO ACTION WAS TAKEN ON THE ITEM. THE APPLICANT WILL REVIEW THE BOARD'S COMMENTS AND INCORPORATE THEM INTO THE PROJECT DESIGN.

Adjourned at 10:30 AM

The next regularly-scheduled Old Town Design Review Board Meeting will be on Thursday, May 16, 2013 at 9:00 AM.

For more information, please contact Kelley Stanco at KStanco@sandiego.gov or 619.236.6545