

CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD

MINUTES OF REGULAR SCHEDULED MEETING OF

APRIL 28, 2005

COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM - 12TH FLOOR
CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Schwartz at 1:02 PM. Chairperson Schwartz adjourned the meeting at 3:37 PM.

ATTENDANCE DURING THE MEETING

Chairperson	Lloyd Schwartz	Present
Vice-Chairperson	Laura Burnett	Present
Boardmember	James Ahern	Absent
Boardmember	Alexander Chuang	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present
Boardmember	Homer Delawie	Absent
Boardmember	Otto Emme	Present
Boardmember	Edward Lynch	Present
Boardmember	Larry Malone	Absent
Boardmember	David Marshall	Present
Boardmember	Delores McNeely	Present
Boardmember	Timothy Murphy	Present
Boardmember	Jerry Schaefer	Present
Boardmember	Marsha Sewell	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present

Staff to the Board in attendance: Mike Tudury, Senior Planner/Architect
Diane Kane, Senior Planner/Historian
Nicole Purvis, Associate Planner
Barbara Hubbard, Board Secretary
Noah Stewart, Staff
Karen Heumann, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF MARCH 24, 2005

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SCHAEFER TO APPROVE THE MINUTES AS PRESENTED.

Seconded by Boardmember McNeely. Vote: 11-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

ISSUES WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD NOT PREVIOUSLY HEARD AND NOT ON THE AGENDA.

None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. Board Administrative Matters and General Information

Notification of Absences

- Boardmembers Ahern and Delawie notified staff that they would be absent today.

General Information

- 30th Annual CPF Preservation (California Preservation Foundation) Conference: The conference is less than a month off. This year, the conference will be held from May 12 (Thursday) through May 15 (Sunday) at the Historic Mission Inn in Riverside. Registration for the conference is available online at www.californiapreservation.org Room reservations are also available online through April 10 at www.missioninn.com
- National Register Nomination for the Salk Institute for Biological Studies: The State Historical Resources Commission will be considering this nomination on May 12, 2005 at its regularly-scheduled meeting beginning at 9:00 a.m. at the Riverside City Council Chambers at 3900 Main Street in Riverside. The issue regarding the boundary for this nomination has already been responded to by staff on behalf of the Board based on their action and the attendant resolution. The proposed project is anticipated to be brought before the Board later this year.

B. Subcommittee Reports

- The Design Assistance Subcommittee met on April 6, 2005, and considered five projects. They were: Disabled access at NTC Building 35; the Maryland Hotel;

the A-1 Globe Flour Mill (the Parron Furniture warehouse); the Ancira residence; and 21 16th Street. The next meeting will be on Wednesday, May 4, 2005 at 3 PM.

- The Policy Subcommittee met on April 11, 2005, and considered two items, proposed changes to the HRB policy regarding Thematic Districts, and the results of the survey concerning HRB Criterion A, which included a brief discussion of this criterion. The next meeting will be on Monday, May 9, 2005 at 3 PM.
- The Archaeology Subcommittee also met on April 11, 2005, and jointly considered HRB Criterion A with the Policy Subcommittee. The next meeting will be on Monday, May 9, 2005 at 4 PM.

C. Conflict of Interest Declarations

Conflicts of interest

- Item 5 – Boardmembers Lynch and Marshall

Ex parte communications

- Item 6 – Boardmember Silvas

Failure to visit sites for designation

- None

D. Staff Report

- HRB Retreat: Kudos to all who participated. Special thanks to Diane Kane.
- Proposed Changes to the Historic Preservation Act: Please see the excerpt from the AIA newsletter that is included in your blue folder. There are substantial changes proposed by the current administration that are not beneficial to historic preservation. I recommend that you review this summary and, if you feel it is appropriate, contact your congressman and/or the applicable member of the National Parks subcommittee, as listed on the excerpt.
- Kunzel Residence: Great News! Boardmembers may recall that the Board designated the Kunzel Residence, a Modernist design in Point Loma by architect Robert Moser, on November 21, 2003, under HRB Criteria A, B, C and D against the desires of the then-owner. The designation was overturned at Council on February 10, 2004. Interestingly, the property has changed ownership and the new owner wishes historic designation. Deputy City Attorney, Karen Heumann, verified that this was legally possible and the property will be brought back to the Board in June for consideration of designation.

- Elliot Residence: A remodel of the Elliot Residence at 426 Marine Street in La Jolla was considered by the Design Assistance Subcommittee on January 5, 2005. The architect, David Singer, made the changes suggested by the subcommittee. On April 13, 2003, a Hearing Officer, on behalf of the City Manager, approved the project as submitted.
- Paseo de Mission Hills: On April 19, 2005, the City Council considered the proposed mixed-use project on Washington Street in Mission Hills that included two potentially historic resources. The project had previously been considered on two occasions by the Design Assistance Subcommittee. Although the project was initially thought to be voted down, a councilmember noted that he had voted incorrectly. The council then voted to reconsider, which passed. Since most of the audience for this item had left (It was 11:30), the mayor indicated that he felt uncomfortable re-voting on the project at that meeting. The item was then continued until the July 19, 2005 council meeting.
- 306 Sea Lane: On behalf of the Board, staff reviewed a proposal for a minor remodel to 306 Sea Lane in La Jolla. The structure is potentially historic, and staff reviewed the proposal and found it to be consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
- Presidio Park Plaque: Staff is working with Mr. Phillip Hinshaw who wishes to place a historic plaque in Presidio Park, on behalf of the Sons of the American Revolution. Staff will review the wording of the plaque for correctness and provide a copy of this information to the Board at a future meeting.
- Voluntary Designation Requests: Boardmembers will note that staff has scheduled three designation requests from the public on today's agenda. Staff has received 2 new designation requests from members of the public since the last HRB meeting, bringing the total number of voluntary designation requests that have not yet been agendized and are waiting to be reviewed by staff for processing to 35. It is likely that 3 items will be scheduled for the next meeting, leaving 32 requests on the list.

E. Requests for Continuances

ITEM 5 - 701 Island, 420-428 and 452 Eighth Avenue, and 704 J Street Buildings

CONTINUE ITEM 5, 701 ISLAND, 420-428 EIGHTH AVENUE, 452 EIGHTH AVENUE AND 704 J STREET BUILDINGS TO MAY 26, 2005 AT OWNER'S REQUEST. (Please refer to the letter from the Simplon Corporation, dated April 27, 2005 regarding this request for a continuance).

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SILVAS TO CONTINUE THE ITEM TO MAY 26, 2005, MEETING PER OWNERS REQUEST.

Seconded by Boardmember Schaefer. Vote: 9-0-2(Lynch, Marshall). Motion passes.

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON THE CONSENT AGENDA.

- **ITEM 7 – GERTRUDE EVANS/EMMOR BROOKE WEAVER HOUSE**
- **ITEM 8 – FRANK E. MELCHER SPEC HOUSE #1**
- **ITEM 9 – T. D. BILLER HOUSE**

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEMS ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Seconded by Boardmember Lynch. Vote: 11-0-0.

ACTION ITEMS**ITEM 5 –701 ISLAND, 420-428 EIGHTH AVENUE, 452 EIGHTH AVENUE AND 704 J STREET BUILDINGS**

Applicant: Scott Moomjian, on behalf of Simplon Ballpark LLC

Location: 701 Island Avenue, 420-428 and 452 Eighth Avenue and 704 J Street, East Village, Centre City Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider designation of 701 Island, 420-428 Eighth Avenue, 452 Eighth Avenue and 704 J Street as Historical Resource Sites.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or "Note and File."

Staff Recommendation: **1)** Consider designation of 701 Island and 704 J Street under HRB Criteria A (Cultural Landscape) and C (Architecture). **2)** To "Note and File" 420-428 Eighth Avenue and 452 Eighth Avenue, due to a loss of integrity.

Report Number: HRB-05-010

Testimony Received:

In Support by:

David Swarens and Bruce Coons submitted speaker forms, but did not speak.

In Opposition by:

No speaker slips submitted.

Public Testimony was closed.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SILVAS TO APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO CONTINUE TO THE MAY 26, 2005, HRB MEETING.

Seconded by Boardmember Schaefer. Vote: 9-0-2 (Lynch, Marshall). Motion passes.

ITEM 6 – CONSIDERATION OF HISTORICAL DESIGNATION OF TWO PROPERTIES IN EAST VILLAGE COMBINED HISTORICAL SURVEYS 2005 - REVERE ROOMING HOUSE AND THE GLENN FURNISHED ROOMS (CONTINUED FROM MARCH 24, 2005)

Applicant: Beverly Schroeder, Centre City Development Corporation (CCDC)

Location: 701-729 Eighth Street and 835 G Street, East Village, Centre City Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the Revere Rooming House and The Glenn Furnished Rooms as a Historical Resource Site.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or "Note and File."

Staff Recommendation: Is to "Note and File."

Report Number: HRB-05-011

Testimony Received:

In Support by:

Steven Scarvelis.

In Opposition by:

No speaker slips submitted.

Public Testimony was closed.

ITEM 6A – 701-729 EIGHTH AVENUE

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER EMME TO APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO NOTE AND FILE.

Seconded by Boardmember McNeely. Vote: 7 (Chuang, Emme, Lynch, Marshall, McNeely, Schaefer, Schwartz) – 4 (Burnett, Curry, Sewell, Silvas) - 0. Motion passes.

ITEM 7 – GERTRUDE EVANS/EMMOR BROOKE WEAVER HOUSE

Applicant: Beth Montes, on behalf of Robertson and Katherine Jones, owners

Location: 1506 Plumosa Way, Mission Hills, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the Gertrude Evans/Emmor Brooke Weaver House as a Historical Resource Site.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or "Note and File."

Staff Recommendation: Designate under HRB CRITERIA B (Historical Person), C (Architecture) and D (Master Architect).

Report Number: HRB-05-012

Testimony Received:

In Support by:

Beth Montes filled out a speaker form, but did not speak.

In Opposition by:

No speaker slips submitted.

Public Testimony was closed.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERIA B (HISTORICAL PERSON) AND C (ARCHITECTURE) AND D (MASTER ARCHITECT).

Seconded by Boardmember Lynch. Vote: 11-0-0. Motion passes. **HRB Site #705**

ITEM 8 – FRANK E. MELCHER SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Beth Montes, on behalf of Nancy and Daniel Diehr, owners

Location: 1768 West Arbor Drive, Mission Hills, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the Frank E. Melcher Spec House #1 as a Historical Resource Site.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or "Note and File."

Staff Recommendation: Designate under HRB CRITERION C (Architecture).

Report Number: HRB-05-013

Testimony Received:

In Support by:

Beth Montes filled out a speaker form, but did not speak.

In Opposition by:

No speaker slips submitted.

Public Testimony was closed.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERION C (ARCHITECTURE).

Seconded by Boardmember Lynch. Vote: 11-0-0. Motion passes. **HRB Site #706**

ITEM 9 – T. D. BILLER HOUSE

Applicant: Beth Montes, on behalf of James and Michel Joyce, owners

Location: 4119 Lymer Street, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the T. D. Biller House as a Historical Resource Site.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or "Note and File."

Staff Recommendation: Designate under HRB CRITERIA C (Architecture).

Report Number: HRB-05-014

Testimony Received:

In Support by:

Beth Montes and Michele Joyce filled out speaker forms, but did not speak.

In Opposition by:

No speaker slips submitted.

Public Testimony was closed.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERION C (ARCHITECTURE).

Seconded by Boardmember Lynch. Vote: 11-0-0. Motion passes. **HRB Site #707**

ITEM 10 – F. M. SHEPPARD DUPLEX AND HOUSE RENTALS

Applicant: City of San Diego

Location: 1049-1051 Coast Boulevard and 1046 Coast Boulevard South, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

Description: Consider the designation of the F. M. Sheppard Duplex and House Rentals as a Historical Resource Site.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or "Note and File."

Staff Recommendation: Designate under HRB CRITERIA A (Cultural Landscape).

Report Number: HRB-05-015

Testimony Received:

In Support by:

No speaker slips submitted.

In Opposition by:

Scott Moomjian, Marie Lia, Dominick DeJoy, James Alcorn and Michael Pallamary,

Public Testimony was closed.

BOARD COMMENT: Board members asked staff and the applicant questions regarding the degree to which the original structures were intact and confirmed when the wood shingle façade was installed (1931). The majority of the members felt that the structures were primarily intact and that the structures were significant examples of Craftsman style vernacular beach cottage architecture.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO APPROVE DESIGNATION UNDER HRB CRITERIA A (CULTURAL LANDSCAPE) AND C (ARCHITECTURE).

Seconded by Boardmember Lynch. Vote: 9-2 (Emme, McNeely) Motion passes.
HRB Site #708

NOTE: All Historical Resources Board meetings are tape recorded and kept on file with the City of San Diego Planning Department. Upon request, copies of the tapes can be obtained by contacting Board Secretary Barbara Hubbard at (619) 533-6307.

ADJOURNMENT

Chairperson Schwartz adjourned the meeting at 3:37 P.M.

NEXT MEETING DATE: May 26, 2005

ONE TIME CHANGE IN LOCATION:
WELLS FARGO BUILDING
401 B STREET, SUITE 400
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101