

CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD

MINUTES OF REGULAR SCHEDULED MEETING OF

MAY 26, 2005

COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM - 12TH FLOOR
CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Schwartz at 1:03 PM. Chairperson Schwartz adjourned the meeting at 5:39 PM.

SWEARING IN OF NEW AND RE-APPOINTED BOARD MEMBERS

Liz Maland, City Clerk Deputy Director, administered the oath to new members Don Harrison and Donna Jones and re-appointed members Laura Burnett, Edward Lynch, Delores McNeely, Dr. Jerry Schaefer, Chair Lloyd A. Schwartz and Abel Silvas.

ATTENDANCE DURING THE MEETING

Chairperson	Lloyd Schwartz	Present
Vice-Chairperson	Laura Burnett	Present
Boardmember	Alexander Chuang	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present (departed @ 4:52 pm)
Boardmember	Homer Delawie	Present
Boardmember	Otto Emme	Present
Boardmember	Don Harrison	Present
Boardmember	Donna Jones	Present
Boardmember	Edward Lynch	Present
Boardmember	David Marshall	Present
Boardmember	Delores McNeely	Present
Boardmember	Timothy Murphy	Present
Boardmember	Jerry Schaefer	Present
Boardmember	Marsha Sewell	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present

Staff to the Board in attendance: Mike Tudury, Senior Planner/Architect
Nicole Purvis, Associate Planner
Barbara Hubbard, Board Secretary
Noah Stewart, Staff
Karen Heumann, Deputy City Attorney

SPECIAL ORDER OF BUSINESS

The City of San Diego Historical Resources Board presented its annual Awards of Excellence for Historic Preservation.

The Historical Resources Board annually gives special recognition to the people and projects that most significantly reflect the best of the year in historic preservation. Chair Schwartz and Vice Chair Burnett presented awards in three categories to the following individuals:

GORDON HATTERSLEY III in category of **Rehabilitation** for his excellent rehabilitation of the 1887 Britt Scripps House, HRB Site #52.

CHRIS LAFORNARA in the category of **Rehabilitation** for his excellent rehabilitation of the 1869 Bay View Hotel, a National Register-Eligible property, now called the Palms Hotel.

SENATOR JIM MILLS in category of **Individual Accomplishment** for his superb contribution to the cause of historic preservation, the Mills Act property tax reduction benefit, a critical and meaningful incentive for historically designated properties.

VICTOR NUNEZ, Code Inspector for the Neighborhood Code Compliance Department, City of San Diego, in the category of **Public Agency**, for his vigilant work in the Sherman Heights Historic District.

JAMES AHERN, Historic Resources Boardmember Emeritus, in the category of **Individual Accomplishment**, for his passionate and often humorous support of historic preservation in the City of San Diego.

LARRY MALONE, Historic Resources Boardmember Emeritus, in the category of **Individual Accomplishment**, for his support of historic preservation in the City of San Diego.

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF APRIL 28, 2005**BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO APPROVE THE MINUTES AS PRESENTED.

Seconded by Boardmember McNeely. Vote: 11-0-4 (Delawie, Harrison, Jones, Murphy). Motion passes.

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

ISSUES WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD NOT PREVIOUSLY HEARD AND NOT ON THE AGENDA.

- Otto Emme spoke regarding several issues including troops returning from Iraq.
- Katherine Rhodes spoke regarding her ongoing volunteer work to prepare survey data for a future La Playa Historic District in the Point Loma area of the city.
- Ron May requested that the “Turquoise House” be placed on next month’s HRB agenda for reconsideration of designation. Mr. May said that he would submit information to staff for their review in order to determine if there is new information that might justify this reconsideration. If so, staff will do so.
- Kurt Drake of Heritage Architecture gave an informational PowerPoint presentation regarding “Balboa Park Ornamentation – Repair of Three Buildings.” These three buildings are the Museum of Man, the Museum of Art and the Casa del Prado.

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS**A. Board Administrative Matters and General Information**

Notification of Absences

- None

General Information

- None

B. Subcommittee Reports

- The Design Assistance Subcommittee met on May 4, 2005, and considered four proposed projects: The Ancira residence remodel in Mission Hills, several issues related to the reconstruction of the Egyptian Theatre on Park Blvd., the Wonder Bread Building project in Centre City, and NTC Building 210 - the Fitness Center. The next meeting will be on Wednesday, June 1, 2005, at 3 PM.
- The Policy Subcommittee met on May 9, 2005, and considered the selection of this year’s historic preservation awards, proposed changes to the HRB policy regarding Thematic Historic Districts, to be applied citywide, and staff procedures for review of Ranch-style houses and Ranch-style residential and mixed-use historic districts. These issues, with the exception of the preservation awards, will return to the

subcommittee for further discussion at a later date. The next meeting will be on Monday, June 13, 2005, at 3 PM.

- The Archaeology Subcommittee, scheduled for May 9, 2005, did not meet as there were no archeological issues to be considered. The next scheduled meeting is Monday, June 13, 2005, at 4 PM.

C. Conflict of Interest Declarations

Conflicts of interest

- Items 5 and 12, Boardmembers Lynch and Marshall
- Item 11, Boardmember Marsha Sewell

Ex parte communications

- None

Failure to visit sites for designation

- Item 6 – Boardmember Homer Delawie indicated that he was unable to visit the site. (During the board discussion of this item, he recalled that he did view it, and subsequently was able to vote.)
- Item 10 – Boardmember Jones

D. Staff Report

- Relevant to Item 6, Staff pointed out that, although allowed by the City's State Historic Building Code, the potential to use fire-treated wood shingles was precedent-setting.
- Regarding Item 11, the Kunzel/Moser House, there is a new owner/applicant that is in favor of designation. In addition, there is a new proposed criterion for designation: HRB CRITERION E (Eligible for the State or National Register).
- Regarding the Andrew Jackson Chase site (the house was demolished by fire approximately a decade ago), staff has been working with the applicant. Although originally proposed by the applicant to be demolished, the outbuilding structure that remains will be preserved. Also, staff is mandating additional articulation of the proposed street-facing new structure.
- The proposed National Register nomination of the Salk Institute for Biological Studies has been temporarily taken off the SHPO calendar for future consideration.

- HRB staff Diane Kane and Noah Stewart attended the California Preservation Association Annual Conference in Riverside. Diane prepared a summary of the conference. That information is in the blue folders.
- Regarding the Clews Horse Ranch, staff reviewed an Initial Study and found that the proposed work was consistent with the direction given by the Design Assistance Subcommittee at their November 6, 2002 meeting.
- Lastly, Boardmembers will note that staff has scheduled four voluntary designation requests from the public on today's agenda. Staff has not received any new designation requests from members of the public since the last HRB meeting, bringing the total number of designation requests that have not yet been agendized and are waiting to be reviewed by staff for processing to 34. Staff anticipates that four or five voluntary designation requests will be scheduled for the next meeting.

E. Requests for Continuances

- None

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON THE CONSENT AGENDA.

- **ITEM 7 – CARL H. HEILBRON/NATHAN RIGDON HOUSE**
- **ITEM 8 – MARY STOCKWELL HOUSE**

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEMS ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Seconded by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 15-0-0. Motion passes.

- **ITEM 10 – DAVID A. AND EMMA LOEBENSTEIN HOUSE**

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Seconded by Boardmember Lynch. Vote: 14-0-1 (Jones). Motion passes.

- **ITEM 11 – HERBERT KUNZEL/ROBERT MOSHER HOUSE**

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Seconded by Boardmember Harrison. Vote: 14-0-1 (Sewell).

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – SNOWFLAKE BAKERY

Applicant: Scott A. Moomjian, on behalf of James S. Brown, owner

Location: 701 16th Street, Centre City Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the Snowflake Bakery as a Historical Resource Site.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or “Note and File.”

Staff Recommendation: Designate under HRB CRITERIA A (Cultural Landscape) and D (Master Architect).

Report Number: HRB-05-016

Testimony Received:

In Support by:

Scott Moomjian, representing Avion Development.

In Opposition by:

No speaker slips submitted.

Public Testimony was closed.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERIA A (CULTURAL LANDSCAPE) AND D (MASTER ARCHITECT).

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas. Vote: 13-0-2 (Lynch, Marshall). Motion passes.
HRB Site #709.

ITEM 6 – LOWRY MCCLANAHAN/THOMAS SHEPHERD HOUSE

Applicant: City of San Diego

Location: 7716 Lookout Drive, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

Description: Consider the designation of the Lowry McClanahan/Thomas Shepherd House as a Historical Resource Site.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or “Note and File.”

Staff Recommendation: Designate under HRB CRITERIA C (Architecture) and D (Master Architect).

Report Number: HRB-05-017

Testimony Received:

In Support by:

Scott Moomjian, representing the owner.

In Opposition by:

No speaker slips submitted.

Public Testimony was closed.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERIA C (ARCHITECTURE) AND D (MASTER ARCHITECT).

Seconded by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 15-0-0. Motion passes. **HRB Site #710**

ITEM 7 – CARL H. HEILBRON/NATHAN RIGDON HOUSE

Applicant: Beth Montes, on behalf of David and Katherine Slayton, owners

Location: 1752 West Lewis Street, Mission Hills, Uptown Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the Carl H. Heilbron/Nathan Rigdon House as a Historical Resource Site.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or “Note and File.”

Staff Recommendation: Designate under HRB CRITERIA B (Historical Person), C (Architecture) and D (Master Architect).

Report Number: HRB-05-018

Testimony Received:

In Support by:

Beth Montes, she did not speak.

In Opposition by:

No speaker slips submitted.

Public Testimony was closed.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERIA B (HISTORICAL PERSON), C (ARCHITECTURE) AND D (MASTER ARCHITECT).

Seconded by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 15-0-0. Motion passes. **HRB Site #711**

ITEM 8 – MARY STOCKWELL HOUSE

Applicant: Ron V. May, RPA, on behalf of Valorie Seyfert, owner

Location: 1835 Fort Stockton Drive, Mission Hills, Uptown Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the Mary Stockwell House as a Historical Resource Site.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or “Note and File.”

Staff Recommendation: Designate under HRB CRITERION C (Architecture).

Report Number: HRB-05-021

Testimony Received:

In Support by:

Ron V. May, RPA, did not speak.

In Opposition by:

No speaker slips submitted.

Public Testimony was closed

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERION C (ARCHITECTURE).

Seconded by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 15-0-0. Motion passes. **HRB Site #712**

ITEM 9 – THE ADAMS APARTMENTS

Applicant: Linda Canada and Beth Montes, on behalf of William M. Nelson, Owner

Location: 2448 Adams Avenue, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of The Adams Apartments as a Historical Resource Site.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or "Note and File."
Staff Recommendation: Designate under HRB CRITERIA C (Architecture) and D (Master Builder).

Report Number: HRB-05-020

Testimony Received:

In Support by:

Linda Canada. Bill Nelson did not speak.

In Opposition by:

No speaker slips submitted.

Public Testimony was closed.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERION C (ARCHITECTURE).

Seconded by Boardmember Marshall. NO VOTE WAS TAKEN.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO DECIDE ON ACCEPTING A SUBSTITUTE MOTION BEFORE THE STANDING MOTION OF DESIGNATION UNDER HRB CRITERION C (ARCHITECTURE) IS VOTED ON.

Seconded by Boardmember Lynch. Vote: 13-0-2 (Emme, Harrison) Motion passes.

BOARD ACTION:

SUBSTITUTE MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERIA C (ARCHITECTURE) AND D (MASTER ARCHITECT).

Seconded by Boardmember Lynch. Vote: 13-0-2 (Emme, Harrison). Motion passes.
HRB Site #713

ITEM 10 – DAVID A. AND EMMA LOEBENSTEIN HOUSE

Applicant: Beth Montes, on behalf of Michael Donohue and Stephen Hill, owners
Location: 1087 Myrtle Way, Marston Hills, Uptown Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the David A. and Emma Loebenstein House as a Historical Resource Site.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or "Note and File."

Staff Recommendation: Designate under HRB CRITERIA C (Architecture).

Report Number: HRB-05-019

Testimony Received:

In Support by:

Beth Montes and Stephen Hill, they did not speak.

In Opposition by:

No speaker slips submitted.

Public Testimony was closed.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERION C (ARCHITECTURE).

Seconded by Boardmember Lynch Vote: 14-0-1 (Jones). Motion passes.

HRB Site #714

ITEM 11 – HERBERT KUNZEL/ROBERT MOSHER HOUSE

Applicant: Marie Lia, on behalf of Dr. Carolyn Kutzke, owner

Location: 3250 McCall Street, Peninsula Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the Herbert Kunzel/Robert Mosher House as a Historical Resource Site.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or "Note and File."

Staff Recommendation: Designate under HRB CRITERIA A (Cultural Landscape), B (Historical Person), C (Architecture), D (Master Architect) and E (Eligible for listing on State or National Register)

Report Number: HRB-05-022

Testimony Received:

In Support by:

Marie Lia and Kathryn Rhodes.

In Opposition by:

No speaker slips submitted.

Public Testimony was closed.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERIA A (CULTURAL LANDSCAPE), B (HISTORICAL PERSON), C (ARCHITECTURE), D (MASTER ARCHITECT) AND E (IS LISTED ON THE STATE REGISTER).

Seconded by Boardmember Harrison. Vote: 14-0-1 (Sewell). **HRB Site #715**

ITEM 12 –701 ISLAND, 420-428 EIGHTH AVENUE, 452 EIGHTH AVENUE AND 704 J STREET BUILDINGS (CONTINUED FROM APRIL 28, 2005)

Applicant: Scott Moomjian, on behalf of Simplon Ballpark LLC, owners

Location: 701 Island Avenue, 420-428 and 452 Eighth Avenue and 704 J Street, East Village, Centre City Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider designation of 701 Island, 420-428 Eighth Avenue, 452 Eighth Avenue and 704 J Street as Historical Resource Sites.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or "Note and File."

Staff Recommendation: **1)** Consider designation of 701 Island and 704 J Street under HRB Criteria A (Cultural Landscape) and C (Architecture). **2)** To "Note and File" 420-428 Eighth Avenue and 452 Eighth Avenue, due to a loss of integrity.

Report Number: HRB-05-010

Testimony Received:

In Support by:

Bruce Coons, Scott Moomjian and Beverly Schroeder.

In Opposition by:

David Swarens. Scott Moomjian, opposes 704 J Street only, out of the four addresses.

Public Testimony was closed.

ITEM 12-A – 701 ISLAND AVENUE

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER JONES TO APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERION A (CULTURAL LANDSCAPE) AND C (ARCHITECTURE).

Seconded by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: **12-0-2**(Lynch, Marshall). [*Boardmember Curry departed @ 4:52 pm*]. Motion passes. **HRB Site #716**

ITEM 12-B – 704 J STREET

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERIA A (CULTURAL LANDSCAPE).

Seconded by Boardmember Burnett. Vote: **8-**(Burnett, Chuang, Delawie, Emme, Harrison, Schaefer, Sewell, Silvas) **4-** (Jones, McNeely, Murphy, Schwartz) – **2**(Lynch, Marshall). [*Boardmember Curry departed @ 4:52 pm*]. Motion passes. **HRB Site #717**

ITEM 12-C - 420-428 EIGHTH AVENUE

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO NOTE AND FILE.

Seconded by Boardmember McNeely. Vote: 12-0-2 (Lynch, Marshall). [*Boardmember Curry departed @ 4:52 pm*]. Motion passes.

ITEM 12-D - 452 EIGHTH AVENUE

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO NOTE AND FILE.

Seconded by Boardmember Jones. Vote: 8 (Chuang, Delawie, Harrison, Jones, McNeely, Murphy, Schaefer, Schwartz) - 4 (Burnett, Emme, Sewell, Silvas) – 2 (Lynch, Marshall). [*Boardmember Curry departed @ 4:52 pm*]. Motion passes.

NOTE: All Historical Resources Board meetings are tape recorded and kept on file with the City of San Diego Planning Department. Upon request, copies of the tapes can be obtained by contacting Board Secretary Barbara Hubbard at (619) 533-6307.

ADJOURNMENT

Chairperson Schwartz adjourned the meeting at 5:39 P.M.

NEXT MEETING DATE: FRIDAY, June 17, 2005

LOCATION: City Administration Building, Council Committee Room - 12th Floor.