

CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD

MINUTES OF REGULAR SCHEDULED MEETING OF

JANUARY 26, 2006

COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM – 12TH FLOOR
CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Schwartz at 1:04 PM.

ATTENDANCE DURING THE MEETING

Chairperson	Lloyd Schwartz	Present
Vice-Chairperson	Laura Burnett	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present (left meeting at 2:50 PM)
Boardmember	Homer Delawie	Present
Boardmember	Otto Emme	Present
Boardmember	Don Harrison	Present
Boardmember	Donna Jones	Present
Boardmember	David Marshall	Present
Boardmember	Delores McNeely	Present
Boardmember	Timothy Murphy	Present
Boardmember	Jerry Schaefer	Present
Boardmember	Marsha Sewell	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Absent

Staff to the Board in attendance: Mike Tudury, Senior Planner/Architect
Diane Kane, Senior Planner/Historian
Cathy Winterrowd, Senior Planner
Noah Stewart, HRB Staff
Jacqueline Lindsay, Deputy City Attorney (arrived 1:37 PM)

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF NOVEMBER 17, 2005

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO APPROVE THE MINUTES WITH CORRECTIONS TO ITEM 3C BY DELETING BOARDMEMBER SEWELL AS HAVING A CONFLICT OF INTEREST AND CHANGING EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS FOR BOARDMEMBER SCHWARTZ FROM ITEM 5 TO ITEM 8..

Seconded by Boardmember Schaeffer. Vote: 9-0-3 (Jones, McNeely, Murphy). Motion passes.

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

- Councilmember Marshall recommended the movie “My Architect” to other Boardmembers, staff and the public.

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. Board Administrative Matters and General Information

Notification of Absences

- Boardmember Silvas notified staff that he may not be able to attend the meeting and Boardmember Curry notified staff that she would have to leave early.

General Information

- New Senior Planner Cathy Winterrowd was introduced. She will be taking Teri Delcamp’s position and leading the historical preservation program and staff at the city.
- Staff noted that Mills Act Agreements have a provision for the property owner to provide visibility of the designated resource from the public right of way. This provision will be addressed through individual Agreements. Mills Act Agreements for properties in redevelopment areas require approval of the redevelopment agency.

B. Subcommittee Reports

- The Design Assistance Subcommittee met on January 4, 2006 and considered a proposed remodel to the Cave Store in La Jolla and the NTC Sign Plan. For specifics please see Meeting Notes. Both issues, together with new items are returning to the DAS at the next meeting on Wednesday, February 1, at 3 PM.
- The Policy Subcommittee met on January 9, 2006, and considered the issues of Re-initiation of Non-Designation Actions, Mills Act rights and privileges, and appropriate

mitigation for impacts to properties designated under Criteria B only. A brief update regarding the Uptown Survey was provided. For specifics regarding these issues, please refer to the Meeting Notes. The next meeting will be on Monday, February 13, 2006, at 3 PM.

- The Archaeology Subcommittee met on January 9, 2006 and considered proposed revisions to the archaeology sections of the Historical Resources Guidelines, Land Development Manual. There will not be a meeting in February 2006.

C. Conflict of Interest Declarations

Conflicts of interest

- None

Ex parte communications

- Item 8 – Boardmembers Harrison and Schaefer

Failure to visit sites for designation

- Item 7 – Boardmember Emme

D. Staff Report

- The Historical Resources Board website is now available, it can be accessed on the internet at sandiego.gov/planning.
- Staff wanted to call attention to SOHO's Craftsman and Spanish Revival Weekend that will occur on March 10, 11, and 12. There will be a historic home tour of five houses in the La Playa and Loma Portal neighborhoods of Point Loma that includes two by noted architect Emmor Brooke Weaver. These private residences have not been open to the public since the California Rosarium Society Garden Tours of 1932. If you're interested in volunteering, SOHO encourages you to contact them via their website sohosandiego@aol.com or call SOHO at 619 297 9327.
- Boardmembers will note that staff has scheduled six designation requests from the public on today's agenda. Staff has received 11 new designation requests from members of the public since the last HRB meeting, bringing the total number of designation requests that have not yet been agendaized and are waiting to be reviewed by staff for processing to 47. It is likely that about 5-6 items will be scheduled for the next meeting, leaving 41 requests on the list.
- A brief update on historic preservation in New Orleans in the wake of hurricane Katrina and the flood that ravaged 80% of the city was presented. New Orleans has the largest number of National Register Historic Districts in the US (16 at last count). A large percentage of the historic resources in New Orleans were spared the flood if not

the hurricane winds due to the city's early development occurring on the high ground adjacent to the Mississippi river – now called the “sliver by the river”. For the areas flooded by 37 billion gallons of water, only the older raised foundation and raised living area houses that were built to anticipate flooding, fared well. It was noted that, with the many still-unoccupied neighborhoods in the wake of Katrina an undesirable trend is occurring - stripping many of the houses of their architectural detail – porch brackets, columns, etc. unfortunately, placards encouraging stripping by stating purchase of these artifacts were posted on telephone poles and elsewhere. Donations can be sent to the New Orleans Preservation Resource Center, a long-time historic preservation institution in the city that is working with the National Trust, in order to provide help to those affected.

E. Requests for Continuances

- None.

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

- **ITEM 6 – EDGAR ULLRICH HOUSE**
- **ITEM 7 – GLEN AND AGNES MOSHER HOUSE**
- **ITEM 10 – ANNUAL CERTIFIED LOCAL GOVERNMENT (CLG) REPORT**

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER JONES TO PLACE ITEMS 6 AND 10 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Seconded by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 12-0-0. Motion passes.

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO PLACE ITEM 7 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Seconded by Boardmember McNeely. Vote: 11-0-1 (Emme). Motion passes.

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – DANIEL MCCONNELL/HERBERT BATHRICK HOUSE (CONTINUED FROM NOVEMBER 17, 2005)

Applicant: Scott A. Moomjian, Esq., on behalf of Troy Zander, owner

Location: 4380 Hilldale Road, Kensington/Talmadge Community, Council District 3

Description: The subject one and two-story residential structure was constructed in 1927 in the Spanish Eclectic style and exemplifies and reflects special elements of the Kensington Heights Unit No. 2 neighborhood's historical and architectural development.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more of the established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate under HRB Criteria A and C.

Report Number: HRB-06-004

Staff report given by Michael Tudury.

Testimony Received:

In support: Scott Moomjian.

In opposition: None.

Public testimony was closed.

Board discussion of restrictive CC&Rs and past discriminatory practices in marketing of homes in this area; and a need to increase the visibility of the house at the public right of way as part of a Mills Act Agreement.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERIA A AND C.

Seconded by Boardmember McNeely. Vote: 10-2 (Harrison, Curry)-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 6 – EDGAR ULLRICH HOUSE

Applicant: City of San Diego

Location: 1745 Kearsarge Road, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

Description: The subject building, constructed in 1925, is an excellent example of the Tudor style as interpreted by Master Architect Edgar.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more of the established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB-06-001

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER JONES TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERION C.

Seconded by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 12-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 7 – GLEN AND AGNES MOSHER HOUSE

Applicant: Ruth Alter, Archaeos, on behalf of Jane Madruga, owner

Location: 3527 Dumas Street, Loma Portal, Peninsula Community, Council District 2

Description: The subject single-story house was built in 1926 and embodies the distinctive characteristics of Tudor Revival architecture. A more recent rear addition is setback from the side façade and is not apparent from the street.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more of the established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-06-002

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERION C.

Seconded by Boardmember McNeely. Vote: 11-0-1 (Emme). Motion passes.

ITEM 8 –ED FLETCHER SPEC HOUSE

Applicant: Ray Brandes, on behalf of Stanley Teliczan and Kimberly Cohagen, owners

Location: 3174 B Street, Golden Hill Community, Council District 8

Description: The subject property is a single-story over partial basement Craftsman style bungalow built by Colonel Ed Fletcher between 1910 and 1912 and is a unique example of local architecture developed during the early decades of the Twentieth Century. The house is currently undergoing restoration.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more of the established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-06-003

Staff report given by Noah Stewart.

Testimony Received:

In support: Scott Moomjian.

In opposition: None.

Public testimony was closed.

Board discussion of more recent alterations using concrete and stone, and whether the stucco exterior was original; use of a typical Craftsman color scheme was suggested for exterior paint.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERIA C.

Seconded by Boardmember Jones. Vote: 11-1 (Emme)-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 9 – BURLINGAME VOLUNTARY/TRADITIONAL HISTORICAL DISTRICT – UPDATE 5

Applicant: Katherine Roach (3015 Kalmia Street)

Jon and Marta Belanger (3175 Maple Street)

Patricia Lidot and Garrett Redelings (2508 San Marcos Avenue)

Brian Revelli (2614 San Marcos Avenue)

Randy and Corrie Karas (2661 San Marcos Avenue)

Location: (9A) 3015 Kalmia Street, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3

(9B) 3175 Maple Street, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3

(9C) 2508 San Marcos Avenue, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3

(9D) 2614 San Marcos Avenue, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3

(9E) 2661 San Marcos Avenue, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3

Description: These five houses were identified as potentially contributing properties within the Burlingame Voluntary/ Traditional Historical District. Each property was built within the period of significance (1912 to 1952), and the architectural styles represented are consistent with the eclectic nature of Burlingame's development.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more of the established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate all the specified buildings under HRB Criterion F.

Report Number: HRB-06-005

Staff report given by Noah Stewart.

Testimony Received:

In support: None.

In opposition: None.

Public testimony was closed.

Item 9B had Board discussion of recent alterations, particularly the stone and concrete chimney and the posts at the front porch. It was suggested that the property owner could work with the Design Subcommittee to reverse either or both of these alterations.

BOARD ACTION ITEM 9A

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERION F, AS CONTRIBUTING PROPERTIES WITHIN THE BURLINGAME VOLUNTARY TRADITIONAL HISTORICAL DISTRICT.

Seconded by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 11-0 -0. Motion passes.

BOARD ACTION ITEM 9B

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO NOT DESIGNATE THE PROPERTY UNDER ANY OF THE HRB CRITERIA.

Seconded by Boardmember Marshall. Vote: 11-0 -0. Motion passes and the property is not designated.

BOARD ACTION ITEM 9C

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERION F.

Seconded by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 11-0 -0. Motion passes.

BOARD ACTION ITEM 9D

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERION F.

Seconded by Boardmember Jones. Vote: 10-1 (Schaefer)-0.

BOARD ACTION ITEM 9E

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERION F..

Seconded by Boardmember Jones. Vote: 11-0 -0. Motion passes.

ITEM 10 – ANNUAL CERTIFIED LOCAL GOVERNMENT (CLG) REPORT

Applicant: City of San Diego

Location: Citywide

Description: The Historical Resources Board Annual Report to the State Office of Historic Preservation, consistent with the City's Certified Local Government (CLG) responsibilities, and Municipal Code Section 111.0206 (d)(7) requirements.

Today's Action: Review, comment and approve the Annual Report.

Staff Recommendation: Direct staff to revise the Annual Report, as appropriate, and forward to the State Office of Historic Preservation and the San Diego City Council.

Report Number: HRB-06-006

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER JONES TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION, WITH MINOR REVISIONS THAT BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL WILL PROVIDE, AND FORWARD TO THE STATE OFFICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION AND SAN DIEGO CITY COUNCIL.

Seconded by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 12-0-0. Motion passes.

ADJOURNMENT

Chairperson Schwartz adjourned the meeting at 4:05 PM.

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: February 23, 2006

LOCATION: City Administration Building
12th Floor, Council Committee Room

NOTE: All Historical Resources Board meetings are tape recorded and kept on file with the City of San Diego Planning Department. Upon request, copies of the tapes can be obtained by call the Department at 619-235-5200.