

CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD

MINUTES OF REGULAR SCHEDULED MEETING OF

April 27, 2006

COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM – 12TH FLOOR
CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Schwartz at 1:02 PM.

ATTENDANCE DURING THE MEETING

| | | |
|------------------|-----------------|-----------------------------------|
| Chairperson | Lloyd Schwartz | Present |
| Vice-Chairperson | Laura Burnett | Present |
| Boardmember | Maria Curry | Present |
| Boardmember | Homer Delawie | Present (left meeting at 3:15 PM) |
| Boardmember | Otto Emme | Present |
| Boardmember | Don Harrison | Present (arrived at 1:12 PM) |
| Boardmember | David Marshall | Present |
| Boardmember | Delores McNeely | Present |
| Boardmember | Jerry Schaefer | Present |
| Boardmember | Marsha Sewell | Present |
| Boardmember | Abel Silvas | Absent |

Staff to the Board in attendance: Mike Tudury, Senior Planner/Architect
Kelley Saunders, Associate Planner/Historian
Cathy Winterrowd, Senior Planner
Jacqueline Lindsay, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF FEBRUARY 23, 2006

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO APPROVE THE FEBRUARY 23, 2006 MINUTES WITH MODIFICATIONS TO THE BOARD ACTION REGARDING ITEM #5 – WAREHOUSE THEMATIC HISTORIC DISTRICT.

Seconded by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 7-0-2 (Emme, Delawie). Motion passes.

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

- Beth Montes representing herself spoke in support of Mills Act conditions for designation of historic properties.
- Katheryn Rhodes about research she is doing using the La Playa lot book.

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS**A. Board Administrative Matters and General Information**

Notification of Absences

- Boardmember Silvas notified staff that he would be out of town and would not be able to attend the meeting.

B. Subcommittee Reports

The Design Assistance Subcommittee met on April 5, 2006 and considered the renovation of Building 193 at the Naval Training Center, a code violation and rehabilitation of a building in the Golden Hill Historical District, alterations to a 1895 house in Pacific Beach that has not been designated, replacement of windows at the designated Carnation Building, a final look at the NTC sign plan, and new construction adjacent to the El Cortez Hotel. The next meeting will be on Wednesday, May 3, 2006 at 3 PM.

The Policy Subcommittee met on April 10, 2006 and considered the draft Historic Preservation Element of the General Plan Update and the issue of regulating alterations to interior elements of historical buildings. The next meeting will be on Monday, May 8, 2006 at 3 PM.

The Archaeology Subcommittee met on April 10, 2006 and considered archaeological resources and Native American consultation aspects of the draft Historic Preservation Element and the archaeological monitoring program associated with the Spindrifft Site. The next meeting will be on Monday, May 8, 2006 at 4 PM.

C. Conflict of Interest Declarations

Conflicts of interest

- Mr. Delawie declared a conflict of interest with Item #11 3035 Lawrence Street House

Ex parte communications

Ms. Sewell greeted the owners of Item #10 located at 4343 Adams Avenue

Failure to visit sites for designation

None.

D. Staff Report

Thanks to Mary Briner for helping out at today's meeting. We are still in the process of filling the Senior Clerk position. Kelley Saunders an Associate Planner has joined the Historical Resources Section of Planning. Kelley was an Intern working with the Board for several years, went to Development Services, and is now back with us. She has taken on several important projects and reviewed a number of voluntary designations for today's meeting. Yesterday Mayor Sanders announced the appointment of Bill Anderson to the position of Director of Planning and Community Investment. He will head a new department comprised of Planning, Redevelopment, and Economic Development under Jim Waring, the Deputy Chief of Land Use and Economic Development. Mr. Anderson has considerable experience in economic analysis and has been especially active in community and inner city markets and in developing regional planning strategies. You may remember him as a Planning Commissioner with the City for many years. We are looking forward to him joining us at the City in late May.

As you all know we currently have 4 unfilled vacancies on the Board and 2 additional members whose terms have expired. This Board has had a 15-member requirement since its inception in 1965. With the recent difficulty in maintaining a full Board, staff surveyed other CLGs to determine the composition of their Boards. All CLGs include a minimum of five board members, as required by the state, with at least two historic preservation professionals. The larger jurisdictions tend toward a larger number of board members, for example, Santa Ana, Sacramento, San Francisco, and Pasadena all have 9 members, but by far the most common number is 7, and no CLGs have more than 11 members. Staff has discussed the possibility of reducing the number of HRB members and feel that this is the opportune time to go forward with a proposal to reduce the number from 15 to 11, as no sitting members would be displaced. With this reduction in board membership, the number required for a quorum would be reduced to 6 as would the number required to designate a historical resource. We have the approval of Jim Waring in the Mayor's office and are going forward with taking this proposal to the City Council as soon as possible. After the reduction of four seats, two vacancies still remain to be filled and, we ask that Ms. Sewell and Mr. Delawie continue to serve until new appointments are made.

We are continuing to process a proposal for charging members of the public a nomination fee and modifying the current Mills Act Agreement fee. A meeting has been scheduled with consultants and interested parties to go over this proposal and seek support prior to going forward to the City Council Land Use and Housing Committed in June. The meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, May 10th, at 3:00 in the 4th Floor conference room.

Boardmembers will note that staff has scheduled 5 designation requests from the public on today's agenda. Staff has received 13 new designation requests from members of the public since the last HRB meeting (in February), bringing the total number of designation requests that are waiting to be reviewed by staff to 65. Staff is currently reviewing additional requests (which were submitted in April and May 2005), we will continue to review and docket these voluntary designations as staff time allows.

We have received several worthy nominations for Awards of Excellence in Historic Preservation. The Policy Subcommittee will make their final determinations at the May 8th subcommittee meeting and the awards will be presented at the May 25th HRB meeting.

BOARDMEMBER HARRISON REQUESTED THAT A DISCUSSION OF THE PROPOSED REDUCTION IN THE NUMBER OF BOARD MEMBERS BE BROUGHT TO THE POLICY SUBCOMMITTEE.

BOARDMEMBER EMME NOMINATED THE WATER AND LIBRARY DEPARTMENTS FOR THEIR EFFORTS TO PRESERVE HISTORIC WATER DOCUMENTS.

E. Requests for Continuances

Staff received letters requesting continuances on two items. Both letters were provided to Board Members in their Blue Folder.

ITEM 7 1845 Fort Stockton Drive requested continuance to June 22, 2006

ITEM 8 R B Meyers House at 1619 J Street requested continuance to May 25, 2006

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO CONTINUE ITEM 7 (1845 FORT STOCKTON DRIVE) TO JUNE 22, 2006 AT THE OWNER'S REQUEST AND CONTINUE ITEM 8 (R B MEYERS HOUSE) AT 1619 J STREET TO MAY 25, 2006 AT THE OWNER'S REQUEST.

Seconded by Boardmember McNeely. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 6 – the Chester Eastman Spec House #1 at 4230 Arden Way

ITEM 10 – the Benjamin Torgerson/George Cooley Spec House #1 at 4343 Adams Avenue

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO PLACE ITEM 6 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND DESIGNATE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION WITH THE ADDITION THAT THE GARAGE IS INCLUDED IN THE DESIGNATION AND WITH THE ADDITION THAT A MILLS ACT AGREEMENT WOULD INCLUDE A REQUIREMENT FOR REMOVAL OF NON-HISTORIC LIGHT FIXTURES FROM THE FRONT AND THAT THE CHIMNEY WOULD BE REPLACED IN KIND WHEN NEEDED.

Seconded by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 9-1 (Emme)-0. Motion passes.

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO PLACE ITEM 10 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Seconded by Boardmember McNeely. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion passes.

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 EDWIN AND CECILIA SMITH/GRETA STEVENTON HOUSE

Applicant: Beth Montes on behalf of Judi Schaim, owner

Location: (5A) 3054 Juniper Street and (5B) 3056 Juniper Street, Greater North Park Community Planning Area, Council District 3

Description: (5A) Two-story Craftsman style residence built in 1919 by Edwin Smith; (5B) Single-story vernacular, with stylistic illusions to the Craftsman style, house built in 1938 by Charles Davis as an income property.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: (1) Designate the Edwin and Cecelia Smith/Greta Steventon House at 3054 Juniper Street under HRB CRITERION C as a fine example of the Craftsman style of architecture embodying several distinctive characteristics of the style including a bracket-supported open-ended gable roof, wood siding and shingles, original wood frame windows and its original wood paneled front door.

(2) Direct staff to include specific provisions in a Mills Act Agreement requiring the property owner to remove the aluminum framed screens that exist over the exterior of the double hung windows and, if desired, replace them with internal screens.

(3) Do not designate the house at 3056 Juniper Street, converted garage at 3050 Juniper Street , or two-car garage accessed from the alley.

Report Number: HRB-06-012

Staff report was given by Mike Tudury.

Testimony Received:

In support: Beth Montes, representing the owner, supports the Mills Act conditions and suggested that it would be appropriate to include outside wooden screens.

In opposition: None.

Public testimony was closed.

Boardmember Emme stated his concern that the Mills Act tax reduction would be applied to the entire property not just the portion that is being designated. Chairman Schwartz insisted that the Mills Act Agreement be very specific and apply only to the designation of Item 5A and not the entire property.

BOARD ACTION

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO DESIGNATE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION THE EDWIN AND CECELIA SMITH/GRETA STEVENTON HOUSE AT 3054 JUNIPER STREET UNDER HRB CRITERION C AND INCLUDE SPECIFIC PROVISIONS IN THE MILLS ACT AGREEMENT EXCLUDING OTHER PORTIONS OF THE PROPERTY AND REQUIRING REMOVAL OF THE ALUMINUM FRAMED SCREENS OVER THE EXTERIOR WINDOWS

Seconded by Boardmember Marshall. Vote: 9-1 (Emme)-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 6 – CHESTER EASTMAN SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Ruth Alter on behalf of Linda and Patrick Stouffer, owners

Location: 4230 Arden Way, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Rectangular primarily two-story Craftsman style residence built in 1912 by salesman Chester Eastman.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Chester Eastman Spec House #1 at 4230 Arden Way under HRB CRITERION C as an early and intact example of the Craftsman style that embodies many of the characteristics of that style, among these characteristics are simplicity of design and construction, natural materials and craftsmanship. Staff recommends that the designation include the detached double garage sited at the rear of the lot with access from a rear alley which was constructed at the same time as the house and exhibits a similar hip roof form and details.

Report Number: HRB-06-013

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO PLACE ITEM 6 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND DESIGNATE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION WITH THE ADDITION THAT THE GARAGE IS INCLUDED IN THE DESIGNATION AND WITH THE ADDITION THAT A MILLS ACT AGREEMENT WOULD INCLUDE A REQUIREMENT FOR REMOVAL OF NON-HISTORIC LIGHT FIXTURES FROM THE FRONT AND THAT THE CHIMNEY WOULD BE REPLACED IN KIND WHEN NEEDED.

Seconded by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 9-1 (Emme)-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 7 – 1845 FORT STOCKTON DRIVE HOUSE

Applicant: Ron May on behalf of Merilee Antrim and Richard Sinkin, owners

Location: 1845 Fort Stockton Drive, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Two-story Spanish Eclectic style with Pueblo influences residence built in 1924 by contractor Louis Dilley.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.
Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the house at 1845 Fort Stockton Drive under any HRB Criteria due to modifications that significantly impact the original character and integrity of the building.

Report Number: HRB-06-014

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO CONTINUE ITEM 7 (1845 FORT STOCKTON DRIVE) TO JUNE 22, 2006 AT THE OWNER'S REQUEST

Seconded by Boardmember McNeely. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 8 – R. B. MEYERS HOUSE

Applicant: Kathleen Crawford, on behalf of Katalyst LLC, owner

Location: 1619 J Street and 371 16th Street (also known as 1601 J Street); East Village, Centre City Community, Council District 2

Description: Single-story, asymmetrical, pyramidal-roofed Transitional vernacular cottage with Craftsman influences built C. 1906.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the R.B. Meyers House located at 1619 J Street under HRB CRITERIA A and C as one of only three homes of a similar style remaining in East Village and as a representative example of working class, Transitional vernacular residential architecture during the third phase of development in East Village beginning in 1906 and ending in 1921. The house at 371 16th Street (also known as 1601 J Street), which is located on the same parcel, is not included in the designation and no action is required for this building.

Report Number: HRB-06-015

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO CONTINUE ITEM 8 (R B MEYERS HOUSE) AT 1619 J STREET TO MAY 25, 2006 AT THE OWNER'S REQUEST.

Seconded by Boardmember McNeely. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 9 – 3104 FREEMAN STREET

Applicant: Vonn Marie May, on behalf of John and Nancy Clifford, owners

Location: 3104 Freeman Street, Peninsula Community, Council District 2

Description: Two-story, Prairie with Mediterranean influences style (or Prairie "Eclectic" style) house built in 1913.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the building at 3104 Freeman Street due to a loss of architectural and historical integrity.

Report Number: HRB-06-016

Staff report given by Kelley Saunders.

Testimony Received:

In support: None.

In opposition: Vonn Marie May, representing the owner, spoke in favor of designation. Ione Stiegler, representing the owner, spoke in favor of designation. The property owners, John and Nancy Clifford, spoke in favor of designation.

Public testimony was closed.

Boardmember Emme stated that not every house is historic and that there are other better examples. Boardmember Curry stated that the garage is not part of the historicity of the property. She is in favor of preservations in general and suggests that the owners could be worked with to achieve designation. Boardmember Harrison asked whether the house could qualify as a contributor to a district. Boardmember Burnett supports designation of the house under HRB Criteria A and C and would support rehabilitation of the house as part of a Mills Act agreement. Boardmember Marshall identified recent alterations to the property including the 1980s garage and the ca.1965 carport and stated that the house lacks integrity and has been too heavily altered to be designated. Boardmember Schaefer stated that the alterations are too out of place, particularly the garage. Boardmember Sewell identified the garage as an issue as well as a loss of integrity. There was board member discussion of possibly referring the property to the Design Assistance Subcommittee to see if the alterations can be reversed sufficiently to support a potential designation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO CONTINUE THE ITEM INDEFINATELY UNTIL AFTER REVIEW BY DAS TO ADDRESS REVERSIBILITY OF CHANGES.

Seconded by Boardmember Curry. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 10 – BENJAMIN TORGERSON/GEORGE COOLEY SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Ione Steigler, on behalf of Peter Dennehy, owner

Location: 4343 Adams Avenue, Talmadge, Mid-City Community, Council District 3

Description: One and two-story Spanish Colonial Revival style residence built in 1930 as a speculative venture by carpenter Benjamin Torgerson and realtor George Cooley.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Benjamin Torgerson/George Cooley Spec House #1 under HRB CRITERION C as an excellent example of a primarily intact Spanish Colonial Revival style building exhibiting distinctive characteristics of the style such as moderately-pitched hip and gable clay tile roof forms with brief overhangs and exposed shaped wood rafter tails, smooth stucco facades, an asymmetrical plan, an arched focal window, an upper level balcony with turned spindles, wood framed casement and double hung windows, tiled vents, and an angled deeply recessed arched entryway. Staff recommends that the garage be included in the designation, but not the driveway gate and posts.

Report Number: HRB-06-017

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO PLACE THE BENJAMIN TORGERSON/GEORGE COOLEY SPEC HOUSE #1 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND DESIGNATE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION, UNDER HRB CRITERION C INCLUDING DESIGNATION OF THE GARAGE AND EXCLUDING THE DRIVEWAY GATE AND POSTS.

Seconded by Boardmember McNeely. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 11 – 3035 LAWRENCE STREET HOUSE

Applicant: Katheryn Rhodes and Judy White, representing themselves (not the owner)

Location: 3035 Lawrence Street, Peninsula Community, Council District 2

Description: One and two-story Spanish Eclectic style residence built in 1931 by Manuel Frietas, a tuna boat captain of Portuguese descent.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate 3035 Lawrence Street under HRB CRITERIA B or C due to insufficient evidence that Captain Manuel Freitas' accomplishments raise him to the level of a historic person in San Diego, and due to modifications to the front, side and rear of the second floor and the deteriorated condition of the house.

Report Number: HRB-06-018

Staff report by Mike Tudury.

Testimony Received:

In support: Matt Peterson and Scott Moomjian, representing the owner, gave an organized presentation in opposition to designation.

In opposition: Katheryn Rhodes and Judy White gave an organized presentation in favor of designation of the house. Cynthia Conger, Peninsula Community Planning Board, spoke in favor of designation. Sandra Angel spoke in favor of designation. Ron May spoke in favor of designation.

Public testimony was closed.

Boardmember Curry stated that she could consider designation of the house under HRB Criteria A, B, C, and F as the house is associated with immigrant history and is important to the community. She believes it could be restored. Boardmember Marshall spoke in support of designation based on the importance of Manuel Freitas and stated that the condition of the house does not justify not designating it. Boardmember Harrison stated that Freitas and the house are important to La Playa and the distinct community that lives there. Boardmember Schaefer identified that there are some integrity issues but believes they are reversible changes and supports the importance of Freitas who is mentioned in Proude's book. Boardmember Sewell disagrees with staff and supports designation of the house under Criteria B and C. Boardmember McNeely said it was a difficult decision and agrees with staff about the integrity, but does consider Freitas to be historic. Boardmember Emme stated that Freitas is not a significant historical person to San Diego, as he achieved no accomplishments outside the community.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO DESIGNATE THE HOUSE AT 3035 LAWRENCE STREET, BASED ON THE BOARD DISCUSSION CONCERNING FREITAS AS A HISTORIC PERSON, UNDER HRB CRITERION B.

Seconded by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 8-1 (Emme)- 0. Motion passes.

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO DESIGNATE THE HOUSE AT 3035 LAWRENCE STREET, BASED ON THE BOARD DISCUSSION CONCERNING ITS SPANISH ECLECTIC ARCHITECTURAL STYLE AND SUFFICIENT INTEGRITY, UNDER HRB CRITERION C, WITH NO CONDITIONS FOR A MILLS ACT AGREEMENT.

Seconded by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 7-2 (Emme, McNeely)- 0. Motion fails.

Chairperson Schwartz adjourned the meeting at 5:15 PM.

NOTE: All Historical Resources Board meetings are tape recorded and kept on file with the City of San Diego Planning Department. Upon request, copies of the tapes can be obtained by call the Department at 619-235-5200.