

CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD

MINUTES OF REGULAR SCHEDULED MEETING OF

June 22, 2006

COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM – 12TH FLOOR
CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Schwartz at 1:25 PM.

ATTENDANCE DURING THE MEETING

Chairperson	Lloyd Schwartz	Present
Vice-Chairperson	Laura Burnett	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Absent
Boardmember	Homer Delawie	Absent
Boardmember	Otto Emme	Present
Boardmember	Don Harrison	Present
Boardmember	David Marshall	Present
Boardmember	Delores McNeely	Absent
Boardmember	Jerry Schaefer	Present
Boardmember	Marsha Sewell	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present

Staff to the Board in attendance:

- Diane Kane, Senior Planner
- Kelley Saunders, Associate Planner
- Mike Tudury, Senior Planner/Architect
- Cathy Winterrowd, Senior Planner
- Nina Fain-Newman, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF MAY 25, 2006

THE MAY 25, 2006 MINUTES WERE NOT AVAILABLE FOR CONSIDERATION AT THIS MEETING.

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS**A. Board Administrative Matters and General Information**

Notification of Absences

- Boardmembers Curry, Delawie and McNeely notified staff that they were out of town and would not be able to attend the meeting.

Boardmember Comment:

- Chair Schwartz noted that the existence of a Mills Act Agreement was used in a Real Estate advertisement and Boardmember Sewell similarly noted that she saw an advertisement for the sale of a designated house that was reviewed by the DAS.
- Boardmember Emme advised he received the Draft EIR and Historical Resources Report for development of the Teledyne Ryan site.

B. Subcommittee Reports

The Design Assistance Subcommittee met on June 7, 2006 and considered rehabilitation/restoration of the designated Cracker Factory including a proposed rooftop structure, changes to proposed alterations of the residence at 1745 Kearsarge, potential constraints associated with redevelopment of the property at 418 10th Avenue, and a proposed Master Plan update for the Salk Institute. The next meeting will be on Wednesday, July 5, 2006 at 3 PM.

The Policy Subcommittee met on June 12, 2006 and considered options for improving the placement of historic markers on designated resources in order to increase the public's knowledge and appreciation of San Diego's history; submittal of late material at HRB meetings and ways to improve the submittal of information in a timely manner; and began work on designation criteria guidelines by reviewing Criteria C and D. The next meeting will be on Monday, July 10, 2006 at 3 PM.

The Archaeology Subcommittee did not meet in June. The next meeting will be on Monday, July 10, 2006 at 4 PM.

C. Conflict of Interest Declarations

Conflicts of interest

Boardmember Marshall identified a conflict of interest on Item #14 for both 418 and 450 10th Avenue.

Ex parte communications

None.

Failure to visit sites for designation

None.

D. Staff Report

The City Council Committee on Land Use and Housing heard two policy issues at yesterday's meeting. Both the proposed fee for nominations and the appeal findings were forwarded on the full City Council without a Committee recommendation. The Committee requested a legal analysis of the staff recommendation and alternative related to the appeal findings and requested staff look at alternatives to address low income property owners nomination fees.

The NTC Foundation, charged with the preservation and renovation of 26 historic buildings at the former Naval Training Center, has received \$12.6 million in federal Historic and New Markets Tax Credits for the renovation of 6 historic buildings at the NTC Promenade. The six buildings totaling 110,000 square-feet of space are the Event Center; NTC Command Center; Dance Place San Diego; Music Place San Diego; and two buildings that will be home to galleries and other nonprofit organizations. All six Phase I buildings are expected to be completed by late 2006.

Staff has scheduled 7 designation requests from the public on today's agenda; an 8th request was reviewed by staff and subsequently withdrawn by the property owner. Staff has received 6 new designation requests from members of the public since the last HRB meeting, bringing the total number of designation requests that are waiting to be reviewed by staff to 63. Staff has identified that there remain 32 designation requests submitted in calendar year 2005, in order for those homeowners to eligible to receive the Mills Act tax reduction in 2007, the designation request has to be heard no later that October of this year. Therefore, staff anticipated bringing 8 designation requests from the public to the next 4 HRB meetings in addition to any other Board business or referrals from Development Services or CCDC. This goal will result in an increased workload for Board Members and staff for the next several months.

E. Requests for Continuances

Ron May, on behalf of the property owner, requested Item #5 (1845 Fort Stockton Drive House) be continued to the July HRB meeting.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO CONTINUE ITEM #5, AT THE REQUEST OF THE PROPERTY OWNER, TO THE JULY 27, 2006 HRB MEETING.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 4 - - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

- **ITEM 8 – SARAH BROCK/WILLIAM TEMPLETON JOHNSON/BRAWNER & HUNTER HOUSE at 4451 Hermosa Way**
- **ITEM 9 – LOUISE AND THOMAS ROTHWELL/THOMAS SHEPHERD HOUSE at 7811 Hillside Drive**
- **ITEM 10 – CHARLES AND FLORA BUTLER HOUSE at 4364 Hermosa Way**
- **ITEM 12 – FANNIE AND LEOTI HOWARD HOUSE at 1529 29th Street**
- **ITEM 13 – HENRY AND EMMA NEUSTADT SPEC HOUSE #1 at 1444 Granada Avenue**

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO PLACE ITEMS 8, 9, 10, 12, AND 13 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Second by Boardmember Marshall. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 5 – 1845 FORT STOCKTON DRIVE HOUSE (Continued from April 27, 2006)

Applicant: Ron May on behalf of the owner, Merilee Antrim and Richard Sinkin

Location: 1845 Fort Stockton Drive, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Two-story Spanish Eclectic style with Pueblo influences residence built in 1924 by contractor Louis Dilley.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the house at 1845 Fort Stockton Drive under any HRB Criteria due to modifications that significantly impact the original character and integrity of the building.

Report Number: HRB-06-014

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO CONTINUE ITEM #5, AT THE REQUEST OF THE PROPERTY OWNER, TO THE JULY 27, 2006 HRB MEETING.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 6 – GEORGE T. FORBES SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Ron May on behalf of the owner, Brad Hunsaker and Denton Brazell

Location: 5191 Hastings Road, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 3

Description: A one and two story Spanish Eclectic style house built in 1927 on a corner lot by George T. Forbes as a speculative model home in Kensington Heights.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate 5191 Hastings Road as a historical building under HRB Criteria A and C as one of the very earliest model homes in Kensington Heights which was used to promote the neighborhood and its Spanish-influenced style, and as an excellent example of Spanish Eclectic architecture retaining a high degree of integrity.

Report Number: HRB-06-024

Staff report by Kelley Saunders.

Testimony Received:

In support: Ron May, representing the owner, spoke in support of designation and objected to Boardmember Harrison's comments regarding use of Criterion A in the designation of this property. Virginia Dematatis, the property owner, requested the Board designate the house under Criterion C.

In opposition: None.

Public Testimony was closed.

Boardmember Harrison stated that he could not support designation of a property under Criterion A if discriminatory deed restrictions were ever placed on the property and believes that recognizing a historical property under such circumstances as significant under Criterion A would give a nod to the racism of that time. Boardmember Schaefer noted that the first deed of transference for this property does not include such a deed restriction, that the discriminatory language came later, and is therefore not associated with the original development.

Boardmember Silvas objected to designating this property under Criterion A because it is in a unique area, part of the original Mission tracts, where Native American use of the area was restricted by the Spanish. Boardmember Marshall disagreed with objections of designation under Criterion A and agreed with Dr. Schaefer. Chairperson Schwartz noted that Mr. Harrison has a standing objection to designation of property in Kensington under Criterion A and suggested that the Board make a motion to approve the designation per the staff recommendation related to Criteria A and C, to put this issue on the record. Boardmember Harrison stated that his objection is based on his personal belief and conscience. Boardmember Marshall suggested that rather than a motion, the discussion regarding Criterion A could be documented the meeting minutes.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO DESIGNATE 5191 HASTINGS ROAD AS A HISTORICAL BUILDING UNDER HRB CRITERION C AS AN EXCELLENT EXAMPLE OF SPANISH ECLECTIC ARCHITECTURE RETAINING A HIGH DEGREE OF INTEGRITY.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 7 – 4414 CONDE PLACE HOUSE -- WITHDRAWN BY OWNER --

NO ACTION OF THE BOARD WAS TAKEN

ITEM 8 – SARAH BROCK/WILLIAM TEMPLETON JOHNSON/BRAWNER & HUNTER HOUSE

Applicant: Beth Montes on behalf of the owner, William and Kelly Hopkins

Location: 4451 Hermosa Way, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: The house is a one-and-two story stucco Spanish Eclectic style home with Pueblo Revival elements built in 1922.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Sarah Brock/William Templeton Johnson/Brawner & Hunter House under HRB Criterion C an excellent example of the Spanish Eclectic style with Pueblo style influences, utilizing materials, forms, details and openings representative of the style; and Criterion D as a representative example of the work of Master Architect William Templeton Johnson and as a representative example of the work of proposed Master Builders Brawner & Hunter, who were known for their quality of construction and their enduring construction methods and techniques. The designation would include the house, garage, site wall, and lower level reflecting pool. Staff also recommends that a condition of the Mills Act tax reduction is that public visibility of the structure be improved by thinning the screening vegetation and modifying the gate to allow for enhanced public view of the house.

Report Number: HRB-06-026

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO PLACE THIS ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Second by Boardmember Marshall. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion passes.

BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL REQUESTED THAT THE OWNERS PROVIDE THEIR PROPOSED PAINT PALLETTE FOR REVIEW BY STAFF AND/OR DAS TO ENSURE THE NEW PAINT COLOR IS APPROPRIATE FOR THE HISTORIC PERIOD OF THE HOUSE AND THE ARCHITECTURAL STYLE.

ITEM 9 – HELEN TOWLE/THOMAS SHEPHERD HOUSE

Applicant: Marie Lia on behalf of the owners, Jeffrey and Kimberly Sandler

Location: 7811 Hillside Drive, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

Description: The house is a two story with basement stucco asymmetrical Spanish Eclectic style home built in 1927.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the property under HRB Criteria C and D as an excellent example of the Spanish Eclectic architectural style, exhibiting many characteristic of the style in form, material, detail and feel; and as an excellent example of the work of Master Architect Thomas Shepherd.

Report Number: HRB-06-027

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO PLACE THIS ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Second by Boardmember Marshall. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion passes.

BOARDMEMBER EMME NOTED THAT SOME RECENT WORK AT THE HOUSE WAS NOT ADDRESSED IN THE STAFF REPORT. HE REQUESTED THAT PHOTOS OF PROPERTIES BE INCLUDED WHEN APPROPRIATE TO DOCUMENT ALTERATIONS AND THAT OWNERS SHOULD BE INTERVIEWED TO FIND OUT WHAT THEY KNOW ABOUT RECENT ALTERATIONS TO PROPERTIES.

ITEM 10 – CHARLES AND FLORA BUTLER HOUSE

Applicant: Scott Moomjian on behalf of the owner, Dr. Richard Clark

Location: 4364 Hermosa Way, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: The house is a one story Craftsman style home built in 1910.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Charles and Flora Butler House under HRB Criterion C as an excellent early example of the Craftsman style, utilizing many characteristics of the style such as form, detail, workmanship and materials.

Report Number: HRB-06-028

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO PLACE THIS ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Second by Boardmember Marshall. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 11 – URIAH AND CLARA BARKEY HOUSE

Applicant: Louis and Tamora Vener, owners

Location: 8265 Paseo del Ocaso, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

Description: The house is a one and two story Spanish Eclectic style house built in 1929.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Uriah and Clara Barkey House under HRB Criteria A and C as one of the first seven homes (which came to be known as the seven sisters) to be built in the La Jolla Shores area prior to the onset of the Great Depression and as an excellent example of Spanish Eclectic architecture.

Report Number: HRB-06-029

Staff report by Kelley Saunders.

Testimony Received:

In support: Louis Vener, property owner agrees with including the tree in the designation and with required modifications to the wall and requested the Board designate the house under Criterion C.

In opposition: None.

Public Testimony was closed.

Boardmember Harrison stated that he has the same philosophical objection with this item as with Item #6 regarding restrictive deeds and designation under Criterion A. Boardmember Burnett stated that the palm tree is a character defining element of the property and should be included in the designation and feels that landscaping around a building should be addressed through the designation process. Boardmember Marshall has concerns about the non-historic brick and iron site wall that is not compatible with the architecture of the house and proposed the Mills Act requirements should include modification to the front wall to be more in keeping with the house. The on site historic wall should be used as a guide for modifying the front site wall.

Boardmember Silvas stated he has the same concerns with designation of this property under Criterion A as with Item #6 but to a greater degree due to this property being located within Pueblo Lands, which are ancient sites, and current issues with Native American human remains found in La Jolla. Boardmember Emme stated that the Board should look at the current situation and not be captive to the past. Chair Schwartz stated that Criterion A is before the Board with this property due to its particular uniqueness related to development of the area and not related to deed restrictions or ancestral claims on property. Boardmember Silvas agreed but stated under the current situation with burials would prefer it to come back the Board after resolution of the burials to reconsider Criterion A.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER EMME TO DESIGNATE THE URIAH AND CLARA BARKEY HOUSE UNDER HRB CRITERIA A AND C AS ONE OF THE FIRST SEVEN

HOMES (WHICH CAME TO BE KNOWN AS THE SEVEN SISTERS) TO BE BUILT IN THE LA JOLLA SHORES AREA PRIOR TO THE ONSET OF THE GREAT DEPRESSION AND AS AN EXCELLENT EXAMPLE OF SPANISH ECLECTIC ARCHITECTURE.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 5-3 (Burnett, Harrison, Silvas)-0. Motion fails.

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER EMME TO DESIGNATE THE URIAH AND CLARA BARKEY HOUSE UNDER HRB CRITERION C AS AN EXCELLENT EXAMPLE OF SPANISH ECLECTIC ARCHITECTURE.

Second by Boardmember Marshall. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 12 – FANNIE AND LEOTI HOWARD HOUSE

Applicant: Ione Stiegler, on behalf of owners Jorge Mendez and Karla V. Lopez Mendez

Location: 1529 29th Street, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 3

Description: The house is a one story Craftsman Bungalow style residence built in 1911.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Fannie and Leoti Howard House under HRB Criterion C as an excellent example of Craftsman Bungalow architecture from the early 1910s, retaining a high degree of integrity.

Report Number: HRB-06-030

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO PLACE THIS ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Second by Boardmember Marshall. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 13 – HENRY AND EMMA NEUSTADT SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Beth Montes, on behalf of owners Robert and Anne Steinberger

Location: 1444 Granada Avenue, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 3

Description: The house is a two story Colonial Revival style residence built in 1910 on a post and pier, perimeter concrete foundation above a large basement.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Henry and Emma Neustadt Spec House #1 under HRB Criterion C as an excellent example of early 20th century Colonial Revival architectural style, retaining a high degree of integrity.

Report Number: HRB-06-031

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO PLACE THIS ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Second by Boardmember Marshall. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 14 – 418 10TH AVENUE (WAREHOUSE DISTRICT) & 450 10TH AVENUE (EAST VILLAGE)

Applicant: Wendy Tinsley, on behalf of LodgeWorks, L.P.

Location: 418 and 450 10th Avenue, Centre City Community, Council District 2

Description: 418 10th Avenue is a utilitarian warehouse built in a rectangular plan of board form concrete and concrete bricks in 1927. 450 10th Avenue is a commercial building constructed in approximately 1949 of board form concrete and concrete brick with two original storefronts and an auto bay converted to a third storefront.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the buildings at 418 10th Avenue or 450 10th Avenue under any HRB criteria.

Report Number: HRB-06-032

THIS ITEM WAS TRAILED TO THE JULY 27, 2006 HRB MEETING DUE TO THE LACK OF A QUORUM.

ITEM 15 – 1488 MARKET STREET & 648 15TH STREET (EAST VILLAGE)

Applicant: Scott Moomjian on behalf of owner CJUF II Lankford Market LLC

Location: 1488 Market Street and 648 15th Street, Centre City Community, Council District 2

Description: 1488 Market Street is a commercial building constructed in 1923 of reinforced concrete frame with 12” “monolithic” concrete block totaling 12,901 square feet plus 8,245 square feet of basement space and 5,177 square feet of mezzanine space. 648 15th Street is a commercial warehouse building constructed in 1946 of reinforced concrete and steel frame with 8” concrete block walls and approximately 300,000 total square feet of space.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation Do not designate the property at 1488 Market Street or 648 15th Street under any HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB-06-033

Staff report by Kelley Saunders.

Testimony Received:

In support (of staff recommendation): Scott Moojjian, representing the property owner; Leslie Wade, representing East Village Association.

In opposition (to staff recommendation): None.

Public Testimony was closed.

Boardmember Marshall questioned why there were two sets of DPR forms for these buildings reaching different conclusions and stated that the building at 1488 Market was not architecturally significant but that the building at 648 15th Street may be the only warehouse built in the International style that can be found in San Diego and therefore may be significant under Criterion C. Boardmember Emme stated that the building at 648 15th Street was intact except for the missing glass block and that it represents a single, stand alone retail use in this area of San Diego. Boardmember Sewell agreed with others and supported designation of both buildings.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO DESIGNATE 648 15th STREET AS A HISTORICAL BUILDING UNDER HRB CRITERION C BUILT IN THE RARE INTERNATIONAL STYLE.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 5-3 (Harrison, Schaefer, Schwartz)-0. Motion fails.

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO DESIGNATE 1488 MARKET AS A HISTORICAL BUILDING UNDER HRB CRITERION C FOR ITS ARCHITECTURAL STYLE.

Second by Boardmember Emme. Vote: 4-4 (Harrison, Marshall, Schaefer Schwartz)-0. Motion fails.

ADJOURNMENT

Chairperson Schwartz adjourned the meeting at 4:12 PM.

NOTE: All Historical Resources Board meetings are tape recorded and kept on file with the City of San Diego Planning Department. Upon request, copies of the tapes can be obtained by calling the Department at 619-235-5200.