

# CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD

## MINUTES OF REGULAR SCHEDULED MEETING OF

**September 28, 2006**

COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM – 12<sup>TH</sup> FLOOR  
CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING

---

### CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Burnett at 1:04 PM.

### ATTENDANCE DURING THE MEETING

Chairperson	Laura Burnett	Present
Vice Chairperson	Jerry Schaefer	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present - Left Meeting at 4:00 PM
Boardmember	Homer Delawie	Present - Left Meeting at 5:00 PM
Boardmember	Otto Emme	Present
Boardmember	Don Harrison	Present
Boardmember	David Marshall	Present
Boardmember	Delores McNeely	Present
Boardmember	Marsha Sewell	Present - Left Meeting at 5:30 PM
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present - Left Meeting at 5:45 PM

Staff to the Board in attendance: Delores Johnson, Board Secretary  
Kelley Saunders, Associate Planner  
Mike Tudury, Senior Planner/Architect  
Cathy Winterrowd, Senior Planner

Kimberly Davies, Deputy City Attorney  
Nina Fain-Newman, Deputy City Attorney

**ITEM 1A. - APPROVAL OF MINUTES of July 27, 2006**

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO APPROVE THE JULY 22, 2006 MINUTES. BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL ASKED FOR A CORRECTION TO THE MINUTES TO SHOW THAT HE WAS ABSENT FOR THE VOTE ON ITEM 6.

Second to amended motion by Boardmember Marshall. Vote: 8-0-2 (Curry, McNeely)  
Motion passes.

**ITEM 1B. - APPROVAL OF MINUTES of August 24, 2006**

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO APPROVE THE AUGUST 24, 2006 MINUTES. BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL SAID HE WAS NOT PRESENT DURING DISCUSSIONS OF ITEM #5 WHICH WAS CONTINUED FROM JULY 27 MEETING. HE DID NOT VOTE ON THAT ITEM.

Second to amended motion by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 9-0-1 (Silvas) Motion passes.

**ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT**

- There were no public comments..

**ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS****A. Board Administrative Matters and General Information**

- ABSENCES  
All Boardmembers were present.
- OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION  
Contents of "Blue Folders" – No blue folders were given to Boardmembers as there were no undistributed materials related to this meeting.
- GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS  
Boardmember Marshall called attention to the 25<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Gaslamp Quarter which would be celebrated tonight at the William Davis House; he also announced that the Orchids and Onions Award will be given on November 17.

**B. Subcommittee Reports**

The Design Assistance Subcommittee met on September 5, 2006 to continue the review of the Salk Institute proposed Master Plan and met on September 6, 2006 to consider proposed rehabilitation and restoration of HRB Site #617 at 1816 Sheridan Avenue; the scope of work and timing for restoration of 3140 Third Avenue; a proposal by the Friends of Balboa Park to install several information kiosks in the Park including within the designated El Prado; proposed courtyard lighting at the Balboa Park House of Hospitality; preservation of the

Craftsman located at 4374 Cleveland Avenue previously proposed for demolition; and a possible design alternative for the proposed Torrey East Building at Salk. The next DAS meeting will be on Wednesday, October 4, 2006 at 3 PM.

The Policy Subcommittee met on September 11, 2006 and considered proposed revisions to the HRB Procedures; a status report on the on-going DAS review of the Salk proposal; and a review of the Ginty House nomination to the National Register. The next Policy Subcommittee meeting will be on Thursday, October 26, 2006 at 11:00 AM just prior to the regular October HRB meeting.

The Archaeology Subcommittee met on September 11, 2006 and discussed the City's current efforts to implement SB 18 regarding City and Tribal intergovernmental consultation and continued discussions of resource needs for the creation of archaeological districts and the need for the revised District Policy to include language specific to archaeological districts. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, November 13, 2006 at 4 PM.

### **C. Conflict of Interest Declarations**

Conflicts of Interest: Ms. Sewell is the owner of Item #5, the Ginty House, and will not vote.

Ex Parte Communications: Vice Chairperson Schaefer had a discussion about one and a half years ago with a member of the Salk Institute about preparing a report; however, he was not retained and not paid.

Failure to Visit Designation Sites/Invocation of Waiver: All members had visited the exteriors of all sites, but members Burnett, Curry, Emme, and Silvas had not seen the interior of Item #13.

### **D. Staff Report**

Although new Board member appointments did not come through in September we are very hopeful that new appointments will occur in early October and, if so, new members will be sworn in at the October 26<sup>th</sup> meeting. I have been asked to announce a birthday celebration for the Star of India sailing ship, docked at the Maritime Museum, to be held on November 4, 2006 from 10am to 3pm. The Board and public are invited to attend the planned festivities. Built in 1863, the Star of India is now 143 years old. Lorraine Sundberg, a museum docent and past Board member, has requested that the HRB recognize the restoration and maintenance efforts that saved this ship, the oldest active ship of any kind in the world, by issuing an award of excellence in historic preservation to be presented at the celebration. The museum would also like to pursue local designation of this State and Nationally-recognized historical landmark.

Boardmembers will note that staff has scheduled 10 designation requests from the public on today's agenda, in addition to one referral from Development Services and one project review for consistency with the Secretary of the Interior Standards. This now leaves 8 requests submitted in 2005 that we will bring to the Board at the October hearing. So far in 2006, there

have been 53 designation requests submitted by the public, including 5 requests since the last HRB meeting.

**E. Requests for Continuances:** No continuances were requested.

#### **ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA**

After discussion, the following non-controversial items were placed on the Consent Agenda:

- ITEM 6 – REVISIONS TO ADOPTED HRB ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEDURES
- ITEM 11 – PACIFIC BUILDING COMPANY SPEC HOUSE #1 at 3910 Eagle Street
- ITEM 12 – JOEL L. AND EDITH M. BROWN HOUSE at 4141 Lark Street
- ITEM 14 – ALBERTA SECURITY COMPANY/MARTIN V. MELHORN SPEC HOUSE #1 at 1201 West Arbor Drive
- ITEM 15 – CHARLES AND MATIE SUMNER HOUSE at 2820 Chatsworth Boulevard
- ITEM 16 – WILLIAM TEMPLETON JOHNSON SPEC HOUSE #1 at 4467 Ampudia Street
- ITEM 17 – WHEELER BAILEY/IRVING GILL HOUSE at 7964 Princess Street

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO PLACE ITEMS 6, 11, 12, 14, 15, 16, AND 17 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 10-0-0 Motion passes.

#### **ACTION ITEMS**

##### **ITEM 5 – GINTY HOUSE NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATION**

Applicant: Marie Burke Lia on behalf of Marsha Sewell, owner

Location: 1568 Ninth Avenue, Centre City Community, Council District 2

Description: Review the nomination of the John Ginty House for listing on the National Register and provide comments to the Office of Historic Preservation.

Today's Action: Review and comment on the nomination of the John Ginty House for listing on the National Register of Historic Places.

Staff Recommendation: Provide comments in support of listing the John Ginty House on the National Register of Historic Places.

Report Number: HRB-06-055

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd.

##### Public Testimony Opened

In Favor: Ms. Sewell took the opportunity to speak at the mike to learn how it felt to address the board from that position.

In Opposition: None

Public Testimony Closed

## BOARD ACTION

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Second by Boardmember Harrison. Vote: 9-0-1 (Sewell) Motion passes.

**ITEM 6 – REVISIONS TO ADOPTED HRB ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEEDURES**

Description: Consider revisions to the adopted Historical Resources Board administrative procedures.

Today's Action: Approve the proposed revisions or do not approve the revisions as proposed and refer to staff with direction to modify the revisions.

Staff Recommendation: Approve the proposed revisions as presented.

Report Number: HRB-06-056

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd

## BOARD ACTION

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion passes.

**ITEM 7 – 1845 FORT STOCKTON DRIVE HOUSE (Continued from April 27, June 22, 2006 and July 27, 2006)**

Applicant: Ron May on behalf of the owners, Merilee Antrim and Richard Sinkin

Location: 1845 Fort Stockton Drive, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Two-story Spanish Eclectic style with Pueblo influences residence built in 1924 by contractor Louis Dilley.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the house at 1845 Fort Stockton Drive under any HRB Criteria due to modifications that significantly impact the original character and integrity of the building.

Report Number: HRB-06-014

Staff Report by Mike Tudury.

Open public testimony

In Favor of Designation: Ron May, Richard Sinkin, Allen Hazzard, and Bruce Coons.

Opposition: None.

Public testimony closed

## BOARD DISCUSSION

Boardmember Curry stated that she felt that the additions do not significantly affect integrity and that she supports designation under Criteria A and C. Boardmember Emme stated that the additions convey a false sense of history, that Spanish Eclectic architecture is not a rare style and that better examples exist which should be designated. Boardmember Marshall stated that the additions are not consistent with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards and would not have been approved had the property been designated. He felt that it could be a contributor, but is no longer individually significant. Boardmember Sewell agreed with staff and Boardmember Marshall. Boardmember Harrison asked what precedent might be set by designating a property with modifications such as these. Boardmember Schaefer felt it was a difficult decision, but ultimately is in support of designation.

## BOARD ACTION

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO MOVE STAFF RECOMMENDATION NOT TO DESIGNATE.

Second by Boardmember Emme. Vote: 3-7(Burnett, Curry, Delawie, Harrison, McNeely, Schaefer, Silvas)-0 Motion fails.

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO APPROVE THE DESIGNATION OF THE PROPERTY UNDER CRITERIA A AND C.

Second by Boardmember Curry. Vote: 7-3(Emme, Marshall, Sewell)-0 Motion passes.

**ITEM 8 – IRVIN AND VITULIA RANDALL HOUSE (Continued from July 27, 2006 as the 3140 Third Avenue House)**

Applicant: Johnson & Johnson Architecture, on behalf of owners, Amy Kiger and David Traver,

Location: 3140 Third Avenue, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: The house is a two story Craftsman style home built in 1910.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

REVISED Staff Recommendation:

- A. Designate the Irvin and Vitulia Randall House, located at 3140 Third Avenue under HRB Criterion C as a good example of Craftsman architecture.
- B. Direct staff to incorporate the following conditions into the Mills Act contract:
  - 1) The following scope of work must be completed within 36 months of the effective date of the Mills Act contract:
    - a. Remove the open balustrade at the first floor porch and restore the half-height wall.
    - b. Reconstruct the trellis at the first floor porch.

- c. Reconstruct the half-height balcony wall at the second floor for appearances only. This area need not function as an actual balcony as it did historically, but should appear as it did historically.
  - d. Reconstruct the trellis at the second floor.
  - e. The casement window which replaced the French Doors may remain.
- 2) Building Permits for the required scope of work must be obtained from the City within 12 months of the effective date of the Mills Act contract.

Report Number: HRB-06-065

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders.

Public Testimony Opened

In Favor: Paul and Sarai Johnson, Amy Kiger

In Opposition: None

Public Testimony Closed.

BOARD DISCUSSION

From remarks by the owner, the impression was received that she wanted to delay items c and d. She agreed that because of necessary plumbing and electrical work, she and her husband won't be able to handle all items within 36 months. Ms. Kiger would like to have ten years to complete c and d. Staff was asked by Boardmember Harrison about the three-year limit. Kelley Saunders responded that staff might manage to monitor the project for three years, but it would be extremely difficult to do so for ten years. Comments were made by Boardmembers about the expense of real estate and its upkeep in San Diego, and expressed understanding of how difficult it would be for a young couple to find the money to completely restore the property in a short period of time. Cathy Winterrowd agreed that 36 months could be given for a and b, and a different schedule arranged for c and d. Boardmember Sewell pointed out that the Mills Act contract is for ten years, and stated that it seemed unfair to others and illogical to take ten years to complete all the restoration. Vice Chair Schaefer expressed the opinion that c and d seemed more primary as far as restoring the property to its original state and wondered if cost would preclude doing those items before a and b. Mr. Johnson stated that because of the estimates his clients had received for plumbing and electrical upgrades, they could manage only a and b, within three years. Boardmember McNeely stated the couple should proceed with a and b, and talk about a time frame for c and d. Boardmember Emme stated that the couple could proceed with taking care of their plumbing and electrical problems, and then come back to the board in a couple of years. Chair Burnett said the Board is trying to be more proactive.

BOARD ACTION

BOARDMEMBER HARRISON MOVED FOR THE APPROVAL OF STAFF'S RECOMMENDATIONS A AND B, AND THAT APPLICANT AND STAFF COME TO A MUTUAL AGREEMENT ON THE REMAINING ITEMS IF POSSIBLE.

Second by Boardmember Delawie.

Discussion of the motion followed. Boardmember Marshall said that the DAS committee has been burned by a lack of monitoring in the past. He suggested that this item be continued to the next meeting. Vice Chair Schaefer asked if there would be enough time to enter into a Mills Act Agreement if the item is continued. Cathy Winterrowd said that staff's recommendation would have to be formulated by October 9 in order to get this on the October agenda. The site would have to be designated in October for a Mills Act Agreement to be processed this year.

BOARDMEMBER HARRISON REVISED HIS MOTION, AND MOVED TO CONTINUE THIS ITEM TO ALLOW STAFF TO MEET WITH THE OWNERS AND MAKE A NEW RECOMMENDATION.

Second by Boardmember Delawie. Vote: 10-0-0 Motion passes.

#### **ITEM 9 – HRB SITE #630, KATHARINE SMITH/THOMAS SHEPHERD HOUSE**

Applicant: City of San Diego Historical Resources Board staff.

Location: 6019 Avenida Cresta, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

Description: The house is a one-story wood frame and stucco structure built in the French Eclectic style with Mediterranean in 1929. The property was designated by the Board in October of 2003, and the designation included elements of the landscaping including the mature Junipers and the Oleander tree in the front yard and the Eugenia (choke cherry) bushes and the box hedges in the side yard.

Today's Action: Consider amending the historic designation of City of San Diego Site No. 630, the Katherine Smith/Thomas Shepherd House, to delete the courtyard landscaping that is not visible to the public, specifically the Eugenia bushes (choke cherries) and the box hedges. The mature Junipers and Oleander tree in the front yard are to remain in the designation.

Staff Recommendation: Amend the historic designation of City of San Diego Site No. 630, the Katherine Smith/Thomas Shepherd House, to delete the courtyard landscaping that is not visible to the public, specifically the Eugenia bushes (choke cherries) and the box hedges. The mature Junipers and Oleander tree in the front yard are to remain in the designation.

Report Number: HRB-06-066

Staff Report by Mike Tudury

Public testimony: None

#### **BOARD DISCUSSION**

Boardmember Harrison asked if he would be allowed to vote, as he did not view the courtyard on his last site visit. In fact, no members viewed the courtyard as it was not visible from the public right of way, lending weight to staff's recommendation to delete the courtyard landscaping that is not visible to the public. All members were allowed to vote. Chairperson Burnett who had seen the courtyard when it was originally designated, and



knew how it had changed since its designation, suggested that in the future if the Board designated any plants, pavings, walls, etc., some type of resource management plan should be set up.

#### BOARD ACTION

BOARDMEMBER EMME MOVED STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION TO DELETE THE COURTYARD LANDSCAPING FROM THE DESIGNATION.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion passes.

THE MEETING WAS RECESSED AT 2:55 PM AND RECONVENED AT 3:15 PM.

#### ITEM 10 – HENRY LANG SPEC HOUSE #3

Applicant: John Eisenhart on behalf of Timothy and Laurie Bostrom, owners

Location: 1787 Fort Stockton Drive, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: The house is a one-story single-family Craftsman style house built in 1913.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Henry Lang Spec House # 3 under HRB Criterion D as the work of Master Builder Henry Lang.

Report Number: HRB-06-041

Staff Report by Mike Tudury

#### Public Testimony Opened

In Favor: John Eisenhart, Beth Montes

In Opposition: None

#### Public Testimony Closed

#### BOARD DISCUSSION

Boardmember Sewell questioned whether the roof, porch railing, and color are consistent with the original. Mr. Eisenhart stated that they were. Boardmember Harrison raised the question of why we don't recognize the early homes of San Diegans who later became famous. He pointed out that Lincoln's birth place is a historic site though he did nothing important in his infancy. Mike Tudury replied that there are later homes still standing in which Henry Lang lived during the most important phases of his career; for that reason, this house is not being recommended because a historic person once lived there.

Boardmember Schaefer noted that the original stucco is exposed in some locations and could eventually be restored. Boardmember Emme felt that the entryway was very contemporary and overwhelms the historic feel.

BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL MOVED STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE THE HOUSE UNDER HRB CRITERION D.

Second by Boardmember McNeely. Vote: 9-1(Emme)-0. Motion passes.

### **ITEM 11 – PACIFIC BUILDING COMPANY SPEC HOUSE #1**

Applicant: Beth Montes, on behalf of Robert Patenaude and Joe Punzalan, owners

Location: 3910 Eagle Street, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: The house is a one-story, 1,300 square foot single family residence constructed in 1912 in the Craftsman Style by the Pacific Building Company according to its own design.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Pacific Building Company Spec. House #1 under HRB Criterion A for its association with the Pacific Building Company, whose integrated design/build business strategies and innovative financing methods broadened middle class home ownership, and HRB Criterion C as a good example of an early 20<sup>th</sup> century Craftsman bungalow, retaining good integrity, from the 1912 period of significance.

Report Number: HRB-06-057

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders.

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion passes.

### **ITEM 12 – JOEL L. AND EDITH M. BROWN HOUSE**

Applicant: Vonn Marie May on behalf of Daniel and Joan Hiser, owners

Location: 4141 Lark Street, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: The house is a two-story, 3,940 square foot, symmetrical, frame and hollow tile stucco box designed in the Prairie architectural style with a brick skirt, flat roof, wide overhanging eaves and simple cornice on a concrete foundation.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Joel L. and Edith M. Brown House under HRB Criterion C as a good example of Prairie Style/Arts & Crafts architecture with Classical influences, from the 1916 period of significance. As a follow-up motion, condition a Mills Act contract to include returning metal framed windows along the Montecito Way façade to wood frame windows.

Report Number: HRB-06-058

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion passes.

**ITEM 13 – LA CASA DE LAS SIETE CANDELAS**

Applicant: Ron May, on behalf of Carl and Betty Hauck, owners

Location: 1863 Altamira Place, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: The house is a two-story, 3,101 square foot Spanish Eclectic style residence built in 1925 on a corner lot by speculative architect/builder Richard Hathaway as his personal residence.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate La Casa de las Siete Candelas, located at 1863 Altamira Place, under HRB Criterion C as an excellent example of Spanish Eclectic architecture. The designation shall include the original home, garage, maid's quarters, exterior lighting fixtures and hardware, the lath house in the rear yard, and the mature sycamore tree in the front yard. On the interior, the designation shall include the seven candle-filled niches and the Batchelder tiles in the entry floor, the entry to the music room, and as the fireplace/mantle. The solarium and carport are explicitly excluded from the designation.

Report Number: HRB-06-059

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

Public Testimony Opened

In Favor: Betty Hauck, Ron May, Allen Hazzard

In Opposition: None

Public Testimony Closed

**BOARD DISCUSSION**

Four members did not see the interior. Information about waivers was read to the Board by Cathy Winterrowd. Boardmember Harrison, who had viewed the interior, stated that the photos in the packet were very good that anyone who reviewed the packet had sufficient information to vote without actually seeing the interior. A question was raised about whether the roof tile was the original. Owner Betty said that it was. Boardmember Marshall asked the owner to provide additional information regarding restorations and modifications to the exterior. Ms. Hauck indicated that two windows on the main elevation had been replaced in-kind due to wood rot and warping materials.

**BOARD ACTION**

BOARDMEMBER HARRISON MOVED THAT A WAIVER BE GRANTED TO THE BOARDMEMBERS WHO HAD NOT SEEN THE INTERIOR AND THAT THEY BE ALLOWED TO VOTE ON THIS ITEM.

Second by Boardmember McNeely. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion carries.

BOARDMEMBER HARRISON MOVED STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE THE HOUSE UNDER HRB CRITERION C.

Second by Boardmember McNeely. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion carries.

**ITEM 14 – ALBERTA SECURITY COMPANY/MARTIN V. MELHORN SPEC HOUSE #1**

Applicant: Ron May, on behalf of Rie Kanasugi and C. Giovanni Arroba, owners

Location: 1201 West Arbor Drive, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: The house is a one-and-two-story, 1,500 square foot Craftsman style residence built in 1914 on a corner lot by speculative Master Architect/Builder Martin V. Melhorn.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Alberta Security Company/Martin V. Melhorn Spec House #1, located at 1201 West Arbor Drive, under HRB Criteria C as an excellent example of Craftsman “Airplane Bungalow” architecture with Asian influences, and under HRB Criterion D as a representative and excellent example of the work of Master Architect/Builder Martin V. Melhorn.

Report Number: HRB-06-063

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE  
CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion passes.

**ITEM 15 – CHARLES AND MATIE SUMNER HOUSE**

Applicant: Ruth Alter, on behalf of William and Olga Holland, owners

Location: 2820 Chatsworth Boulevard, Peninsula Community, Council District 2

Description: The house is a two-story, 3,000 square foot Prairie style residence with Colonial Revival influences built in 1915 by Charles and Matie Sumner as their personal residence.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Charles and Matie Sumner House, located at 2820 Chatsworth Boulevard, under HRB Criterion C as an excellent example of Prairie architecture with Colonial Revival influences.

Report Number: HRB-06-060

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE  
CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion passes.

**ITEM 16 – WILLIAM TEMPLETON JOHNSON SPEC HOUSE #1**

Applicant: Vonn Marie May on behalf of J. Terrence and Colleen O’Malley, owners

Location: 4467 Ampudia Street, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: The house is a one-and-two-story, 4,070 square foot Spanish Eclectic style residence with Moorish influences built in 1926 as a speculative house by Master Architect William Templeton Johnson, who sold it to Moritz Trepte shortly after its completion.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the William Templeton Johnson Spec House #1, located at 4467 Ampudia Street, under HRB Criteria C as an excellent example of Spanish Eclectic architecture with Moorish influences, and under HRB Criterion D as a representative and excellent example of the work of Master Architect William Templeton Johnson.

Report Number: HRB-06-061

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders.

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE  
CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion passes.

#### **ITEM 17 – WHEELER BAILEY/IRVING GILL HOUSE**

Applicant: Marie Lia, on behalf of The Reynolds Family, owner

Location: 7964 Princess Street, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

Description: The house is a two-story stucco asymmetrical Craftsman and International style home designed and built in 1907 by Master Architect Irving Gill and remodeled by Gill in 1932.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Wheeler Bailey/Irving Gill House under HRB Criterion C as an excellent example of Craftsman and International style architecture, and under HRB Criterion D as an excellent example of the architectural style of Irving Gill which evolved from Craftsman to International style, exhibiting many characteristics of these styles in form, material, detail and feel.

Report Number: HRB-06-062

Staff Report by Mike Tudury

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE  
CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion passes.

THE MEETING WAS RECESSED AT 3:40 PM AND RECONVENED AT 3:52 PM.

#### **ITEM 18A and 18B – SALK INSTITUTE**

**18A** – Informational Item: Presentation of the Salk Institute National Register Nomination

Presenters: Jeffery Shorn, Vonn Marie May and Courtney Ann Coyle

Location: 10010 Torrey Pines Road, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

Description Presentation of the Salk Institute National Register Nomination and response to the nomination from Salk Institute representatives.

Today's Action: None

Public Testimony Opened

None (Presentation by Courtney Coyle, Vonn Marie May, and Jeffrey Shorn with a response from Chris Von Planck)

Public Testimony Closed

BOARD ACTION:

NONE

**18B** – Board Recommendation on Consistency with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Salk Institute Master Plan and Development

Applicant: Salk Institute for Biological Studies

Location: 10010 Torrey Pines Road, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

Description Review proposed project for compliance with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Today's Action: Determine whether or not the proposed Salk Institute project meets the U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Staff Recommendation:

- 1) Find that, with the exception of the Torrey East Building, the proposed Master Plan, Design Guidelines, and new construction are consistent with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation with respect to the adjacent, historically designated Louis Kahn-designed Salk Institute for Biological Studies building based on the 1991 City of San Diego designation, but not consistent with the more recent listing at the State level and the proposed listing at the National level. The specific Standards for Rehabilitation that apply to the proposed new development are Standards 1, 2, 3, 8, 9 and 10.
- 2) Find that, as currently proposed, the design of the Torrey East Building is not consistent with the Standards, with respect to the adjacent, historically designated Louis Kahn-designed Salk Institute for Biological Studies building based on the 1991 City of San Diego designation and the more recent listing at the State level and the proposed listing at the National level. The specific Standards for Rehabilitation that apply to the proposed new development are Standards 1, 2, 3, 8, 9 and 10.

Report Number: HRB-06-064

Staff Report by Mike Tudury

Public Testimony Opened

In Favor: Beth Alton, Mark Rowson, Jack McAllistor, Chris Von Planck, Michael Schuerman, Bruce Coons

In Opposition: John Eisenhart, Courtney Coyle, Vonn Marie May

Public Testimony Closed

## BOARD DISCUSSION

Boardmember Marshall noticed a number of inconsistencies relating to glazing types identified in the architectural design guidelines; the local, state and national designations/nominations; the CEQA determination; and building height (staff report said that Salk will adhere to the Coastal Height Limit of 30 feet, but Salk's report say there would be a deviation from the 30-foot height limit). Mike Tudury responded to the height issue, stating that height is measured in several ways. The applicant is proposing to deviate from the base zone height, which allows deviations, but will be complying with the 30' Coastal height limit established by Proposition D, which would require a vote of the people to change. Salk confirmed that they would meet the Prop D Coastal height limit.

Boardmember Emme stated that the main view issue is from within the complex toward the ocean, and that the proposed buildings are a great distance from the historic Kahn structure. Boardmember Silvas stated that SB18 needed to be addressed. Staff responded that they will be inviting SB18 consultation. Chairperson Burnett was disappointed in the lack of attention to landscape at this point, despite direction given at DAS, and stated that a landscape management plan must be incorporated into the Design Guidelines.

Boardmember Marshall felt that the alternative design for the Torrey East building presented at the hearing was moving in the right direction, but felt uncomfortable supporting it without further review and information. Boardmember Schaefer felt that it is important to preserve the experience of Salk and stated that the CEQA review process should resolve the remaining issues.

## BOARD ACTION

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO CONTINUE THE ITEM.

No second. Motion fails.

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO DETERMINE THAT THE MASTER PLAN AND DESIGN GUIDELINES (AND IN PARTICULAR THE LANDSCAPE MAINTENANCE PLAN) ARE NOT CONSISTENT WITH THE STANDARDS; AND THAT THE REVISED TORREY EAST BUILDING PRESENTED AT THE HEARING IS MOVING IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION TOWARD CONSISTENCY WITH THE STANDARDS.

Second by McNeely. Vote 4-2(Harrison, Emme)-0. Motion passes.

ADJOURNED AT 6:15 PM.

*NOTE: All Historical Resources Board meetings are tape recorded and kept on file with the City of San Diego City Planning and Community Investment Department. Upon request, copies of the tapes can be obtained by calling the Department at 619-235-5200.*