

CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD

MINUTES OF REGULAR SCHEDULED MEETING OF

October 26, 2006

COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM – 12TH FLOOR
CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Burnett at 1:08 PM.

ATTENDANCE DURING THE MEETING

Chairperson	Laura Burnett	Present
Vice Chairperson	Jerry Schaefer	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present -Left Meeting at 4:10 PM
Boardmember	Homer Delawie	Absent
Boardmember	Otto Emme	Present
Boardmember	Don Harrison	Present
Boardmember	David Marshall	Present
Boardmember	Delores McNeely	Absent
Boardmember	Marsha Sewell	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance: Delores Johnson, Board Secretary
Cathy Winterrowd, Senior Planner
Dian Kane, Senior Planner
Kelley Saunders, Senior Planner
Mike Tudury, Senior Planner/Architect
Ginger Weatherford, Intern

Nina Fain-Newman, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1A. - APPROVAL OF MINUTES of September 28, 2006

Staff was unable to prepare the minutes in time for consideration at this meeting. This item was trailed to the November 30, 2006 meeting.

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

- Kristin Harms spoke on behalf of preventing demolition by neglect. She was concerned, specifically about a log cabin located at 4656 North Avenue, which is in very bad shape. She would like to Board to do something to prevent it from continuing to deteriorate.

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS**A. Board Administrative Matters and General Information**

- **ABSENCES**
Boardmember McNeely is out of the country. Boardmember Delawie is absent because of a death in the family.
- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**
E-mails were received re Item 5 – 4374 Cleveland Avenue House. They were received during the last two days with not enough time to mail them to Boardmembers, so were distributed just before the beginning of this meeting.
- **GENERAL BOARDMEMBER COMMENTS**
There were no general comments from Boardmembers.

B. Subcommittee Reports

The Design Assistance Subcommittee met on October 4, 2006 to consider demolition of HRB site # 294 at 921, 925 and 927 Coast Blvd South, the Colonial Inn Project Sites, designated on 12/5/1990, in order to construct a proposed new building which would provide parking and additional hotel rooms to serve the existing historical hotel complex on the property; the design of an existing second unit at an Irving Gill-designed house at 3415 Albatross Street; an addition to the rear of a potentially historic Craftsman style house located at 3230 Homer Street including modification to an existing central dormer at the front elevation; a revised design for development adjacent to the Lafayette Hotel focusing on the relationship of the historic hotel to the proposed new structures on the rear portion of the full-block site; proposed modifications to the front porch, brick piers and driveway at 3157 Maple Street, a contributing structure to the Burlingame Historic District; a mitigation plan consisting of HABS documentation relative to demolition of the designated resource at 1619 J Street, in light of the designation appeal and an affordable housing project now proposed for the property; and, two outstanding issues related to The Salk Institute to determine whether the building design, master plan and guidelines are consistent with the Standards so that the review in the EIR can be focused on those aspects that are not consistent. The next DAS meeting will be on Wednesday, November 1, 2006 at 3 PM.

The Policy Subcommittee met earlier today and considered proposed revisions to the HRB District Policy and Guidelines for Designation under HRB Criteria B and F. The next Policy Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, November 13, 2006 at 2:00 PM, with the first hour reserved for a discussion of HRB Criterion A.

The Archaeology Subcommittee did not meet in October 2006. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, November 13, 2006 at 4 PM.

C. Conflict of Interest Declarations/Failures to View

Boardmember Emme reported that he had a conflict on Item #5 and would not be voting. Boardmember Marshall disclosed that his firm is working with the architect for Item #5, Golba Architecture, on another unrelated project. That association won't influence his opinion, but he wanted to disclose the relationship. Boardmembers Harrison, Curry, Emme, Burnett and Silvas revealed that they weren't able to view the interior of Item #6. Boardmember Marshall pointed out that there are photos of the interior included in the packet that was distributed just before the meeting, and that those photos should be sufficient for a judgment. As the viewing of the interior was by appointment only, he felt that some flexibility should be given the Board, and that should be sufficient for a waiver.

D. Staff Report

On October 17, 2006 the Mayor announced the appointment of Priscilla Ann Berge, John Howard Eisenhart, and Robert A. Vacchi, and the reappointment of Maria Curry, P. David Marshall, and Louis Otto Emme for service on the Historical Resources Board, subject to City Council confirmation. The confirmation hearing is expected to occur on November 14, 2006. New members would be sworn in at the November 30th meeting.

Kelley Saunders has been promoted to Senior Planner. Kelley has five years experience at the City, the first two-and-a-half with the HRB, then two years as a current planner in Development Services, and the last six months back with the Board. She brings a wealth of knowledge of both historic preservation and City processing and review procedures to the Historical Resources section.

Ginger Weatherford has now joined the section as an Intern. Ginger holds Bachelor's and Master's degrees in Historic Preservation/Architecture from Tulane University and is continuing her education in photography/visual arts. Ginger will be working on the HRB library and archives to provide better efficiency and will create an inventory of established Master Architects, Builders, Landscape Architects, and others for reference by the public and staff use. She will also help out with voluntary designations, site photography, PowerPoint presentations, and other tasks.

Staff has scheduled 11 designation requests from the public on today's agenda; in addition two items are continued from previous meetings; one referral from Development Services, and one special commendation. All complete designation requests that were submitted in 2005 have

now been reviewed by staff and brought to the Board. So far in 2006, there have been 54 designation requests submitted by the public, including one request since the last Board meeting.

Boardmember Emme asked how many requests are received by staff from Development Services. Staff responded that the four staff members probably average one or two calls a day from DSD. There are one or two more formal requests each week.

E. Requests for Continuances

None were received by staff.

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

The following non-controversial items, with all parties agreeable to the staff recommendation, were placed on the Consent Agenda:

- ITEM 10 – JOHN AND ALICE WOODSIDE SPEC HOUSE #1 at 2738 Dale Street
- ITEM 11 – HOMER CHANDLER HOUSE at 3542 Herbert Street
- ITEM 13 – TUDOR RODGERS/MARTIN V. MELHORN HOUSE at 4060 Alameda Drive
- ITEM 14 – CONRAD AND IDA FELGER HOUSE at 4052 Albatross
- ITEM 15 – GEORGE GANS SPEC HOUSE #2 at 3565 Herman Avenue
- ITEM 16 – ARTHUR BRADSHAW HOUSE at 3729 Amaryllis Drive
- ITEM 18A – STAR OF INDIA located at 1306 North Harbor Drive
- ITEM 18B – SPECIAL COMMENDATION FOR EXCELLENCE IN HISTORIC PRESERVATION TO THE SAN DIEGO MARITIME MUSEUM AND THE STAR OF INDIA

Boardmember Emme stated that although he didn't want Item 14 withdrawn from the Consent Agenda, he would vote No on that item.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO PLACE ITEMS 10, 11, 13, 14, 15, 16, 18A AND 18B ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 9-0-0 (Items 10, 11, 12, 13, 16, 18A and 18B)
8-1(Emme)-0 (Item14)

Public Testimony on Items on the Consent Agenda

Elizabeth Pinedo, owner of 3729Amaryllis Drive, thanked the Board for designating her home. Deeba Zaher, of 2738 Dale Street, thanked the Board on behalf of herself and her husband. She said the two of them felt that they were caretakers of their wonderful home, and want to make sure

that it stays wonderful. Joy Wright-MacDade, owner of the Homer Chandler House, said that she and her husband really appreciated the designation and plan on maintaining the integrity and character of the house. William McCall, owner of the property at 4060 Alameda Drive, thanked the Board as well, and said he and his wife were excited about making the house available for everyone. Ray Ashley, representing the Star of India, thanked the Board on behalf of his organization for the designation. He said that the Star of India is testimony to the City's care and concern of its own history. She is one of 19 ships on the list of the World Ship Trust International Organization. That places it on the same list of World Treasures as the Great Wall of China and the Parthenon.

Chair Presentation: Chairperson Burnett presented a special commendation for excellence in preservation to Mr. Ashley for the San Diego Maritime Museum.

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – 4374 CLEVELAND AVENUE HOUSE (continued from August 24, 2006)

Applicant: City of San Diego, referral from the Development Services Department

Location: 4374 Cleveland Avenue, Uptown Community, Council District 3

Description: The house is a one-and-one-half story Craftsman style home built in 1912.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the house under any HRB Criteria, due to modifications which have compromised the architectural and historical integrity of the house.

Report Number: HRB-06-046

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

Public Testimony Opened

In Favor: Scott Moomjian and Tim Golba

In Opposition: Christine Mann (9 individuals deferred their time to this speaker), Bruce Coons, Alex Sachs, (Deputy City Attorney, speaking as a private citizen), Kristin Harms, and Leo Wilson

Public Testimony Closed

BOARD DISCUSSION

Boardmember Curry voiced the opinion that although communities such as Mission Hills and La Jolla are relatively well represented with historical sites, working class communities are losing their sense of history, with few designations. Boardmember Harrison reminded the Board that if the property owner wanted designation, the Board would not accept the property as it is, without a number of changes to restore it to its historical character. He, therefore, questioned how the Board could designate this property as is with all its changes.

Boardmember Marshall agreed with this assessment, although he, along with other members of DAS, had thought that the owner could restore the house, and add units at the rear, thus making a "win-win" situation. Boardmember Schaefer agreed with Boardmember Marshall.

Boardmember Sewell felt that the house should be incorporated into the new project. Boardmember Silvas stated that he was on the fence, but can support designation under Criterion A.

BOARD ACTION

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SILVAS TO DESIGNATE THE PROPERTY UNDER CRITERION A AS A COMMUNITY RESOURCE THAT REFLECTS THE GENERAL DEVELOPMENT OF UNIVERSITY HEIGHTS.

Second by Boardmember Harrison

Discussion of Motion: Scott Moomjian, who still had three minutes to speak, questioned whether the Board could designate the property under any criteria as the building no longer had integrity because of its changes. Boardmember Harrison asked City Attorney Nina Fain-Newman if the Board could vote to designate under Criteria A. She stated that she could see no legal reason why the Board would be precluded from designating under any criterion it deemed appropriate.

Vote on Above Motion: 5-2(Marshall, Schaefer)-0 Motion fails.

Further Board Discussion: Boardmember Curry raised the question of whether it is the Board's role to be overly concerned about an applicant's ability to make restorations to property. If there is enough money to develop property, then there is enough to restore it. In her opinion, money should be a concern only in cases of economic hardship.

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CURRY TO DESIGNATE THE PROPERTY UNDER CRITERION C.

Second by Silvas. Vote: 4-3(Harrison, Schafer, Marshall)-0 Motion fails.

THE MEETING WAS RECESSED AT 2:36 AND RECONVENED AT 2:45.

ITEM 6 – 3140 THIRD AVENUE (Continued from September 28, 2006 and July 27, 2006)

Applicant: Johnson & Johnson Architecture, on behalf of owners, Amy Kiger and David Traver,

Location: 3140 Third Avenue, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: The house is a two story Craftsman style home built in 1910.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the house under any HRB Criteria, due to modifications which have compromised the architectural and historical integrity of the house and the homeowner's inability to implement the directed scope of work from the Design Assistance Subcommittee.

Report Numbers: HRB-06-035 and HRB-06-065

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

Public Testimony Opened

In Favor: No one

In Opposition: Paul and Sarai Johnson, Amy Kiger, and David Traver

Public Testimony Closed

BOARD DISCUSSION

Boardmembers agreed that the house had character-defining features and integrity that made it worthy of designation if it could be restored; they also understood that a young couple could have financial problems restoring the entire house in a three-year period. As the applicants had been directed to meet with staff to “work something out,” the question was raised of “What happened?” Staff reported that though the owners were willing a) to remove the open balustrade at the first floor porch and restore the half-height wall, as well as b) reconstruct the trellis at the first floor porch within three years, they couldn’t commit to c) reconstructing the half-height balcony wall at the second floor or d) reconstructing the trellis at the second floor within three years or even a ten-year period, and therefore preferred to have those items left out. The owners were asked if that was correct. Amy Kriger said that they were out of town when DAS met, so they met with staff later and indeed, they could only handle the first two items within a three-year period, and preferred not to commit to do everything within a ten-year period, but were willing to do so if necessary. Boardmember Emme stated that he believed the couple should withdraw their request and resubmit it after they had made the restorations or agree to a, b, c, and d; he also stated that having the property designated and a Mills Act Agreement entered into were privileges, not rights. Boardmember Harrison stated that he felt 10 years was a reasonable timeframe to complete items c and d.

BOARD ACTION

MOTION BY VICE CHAIR SCHAEFER TO DESIGNATE THE EXTERIOR UNDER HRB CRITERION C WITH THE CONDITIONS OF A AND B, THE RESTORATION OF THE FIRST FLOOR TERRACE AND BALUSTRADE AND RECONSTRUCTION OF THE FIRST-FLOOR TRELLIS WITHIN THREE YEARS AND THAT BUILDING PERMITS FOR THE REQUIRED SCOPE OF WORK MUST BE OBTAINED FROM THE CITY WITHIN 12 MONTHS.

Second by Curry. Vote: 5-3(Emme, Harrison, Sewell)-0 Motion fails.

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO DESIGNATE THE HOUSE UNDER HRB CRITERION C WITH THE FOLLOWING MILLS ACT AGREEMENT CONDITIONS:

1) THE OWNER MUST RECEIVE BUILDING PERMITS FROM THE CITY WITHIN TWELVE (12) MONTHS OF THE EFFECTIVE DATE OF THIS CONTRACT AND THE WORK MUST BE COMPLETED WITHIN THIRTY-SIX (36) MONTHS OF THE EFFECTIVE DATE OF THIS CONTRACT FOR THE FOLLOWING SCOPE OF WORK:

(A) REMOVE THE OPEN BALUSTRADE AT THE FIRST FLOOR PORCH AND RESTORE THE HALF-HEIGHT WALL.

(B) RECONSTRUCT THE TRELLIS AT THE FIRST FLOOR PORCH.

2) THE OWNER MUST COMPLETE WITHIN TEN (10) YEARS OF THE EFFECTIVE DATE OF THIS CONTRACT THE FOLLOWING SCOPE OF WORK:

(C) RECONSTRUCT THE HALF-HEIGHT BALCONY WALL AT THE SECOND FLOOR FOR APPEARANCES ONLY. THIS AREA NEED NOT FUNCTION AS AN ACTUAL BALCONY AS IT DID HISTORICALLY, BUT SHOULD APPEAR AS IT DID HISTORICALLY. THE CASEMENT WINDOW WHICH REPLACED THE FRENCH DOORS MAY REMAIN.

(D) RECONSTRUCT THE TRELLIS AT THE SECOND FLOOR.

Board Discussion: The owners were asked if they were willing to comply if conditions c and d were to be added to a Mills Act Agreement and fulfilled within a ten-year period. They said yes. Boardmember Emme said that they might sell the house within ten years and therefore never comply. Cathy Winterrowd said that the Mills Act Agreement would be binding on the new owner and that there is a substantial financial penalty for non-compliance.

Second by Curry: Vote: 6-2(Emme, Sewell)-0. Motion passes.

Chairperson Burnett directed staff to put the scope of work in writing for the owners before a Mills Act Agreement is drafted.

Chairperson Burnett asked for a waiver to allow the Board to vote on the interior of the house. Boardmember Harrison said that he felt uncomfortable voting on such a motion as five people had not seen the interior of the house. Boardmember Marshall said that he felt that more interiors should be designated as they are an important part of the fabric of a building, even though it means more work for staff and Boardmembers to view them. He mentioned the Balboa Theater and its interior, though it is a public building. However, he agrees with Ms. Sewell that the Board needs to develop some policy on what standards will be used to designate interiors, and suggested that this be discussed at a Policy Subcommittee meeting.

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO TABLE CONSIDERATION OF THE INTERIOR UNTIL A FUTURE UNDETERMINED DATE.

Second by Curry. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 7 – 2231 LA CALLECITA HOUSE

Applicant: Ron May, Legacy 106, on behalf of the owners, Robert and Michele Bushman

Location: 2231 La Callecita, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: This single story house built in 1948 is designed in the Minimal Traditional/Ranch style with subtle Colonial influences, comprised of wood frame construction on a reinforced concrete foundation.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the house at 2231 La Callecita because it does not meet HRB designation criteria for its association with significant people or builders, nor does it meet adopted staff procedures on determining the significance of post-war ranch style houses for individual designation.

Report Number: HRB-06-050

Staff Report by Diane Kane.

Public Testimony Opened

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Ron and Dale May, and Robert and Michelle Bushman

Public Testimony Closed

BOARD DISCUSSION

Boardmember Harrison thanked Ron May for an excellent presentation, and a good depiction. He believes that this house tells the story of his parents' generation. There were three rough periods in a row in this country: the Depression, the War, and the Post-War years. This house represents the type of home lived in by defense workers and others who came to San Diego during those years. Boardmember Emme said that the landscaping and hardscaping detracts from the house. Boardmember Curry suggested the Board reconsider the house at a future date when the house is a little older.

BOARD ACTION

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER EMME TO MOVE STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO NOT DESIGNATE THE HOUSE UNDER ANY HRB CRITERIA.

Second by Sewell. Vote: 4-4(Burnett, Curry, Harrison, Silvas)-0. Motion fails.

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO DESIGNATE UNDER CRITERION C.

No second.

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CURRY TO TABLE THE MOTION UNTIL A FUTURE UNDETERMINED DATE.

Second by Silvas. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 8 – NATHAN RIGDON SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Vonn Marie May, on behalf of Wallace and Julie Halliday, owners

Location: 2206 Fort Stockton Drive, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: The house is a Prairie style home built by Master Builder Nathan Rigdon.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Nathan Rigdon Spec House #1 under HRB Criteria C as an excellent example of Prairie architecture, and D as the work of Master Builder Nathan Rigdon.
Report Number: HRB-06-065

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd

Public Testimony Opened

In Favor: Vonn Marie May

In Opposition: None

Public Testimony Closed

BOARD DISCUSSION

Boardmember Marshall had asked to have this item pulled from the Consent Agenda because of the strongly textured stucco treatment, which destroys the design intent of the architecture. Ms. May said that her client had to leave before this item was heard, and doesn't know what the owner can do or is willing to do to remedy the stucco treatment. At the time it was done, it was a highly touted treatment. Boardmember Emme pointed out that the Board has designated at least one house that he knows of which had a worse stucco treatment. Vice Chair Schaefer felt that the architecture is impressive, but the stucco detracts from it. Diane Kane said that there is a proposed Fort Stockton District and that this house would certainly be a contributor to that district. Because of the stucco, Boardmember Marshall said he could not support the house under HRB Criteria C as an excellent example of Prairie architecture, as stucco of this texture would not normally be used.

BOARD ACTION

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO DESIGNATE UNDER CRITERION D AS THE WORK OF MASTER BUILDER NATHAN RIGDON.

Second by Sewell. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion carries.

ITEM 9 – WILLIAM AND FANNIE KIELSMEIER HOUSE

Applicant: Amir and Betsy Shirazi, owners

Location: 4268 Adams Avenue, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the William and Fannie Kielsmeier House as a Historical Resource.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the William and Fannie Kielsmeier House as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as a good example of Spanish Eclectic architecture.

Report Number: HRB-06-066

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

BOARD DISCUSSION

Vice Chair Schaefer, who pulled the item from the consent agenda, said that he was distracted by the wall around the property and other recent modifications that were not in keeping with the house. Boardmember Sewell agreed; she said that because of the hardscaping and landscaping, the house wasn't visible from the public right-of-way; she had to get out of her car to see it. Boardmember Emme agreed; he had a problem with the setting, saying that the accoutrements were overwhelming; the landscaping and hardscaping were overdone. Boardmember Marshall also agreed. Kelley Saunders said that staff initially had many of the same concerns, but noted that many of the elements in question were added on to the house with little or no loss of historic fabric and could easily be reversed. In addition, the applicant had taken steps to increase visibility, including replacing the thick wooden lattice from the wall and replacing it with an iron fence that increased visibility. Mills Act Agreement conditions could also be incorporated to increase visibility. Chairperson Burnett noted that the landscape features could be excluded from the designation. Boardmember Harrison thinks that the traffic and noise may be the reason for the wall. Betsy Shirazi said that she and her husband Amir have only owned the house since March, but they have had some of the same concerns as the Board. They have replaced the wooden trellis with a wrought iron one and have removed an aluminum-and-glass enclosure of the side entryway. They are open to suggestions from the Board on what to do to restore the exterior. They would like to maintain the wall, due to heavy street traffic.

BOARD ACTION

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO CONTINUE THE ITEM PENDING REVIEW AND INPUT FROM THE DESIGN ASSISTANCE SUBCOMMITTEE.

Second by Harrison.

Discussion of Motion: Boardmember Emme questioned whether items already heard by the Board should be referred to DAS, and suggested that consultants tell their clients that the votes of the Board aren't guaranteed. Boardmember Marshall said that he thinks that it is indeed the role of DAS, even though the agendas are getting longer.

Vote: 6-1(Emme)-0. Motion carries.

ITEM 10 – JOHN AND ALICE WOODSIDE SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Linda Canada, on behalf of owners Deeba Zaher and H. Doug Gray

Location: 2738 Dale Street, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the John and Alice Woodside Spec House #1 as a Historical Resource.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the John and Alice Woodside Spec House #1 as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as a good example of Craftsman architecture.

Report Number: HRB-06-067

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

BOARD ACTION

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO PLACE THIS ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Second by Sewell. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion carries.

ITEM 11 – HOMER CHANDLER HOUSE

Applicant: Johnson and Johnson on behalf of owners Dennis and Joy Wright-MacDade

Location: 3542 Herbert Street, Uptown Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the Homer Chandler House as a Historical Resource.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate under HRB Criterion C as a good and unique example of a Craftsman style structure.

Report Number: HRB-06-068

Staff Report by Mike Tudury

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO PLACE THIS ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Second by Sewell. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion carries.

ITEM 12 – 3303 28TH STREET HOUSE

Applicant: Vonn Marie May on behalf of owners

Location: 3303 28th Street, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the house at 3303 28th Street as a Historical Resource.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the house under any HRB Criteria due to a substantial modification to the stucco which has adversely impacted the resource.

Report Number: HRB-06-069

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

Public Testimony Opened

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Vonn Marie May and Clark Settles

Public Testimony Closed

BOARD DISCUSSION

Questions were raised about whether the heavily textured stucco imbedded with pebbles, which obscured some features and covered window sills and wood trim, was original. The applicant felt that it was, noting that the existing stucco in intact behind very old landscape elements. Boardmember Marshall stated that he has seen similar stucco work in Coronado and that the stucco may be original and simply painted over poorly.

BOARD ACTION

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO DESIGNATE UNDER CRITERION C AS A GOOD EXAMPLE OF SPANISH ECLECTIC ARCHITECTURE.

Second by Harrison. Vote: 6-1(Emme)-0. Motion carries.

ITEM 13 – TUDOR RODGERS/MARTIN V. MELHORN HOUSE

Applicant: William and Sandra McColl, owners, with Allen Hazard and Janet O’Dea

Location: 4060 Alameda Drive, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the Tudor Rodgers/Martin V. Melhorn House as a Historical Resource.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Tudor Rodgers/Martin V. Melhorn House as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as an excellent example of Craftsman architecture, and under HRB Criterion D as one of the earliest, if not the first home built in San Diego by Master Architect/Builder Martin V. Melhorn.

Report Number: HRB-06-070

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO PLACE THIS ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Second by Sewell. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion carries.

ITEM 14 – CONRAD AND IDA FELGER HOUSE

Applicant: Ruth Alter, on behalf of owners Osborne Olson, Rita Blackwood and Paul Freidson

Location: 4052 Albatross Street, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the 4052 Albatross House as a Historical Resource.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Conrad and Ida Felger House under HRB Criterion C as a good example of Craftsman architecture. Require the owner to consult with the Design Assistance Subcommittee to discuss various treatment options for repairing damage to the brick porch piers as part of a Mills Act contract.

Report Number: HRB-06-071

Staff Report by Diane Kane

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO PLACE THIS ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Second by Sewell. Vote: 7-1(Emme)-0. Motion carries.

ITEM 15 – GEORGE GANS SPEC HOUSE #2

Applicant: Scott Moomjian, on behalf of owner Mr. Peter Dixon and Dr. Gary Dick

Location: 3565 Herman Avenue, North Park Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the George Gans Spec House #2 as a Historical Resource.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the George Gans Spec. House #2 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of an early 20th century Craftsman bungalow, retaining good integrity, from its 1925 period of significance, and HRB Criterion D, as a good example of Master Builder George Gans.

Report Number: HRB-06-072

Staff Report by Mike Tudury

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO PLACE THIS ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Second by Sewell. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion carries.

ITEM 16 – ARTHUR BRADSHAW HOUSE

Applicant: Ruth Alter/Archeos on behalf of owners Rafael and Catherine Pinedo

Location: 3729 Amaryllis Drive, Peninsula Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the Arthur Bradshaw House as a Historical Resource.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Arthur Bradshaw House under HRB Criterion C a good example of the Spanish Eclectic style evidencing many of the characteristics of that style.

Report Number: HRB-06-073

Staff Report by Mike Tudury

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO PLACE THIS ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Second by Sewell. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion carries.

ITEM 17 – M.B. AND IDA IRVIN SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: City of San Diego Development Services Department

Location: 3960 Alameda Place, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the M.B. and Ida Irvin Spec House #1 as a Historical Resource.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the M.B. and Ida Irvin Spec House #1 located at 3960 Alameda Place as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as a good example of Spanish Eclectic architecture.

Report Number: HRB-06-074

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

Public Testimony Opened

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian and Matt Reno

Public Testimony Closed

BOARD DISCUSSION

Boardmember Marshall noted that the stucco was new, but it did not dramatically change the look of the house which retains a high degree of integrity, and is well designed. He said that it is a fairly unique example of the style – modern, some Irvin Gill influences, potentially.

Boardmember Sewell agreed. As those opposed to designation suggested this home was not among the best examples of Spanish Eclectic architecture, Boardmember Harrison posed the question of whether there should be a limited number of homes for the various types of architecture. Boardmember Sewell stated that by segregating “the best” of a particular style and tearing down the rest, we would be eliminating a style of architecture that working class people can afford, thereby losing a part of our history. Boardmember Schaefer said that this particular home had a combination of boldly used elements such as the multi-paned windows in a row up front; it’s boldly used with the tile and extends across the entire façade and across to integrate the porte-cochere in a very good way with the prominent roof elements and the buttresses of the wall are decorated and it all fits together very nicely.

BOARD ACTION

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO MOVE STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER CRITERION C.

Second by Schaefer. Vote: 6-1(Harrison)-0. Motion carries.

ITEM 18A & 18B – STAR OF INDIA**18A – Designation of the Star of India to the San Diego Register**

Applicant: San Diego Maritime Museum

Location: 1306 North Harbor Drive, Centre City Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the Star of India as a Historical Resource.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Star of India, an 1863 iron-hulled three masted bark listed as both a National and a State Historic landmark for its international, national and state-wide significance, as a historical resource under HRB Criterion E.

Report Number: HRB-06-075

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO PLACE THIS ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Second by Sewell. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion carries.

18B – Special Commendation for Excellence in Historic Preservation to the San Diego Maritime Museum and the Star of India

Applicant: Historical Resources Board Staff

Location: 1306 North Harbor Drive, Centre City Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider awarding the San Diego Maritime Museum with a Special Commendation for Excellence in Historic Preservation.

Today's Action: Approve the special commendation or do not approve.

Staff Recommendation: Award the San Diego Maritime Museum with a Special Commendation for Excellence in Historic Preservation for their continued stewardship and preservation of the Star of India, the oldest merchant ship still afloat, the oldest iron-hulled vessel afloat, and the world's second-oldest active ship, in honor of the 143rd birthday of the Star of India.

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO PLACE THIS ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Second by Sewell. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion carries.

REMINDER: Next Board meeting is on Thursday, November 30, 2006

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:10 PM.

NOTE: All Historical Resources Board meetings are tape recorded and kept on file with the City of San Diego City Planning and Community Investment Department. Upon request, copies of the tapes can be obtained by calling the Department at 619-235-5200.