

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF JULY 25, 2013
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12th FLOOR
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:06PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Gail Garbini	Present
2 nd Vice Chairperson	Linda Marrone	Present
Boardmember	Michael Baksh	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present
Boardmember	Tom Larimer	Present
Boardmember	Evelya Rivera	Present <i>arrived at 1:22PM</i>
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Absent
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
 Cathy Winterrowd, Interim Deputy Director
 Jodie Brown, Senior Planner
 Camille Pekarek, Planning Intern

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Corrine Neuffer, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR April 25, 2013

BOARD ACTION:

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FOR THE
APRIL 25, 2013 AS WRITTEN**

Seconded by	Vote: 7-0-2	Motion Passes
	<i>(Lemmo, Garbini)</i>	

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

• **ABSENCES**

Boardmember Silvas advised staff he would not be able to attend this meeting.

• **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Draft April Minutes
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

• **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

Boardmember Marrone would like the Board to be notified prior to the Council Hearing for items that have been appealed.

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

• **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

• **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

None

C. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

None

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 6 – HORTON AND HELEN TITUS HOUSE

ITEM 7 – LEWIS AND ANNIE DODGE SPEC HOUSE #1

ITEM 8 – MORRIS AND IDA IRVIN SPEC HOUSE #2

Vice –Chair Garbini pulled Item 6

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEMS 7 AND 8 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 9-0-0

Motion Passes

INFORMATION ITEMS

ITEM A – SOUTHEASTERN SAN DIEGO HISTORIC CONTEXT STATEMENT

The historic consultant, Ruth Todd from Page and Turnbull, will update the Board on the status of the Southeastern San Diego Context Statement. No action on the part of the Board is required.

Boardmember Curry likes the integrity discussion. Cannot apply the same standards to all buildings, but there are no real rules when looking for districts. Difficult to have districts in this area because of the population shifts. She insists on more participation from the people living in these neighborhoods.

Boardmember Berge is pleased with the document.

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – PULLED FROM THE AGENDA

ITEM 6 – HORTON AND HELEN TITUS HOUSE

Applicant: Thome Family Trust represented by Scott Moomjian

Location: 3114 Lawrence Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1288 4-A)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3114 Lawrence Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Horton and Helen Titus House located at 3114 Lawrence Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the more recently constructed two story garage and laundry room located at the northwest corner of the house.

Report Number: HRB 13-035

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Scott Moomjian, Kim Grant, Joseph Thorne

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Vice-Chair Garbini thought that the landscaping was old and very unusual; very similar to Pico Island in Azores. They probably brought the trees in from Pico Island, particularly the olive trees. The date palms and pygmy palms are close to 100 years old, good example of a cultural landscape.

Boardmember Berge thinks the resolution should include the landscape.

Vice-Chair Garbini thinks it could be designated under Criterion A and possibly under Criterion B, not just for the trees but as a designed space.

Boardmember Larimer supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Bethke agrees with Vice-Chair Garbini. He is hesitant to designate today without including the landscaping.

Boardmember Marrone asked if was possible to designate significant trees.

Chair Lemmo supports Staff's recommendation and additional Criteria with documentation to support designating the gardens and landscape.

Boardmember Curry thinks they should continue it and ask for more information on Criterion A.

Boardmember Baksh supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Woods supports designation under Criteria C and B.

Boardmember Rivera supports designation under Criteria A, B and C.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 6 - HORTON AND HELEN TITUS HOUSE UNDER CRITERION C PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Larimer

Vote: 9-1-0

Motion Passes

(Bethke)

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE THE CAPTAIN MANUEL ROSA HOUSE UNDER CRITERION B, AS HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT FOR ITS ASSOCIATION WITH CAPTAIN ROSA AND THE PORTUGUESE COMMUNITY AND THE TUNA FISH INDUSTRY IN PARTICULAR. FOR THE PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE THAT HE RESIDED THERE WITH HIS FAMILY, 1935-1972. THE CHARACTER DEFINING FEATURES INCLUDE NOT ONLY THE HOME ITSELF, BUT THE GARDEN SURROUNDING THE HOUSE.

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 10-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 7 – LEWIS AND ANNIE DODGE SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Thomas J. and Christina A. Hindman represented by Legacy 106, Inc

Location: 4545 Alhambra Street, 92107, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 **(1287 1-H)**

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4545 Alhambra Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Lewis and Annie Dodge Spec House #1 located at 4545 Alhambra Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C. Interior elements included in the designation are the living room fireplace with decorative quoins and mantle, and the built-in buffet in the dining room. The designation excludes the modified, detached garage at the rear of the property.

Report Number: HRB 13-036

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 8 – MORRIS AND IDA IRVIN SPEC HOUSE #2

Applicant: Joel and Christine Torcolini represented by Legacy 106, Inc

Location: 1530 Fort Stockton Drive, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 **(1268 5-H)**

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1530 Fort Stockton Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Morris and Ida Irvin Spec House #2 located at 1530 Fort Stockton Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1921 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the 300 square foot addition found at the northwest corner of the house.

Report Number: HRB 13-037

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 9 – 1515 WEST LEWIS STREET

Applicant: Elizabeth Willis Revocable Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc

Location: 1515 West Lewis Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1268 5-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1515 West Lewis Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 1515 West Lewis Street under any adopted HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: HRB 13-038

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Ron May, Kiley Wallace (*Alexandra Wallace*), Betty Willis, Barry Hagar

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Rivera is on the fence, would like to hear other Boardmember comments.

Boardmember Woods thinks it is a beautiful house, the interiors are nice, but the porch is a problem. She supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Baksh is on the fence. He could support designation under Criterion D, but not C due to the porch.

Boardmember Curry mentioned that it is a very old house and has many character defining features, supports designation under Criterion D.

Chair Lemmo supports designation under Criterion D, as a notable example of Rigdon.

Vice-Chair Garbini supports designation under Criterion D, but thinks the porch looks right in scale and does not affect designation.

Boardmember Marrone supports designation under Criterion D, style is consistent with other Rigdon houses.

Boardmember Bethke mentioned that the architect is tied the front porch, hard to say that changes to the porch would affect Criterion D.

Boardmember Larimer questioned if there is enough evidence to reconstruct the front porch and if there is enough evidence to support designation.

Boardmember Berge supports designation under Criterion D.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CURRY TO DESIGNATE THE NATHAN AND HATTIE RIGDON SPEC HOUSE #2* UNDER CRITERION D AS A NOTABLE WORK NATHAN RIGDON; AS A MASTER BUILDER AND AS AN IMPORTANT EXAMPLE OF HIS EARLY WORK IN THE MISSION HILLS BOX STYLE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1910. DESIGNATION INCLUDES PORTIONS OF THE INTERIOR IDENTIFIED IN THE STAFF REPORT.

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 9-1-0
(Bethke)

Motion Passes

** Name has been changed to the Nathan Rigdon Spec House #3 per the HRB naming policy.*

REMINDER: NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: Thursday, August 22, 2013

LOCATION:

City Administration Building
12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:35PM