



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: April 11, 2013 REPORT NO. HRB-13-021

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of April 25, 2013

SUBJECT: **ITEM #14 – William and Edith Potter Spec House #1**

APPLICANT: Donald Fay represented by Allan Hazard & Janet O'Dea

LOCATION: 1417 Sutter Street, Uptown Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the William and Edith Potter Spec House #1 located at 1417 Sutter Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the William and Edith Potter Spec House #1 located at 1417 Sutter Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1920 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the detached garage that was converted to a guest house located at the southeast corner of the lot. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman Bungalow style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1920 period of significance. Specifically, the resource retains its low-pitch, front gable roof with wide eave overhangs and exposed rafter tails; decorative braces under gables; lattice attic vents; horizontal clapboard siding; cross gabled corner front porch; massive stucco porch piers; and wood double-hung and casement windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. 1417 Sutter Street is located on a residential street surrounded by single family residences of the Craftsman and Spanish Revival styles constructed by the same builder, William K. Potter.

The historic name of the resource, the William and Edith Potter Spec House #1, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of William and Edith Potter, who owned the land and constructed the house as a speculation house.

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Allen Hazard and Janet O’Dea, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION C – Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

This one-story Craftsman Bungalow house was built by William K. Potter as a speculation house in 1920. William and his wife Edith Potter purchased 28 lots on Sutter Street in 1912 and built at least 10 houses in the subdivision including a house for themselves and the Craftsman Bungalow at 1417 Sutter Street. The subject house possesses a low-pitched front-gabled roof with wide eave overhangs and exposed rafter tails. Gable ends feature lattice attic vents and decorative exposed beams. The exterior is clad in horizontal clapboard which flares at the foundation and a stucco chimney is located on the west elevation. A partial-width front porch located at the northeast corner of the house is covered by a cross-gabled roof supported by massive stucco porch piers with horizontal grooves. The porch piers are topped by short, slightly tapered wood columns that feature molding and dentil detailing. The front porch contains the original oak front door with three beveled glass panels at the west wall and a pair of ten-light French doors located on the south side. The front porch is accessed by a concrete walkup and steps from the sidewalk. Fenestration on the house varies in size and consists of original wood one-over-one double-hung and multi-light casement windows. In addition, two original Chicago style windows made up of a picture window with single light transom flanked by two double hung windows are located on the front and east façades.

The detached garage, located at the southeast corner of the property, has been significantly modified and converted into a guest house since its 1920 construction date and therefore is not included in this designation.

A few modifications to the house have occurred over the years but do not significantly impact the building’s historic integrity. Recently, the original scored concrete porch floor, walkway and driveway have been covered by a black skim coat scored in a non-historic pattern. The skim coat has started to crack and peel off revealing the intact scored concrete below. A simple non-historic wood trellis has been installed on the east elevation over the driveway but is minimally obtrusive and does not appear to altered any historic material. Finally, new light fixtures have been installed on the exterior of the house, new hardware has been installed on the original craftsman front door, and a bronze plaque has been installed to the left of the front door. These alterations do not significantly impact the overall integrity of this 1920 Craftsman Bungalow.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, which was born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation

with the style. As a result, a flood of pattern books appeared, offering plans for Craftsman bungalows. One story vernacular examples are often called simply bungalows. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

The subject house continues to convey the historic significance of Craftsman Bungalow style of architecture by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style including the: low-pitch, front gable roof with wide eave overhangs and exposed rafter tails; decorative braces under gables; lattice attic vents; horizontal clapboard siding; corner front porch with cross-gabled roof; massive stucco porch piers; and wood double-hung and casement windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the William and Edith Potter Spec House #1 under Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the William and Edith Potter Spec House #1 located at 1417 Sutter Street be designated with a period of significance of 1920 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of Craftsman Bungalow Architecture. The designation excludes the detached guest house located at the southeast corner of the lot. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Sarah Vonesh
Planning Intern



Cathy Winterrowd
Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

SV/ks/cw

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 4/25/2013

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 4/25/2013, to consider the historical designation of the **William and Edith Potter Spec House #1** (owned by Donald Fay, 1417 Sutter Street, San Diego, CA 92103) located at **1417 Sutter Street, San Diego, CA 92103**, APN: **451-163-03-00**, further described as LOTS 23 & 24 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the William and Edith Potter Spec House #1 on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman Bungalow style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1920 period of significance. Specifically, the resource retains its low-pitch, front gable roof with wide eave overhangs and exposed rafter tails; decorative braces under gables; lattice attic vents; horizontal clapboard siding; cross gabled corner front porch; massive stucco porch piers; and wood double-hung and casement windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation excludes the detached garage that was converted to a guest house located at the southeast corner of the lot.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
CORRINE NEUFFER,
Deputy City Attorney