

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF JANUARY 23, 2014
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12th FLOOR
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:07PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present <i>left@2:45pm</i>
Vice Chairperson	Gail Garbini	Present
2 nd Vice Chairperson	Linda Marrone	Present
Boardmember	Michael Baksh	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present
Boardmember	Tom Larimer	Present
Boardmember	Evelya Rivera	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance

Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
Cathy Winterrowd, Interim Deputy Director
Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner
Camille Pekarek, Junior Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Corrine Neuffer, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR October 24, 2013 and December 11, 2013

Minutes were not available

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

• **ABSENCES**

None

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Request for Continuance for Item 12
- ✓ Corrected Draft Resolution for Item 5
- ✓ Correspondence for Item 7
- ✓ California's Statewide Preservation Plan
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

None

C. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

The applicant for Item 12 – 2680 Greentree Lane is requesting an indefinite continuance. Staff is in support of the applicant's request.

ITEM 12 – 2680 GREENTREE LANE WAS WITHDRAWN BY THE APPLICANT

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 7 – WILLIAM AND RUBY SNELL COTTAGE

ITEM 8 – ROBERT O. PETERSON/RUSSELL FORESTER RESIDENCE (HRB 959)

ITEM 9 – JOHN AND EVELYN RICE/ARTHUR KEYS HOUSE

ITEM 10 – AMERICAN FEDERATION OF LABOR BUILDING

ITEM 13 – CHARLES BROWN/LESTER OLMSTEAD HOUSE

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEMS 8, 9, 10 AND 13 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Rivera

Vote: 11-0-0

Motion Passes

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Rivera

Vote: 10-0-1
(Berge)

Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – GEORGE AND MARION COTTRELL/CLIFF MAY HOUSE

Continued from December 2013

Applicant: Diane Kane

Owner: Lookout LLC represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 7727-7729 and 7813 Lookout Drive, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1227 6-G)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 7727-7729 and 7813 Lookout Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the George and Marion Cottrell/Cliff May House located at 7727-7729 and 7813 Lookout Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1936 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB 13-057

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Scott Moomjian (*Justin Madlebaum, David Mandlebaum, Herm Baterban*), Diane Kane, Desiree Kellogg, Donna Blackmond, Karen Yianilos, Laurel Yianilos, Leslie Davis, Mathew Welsh, Casey Fenton, John Kane, John Keethler, Sue Pruet, Susan Keen, John Drinkwater, Heath Fox, Bruce Coons

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge is leaning towards supporting the revised Staff recommendation. She may consider including all three parcels in designation because house was sited by Master Architect.

Boardmember Silvas likes the house. He is perplexed by the palm trees and how they relate to the Cliff May design.

Boardmember Bethke asked if the original property was located on all 4 parcels, he supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Laminar supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Marrone is in support of Staff's recommendation, but also supports designation of all four parcels. She thinks it is a shame that the palm trees were removed.

Vice-Chair Garbini is not just interested in plant material but the land use and how the land supports the structure. She thinks the parcel that supported the views is very important. House was built with more space on the north property line.

Chair Lemmo supports Staff's recommendation, he is open to inclusion of northern parcels for reasons Vice-Chair Garbini identified. He is not happy about the removal of the palm trees.

Boardmember Curry thinks that the architecture goes with the site. Site can be designated under Criteria A and B; not just Criteria C and D. We need to listen to the people/neighbors. She wanted to know when the palm trees were planted.

Boardmember Baksh supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Woods supports Staff's recommendation, but thinks the Board needs to look at Parcel 4.

Boardmember Rivera supports Staff's recommendation. She thanks the community for their passion and involvement.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 – GEORGE AND MARION COTTRELL/CLIFF MAY HOUSE PER STAFF'S REVISED RECOMMENDATION WHICH PERTAINS TO APN# 352-012-16-00 FOR CRITERIA C AND D AS SET FORTH IN THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Seconded by Boardmember Larimer

Vote: 11-0-0

Motion Passes

Chair Lemmo left at 2:45

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 – GEORGE AND MARION COTTRELL/CLIFF MAY HOUSE PARCEL 4 (APN 352-012-19-00) UNDER CRITERION D AS A REPRESENTATIVE OF A NOTABLE WORK OF MASTER ARCHITECT CLIFFORD MAY AND RETAINS INTEGRITY AS IT RELATES TO THE ORIGINAL DESIGN AND ITS PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1936. IN PARTICULAR THE RESOURCE IS A WELL EXECUTED REPRESENTATION OF HIS INTEGRATION OF INDOOR/OUTDOOR LIVING IN THE CUSTOM CALIFORNIA RANCH STYLE, NOTING THAT AT THE TIME OF DESIGN IT INCLUDED A PORTION OF WHAT IS ALSO REFERRED TO AS PARCEL 4 NORTH OF THE HOUSE.

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 8-2-0

Motion Passes

(Baksh, Larimer)

ITEM 6 – GEORGE AND MARION COTTRELL/CLIFF MAY HOUSE

Continued from December 2013

Applicant: Diane Kane

Owner: Lookout LLC represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 7727-7729 and 7813 Lookout Drive, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1227 6-G)

Description: Review the California Register Nomination of the George and Marion Cottrell/Cliff May House

Today's Action: Review and make a recommendation on the California Register Nomination of the George and Marion Cottrell/Cliff May House

Staff Recommendation: Recommend the listing of the George and Marion Cottrell/Cliff May House to the California Office of Historic Preservation.

Report Number: Staff memo dated December 4, 2013 and HRB-13-057

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Diane Kane, Bruce Coons

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Rivera supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Woods supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Baksh supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Curry supports Staff's recommendation.

Vice-Chair Garbini supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Marrone supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Larimer is concerned about not having owner support and well as incorrect information in the report.

Boardmember Bethke is unsure.

Boardmember Silvas supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Berge supports Staff's recommendation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BETHKE TO RECOMMEND LISTING ITEM 5 – THE GEORGE AND MARION COTTRELL/CLIFF MAY HOUSE AS PASSED BY THE HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD FOR LOCAL DESIGNATION

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 9-1-0

Motion Passes

(Larimer)

ITEM 7 – WILLIAM AND RUBY SNELL COTTAGE

Applicant: Jack and Karen Visin Joint Living Trust represented by Scott Moomjian

Location: 337 and 341 Playa Del Sur, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1247 2-E)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 337 and 341 Playa Del Sur as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate William and Ruby Snell Cottage located at 341 Playa Del Sur as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criterion A as a resource that reflects the early historical and architectural development of the Windansea neighborhood. The designation excludes the 20 square foot addition to 341 Playa Del Sur constructed in 1979, and the rear cottage addressed at 337 Playa Del Sur in its entirety. The designation shall include the cobble retaining wall at the front of the property.

Report Number: HRB 14- 001

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 8 – THE ROBERT O. PETERSON/RUSSELL FORESTER RESIDENCE (HRB 959)

Applicant: Jeffrey R Krinsk Property Trust Et Al represented by

Location: 567 Gage Lane, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1288 3-A)

Description: National Register of Historic Resources listing recommendation

Today's Action: Review the National Register Nomination of the Robert O. Peterson/Russell Forester Residence

Staff Recommendation: Recommend the listing of the Robert O. Peterson/Russell Forester Residence to the California Office of Historic Preservation.

Report Number: Staff memo dated January 9, 2014, HRB 09-060 and HRB 10-024

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 9 – JOHN AND EVELYN RICE/ARTHUR KEYES HOUSE

Applicant: Deliz Family Trust represented by Allan Hazard & Janet O'Dea

Location: 3565 Third Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1269 6-A**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3565 Third Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the John and Evelyn Rice/Arthur Keyes House located at 3565 3rd Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1913 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB 14-003

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 10– AMERICAN FEDERATION OF LABOR BUILDING

Applicant: Holman Family Trust represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 2323 Broadway, 92102, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 3 (**1289 3-C**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2323 Broadway as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the American Federation of Labor Building, located at 2323 Broadway as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1948 under HRB Criteria A and C. The designation excludes the 1958 east side addition.

Report Number: HRB 14-004

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 11 – WILLIAM AND VERA WYLIE SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Gregory and Mary Donnelly represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 4460 Hermosa Way, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1268 4-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4460 Hermosa Way as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the William and Vera Wylie Spec House #1 located at 4460 Hermosa Way as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1924 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 2012 rear additions to the east and west wing projections.

Report Number: HRB 14-005

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Ron May, Mary Donnelly, Alexandra Wallace, Kiley Wallace

In Opposition:

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge is concerned that there is no documentation as to what the roof was historically.

Boardmember Bethke wanted to know what sub style was identified by the applicant.

Boardmember Larimer supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Marrone supports Staff's recommendation.

Vice-Chair Garbini supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Curry supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Baksh supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Woods supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Rivera supports Staff's recommendation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CURRY TO DESIGNATE ITEM 11 – WILLIAM AND VERA WYLIE SPEC HOUSE #1 PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Bethke

Vote: 9-1-0

Motion Passes

(Berge)

ITEM 12 – DR. HANS AND RUTH SUESS/DALE NAEGLE HOUSE

Applicant: Simon Lewis and Elizabeth Pritscher-Lewis represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 2680 Greentree Lane, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (**1227 2-J**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2680 Greentree Lane as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Dr. Hans and Ruth Suess/Dale Naegle House located at 2680 Greentree Lane as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1965-1966 under HRB Criteria C and D

Report Number: HRB 14-006

ITEM WAS WITHDRAWN BY THE APPLICANT

ITEM 13 – DR. CHARLES BROWN/LESTER OLMSTEAD HOUSE

Applicant: John and Patricia Ravits represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 1614 Torrance Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1268 6-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1614 Torrance Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Dr. Charles Brown/Lester Olmstead House located at 1614 Torrance Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB 14-007

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 14 – OTAY MESA HISTORIC SURVEY

Applicant: City of San Diego

Location: Otay Mesa Community, Council District 8

Description: Review and consider the Otay Mesa Historical Resources Survey (Survey), the Historic Preservation Element of the Otay Mesa Community Plan update (HPE), and the Final Environmental Impact Report (FEIR) related to Cultural/Historical Resources for the purposes of making a Recommendation on the adoption of the Survey, HPE and FEIR to the City Council.

Today's Action: Recommend to the City Council adoption of the Survey, HPE, and FEIR or do not recommend adoption.

Staff Recommendation: Recommend to the City Council adoption of the Otay Mesa Historical Resources Survey, the Historic Preservation Element of the Otay Mesa Community Plan update, and the Final Environmental Impact Report related to Cultural/Historical Resources.

Report Number: HRB 14-009

Testimony Received:

In Favor:

In Opposition:

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Woods supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Baksh supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Curry had questions with regards to the trails and landscape; she would like more information on them. She supports Staff's recommendation.

Vice-Chair Garbini supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Marrone supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Larimer supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Bethke supports Staff's recommendation and applauds effort.

Boardmember Silvas would like staff to check into the Native spelling and pronunciation of Otay. He would like to see more on early Rancho period for interpretation. The end date of the Mexican-American war is 1846 not 1845; needs to be corrected in report.

Boardmember Berge supports Staff's recommendation and mentioned that the reconnaissance survey is out of date and needs to be updated.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO RECOMMEND TO THE CITY COUNCIL ADOPTION OF THE OTAY MESA HISTORIC CONTEXT STATEMENT, HISTORIC RESOURCE SURVEY, HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT OF THE OTAY MESA COMMUNITY PLAN UPDATE AND THE FINAL ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT RELATED TO THE CULTURAL RESOURCES AND UPDATES BY STAFF PRIOR TO GOING TO THE CITY COUNCIL AS DISCUSSED TODAY.

Seconded by Boardmember Rivera

Vote: 10-0-0

Motion Passes

REMINDER: NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: Thursday, February 27, 2014

LOCATION: City Administration Building
12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:46PM