

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF OCTOBER 23, 2014
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12th FLOOR
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by 2nd Vice-Chair Marrone at 1:05PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present <i>arrived @ 2:24PM</i>
Vice Chairperson	Gail Garbini	Absent
2 nd Vice Chairperson	Linda Marrone	Present
Boardmember	Michael Baksh	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Absent
Boardmember	Tom Larimer	Present
Boardmember	Evelya Rivera	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance

Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
Cathy Winterrowd, Deputy Director
Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner
Camille Pekarek, Junior Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Corrine Neuffer, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES for September 25, 2014

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER WOODS TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FOR SEPTEMBER 25, 2014 AS WRITTEN

Seconded by 2nd Vice-Chair Marrone

Vote: 4-0-3 Motion Passes
(Berge, Rivera, Silvas)

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

Charles Kaminski – Potential LGBTQ Historic Sites in San Diego

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

• ABSENCES

Vice-Chair Garbini and Boardmember Curry notified Staff they would not be in attendance. Chair Lemmo will be late.

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Correspondence for Item 5-716 16th Street
- ✓ Correspondence for Potential LGBTQ Sites in San Diego
- ✓ Draft September Minutes
- ✓ HRB Criteria Guidelines
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

- **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- Staff has previously reported that the Appeal of the Historical Designation of the Treadwell House, located at 579 San Elijo Street, was tentatively docketed for October 28th. However, at the City Council meeting on July 15, 2014, the item was not continued to a date certain, but rather returned to staff for re-docketing once the interested parties are ready to proceed. At this time, discussions between interested parties are ongoing, and the item will not be heard on October 28th. Staff will be report back once the item is ready to proceed to City Council and a docket date has been identified. We do not anticipate that this will occur before the New Year.
- Staff would like to remind everyone that the November hearing will occur Thursday, December 4th, due to the Thanksgiving holiday.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

None

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 7 – SAN DIEGO FIRE DEPARTMENT SHOPS AT STATION 6

ITEM 8 – AGNES MOSHER HOUSE

ITEM 12 –EVA HILL AND PANTAGES, MILLS & SHREVE COMPANY SPEC HOUSE #1

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE ITEMS 7, 8 AND 12 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – HOMER MCCLURE BUILDING

Continued from September 2014

Applicant: Navarra Properties A J 1 LP represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 716 16th Street, 92101, Downtown Community, Council District 3 (**1289 3-C**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 716 16th Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Homer McClure Building located at 716 16th Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1947 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB 14-055

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian, Michael Yanicelli, Stacy Pennington, Rob Lankford, Mary Pampuch, Ryan Simmons, Harmon Anderson, Jerry Navarra, Mark Navarra, Sherman Harmer, Ann Navarra, Simon Andrews, Chris Movafagh, Lisa Lew

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 – HOMER MCCLURE BUILDING PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Rivera

Vote: 1-6-0

Motion Fails

(Marrone, Woods, Baksh, Larimer, Silvas, Berge)

ITEM 6 – 1320 MUIRLANDS DRIVE

Applicant: Bill and Dawn Davidson represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 1320 Muirlands Drive, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (**1247 2-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1320 Muirlands Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 1320 Muirlands Drive under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB 14-061

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Marie Lia, Tony Crisafi, Andy Fotsch

In Opposition: Bruce Coons

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE THE WILLIAM AND MARIE MITCHELL/THOMAS SHEPHERD HOUSE LOCATED AT 1320 MUIRLANDS DRIVE AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1937 UNDER HRB CRITERIA D. THIS RECOMMENDATION IS BASED ON THE FOLLOWING FINDING:

THE RESOURCE IS REPRESENTATIVE OF A NOTABLE WORK OF THOMAS SHEPHERD, A MASTER ARCHITECT, AND RETAINS INTEGRITY AS IT RELATES TO THE ORIGINAL DESIGN. SPECIFICALLY, THE RESOURCE IS A GOOD EXAMPLE OF SHEPHERD'S DEVELOPMENT OF STYLE MOVING FROM SPANISH ECLECTIC TO RANCH IN THE SPANISH HACIENDA RANCH STYLE AND RETAINS INTEGRITY TO ITS 1937 PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE. THIS FINDING IS BASED UPON INFORMATION IN THE STAFF REPORT, THE HISTORICAL RESEARCH REPORT, AND WRITTEN AND ORAL EVIDENCE PRESENTED AT THE DESIGNATION HEARING. THE DESIGNATION SHALL EXCLUDE THE 1984 ADDITION AT THE ENTRY.

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas

Vote: 3-4-0

Motion Fails

(Marrone, Larimer, Woods, Rivera)

ITEM 7 – SAN DIEGO FIRE DEPARTMENT SHOPS AT STATION 6 (HRB 251)

Applicant: San Diego Firehouse Museum/Pioneer Hook & Ladder Co.

Owner: City of San Diego

Location: 1572 Columbia Street, Downtown Community, Council District 3 (1289 2-A)

Description: National Register of Historic Resources listing recommendation

Today's Action: Review the National Register Nomination of the San Diego Fire Department Shops at Station 6

Staff Recommendation: Recommend the listing of the San Diego Fire Department Shops at Station 6 to the State California Office of Historic Preservation.

Report Number: HRB 14-062

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 8 – AGNES MOSHER HOUSE

Applicant: Richard Dupuis and Lauren Espinosa represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 1511 29th Street, 92102, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 3 (1289 2-E)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1511 29th Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Agnes Mosher House located at 1511 29th Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1912 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 1943 second story rear addition.

Report Number: Staff memo dated October 10, 2014 and HRB 14-013

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 9 – 405 BELVEDERE STREET

Applicant: Beacham Family 1999 Trust represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 405 Belvedere Street, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1247 1-E)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 405 Belvedere Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 405 Belvedere Street under any adopted HRB Criteria due to a lack of historical significance, a sufficient degree of integrity, or association with an established master architect, builder or designer.

Report Number: HRB 14-063

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian, Simon Andrews

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE THE PHILIP AND BETTY ACKER HOUSE LOCATED AT 405 BELVEDERE STREET AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1937 UNDER HRB CRITERION C. THIS RECOMMENDATION IS BASED UPON THE FOLLOWING FINDING: THE RESOURCE EMBODIES THE DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS THROUGH THE RETENTION OF ALL OF THE PRIMARY AND SECONDARY CHARACTER-DEFINING CHARACTERISTICS OF THE MODERN MINIMAL TRADITIONAL STYLE AND RETAINS A GOOD LEVEL OF ARCHITECTURAL INTEGRITY FROM ITS 1937 PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE. SPECIFICALLY, THE RESOURCE FEATURES A COMPACT ONE-STORY SIZE; LOW-PITCHED GABLE AND HIPPED ROOF WITH SHALLOW OVERHANGS; SIMPLIFIED DETAILS; USE OF TRADITIONAL BUILDING MATERIALS EMPHASIZING THE STREET FAÇADE; A SIMPLE FLOOR PLAN WITH MINIMAL CORNERS; A SMALL FRONT PORCH; MODESTLY SIZED WOOD FRAME WINDOWS AND PICTURE WINDOW; AND A FRONT-FACING GARAGE, SET BACK FROM THE HOUSE.

Seconded by Boardmember Marrone

Vote: 4-4-0

Motion Fails

(Larimer, Berge, Woods, Rivera)

ITEM 10 – F.K. PACK SPECULATION HOUSE

Applicant: Devermann Family Revocable Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 4668 East Talmadge Drive, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9 (1269 3-H)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4668 East Talmadge Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the F.K. Pack Speculation House located at 4668 East Talmadge Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the second story addition at the northwest corner of the house and the east side addition at the patio area.

Report Number: HRB 14-064

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Paul Devermann, Kim Devermann, Kiley Wallace, Alexandra Wallace, Ron May

In Opposition: None

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 10 PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION WITH THE NAME CHANGED TO THE FARRELL AND MERLE PACK SPECULATION HOUSE

Seconded by Boardmember Marrone

Vote: 6-2-0

Motion Passes

(Larimer, Rivera)

ITEM 11 – ALFRED AND HELEN CANTONI/RALPH L. FRANK AND WILLIAM B. MELHORN HOUSE

Applicant: Peter Dixon Living Trust and Gary Dick Living Trust

Location: 2412 Pine Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1268 4-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2412 Pine Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Alfred and Helen Cantoni/Ralph L. Frank and William B. Melhorn House located at 2412 Pine Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1964 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB 14-066

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Peter Dixon, Scott Moomjian

In Opposition: None

BOARD ACTION:

**MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 11 – ALFRED AND HELEN CANTONI/
RALPH L. FRANK AND WILLIAM B. MELHORN HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 12 – EVA HILL AND PANTAGES, MILLS & SHREVE COMPANY SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Lawrence Katz and Carolina Finch represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 1007 Cordova Street, 92107, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (**1287 2-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1007 Cordova Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Eva Hill and Pantages, Mills & Shreve Company Spec House #1 located at 1007 Cordova Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criteria A and C. The designation excludes the 425 square foot rear addition and the 1,096 square foot detached garage with guest quarters above.

Report Number: HRB 14-065

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

REMINDER: NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: Thursday, December 4, 2014

LOCATION:

City Administration Building
12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:00PM