



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: May 8, 2014 REPORT NO. HRB-14-039

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of May 22, 2014

SUBJECT: **ITEM 11 – India and Date Street (519 West Date Street) – Centre City Planned Development Permit/Site Development Permit No. 2013-10**

APPLICANT: H G Fenton Development Company, LLC

LOCATION: 519 West Date Street, 92101, Downtown, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Recommend to the Planning Commission adoption of the mitigation measures and findings associated with the site development permit as presented or recommend inclusion of additional permit conditions related to a designated historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

The Historical Resources Board recommends to the Planning Commission adoption of the mitigation measures and findings associated with the Site Development Permit related to the designated historical resource (HRB #1036—Antonio and Josephine Giacalone House) as presented.

BACKGROUND

The City's Land Development Code Section 126.0503(b)(2) requires a recommendation from the Historical Resources Board prior to the Planning Commission decision on a Site Development Permit when a historical district or designated historical resource is present. The HRB has adopted the following procedure for making recommendations to decision-makers (Historical Resources Board Procedures, Section II.B):

When the Historical Resources Board is taking action on a recommendation to a decision-maker, the Board shall make a recommendation on only those aspects of the matter that relate to the historical aspects of the project. The Board's recommendation action(s) shall relate to the cultural resources section, recommendations, findings and mitigation measures of the final environmental document, the Site Development Permit findings for historical purposes, and/or the project's compliance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Treatment of Historic Properties. If the Board desires to recommend the inclusion of additional conditions, the motion should include a request for staff to incorporate permit conditions to capture the Board's recommendations when the project moves forward to the decision maker.

The Antonio and Josephine Giacalone House is located at 519 West Date Street in the Downtown Community Planning area. The building was originally constructed ca. 1885 in the Folk Victorian Vernacular style and relocated to its current site from an unknown location in 1925. On February 23, 2012, the site was designated by the Historical Resources Board as HRB #1036; under Criterion C as a resource embodying the distinctive characteristics of the Folk Victorian Vernacular style with a ca. 1885 period of significance. The house features a truncated pyramidal roof with asphalt shingles; short, boxed eaves; a simple frieze; horizontal tongue and groove siding over box frame construction. The entry porch is centered across nearly the entire width of the front façade, and features a moderately pitched half-hipped roof supported on tapered square columns on narrow wood piers with wood pickets in-between. A pair of narrow wood entry doors with 8 narrow panes in the upper portion of the door and fixed, wood frame 2-lite transoms above provide access to the interior. Tall 1-over-1 double hung wood frame and sash windows with wood surrounds flank the entry. Remaining fenestration consists of tall 2-over-2 double hung wood frame and sash windows with vertical divides and wood surrounds. At the rear of the house, a flat-roof section set under the eave of the pyramidal roof runs the width of the building. A non-historic concrete slab porch with wood railing and a small flat wood roof over the rear entry door are the only known modifications.

The applicant proposes construction of mixed-use project with a seven story building on the north side of Date Street between India and Columbia streets; a five story building on a parcel south of Date Street that includes the designated resource; construction of an underground parking structure under both buildings; and a street vacation on Date Street between India and Columbia streets for an 11,200 square foot public plaza. As part of the overall project, the applicant proposes to relocate the designated resource to one of two locations. The primary location for the resource would be Amici Park in Little Italy at Union and Date Street. The secondary location, if the primary location were not approved by the San Diego Unified School District Board, would be 1792 National Avenue in Barrio Logan.

The Amici Park location would require the house to be moved approximately 3 blocks east. The rear shed roof addition, adjacent concrete stoop, and concrete steps leading to the front porch would be removed. The windows, doors, and portion of the house exposed by the removal of the shed addition would be boarded with plywood and secured. The house would be moved as one entity. This proposal may require the house to be temporarily stored if the project scheduling cannot accommodate the house on the receiving site. The storage facility would be a secured location in Spring Valley that currently houses other designated resources being temporarily stored. Once relocated to the park the exterior materials would be restored. The foundation

would be set at 30” above grade consistent with its current height. The windows, doors and siding would be rehabilitated in place. The rear wall where the addition was removed would have wood siding to match the existing installed. The roof shingles would be replaced with a brown asphalt shingle. An accessible ramp would be added to the right side of the structure. The ramp would access the porch via removal of a segment of the porch railing at the end of the porch. Concrete steps would be reconstructed to access the front porch. The new use at Amici Park would be a public restroom. Privacy for the restrooms would be provided by adding a separate frosted sash at the interior.

The secondary location would be 1792 National Avenue in Barrio Logan. The lot currently has a building located to the rear of the parcel. Similar work would be done to relocate the house with the addition of temporary removal of the roof structure to clear the trolley lines. The roof would be cut at the ridges and disassembled into five sections (1 flat tray and 4 hipped sections). The roof portion over the front porch and the rear third of the building would remain intact. The new use at the National Avenue lot would be commercial.

As summarized above and provided in Attachments 1 and 2, the proposed rehabilitation of the structure at either site would be consistent with the Standards.

ANALYSIS

The proposed relocation of the designated building is by definition a substantial alteration requiring a site development permit, consistent with Municipal Code Section 143.0251. Impacts related to the proposed alteration and relocation would be reduced through implementation of the required mitigation measures found in the FEIR Mitigation, Monitoring and Reporting Program (MMRP) for the 2006 Downtown Community Plan (Attachment 3). Findings for the relocation of a designated historical resource are required for approval of the permit, consistent with Municipal Code Section 126.0504(h).

The three required Supplemental Findings and supporting information are provided in Attachment 4 and are summarized below.

1. There are no feasible measures, including maintaining the resource on site, that can further minimize the potential adverse effects on historical resources.

The project proposes relocation, rehabilitation and reuse of the Antonio and Josephine Giacalone House, from its current location at 519 West Date Street in the Centre City Planned District to Amici Park in Little Italy or to 1792 National Avenue in Barrio Logan. Relocation of the house would allow development of underground parking, in addition to the above grade development discussed earlier, that will stretch from the north side of West Date Street, under the vacated right of way of West Date Street and under the parcel where the historic resource is located. The developer evaluated three options, which included retention of the building on the site maintaining required setbacks, incorporating the existing building into the new development, or relocating the house to another parcel. The house currently occupies 22% of a 5,000 SF lot. If the house was maintained on the site, the amount of developable land would be significantly reduced, deeming this option infeasible. If the house were incorporated into the existing design, significant portions of the resource would be lost. The new development would be constructed

around the resource and would connect with the resource resulting in a loss of historic fabric. Given the adverse impact to the resource and the loss of historic material, this option was deemed infeasible. Relocation to a new site, either Amici Park or National Avenue, would allow the resource to be maintained in its entirety surrounded by lower density and lower scale buildings. The proposed relocation and rehabilitation will result in reduced physical impacts to the overall integrity of the resource while keeping it in close proximity to its original location with increased public visibility.

2. The proposed relocation will not destroy the historical, cultural or architectural values of the historical resource and the relocation is part of a definitive series of actions that will assure the preservation of the designated historical resource.

The developer, as the property owner, has agreed to implement measures identified in the FEIR Mitigation, Monitoring and Reporting Program pertaining to the relocation, rehabilitation and reuse of designated historical resource #1036, the Antonio and Josephine Giacalone House. Further, the developer has identified a primary relocation site and a secondary site should the San Diego Unified School Board fail to approve relocation to the primary site. The relocation sites meet the requirements of the National Park Service's Criterion Consideration B for Moved Properties and the City's Historical Resources Regulations on the same subject. After relocation and stabilization of the resource, it will be rehabilitated in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. A qualified historical architect monitor will supervise the relocation and rehabilitation project. The property's status as a designated historical resource will be transferred to the relocation site and the property will remain a designated resource under the jurisdiction of the San Diego Historical Resources Board. These measures ensure that the proposed relocation, rehabilitation and reuse will not destroy the historical, cultural, or architectural values of the historical resource and the relocation will be part of a definitive series of actions to assure the preservation of the designated historical resource.

3. There are special circumstances or conditions apart from the existence of the historical resource, applying to the land that are peculiar to the land and are not of the applicant's making, whereby the strict application of the provisions of the historical resources regulations would deprive the property owner of reasonable use of the land.

The Downtown Community Plan's goals for the surrounding neighborhood calls for greater development, especially on vacant land and underdeveloped sites. Consistent with these goals, the area surrounding the site has seen an increase in density and larger scale development in the last several years. Included in this growth are multi-story development projects which are located directly south and northeast from the Antonio and Josephine Giacalone House. The existing site constraints, land development factors which include off-street parking requirement and the location of the historical resource which occupies 22% of a 5,000SF lot zoned for high density, and the overall setting and context of the neighborhood constitute special circumstances and conditions which exist apart from the presence of the historical resource. These special circumstances applying to the land are peculiar to the land and are not of the developer's making. Therefore the strict application of the provisions of the Historical Resources Regulations would deprive the developer, as the property owner, of reasonable use of the land.

CONCLUSION

Staff concurs that the proposed mitigation measures and permit conditions as provided to the HRB are sufficient to reduce the identified impacts to the Antonio and Josephine Giacalone House (HRB #1036) and recommends that the Historical Resources Board recommend the Planning Commission approve Planned Development/Site Development Permit No. 2013-10 for the relocation of the Antonio and Josephine Giacalone House and adopt the mitigation measures and findings associated with the Site Development Permit.



Jodie Brown, AICP
Senior Planner



Cathy Winterrowd
Deputy Director/HRB Liaison

JB/cw

Attachments:

1. Treatment Plan for Amici Park location (under separate cover)
2. Treatment Plan for 1792 National Avenue location (under separate cover)
3. 6th Addendum to the 2006 Final Environmental Impact Report for the Downtown Community Plan, Centre City Planned District Ordinance and Centre City Redevelopment Plan (under separate cover)
4. Site Development Permit Deviation Findings Provided by the Applicant (under separate cover)