



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: November 20, 2014 REPORT NO. HRB-14-070

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of December 4, 2014

SUBJECT: **ITEM #8 – June Magee/Richard Requa & R.P. Shields and Son House**

APPLICANT: Peter M T Considine

LOCATION: 4440 Hermosa Way, Uptown Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the June Magee/Richard Requa & R.P. Shields and Son House located at 4440 Hermosa Way as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the June Magee/Richard R.P. Shields and Son House located at 4440 Hermosa Way as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criteria C and D. The 42 square-foot bedroom addition and 30 square-foot bathroom addition shall be excluded from the designation. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

1. The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits medium-pitch gable roofs with single barrel clay tile; slightly overhanging eaves accented with a mixture of exposed eaves and decorative moulding with dentil detailing; lightly textured stucco walls; a wide, tapered stucco chimney; a paneled wood entry door; windows consisting of single-lite fixed, single-lite sliding and 3-lite casement wood frame and sash windows; and paneled wood shutters.
2. The resource is representative of the notable work of Master Architect Richard Requa and Master Builder R.P. Shields and Son, and retains integrity as it relates to the original design and construction. Specifically, the resource is a good example of a Requa home from this period, and showcases an interesting blend of motifs and influences. In addition, the property and reflects the notable work of R.P. Shields and Son on a smaller residential scale, as designed by a respected Master Architect.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The building is located on APN 443-140-20-00 in the residential subdivision of Allen Terrace. The property was identified in the Draft 2007 Uptown Survey and given a Status Code of 5S3, "Appears to be individually eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation."

The historic name of the resource, the June Magee/Richard Requa & R.P. Shields and Son House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of June Magee, who constructed the house as her personal residence, and the names of Richard Requa, a Master Architect, and R.P. Shields and Son, a Master Builder.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Peter Considine, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C and D, and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 4440 Hermosa Way did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or Mission Hill's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 4440 Hermosa Way did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject building located at 4440 Hermosa Drive was constructed in 1928 in the Spanish Eclectic style and features a U-shaped floor plan, medium-pitch gable roofs with single barrel clay tile; slightly overhanging eaves accented with a mixture of exposed eaves and decorative moulding with dentil detailing; lightly textured stucco over wood frame construction; and a concrete foundation. The house is set several feet higher than the street, and is accessed via a walkway and stairs leading to the porch, which is accented with original basket-weave

brickwork. The original paneled wood door is set under a decorative cornice moulding with dentil detailing. To the right of the entry is a wide, tapered stucco chimney, followed by an original, projecting enclosed sunroom. To the left of the entry, the house steps backward, following the property line, and features a small brick terrace. Fenestration consists of single-lite fixed; single-lite sliding and 3-lite casement wood frame and sash windows, many with paneled wood shutters. The attached two-car garage is accessed off the alley.

Modifications are minimal, and consist of a small, roughly 42 square-foot pop-out addition to Bedroom #3 at an unknown date, and a roughly 30 square-foot bathroom addition at the rear near the garage in 1969. The 42 square-foot addition is distinguished as a pop-out, and did not impact the original cornice line or clay pipe vents. Although located on the street-facing façade, the placement of the addition is on a secondary element stepped back from the main entry, and did not impact any significant character defining features. The 30 square-foot bathroom addition likewise did not impact any significant character defining features, and is sensitively placed on a secondary façade. The modifications do not significantly impact the design, materials, workmanship or feeling of the house or its ability to convey its original Spanish Eclectic design.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, an unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including medium-pitch gable roofs with single barrel clay tile; slightly overhanging eaves accented with a mixture of exposed eaves and decorative moulding with dentil detailing; lightly textured stucco walls; a wide, tapered stucco chimney; a paneled wood entry door; windows consisting of single-lite fixed, single-lite sliding and 3-lite casement wood frame and sash windows; and paneled wood shutters. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C. The 42 square-foot bedroom addition and 30 square-foot bathroom addition shall be excluded from the designation.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

Richard Requa was born in Rock Island, Illinois in 1881. He grew up in Nebraska and was trained as an engineer. In 1900, he and his family relocated to San Diego and though he did not attend architecture school he trained under Master Architect Irving Gill, one of the early Modernists in San Diego. Gill was known for simplifying his designs, reducing ornamentation, and focusing on the mass and shape of a building. In 1912, he partnered with another Gill-trained architect Frank Mead. Together they continued a refinement of Gill's interpretation of indigenous architectural design based on Mediterranean and Southwest styles that – owing to

similar materials, climate and terrain – were appropriate for San Diego. Requa and Mead were heavily influenced by the Panama-California Exposition designs and began an intense study of 15th through 18th century Spanish and Mexican architectural styles, Native American southwestern pueblos, and 11th through 14th century Moorish architecture. During this time Requa developed an architectural style that emphasized outdoor living and capturing sunlight with the incorporation of French doors and expansive windows placed on south and west-facing elevations of buildings. In 1920, Requa became a licensed architect, left his partnership with Mead. Subsequently, structural engineer Herbert Jackson joined Requa. The firm of Requa & Jackson became the architects of choice during the booming 1920's and their style, which Requa named Southern California architecture, dominated the San Diego scene.

Robert Shields was already an experienced contractor when he arrived in San Diego from Chicago via Los Angeles around 1909. The company, R.P. Shields and Son, whose principals were Robert Shields and his son Ernest Shields, were active in the San Diego building industry from about 1909 to the mid 1930s. The company built the First National Bank Building at the corner of 5th and Broadway, the municipal bulkhead at the San Diego Harbor, five houses along Cypress Way and a number of other private residences in San Diego. Ernest Shields also built the car barns on Imperial Avenue, the Masonic Temple on Fifth and Ash, and the YMCA building on the northeast corner of 8th and C Streets. The Shields group showed amazing depth in its ability to undertake both very large and small projects. Not only was Robert Shields responsible for providing San Diego with many important buildings, he also constructed structures in the Chicago area. R.P. Shields and Son was established as a Master Builder by the HRB in 2008 with the designation of HRB Site #856 located at 2019-2021 Granada Avenue.

Significance Statement: The subject property was constructed in 1928 after Master Architect Richard Requa returned from an extensive trip to Europe, funded by the Monolith Cement Company in Colorado, where he traveled throughout the Mediterranean to photograph authentic architectural details. The Magee house is a good example of a Requa home from this period, and showcases an interesting blend of motifs and influences. As such, the house reflects the notable work of Master Architect Richard Requa. In addition, the subject property was constructed by Master Builder R.P. Shields and Son, and reflects their notable work on a smaller residential scale, as designed by a respected Master Architect.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 4440 Hermosa Way has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 4440 Hermosa Way is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the June Magee/Richard Requa & R.P. Shields and Son House located at 4440 Hermosa Way be designated with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of Spanish Eclectic architecture; and Criterion D as a property that reflects the notable work of Master Architect Richard Requa and Master Builder R.P. Shields & Sons. The designation excludes the 42 square-foot bedroom addition and 30 square-foot bathroom addition. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

KS

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 12/4/2014

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 12/4/2014, to consider the historical designation of the **June Magee/Richard Requa & R.P. Shields and Son House** (owned by Peter M T Considine, 4440 Hermosa Way, San Diego, CA 92103) located at **4440 Hermosa Way, San Diego, CA 92103**, APN: **443-140-20-00**, further described as BLK A LOTS 1 & 2 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the June Magee/Richard Requa & R.P. Shields and Son House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of Spanish Eclectic style architecture and retains integrity to its 1928 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits medium-pitch gable roofs with single barrel clay tile; slightly overhanging eaves accented with a mixture of exposed eaves and decorative moulding with dentil detailing; lightly textured stucco walls; a wide, tapered stucco chimney; a paneled wood entry door; windows consisting of single-lite fixed, single-lite sliding and 3-lite casement wood frame and sash windows; and paneled wood shutters. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

(2) The property is historically significant under CRITERION D as a property that reflects the notable work of Master Architect Richard Requa and Master Builder R.P. Shields & Sons, and retains integrity to its 1928 date of construction. Specifically, the subject property is a good example of a Requa home from this period, and showcases an interesting blend of motifs and influences. In addition, the property and reflects the notable work of R.P. Shields and Son on a smaller residential scale, as designed by a respected Master Architect. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 42 square-foot bedroom addition and 30 square-foot bathroom addition

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
CORRINE NEUFFER,
Deputy City Attorney