



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: November 20, 2014 REPORT NO. HRB-14-074

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of December 4, 2014

SUBJECT: **ITEM #12 – Gustaf and Ida Anderson Spec House #1**

APPLICANT: Dede Bodnar and Coral Bodnar represented by IS Architecture

LOCATION: 4929 Westminster Terrace, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Gustaf and Ida Anderson Spec House #1 located at 4929 Westminster Terrace as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Gustaf and Ida Anderson Spec House #1 located at 4929 Westminster Terrace as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1929 under HRB Criterion C. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a predominantly flat roof with parapet and shed tile roofs with shallow eaves and exposed rafter tails; decoratively troweled stucco over wood frame construction; a central entry tower under a pyramidal roof; a tapered stucco chimney; paired 6 and 3-lite wood frame and sash casement windows; a decorative wood spindle window grille; and hammered wood accents that include decorative corbels and window lintels.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The building is located on APN 440-371-02-00, in the residential subdivision of Kensington Manor Unit No 1. The property was identified in the 1996 Greater Mid-City San Diego Preservation Strategy as an individually significant property within the potential Kensington Historic District.

The historic name of the resource, the Gustaf and Ida Anderson Spec House #1, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the original owners who constructed the house as a speculation house.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by IS Architecture, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C, and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 4929 Westminster Terrace did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or Kensington's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 4929 Westminster Terrace did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject house located at 4929 Westminster Terrace was constructed in 1929 in the Spanish Eclectic style and features a predominantly flat roof with parapet and shed tile roofs with shallow eaves and exposed rafter tails; decoratively troweled stucco over wood frame construction; and a concrete foundation. The one-story house appears long to the street, with a central entry tower under a pyramidal roof, accented by a round stained glass oculus. The entry is recessed under the tower and accessed by an arched opening. A tapered stucco chimney is set to the left of the entry tower. Paired 6 and 3-lite wood frame and sash casement windows are the predominant window type, with one pair of 1-over-1 double hung windows set behind a decorative wood spindle grille. Hammered wood accents found throughout include decorative corbels and lintels at the windows. A two-car garage with sliding wood doors is set to the far east end of the building.

Modifications are minimal, and include the addition of an aluminum window and a utility door to the east (side) elevation and an aluminum patio awning to the north (rear) elevation in the 1970s; and removal of a narrow half-light and wood panel door located on the west elevation of the garage. These modifications have had a negligible impact on the building's integrity of design,

materials, workmanship and feeling; and its ability to convey significance as a Spanish Eclectic style building.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style, which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, an unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

Significance Statement: The house, which retains integrity to its 1929 date of construction and period of significance, continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a predominantly flat roof with parapet and shed tile roofs with shallow eaves and exposed rafter tails; decoratively troweled stucco over wood frame construction; a central entry tower under a pyramidal roof; a tapered stucco chimney; paired 6 and 3-lite wood frame and sash casement windows; a decorative wood spindle window grille; and hammered wood accents that include decorative corbels and window lintels. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject property at 4929 Westminster Terrace was built by Gustaf L. Anderson. Anderson has not been established by the Historical Resources Board as a Master Architect, Designer or Builder, and there is insufficient information to designate him as such at this time. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 4929 Westminster Terrace has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 4929 Westminster Terrace is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Gustaf and Ida Anderson Spec House #1 located at 4929 Westminster Terrace be designated with a period of significance of 1929 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of Spanish Eclectic style architecture. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

KS

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 12/4/2014

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 12/4/2014, to consider the historical designation of the **Gustaf and Ida Anderson Spec House #1** (owned by Dede Bodnar and Coral Bodnar, 4929 Westminster Terrace, San Diego, CA 92116) located at **4929 Westminster Terrace, San Diego, CA 92116**, APN: **440-371-02-00**, further described as BLK 6 LOT 6 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Gustaf and Ida Anderson Spec House #1 on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains integrity to its 1929 date of construction and period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a predominantly flat roof with parapet and shed tile roofs with shallow eaves and exposed rafter tails; decoratively troweled stucco over wood frame construction; a central entry tower under a pyramidal roof; a tapered stucco chimney; paired 6 and 3-lite wood frame and sash casement windows; a decorative wood spindle window grille; and hammered wood accents that include decorative corbels and window lintels. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
CORRINE NEUFFER,
Deputy City Attorney