

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: July 12, 2012 REPORT NO. HRB-12-042

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board

Agenda of July 26, 2012

SUBJECT: ITEM #9 – AUGUST AND ELLEN ROSS HOUSE

APPLICANT: Bonnie Ingalls and Cydna Swan represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

LOCATION: 4010 Wesleyan Place, Kensington-Talmadge Community,

Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the August and Ellen Ross House located at

4010 Wesleyan Place as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the August and Ellen Ross House located at 4010 Wesleyan Place as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1955 under HRB Criterion C. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Custom Ranch architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1955 date of construction and period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a low pitched cross-hipped roof with wide overhanging eaves and a wide red brick chimney; prominent horizontal massing and design; a recessed front entry way featuring horizontal common bonded red scratch-face brick with built in stepped planters; a lower level two car garage with a wood herringbone pattern and side access door with a frosted glass fixed pane window within it; a large rectangular metal frame fixed pane picture window flanked by casement windows on each side and small rectangular fixed panes above; metal tripartite windows with wood shutters on each side of the windows; and a wide "L" shaped floor plan with a large rear patio courtyard area.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The house is a one-story building over a two car garage within the ground level of the structure, and is located on the northwest corner of the cul-de-sac on Wesleyan Place within the Kensington Heights subdivision of the Kensington-Talmadge Community.

The historic name of the resource, the August and Ellen Ross House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the original owners August and Ellen Ross, who had the house constructed as their personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Legacy 106, Inc, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines* for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria, as follows:

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject building is a one-story Custom Ranch house over a two car garage constructed in 1955, and features a roughly L-shaped floor plan with a large rear patio courtyard area. The home is asymmetrical with prominent horizontal massing and features a low pitched cross-hipped roof with red concrete tile, wide overhanging eaves, a stucco soffit and a wide red brick chimney. The façade of the structure is primarily stucco over wood frame construction. The front entry way is recessed and features horizontal common bonded red scratch-face brick with built in stepped planters and steps leading down to the street level. To the left of the solid wood front door is a panel of square glass blocks with eight rows of six. Facing the street is a large rectangular metal frame fixed pane picture window flanked by casement windows on each side and small rectangular fixed panes above. Remaining fenestration consists of metal tripartite windows, casement windows, and glass block. The two-car garage is situated on the lower level of the structure and is incorporated into the long horizontal design of the home. The garage has an original wood herringbone patterned garage door along with a wood side access door to the right of the garage with a frosted glass fixed pane window within it.

The owner has proposed designation of the built-in cabinetry and wood interior wall paneling that is seen throughout the inside of the house; however, staff is not recommending designation of these interiors because they are not distinctive features that warrant inclusion in the designation.

The only modification to the structure identified is the installation of a roof mounted photo voltaic or solar panel system in 2009 and a new brick paver driveway. The roof-top solar panels are located on the rear part of the roof and do not alter the character defining features of the building or significantly impair the design, materials, workmanship or feeling aspects of integrity as it relates to the 1955 date of construction. Staff questioned whether the red concrete tile roof was original and the plans provided by the applicant revealed that it is. (Attachment 1)

The Custom Ranch style of architecture was popular between 1950 and 1975 and is differentiated from Tract Ranch homes because they were typically custom-designed with a specific client in mind. The Ranch style became the era's most prevalent type of residential construction in San Diego. Custom Ranch Homes are generally more lavish than their tract counterparts, but like Tract Ranch housing, materials and detailing are generally traditional. Primary Character defining features include horizontal massing, wide to the street; usually single-story; custom details such as wood shutters, large wood windows, or large prominent brick or stone chimneys; and prominent low-sloped gabled or hipped roofs with deep overhangs. Secondary Character defining features include a sprawling floor plan frequently "L" or "U" shaped around a central courtyard; large attached carports or garages; and expensive building materials such as wood shingle roofing, wood siding, brick, stone, and adobe which are usually much more generous in materials and craftsmanship than tract homes. The subject house conveys the historic significance of Custom Ranch architecture by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style, including prominent horizontal massing and design with a wide street elevation; low-sloped hipped roof; wide overhanging eaves; a large attached garage; and traditional building materials such as generous use of scored edge, red-fired brick cladding and a matching prominent brick chimney Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject building under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of Custom Ranch architecture and retains integrity to the 1955 date of construction.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Ben and Frieda Kaplan House located at 4010 Wesleyan Place be designated with a period of significance of 1955 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of Custom Ranch architecture. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more

flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.

Jeffrey E. Oakley Associate Planner

Cathy Winterrowd

Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

JO/ks/cw

Attachments: 1. Draft Resolution

2. Blueprint showing roofing material

3. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 7/26/2012

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 7/26/2012, to consider the historical designation of the **August and Ellen Ross House** located at **4010 Wesleyan Place**, **San Diego**, **CA 92116**, APN: **440-161-09-00**, further described as BLK 10 LOT A DOC 96-326001 IN LOTS 1&2 BLK 4&IN in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the August and Ellen Ross House on the following finding:

The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Custom Ranch architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1955 date of construction and period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a low pitched cross-hipped roof with wide overhanging eaves and a wide red brick chimney; prominent horizontal massing and design; a recessed front entry way featuring horizontal common bonded red scratch-face brick with built in stepped planters; a lower level two car garage with a wood herringbone pattern and side access door with a frosted glass fixed pane window within it; a large rectangular metal frame fixed pane picture window flanked by casement windows on each side and small rectangular fixed panes above; metal tripartite windows with wood shutters on each side of the windows; and a wide "L" shaped floor plan with a large rear patio courtyard area. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0.**

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

BY:
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board
BY:
KEITH BAUERLE
Deputy City Attorney



