



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: November 15, 2012 REPORT NO. HRB-12-076

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of November 29, 2012

SUBJECT: **ITEM #12 – Kelly Family House**

APPLICANT: Anthony Keller and Sherri Rudinsky represented by Scott A. Moomjian

LOCATION: 1538 Granada Avenue, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Kelly Family House located at 1538 Granada Avenue as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Kelly Family House located at 1538 Granada Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1912 under HRB Criteria C and D as an example of Craftsman architecture and a notable work of the Pacific Building Company, a Master Builder. The 470 square foot detached garage is excluded from this designation as it has been significantly altered since the 1912 period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

1. The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Craftsman style architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1912 date of construction and period of significance. Specifically, the resource retains its moderately-pitched front-gabled roof with wide eave overhangs and exposed rafters; decorative stick work and braces in gable; lattice attic vent; horizontal clapboard siding; partial-width front porch with crenellated parapet; square tapered wood columns on clapboard piers; and wood double-hung and transomed windows.
2. The resource is representative of a notable work of Master Builder the Pacific Building Company and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource represents the Pacific Building Company's work in the Craftsman architectural style and their association with the development of South Park.

Development Services Department

1222 First Avenue, MS 512 • San Diego, CA 92101-4155
Tel (619) 235-5200 Fax (619) 446-5499

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The house is a two story Craftsman style house built in 1912 by the Pacific Building Company in the South Park community.

The historic name of the resource, the Kelly Family House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy. The property was originally purchased on October 5, 1910 by sisters, Maude, Mabel, and Ella Kelly. On November 27, 1911, the three sisters transferred the property over to their mother, Narcissa Kelly, to finance the construction. Narcissa Kelly never resided at the house and at the time of her death in December 1916, the deed was transferred back to Maud, Mabel and Ella. The three sisters owned and occupied the house from 1912 when it was constructed until Ella Kelly's death in 1978. Due to the involvement of many members of the Kelly family, the subject house located at 1538 Granada Street is named the Kelly Family House.

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Scott A. Moomjian, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C and also finds it eligible under Criterion D for its association with established master builder, the Pacific Building Company. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject two-story Craftsman house was designed by the Pacific Building Company for the three Kelly sisters in 1912. The house possesses a moderately-pitched front-gabled roof with wide eave overhangs, exposed rafter tails, and extra stick work. The exterior is clad in horizontal clapboard which flares at the foundation. The primary (east) elevation is dominated by a partial-width front porch with crenellated parapet forming a second floor balcony supported by square tapered wood columns on top of clapboard piers. A porch roof with knee braces and exposed rafter tails bands across the first floor of the east elevation and ends at the chimney on the south side. The original paneled front door with viewing window is flanked by two square fixed windows in the front porch and is accessed by the original concrete walkway and steps. The second floor balcony is accessed by a multi-light French door on the second story. Fenestration on the house is made up of custom built dual paned, wood windows carefully replicating the original window designs. Windows found on the house vary in size and consist of double hung windows, simulated divided light transomed picture windows, simulated divided light casement windows, and fixed single pane windows.

There is a brick chimney along the south side elevation as well as a central chimney towards the back (west) portion of the house. A partial-width projecting utility room is located on the rear elevation and is accessed by a wooden door flanked by three double hung windows. The first story projection creates a second story balcony off a back bedroom accessed by a multi-light door. There is another slight projection adjacent to the utility room with a small hipped roof. The 470 square foot garage, located on the southwest corner of the property, has been significantly modified since its 1912 construction date and therefore is not included in this

designation. The garage seen in the historic photograph from 1912 has simple gable roof. Today, the garage features a crenellated parapet and a 415 square foot addition from 2001.

A few modifications have been made to the subject house. In 2012, all windows were replaced with new dual-paned, simulated divided light windows custom made in the same design as the originals. The report notes that each window was carefully removed and replaced with custom made “like-kind” wood windows. Although it is unfortunate the house does not possess its original windows, the replacements are in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior’s standards for replacement. Metal railings have been added at an unknown date to the front steps. Overall, the modifications do not detract from historic character of the house.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, which was born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties. The subject house continues to convey the historic significance of Craftsman style of architecture by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style including the: moderately-pitched front-gabled roof with wide eave overhangs and exposed rafters; decorative stick work and braces in gable; lattice attic vent; horizontal clapboard siding; a partial-width front porch with crenellated parapet supported by square tapered wood columns on clapboard piers; and wood double-hung and transomed windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the Kelly Family House under Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The Pacific Building Company was said to be one of the most important and prolific real estate companies in San Diego in the first half of the 20th Century. The company was founded by Oscar W. Cotton in 1908 and he managed the firm until 1928. The company specialized in well built, yet cost effective products to extend home ownership to those of modest means. The company not only developed dozens of tracts, it engineered creative ways for the average buyer to finance the purchase of both a lot and house. The company started off well for itself building a house a day when the company was formed in 1908. Throughout the 1910’s the company focused more on designing and constructing homes on lots purchased either by individuals or by the company itself. Draftsmen, many hired from Irving Gill’s office, would create plans for both large and small homes. Renderings of these designs were incorporated into advertisements along with costs to build any particular model. The company offered to build houses on a monthly payment plan, which was an entirely new concept in San Diego in the early part of the 20th Century. The Pacific Building Company used a “Deed of Trust” or “Trust Deed” which allowed the builder to lend buyers up to 80%. Buyers paid the mortgage in 3-5 years and the Trust Deed monthly. By the 1920’s, Pacific Building Company expanded its focus and began to promote lot sales and financing. Because the company maintained experienced architects in its employ and built houses on many of the lots it sold, homes in neighborhoods affiliated with the company tended to

develop a harmonious look, usually emphasizing a particular architectural style. The architectural styles include those of the Craftsman, Prairie, and Colonial Revival styles.

The company built many homes in the South Park addition after buying the land from the Bartlett Estate Company who had subdivided the land in 1870. The Pacific Building Company was truly innovative in providing customers with architectural, sales, financing, and construction services. The Pacific Building Company was working against other notable designers/architects/builders in the South Park neighborhood including The Quayle Brothers, Irving J. Gill, William Sterling Hebbard, and Richard Requa. Homes were built for notable people in South Park including Charles S. Bell, a realtor and promoter of the Pacific Building Company, who had the building company build his house in the early Prairie Style in 1911. The Pacific Building Company also built homes in North Park on Utah, Kansas, and Idaho Streets.

The design of the Kelly Family House at 1538 Granada Avenue by the Pacific Building Company, as noted in the San Diego Union Newspaper article in January of 1912, is representative of the quality and character of their craftsmanship, and therefore merits designation under HRB Criterion D as the work of an established Master Builder.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Kelly Family House located at 1538 Granada Avenue be designated with a period of significance of 1912 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of Craftsman Architecture and Criterion D as a notable work of Master Building firm, the Pacific Building Company. The designation excludes the 470 square foot detached garage on the southwest corner of the property. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Sarah Vonesh
Planning Intern



Cathy Winterrowd
Assistant Deputy Director/HRB Liaison

SV/ks/cw

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 11/29/2012

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 11/29/2012, to consider the historical designation of the **Kelly Family House** (owned by Anthony W. Keller and Sherri L. Rudinsky, 1538 Granada Avenue, San Diego, CA 92102) located at **1538 Granada Avenue, San Diego, CA 92102**, APN: **539-344-11-00**, further described as BLK 10 LOT 11 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Kelly Family House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Craftsman style architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1912 date of construction and period of significance. Specifically, the resource retains its moderately-pitched front-gabled roof with wide eave overhangs and exposed rafters; decorative stick work and braces in gable; lattice attic vent; horizontal clapboard siding; partial-width front porch with crenellated parapet; square tapered wood columns on clapboard piers; and wood double-hung and transomed windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

(2) The property is historically significant under CRITERION D as a notable work of Master Builder the Pacific Building Company and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource represents the Pacific Building Company's work in the Craftsman architectural style and their association with the development of South Park. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 470 square foot detached garage on the southwest corner of the property.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
KEITH BAUERLE
Deputy City Attorney