

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF JUNE 26, 2008
202 C Street, City Administration Building
Council Committee Room, 12th Floor
San Diego, CA 92101**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Lemmo at 1:10pm

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Jerry Schaefer	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present
Boardmember	John Eisenhart	Present
Boardmember	Otto Emme	Absent
Boardmember	Gail Garbini	Present
Boardmember	Paul Johnson	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance: Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
Kelley Saunders, Senior Planner
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner
Jennifer Hirsch, Senior Planner
Tricia Olsen, Associate Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Marianne Greene, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Minutes were not available for this hearing

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

Vonn Marie May would like the Board to call a public meeting regarding Casa de Bandini, or a co-board meeting with the Old Town Advisory Board, as a venue for the public to ask questions and express their concerns.

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

• **ABSENCES**

Boardmember Emme will not be in attendance today

• **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

Copy of Memorandum of Law from Marianne Greene, Deputy City Attorney

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

None

- **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- Responses to the Grand Jury Report on the Mills Act heard at City Council June 16, 2008 will be forwarded to the Presiding Judge. The Mayor, Independent Budget Analyst and City Council are in agreement on the responses. The report with the draft responses was prepared by the IBA's office and is available on the City's website: www.sandiego.gov/iba. Click on "reports" and "2008" and report 08-58.
- The Mayor's proposed changes to the Mills Act program will be considered by the Board at the regularly scheduled HRB meeting of July 24, 2008 at a time certain of 4:00PM. It is expected that the Board will make specific recommendations related to the Mayor's proposal. Those recommendations will be forwarded to the City Council Committee on Land Use and Housing later this summer. Meeting notices will be mailed out to all designated property owners and all property owners that have submitted a nomination report. The notice will also be sent to the City Council offices, recognized community planning groups, historic consultants and other interested parties, and will be posted on the HR website. Audio from the April workshop has been added to the website, and Audio from the June workshop will be posted shortly.
- Due to a lack of items a DAS meeting will not be held on Wednesday, July 2, 2008. The next DAS meeting is scheduled for the third Wednesday in August on the 20th, due to staff vacations. The next Policy, Incentives and Archaeology Subcommittee meetings will be on Monday, July 14.

Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes 1 referral from CCDC and six individual homeowner nominations. There are 5 individual homeowner nominations that were submitted in 2006, 68 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2007, and 33 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2008 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

None

E. INFORMATION ITEMS

None

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 7 – FRANK AND MILLIE LEXA HOUSE, 3030 33RD Street

ITEM 8 – LOUELLA ASH HOUSE, 1846 Granada Avenue

ITEM 9 – MORRIS AND LILIAN HERRIMAN RESIDENCE, 435 W. Thorn Street

ITEM 10 –FREDERICK W. HAMAN SPEC HOUSE #1, 2914 Date Street

Board Discussion:

Owner pulled Item 8 from Consent Agenda

Boardmember Berge pulled Item 7 from the Consent Agenda and wanted to change the name of Item 9 to The Morris and Lilian Herriman House, instead of The Morris and Lilian Herriman Residence and proposed a name change to Item 10 to the Frederick W. Haman Spec House #1 to include the wife's name.

Staff is OK with Item 9 name change

Scott A. Moomjian, on behalf of the owner, will provide the copies of the original grant deeds for Item 10

Chair Lemmo recommended the Board take the Item on Consent and then visit the naming issue at a later date, after Staff receives copies of the grant deeds.

Boardmember Berge is fine with that, since this was received prior to the change in the naming requirements.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER EISENHART TO APPROVE STAFF RECOMMENDATION OF CONSENT ITEMS; 9 – THE MORRIS AND LILIAN HERRIMAN RESIDENCE WITH NAME CHANGE TO THE MORRIS AND LILIAN HERRIMAN HOUSE, AND 10 –THE FREDERICK W. HAMAN SPEC HOUSE #1 WITH THE CAVEAT IT WILL COME BACK FOR NAMING TO BE IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE DEED

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – KOLBECK AUTO WORKS

Applicant: Marie Burke Lia, on behalf of the owner 1220 J Street, LLC

Location: 1220 J Street, Centre City Community, Council District 2 (1289-B4)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1220 J Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the structure located at 1220 J Street under any HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB-08-039

Staff Report by Jennifer Hirsch

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Marie Lia

In Opposition: Bruce Coons, Janet O'Dea

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Curry does not support Staff recommendation; building reflects industrial history is San Diego. It is a unique structure, relevant for its location, utilitarian, and is scarce; it has survived and is adaptable. We need to preserve all aspects of San Diego.

Boardmember Berge supports Boardmember Curry and warrants designation. The Board is here to evaluate and register, as part of the "Goal of Preservation". Covers a period of construction; style is a rare example of Minimal Tradition in a Warehouse/Industrial construction. This is a part of our history, it is a marker, and would like it to be marked.

Boardmember Eisenhart concurs with the other Boardmembers and also supports designation. This property really has nothing to do with Mission Revival; trusses are covered, which is a reaction to the construction. In the Midwest, there are numerous examples of this vernacular warehouse type structures from the 1940's and 1950's. It is unique for the use of the long-span trusses on a short building.

Boardmember Schaefer had questions as to why the district nomination was withdrawn. It is a plain utilitarian building; but there are those incredible imposing doors, which do resemble aircraft hanger doors, and there is nothing like that in the downtown/urban area.

Boardmember Silvas was also onboard when this property came up, and what fascinated him about the Warehouse District was that people lived in houses nearby and walked to work.

Boardmember Garbini added that in that area there is also a structure to the South, so it is supported by a similar structure.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER EISENHART TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 – KOLBECK AUTO WORKS UNDER CRITERIA C, AS A GOOD EXAMPLE OF INDUSTRIAL VERNACULAR ARCHITECTURE

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 6 – MARTIN ORTLIEB DUPLEX

Applicant: Vonn Marie May, on behalf of the owner Richard and Marsha Lenyk

Location: 2875 Palm Street and 2889 Palm Street/2844 29th Street, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (1269-E7)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2875, 2889 Palm Street/2844 29th Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Martin Ortlieb Duplex at 2889 Palm Street and 2844 29th Street as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C, for its representation of Spanish Colonial Revival architecture. Do not designate the single-family home at 2875 Palm Street under any HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB-08-040

Staff Report by Jennifer Hirsch

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Vonn Marie May

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Eisenhart had questions about the roof, there are discrepancies between the historic photo and the current photo, the current roof appears have more to be concrete not tile

Richard Lenyk, property owner, responded that the roof is flat on top and with tile along the perimeter; it is their understanding that it is the original roof.

Boardmember Eisenhart is only concerned with the flat roof, wanted to confirmation that the tile is actually clay tile.

Mr. Lenyk replied that it looks like clay tile from looking at it, he is willing to go up and test it, to make sure

Boardmember Johnson has the same suspicions that Boardmember Eisenhart has, there is something not right about the roof, it doesn't appear to be brand new, but the shape and texture does not appear to be from the 1920's.

Boardmember Berge is not as troubled by the shape as the other Boardmembers, and need to consider whether this is an appropriate replacement.

Boardmember Eisenhart responded it appears to be "watered down" roofing and impacts the resource; he cannot support designation in its current condition. If they came back and replaced the roof with a single barrel tile, he could support designation.

Boardmember Johnson is concerned with the roof; although you really have to back away quite a bit too really see the roof. The material of the tile is not a deal breaker, and feels that it can be included as Mills Act condition for future, more appropriate, roofing.

Boardmember Schaefer feels this is a delightful building, with all of its original doors, windows and hardware. He respects Boardmembers Johnson and Eisenhart, regarding their opinions on the roof. Maybe we can get an enlarged historic photo, to show more detail

of the roof. A lot of the building is intact, with lots of detail, do we want to consider a condition of a Mills Act.

Chair Lemmo was in favor of Staff's recommendation, until this issue was raised, now not sure Boardmember Eisenhart loves the structure itself, but is uncomfortable designating this structure if it is a concrete roof. He asked for more information to be brought before the Board.

Boardmember Johnson also feels this is a fantastic house, supports designation and the replacement of the roof over time.

Boardmember Berge feels this duplex deserves designation; and is in favor of putting a condition or time frame for the roof to be replaced. The single family residence, has integrity issues, but is a good example of infill and should be considered for designation with Mills Act condition.

Boardmember Curry the smaller home is protected by virtue of the owner. The roof is not a significant issue and supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Berge would like the wife's name included in the designation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER TO EISENHART TO DESIGNATE ITEM 6 PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION; WITH A MILLS ACT CONDITION THAT THE EXISTING ROOF BE REPLACED WITH A SINGLE BARREL CLAY TILE ROOF WITHIN 10 YEARS, IF ROOF IS NOT ALREADY CLAY TILE AND TO CHANGE THE NAME TO MARTIN AND CATHERINE ORTLIEB DUPLEX.

Seconded by Boardmember

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 7 – FRANK AND MILLIE LEXA HOUSE

Applicant: Scott Moomjian, on behalf of the owners, Richard and Yvonne Kenyon

Location: 3030 33rd Street, North Park Community, Council District 3 (1289-F1)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3030 33rd Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Frank and Millie Lexa House at 3030 33rd Street as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as a good example of a Craftsman Bungalow style house.

Report Number: HRB-08-041

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Scott Moomjian

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge pulled this from consent; she has concerns with the location of the front walkway and the front steps to the home. Different from other homes in the neighborhood, does not feel she has enough information to support designation.

Boardmember Schaefer recalled that a lot of the Bungalows, in that area, had the center walkways and steps in the front. He did not pick up that the walkway was moved.

Boardmember Berge after hearing comments from Staff and the Applicant, she feels that more information needs to be included in the consultant reports and is now supporting Staff;

Boardmember Garbini mentioned that a central walkway is pretty routine in that neighborhood. The front porch is damaged and a lot times they will cover the old/damaged cement with tile.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 – FRANK AND MILLIE LEXA HOUSE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Johnson Vote: 8-0-0 Motion Passes

ITEM 8 – LOUELLA ASH HOUSE

Applicant: IS Architecture, on behalf of the owner, Melissa J. McKinstry Revocable Trust 05-28-03 et al.

Location: 1846 Granada Avenue, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 3 (1289-E2)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1846 Granada Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Louella Ash House at 1846 Granada Avenue as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as a good example of a Craftsman Bungalow style house.

Report Number: HRB-08-042

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor:

In Opposition: Doug Kipperman, Ione Stiegler

Board Discussion:

Owner pulled item from consent

Boardmember Johnson thanked the applicant for such a beautiful house, questioned the extent of the restoration/repair of work done to the porch gable roof. He doesn't have any problems with the gutters.

Boardmember Schaefer says the gutters don't bother him much, because the fabric is there, and by taking down the upper part of the fence would be acceptable and would provide adequate visibility.

Boardmember Garbini says the Japanese gardens were typical to Craftsman homes. Fence doesn't bother her, but the landscaping should be pruned.

Boardmember Curry feels this home should be designated, and considers the "other considerations" to be minor issues.

Boardmember Berge does not have a problem with the fence, questioned the extension of the end rafter tail. She also has an issue with the name of the home, the woman who had the home built never lived there, and the name should reflect that, per the naming policy.

Boardmember Eisenhart wanted to comment on the roof rafters, they are a character defining feature, and feels that they need to comeback, he also does not have a problem with the fence. He would also recommend that the gutters be removed on the porch area.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SCHAEFER TO DESIGNATE ITEM 8 – LOUELLA ASH SPEC HOUSE UNDER CRITERION C AS AN EXCELLENT EXAMPLE OF A CRAFTSMAN BUNGALOW

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 9 – MORRIS AND LILIAN HERRIMAN RESIDENCE

Applicant: Scott Moomjian, on behalf of the owners John and Jackie Stone

Location: 435 W. Thorn Street, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (1268-J7)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 435 W. Thorn as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Morris and Lilian Herriman Residence at 435 West Thorn Street as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C, for its representation of Italian Renaissance architecture.

Report Number: HRB-08-043

Staff Report by Jennifer Hirsch

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT – NAME CHANGED TO MORRIS AND LILIAN HERRIMAN HOUSE

ITEM 10 – FREDERICK W. HAMAN SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Scott A. Moomjian, on behalf of the owner, Laurence Zeitlin

Location: 2914 Date Street, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 3, (1289-E2)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2914 Date Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Frederick W. Haman Spec House #1 located at 2914 Date Street under HRB Criterion C as a good example of Craftsman architecture.

Report Number: HRB-08-044

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 11 – BENJAMIN AND LOIS TORGERSON HOUSE

Applicant: Happy Hazard LLC on behalf of the owners, Laurie Shaw and Gary Petil

Location: 2851 Ivy Street, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (1289-E1)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2851 Ivy as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the Benjamin and Lois Torgerson House located at 2851 Ivy Street as a historical resource under any HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB-08-045 and HRB-08-006

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Janet O’Dea (*Allen Hazard, John Oldenkamp, Carin Howard, Dale Ballou-May, Laurie Shaw*), Gary Petill, Ron May

Board Discussion:

All Boardmember reviewed the Audio for this Property

Boardmember Curry appreciates all of the material provided by the consultant and found it to be very interesting to read. She is attracted to the history Torgerson. Feels that the home qualifies a little bit under each Criterion, so why not designate it. Torgerson should be recognized as a Master Builder. House is part of continuity of history.

Boardmember Berge thinks the house warrants designation, she is focused on Criterion C. We need to shift away from style and look at the method of construction. This home is clearly a split-level, from the period of depression.

Boardmember Garbini feels that this is a fascinating and exciting home; she can see the Monterey Style in it. She also thinks that Torgerson is probably a master.

Boardmember Eisenhart supports Staff’s recommendation. To quote the saying “the sum is greater than the parts”, in this home there are a lot of interesting parts, but the sum doesn’t come together. Goal of a Split-level was an efficient floor plan with minimal stairs between to levels, does not feel that is the case here, and even the consultant says this is not a split level. Roofing should be wood shake, which is a dominate feature of Monterey Style, it isn’t; overall composition of the building doesn’t embody anything distinctive.

Boardmember Johnson concurs with Staff's report; there maybe a case for Torgerson to be elevated to the level of Master Builder, but this does not appear to be an exemplary example of his work.

Boardmember Schaefer also agrees with Staff's recommendation, regrettably to some extent. He doesn't see this as Monterey at all; it does not fit most of the Criteria that would identify it as Monterey. Torgerson is a Master Builder, consultant provided enough examples, but he agrees with Boardmember Johnson that his is not an exemplary example of his work. There are a lot of fine details to this house, but it is not an exemplary house in terms of style or showing enough of those elements of construction.

Boardmember Curry also wondered why he built what he did, maybe because it was in the Depression era. Believes this house is historic, has integrity, and deserves designation.

Boardmember Berge did not mean that it **is** a split-level; she was referring to the first staff report which called it a pre-cursor to a split-level. Her main focus is on the **method** of construction.

Boardmember Curry mentioned that the topography resulted in two stories being perceived from the rear and not the front.

Boardmember Garbini mentioned that flat sites are cheapest to develop; sloping sites are more difficult or expensive.

Chair Lemmo feels that the house is interesting, particularly interesting with regards to the pre-cursor split-level element. He agrees that our Criterion C is broader than style, but not sure this is distinctive enough to push it over. Also agrees that it is a little of each Criterion, but it is not at the level needed for designation. He is supportive of Staff Recommendation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 11 – BENJAMIN AND LOIS TORGERSON HOUSE UNDER CRITERION C FOR THE METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas

Vote: 4-4-0

Motion Fails

(Berge, Garbini, Curry, Silvas)

REMINDER:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: July 24, 2008

LOCATION: City Administration Building
12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:40PM