

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO  
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD  
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF JANUARY 22, 2009  
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING  
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12<sup>TH</sup> FLOOR  
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

---

**CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING**

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Lemmo at 1:10 PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Jerry Schaefer	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present
<i>Boardmember</i>	<i>Otto Emme</i>	<i>Absent</i>
Boardmember	Gail Garbini	Present
Boardmember	Linda Marrone	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance: Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary  
Cathy Winterrowd, Senior Planner  
Jennifer Hirsch, Senior Planner  
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner  
Tricia Olsen, Associate Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Nina Fain, Deputy City Attorney

**ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES for November 21, 2008**

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE NOVEMBER 21, 2008 MINUTES AS WRITTEN**

Seconded by Boardmember Schaefer      Vote: 6-0-1      Motion Passes  
(Lemmo)

**ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT**

None

**ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS**

**A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION**

• **ABSENCES**

Major Otto Emme is on his way to Germany for additional training and will be stationed in Kosovo beginning next month. He will officially resign from the Board in the next few weeks. The Mayor's office is aware of this pending vacancy and is working to fill all vacancies as soon as possible.

• **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Draft Minutes for November 21, 2008
- ✓ Staff Report for Information Item A – Calendar Year Work Program

• **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

**B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS**

• **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

Boardmember Garbini recused herself from Item #6 3528/3538 Indiana Street due to a conflict of interest

• **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

Boardmember Berge informed the Board that prior to becoming a Boardmember; she provided public testimony before the Land Use and Housing Board regarding Item 10 – Historical Resource Designation Appeals Process

Boardmember Schafer spoke with the property owner of Item 9 – C. Arnholt Smith/ Ralph L. Frank House regarding current restoration of the exterior of the property that other Boardmembers were not privy to in the report.

Chair Lemmo spoke with the representative for Item 5 – Old Fire Station #19 while touring the interior of the building; information was consistent with what was included in the report.

• **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

Boardmembers Garbini, Silvas, Schaefer, and Curry were unable to view the interiors of Item 5 – Old Fire Station #19; agree that the photos included in the report are sufficient.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO INVOKE WAIVER FOR THE BOARDMEMBERS WHO WERE UNABLE TO VIEW THE INTERIORS OF ITEM 5- OLD FIRE STATION #19**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

VOTE: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

### **C. STAFF REPORT**

- An informational handout summarizing the new Mills Act Program and fees, including the application and amended Council Policy are provided on the back table and will be posted to the City's website tomorrow. We are accepting applications for new Mills Act agreements until March 31, 2009. The property must have been designated a historical resource by December 31, 2008 for the property owner to apply this year. The application includes requirements for a tailored 10-year work plan and demonstrated investment of anticipated tax savings in the resource.
- Historical resources staff has been working on several historic surveys over the past several months and will be working in various capacities on several new historic surveys during the next 2 years. A consultant has completed the first draft of the Barrio Logan survey; we are reviewing it and will be providing comments. We will bring it to the Board in March for a public workshop and comment. Staff completed the historic context and built environment survey for Otay Mesa and is in the process of the same for Ocean Beach. Surveys for Uptown, Greater North Park, Greater Golden Hill, San Ysidro, Old Town and Midway will be commencing over the next few months. Some of the work will be completed by consultants and some of it will be completed by staff. All of the surveys are being completed in support of community plan updates and will accompany the plans through the hearing process.
- Historical resources staff is also working on a new Programmatic Agreement for the Quieter Homes Program, including a neighborhood background study and treatment guidelines that have been prepared by a consultant for the Airport Authority. We will be bringing these components to the Policy Subcommittee for review during the next several months.
- The next Policy Subcommittee meeting is scheduled for Monday, February 9, 2009 and the next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting is scheduled for Monday, March 9, 2009. The DAS and Incentives Subcommittee meetings will resume when the membership has been addressed by the Policy Subcommittee and the full Board.
- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes two referrals from Development Services, three individual homeowner nominations and the Historical Resource Designation Appeals Process. There are 56 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2007 and 53 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2008 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

### **D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES**

None

### **ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA**

ITEM 7 – CHARLES W. FOX/WILLIAM STERLING HEBBARD HOUSE *at 3100  
Brant Street*

ITEM 8 – LILLIAN ARNETT HOUSE *at 2112 Pine Street*

ITEM 9 – C. ARNHOLT SMITH/RALPH L. FRANK HOUSE *at 2293 San Juan Street*

**Board Discussion:**

Owner pulled Item 8 from Consent Agenda

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO APPROVE STAFF RECOMMENDATION ON CONSENT AGENDA ITEM 7 – CHARLES W. FOX/ WILLIAM STERLING HEBBARD HOUSE AND ITEM 9 – C. ARNHOLT SMITH/RALPH L. FRANK HOUSE**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

---

**INFORMATION ITEMS**

---

**A. CALENDAR YEAR 2009 WORK PROGRAM**

Report Number: HRB-09-001

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd

NO ACTION OF THE BOARD WAS REQUIRED FOR THIS ITEM

---

**ACTION ITEMS**

---

**ITEM 5 –OLD FIRE STATION #19**

Applicant: City of San Diego represented by Brothers United Firefighters Inc

Location: 3601 Ocean View Boulevard, 92113, Southeastern San Diego Community, Council District 4 (**1289 5-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3601 Ocean View Boulevard as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate Old Fire Station #19 located at 3601 Ocean View Boulevard as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 – 1951, under HRB Criteria A and B. In addition, designate the interior of Old Fire Station #19 (excluding the bathrooms and any contemporary alterations in the kitchen) with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-09-003

Staff Report by Jennifer Hirsch

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Jonathan Bowens, Samuel Campbell (*Dale May, Ron May*), Jermaine Stevenson, Kenneth Malbrough, Russell Steppe, Carrol Waymon

In Opposition: None

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Schaefer thought that there is a broader historic context for this fire house in terms of the African American community as a whole; since it was built and occupied during the heyday of the “Harlem of the West” downtown. It is clear that the property is eligible under Criteria A and B. He would like to see the exterior restored in order to make it eligible under Criterion C; he does support designation of the interiors under Criterion C.

Boardmember Berge agrees with Boardmember Schaefer and supports Staff’s recommendation. She thought maybe CDBG money may available for restoration of the exterior.

Boardmember Curry strongly supports designation under Criteria A and B; this fits perfectly a model of what we want for Criteria A and B. Also supports Staff’s recommendation for Criterion C. She also agrees with the other Boardmembers in regards to the exterior stucco restoration. There is also an International history as well, since San Diego firefighters helped in Tijuana during the period of significance.

Boardmember Silvas thinks this is a great story; a structure and human story connected. He also supports Staff’s recommendation.

Boardmember Garbini also supports Staff’s recommendation.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 – OLD FIRE STATION #19 PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge                      Vote: 7-0-0                      Motion Passes

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DIRECT STAFF TO WRITE A LETTER FROM THE HRB TO THE COUNCILMEMBER’S OFFICE REQUESTING THE USE OF CDBG FUNDS FOR THE REHABILITATION AND RENOVATIONS OF THE EXTERIOR STUCCO AND DOORS.**

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas                      Vote: 7-0-0                      Motion Passes

**ITEM 6 – ADENA MEAD HOUSE**  
**Trailed from October and November 2008**

Applicant: MDTC LLC represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 3528/3538 Indiana Street, 92103, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3  
**(1269 6-C)**

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3528/3538 Indiana Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Adena Mead House be designated under HRB Criterion C as an example of Craftsman Bungalow style architecture retaining a high level of integrity, and excluding 3528 Indiana Street from the designation due to a loss of integrity of materials, design and feeling.

Report Number: HRB-08-067

Staff Report by Tricia Olsen

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Marie Burke Lia (*Scott Moomjian, Kathryn Conniff, Hung Dao, David Hawkins*)

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Curry feels that it is very important to preserve this house. The house is historic; it has architectural value and complies with the criteria for designation. It does not matter that they are too many in other places; this home is historic for this street. She supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Berge is not sure that the setting, association and feeling are as critical as the need to look at its individual significance. The house looks like the typical bungalow with a 1920's fitting on a small lot. She is uncertain on this one and would like to hear from other Boardmembers.

Chair Lemmo is also uncertain on this one and would like to hear from other Boardmembers as well. He is trying to look at it in a context as if the owner had brought it forward as a voluntary designation rather than an involuntary designation.

Boardmember Schaefer is also on the fence with this one. It does have the character defining features of craftsman style architecture; but it is not a special example or a particularly good one either.

Boardmember Marrone is also not sure on this one; because it is one of the last examples of its kind in the immediate area, does that contribute to its importance?

Boardmember Berge answered that the City follows State DPR instructions; this includes looking at the same property types in the same historic context.

Boardmember Curry believes that it is historic; it has integrity and has a setting. Modest or small buildings are also important to history.

Chair Lemmo is having difficulty supporting designation; unfortunately a unanimous vote is needed to designate.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 6 – ADENA MEAD HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 1-5-1

Motion Fails

(*Lemmo, Schaefer, Silvas, Marrone, Berge*)(*Garbini*)

**ITEM 7 – CHARLES W. FOX/WILLIAM STERLING HEBBARD HOUSE**

Applicant: RSL Woodglen LLC represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 3100 Brant Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1269 7-A**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3100 Brant Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Charles W. Fox/William Sterling Hebbard House located at 3100 Brant Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1908 under HRB Criteria C and D, excluding the 6,000 square foot 2006/2007 additions.

Report Number: HRB-09-002

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

ITEM PASSENT ON CONSENT

**ITEM 8 – LILLIAN ARNETT HOUSE**

Applicant: Jake Douglas & Amy Becker represented by Happy Hazard

Location: 2112 Pine Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 5-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2112 Pine Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Lillian Arnett House as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1916 under HRB Criterion C as an example of Craftsman Bungalow style architecture retaining a good degree of integrity.

Report Number: HRB-09-005

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Janet O'Dea

In Opposition: None

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Berge thinks that the alterations could be considered significant in its own right.

Chair Lemmo is not bothered by it.

Boardmember Schaefer commented that per the standards to make any changes without enough documentation is inappropriate; it is better to leave it be. He thinks that the texture of the stucco piers is questionable. He is in support of Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Curry supports Staff's recommendation; "*restoration stops when hypotheses begins*"

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CURRY TO DESIGNATE ITEM 8 – LILLIAN ARNETT HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Schaefer

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

**ITEM 9 – C. ARNHOLT SMITH/RALPH L. FRANK HOUSE**

Applicant: Pollack Family Trust represented by IS Architecture

Location: 2293 San Juan Road, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (1268 5-G)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2293 San Juan Road as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the C. Arnholt Smith/Ralph L. Frank House located at 2293 San Juan Road as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1936-1967 under Criteria B, C and D.

Report Number: HRB-09-007

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

ITEM PASSENT ON CONSENT

**ITEM 10 – HISTORICAL RESOURCE DESIGNATION APPEALS PROCESS**

**Continued from November 2008**

Applicant: City of San Diego, City Planning & Community Investment Department

Location: Citywide

Description: Review and consider the alternatives for modifying the current historical resource designation appeals process.

Today's Action: Make a recommendation to the San Diego City Council regarding the issue of whether or not to modify the current historical resource designation appeals process.

Staff Recommendation: Recommend to the City Council either maintaining the current historical resource designation appeal process or adoption of the proposed alternative that would expand the Council's discretion in overturning a historical designation, or remain neutral on the issue and not present a recommendation to the City Council.

Report Number: HRB-08-073

**Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd**

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Marie Burke Lia, Scott Moomjian

Neutral: Janet O'Dea, Dan Soderberg

In Opposition: Bruce Coons, Ron May (*Dale May*), Ione Stiegler

**Board Discussion:**

Chair Lemmo commented that the designation process of this Board is fundamentally different from permit decisions; these determinations are technical in nature and the Council has already decided who the technicians are. This process exists because the Council has deemed it to exist; they can change the process if they want to no matter what we think.

Boardmember Curry wants to recommend to the City Council to maintain the current historical resource designation appeals process. The economics of San Diego is so different than other places that you can't compare. Old buildings cannot defend themselves; that is what the Board is for.



Boardmember Schaefer mentioned that the Board is an advisory board more than anything else. The Board's power is limited, the only real power we have is to designate properties. The current process provides incentives for developers to incorporate historic properties within their projects. Under this proposed de novo review it would be more arbitrary and politically charged as said before. This type of de novo review would be contrary to the whole code, regulatory resources and guidelines that are set in the historic resources section of the building code as to how properties are designated. It would degrade the City's principles of promoting historic preservation by having that de novo review and would like the Board to come out, very explicitly, for the status quo.

Boardmember Berge agrees with Boardmember Schaefer. She questioned if the appeal process is the same as the permit; would that mean if the Board did not designate a property it could be appealed. She is strongly in support of retaining the current appeal process.

Boardmember Silvas also supports the status quo.

Boardmember Garbini would like to request a full Board along with their recommendation.

Boardmember Marrone concurs with other Boardmembers that it is important to maintain the current process.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO RECOMMEND TO THE CITY COUNCIL TO RETAIN THE CURRENT HISTORICAL RESOURCE APPEAL PROCESS FOR THE FOLLOWING REASONS: (1) MAINTAINS THE DESIGNATION DECISION WITH THE TECHNICAL EXPERTS APPOINTED TO THE HRB AND ACCORDING TO THE LAND DEVELOPMENT CODE, GUIDELINES AND PUBLISHED HRB POLICIES AND PROCEDURES; (2) MAINTAINS THE DISTINCTION BETWEEN A DESIGNATION DECISION THAT IS USED TO IDENTIFY SIGNIFICANT HISTORICAL RESOURCES AND A PERMITTING DECISION THAT IS USED TO REGULATE LAND USES; AND (3) ALIGNS WITH CEQA AND DEFINITION OF A HISTORICAL RESOURCE**

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

**REMINDER:**

**NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE:** February 26, 2009

**LOCATION:** City Administration Building  
12<sup>th</sup> Floor, Council Committee Room

**MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:18 PM**