

DESIGN ASSISTANCE SUBCOMMITTEE

February 22, 2007, 4:00 pm – 5:30

4th Floor Conference Room

City Administration Building

202 C Street, San Diego, CA

MEETING NOTES

1. ATTENDANCE

Boardmembers:

David Marshall (Chair), Laura Burnett and John Eisenhart

HRB Observers: Priscilla Ann Berge and Jerry Schaefer

Staff:

Marianne Green, City Attorney's Office; Michael Tudury, Kelley Saunders and Diane Kane, HRB

Guests:

3333 Harbor View Drive: Christiamaria and Dan Ormsby, owners

1520 Fort Stockton Drive: Scott Moomjian, attorney

838 25th Street: Bob Bauer, Architect; Douglas Holbrook, owner

Other:

Bruce Coons, SOHO

2. Public/Staff Comment

None

3. Projects

- 3333 Harbor View Drive: (John Eisenhart recused himself)

The owner of a potentially historic Monterey style house was looking to redesign their project consistent with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation in order to preserve their possible eligibility for designation. Staff had met with the applicant and provided direction regarding design and consistency with the Standards. The applicant requested to bring their project forward to DAS for a second opinion and additional input. HRB staff Kelley Saunders presented the project and noted that the house was originally on a much larger lot and that the orientation of the original entry was impacted by previous owners dividing the site and selling off the lot that was once the front yard. Due to that, the front entry is now on the side of the house. She also noted that the original designer/architect is unknown. The owners, Christiamaria and Dan Ormsby indicated that they wished to relocate the entry to the current front of the house. The owners also noted that they had previously constructed a two-car garage that is located in the front yard. The garage permit was obtained in an over-the-counter manner.

Board Comment:

Chair David Marshall stated that since the new (non-compatible) two-car garage severely restricted the public visibility of the house, he felt that the house was likely no longer eligible for historic designation. Consequently, the proposed changes

would be a moot issue. He was not sure why the building department did not forward the garage plans to HRB since the house is clearly over 45-years old. Loopholes like this need to be closed.

Laura Burnett concurred with Mr. Marshall that the lack of visibility probably precluded the house from being designated.

Other: Bruce Coons of SOHO concurred, stating his reasons as the impact of the change of the lot/entry orientation and the construction of the new garage in front of the house.

- 1520 Fort Stockton Drive:

This Craftsman style bungalow had been scheduled for consideration of designation at the February 22, 2007 HRB meeting and a requested continuance was granted to the owner's representative at that meeting. The owner's representative, Scott Moomjian discussed options regarding the structure to gain support for possible designation. It was noted by HRB staff that the house was intact with the exception of the small entry porch having been filled in by moving the original door and frame forward. This modification created a new side door from the driveway directly into the entry foyer. It was noted that the original columns, pergolas, and arched roof at the entry were not changed. Finally, it was noted that HRB staff felt that in its current configuration, it could be a contributor to a future historic district in that area.

Board Comment:

Laura Burnett stated that she felt that the house would be individually designatable in its current configuration.

John Eisenhart did not concur, stating that he felt it would not be designatable without returning the front entry to its historic configuration.

David Marshall stated, although no guarantee for designation could be made, that if the infill foyer was removed and the front porch and entry was returned to its historic position, it would likely be individually designated.

Other:

Bruce Coons concurred with Mr. Eisenhart and Mr. Marshall.

- 838 25th Street (HRB Site #130-054):

This Colonial Revival style structure (not Eastlake Victorian as stated in the agenda) in Golden Hill has been before the DAS on three previous occasions: October, November and December of 2004. At the last meeting of the DAS there were three outstanding issues that needed to be addressed in order for the DAS to determine that the proposed project met the Standards. These three issues were: 1. the narrowing of the curb cut; 2. the softening the visual impact of the driveway by means of a "Hollywood" drive, additional landscaping and utilizing "Grasscrete" landscaped pavers; and 3. the elimination of the balustrade and the use of the flat roof of the porch as a balcony. The applicant, Douglas Holbrook, has agreed to items 1 and 2 and they are no longer outstanding issues.

HRB staff noted that the original architect of this 1893 structure was determined to be Irving Gill. It is perhaps the first work by Irving Gill in the city, and is the earliest example of his work extant in the city. The house was done before he became a partner with Mr. Hebbard, and before he opened his own practice and developed his signature style.

Mr. Holbrook and his architect, Bob Bauer, presented new information regarding the possible previous existence of a balustrade and the possible historic use of the rooftop as a balcony. It was noted that the existing balustrade was installed by the current owner. Mr. Bauer noted the existence of a 25 ½" height newel post pilaster at the rooftop level that suggested that there was a previous balustrade at this location. He then presented other Irving Gill designs of a similar vintage, such as the historically-designated 1896 Frost house that utilized the flat entry roof over an entry porch as a walking surface with a balustrade. From these examples, it was suggested that the location of a balustrade should be set back from the edge of the roof approximately 18", in line with the columns below. Mr. Bauer presented a structural report that indicated that the roof appeared to be originally structured to accommodate a walking surface. It was pointed out that there is an existing door frame at the large window that is used as access to the roof top on the side of the house that suggests that there was an original door at this location.

Board/Other Comment:

David Marshall noted that in the case of details such as this, he wished to hear from Bruce Coons of SOHO, who has extensive knowledge of buildings of this vintage and style. Mr. Coons stated that the evidence presented indicated a high likelihood of an original balustrade at the rooftop of the entry porch.

David Marshall concurred with Mr. Coons, but stated that he would like documentation such as a historic photo or an original drawing regarding the actual design. The applicant stated that they would be pursuing additional information. If that new documentation is not available, Mr. Marshall stated that he would support the construction of a new 24" height balustrade with intermittent posts in alignment with the porch posts below. The new balustrade should be set back from the roof edge, in line with the posts below. If the documentation is available that shows the balustrade, it would allow the reconstruction of 24" height balustrade under the California Historical Building Code. If the documentation is not available, the new balustrade should be done with simple 1½" square wood vertical balusters and a simple cap rail at a height of 24". An unobtrusive horizontally-oriented wrought iron rail could be used above, extending to the code-required height of 36", in order to differentiate the new from the complementary wood balustrade.

Mr. Eisenhart and Ms. Burnett concurred with the above comments.

4. Adjourned at 5:30

The next DAS Meeting is scheduled for February 22, 2007 at 4-5 p.m. following the full HRB meeting.