

CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD

DESIGN ASSISTANCE SUBCOMMITTEE

Wednesday, November 04, 2009, at 4:00 PM

12th Floor Conference Room 12B

City Administration Building

202 C Street, San Diego, CA

MEETING NOTES

1. ATTENDANCE

Subcommittee Members	Alex Bethke (Chair); Salvador Aréchiga; Gail Garbini
Recusals	None
City Staff	
HRB	Kelley Saunders
City Attorney	Nina Fain
Guests	
Item 3A	John Eisenhart; Doug Calvin
Other	None

2. Public Comment (on matters not on the agenda)

- None

3. Project Reviews

▪ **ITEM 3A:**

Listings: HRB Site #160 & #208-388

Address: 633 20th Street

Historic Name: The Sherman Hearn House

Significance: Architecture (Victorian Era, 1887)

Mills Act Status: Active Contract, Recorded 2002

PTS #: N/A

Project Contact: John Eisenhart

Treatment: Rehabilitation

Project Scope: This rehabilitation project proposes to remove an existing non-permitted garage deck and construct a new two-car garage with a new dwelling unit above. The second floor unit will be connected to the existing house. The project as proposed will require a variance for setbacks.

Existing Square Feet: 1,946

Additional Square Feet: 740

Total Proposed Square Feet: 2,686

Prior DAS Review: N/A

Staff Presentation: This rehabilitation project proposes to remove an existing non-permitted garage deck and construct a new two-car garage with a new dwelling unit above. The second floor unit will be connected to the existing house. The project as proposed will require a variance for setbacks, which staff is unsure can be supported as presented, due to the extent of the setback variance.

Applicant Presentation: Zoned MF-3000. An unpermitted 2 car garage currently on-site needs to be removed. The owner wants to construct a new 2-car garage, and the turning radius needed between the garage and house would require the garage to be built on the side and rear property line with no setback. The second floor would be built outside of the required setback and will not require a variance. The second floor will be cantilevered over the new garage below. The space above the garage will serve as a guest unit. The second floor will be connected to the rear of the house at the second floor at a width of 9 feet. The original structure has a shiplap siding. The garage will be stucco with the second floor guest unit covered in shiplap and the connecting element finished in board and batten. The applicant is looking for DAS to comment on the variance request and consistency with the Standards.

Public Comment: None

Q&A:

Subcommittee-member Issue or Question	Applicant's Response
The existing garage is unpermitted?	The unit above is. Simply removing everything (1960's era construction).
What garage doors will be used?	Sliders with overhead track with 3 parallels
Will the window sizes be similar to existing house?	Yes.

Subcommittee Discussion and Comment:

Subcommittee-member	Comments
Aréchiga	Concerned about the visibility from the west elevation.
Garbini	Can definitely tell that they are of different eras. The board and batten is reminiscent of single wall construction.
Bethke	House and addition should be two different, but complimentary color palettes.

Staff Comment:

Staff Member	Comments
Saunders	Why connect the unit to the house? (For ease of access, versatility).

Recommended Modifications: The project as designed is consistent with the Standards and the variance request seems reasonable given the constraints. The house and addition should be two different, but complimentary color palettes.

Consensus:

- Consistent with the Standards
- Consistent with the Standards if modified as noted
- Inconsistent with the Standards and needs revision and additional review
- Inconsistent with the Standards but is the best feasible alternative
- Inconsistent with the Standards

4. Adjourned at 4:30PM

The next regularly-scheduled Subcommittee Meeting will be on December 2, 2009 at 4:00 PM.

For more information, please contact Kelley Saunders at KMSaunders@sandiego.gov or 619.236.6545