



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: February 12, 2009 REPORT NO. HRB-09-009

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of February 26, 2009

SUBJECT: **ITEM #6 – P.M. and Charlotte A. Peltier House**

APPLICANT: Lynn Family Trust, owners; represented by Scott Moomjian

LOCATION: 2242 Pine Street, Uptown Community, Council District 2

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the P.M. and Charlotte A. Peltier House located at 2242 Pine Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the P.M. and Charlotte A. Peltier House as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies distinctive characteristics through retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic architectural style and retains integrity from its period of significance, the construction date of 1935.



City Planning & Community Investment
202 C Street, MS 5A • San Diego, CA 92101-3865
Tel (619) 235-5200 Fax (619) 533-5951

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a proposed building modification or demolition of a structure of 45 years or more, consistent with San Diego Municipal Code Section 143.0212.

The subject property is located on the northeast corner of Pine and Hortensia Streets in the Mission Hills neighborhood. The residential building record for 2242 Pine Street indicates that it was constructed in 1935. Water and sewer connection records support a construction date of 1935. The building was constructed by P.M. and Charlotte Peltier and they lived in the building from 1936 to 1938 when Charlotte Peltier sold the property.

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Scott Moomjian, which concludes that 2242 Pine Street is not significant under any HRB Criteria. Staff disagrees and finds that 2242 Pine Street is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C, as follows:

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The one-story Spanish Eclectic home constructed in 1935 features a rectangular floor plan and concrete foundation. Two front (southwest facing) wings feature gable roofs clad with Mission tiles, little eave overhang and exposed wood rafters. Small, arched vents are located just below the peak of each gable. The gable wings are not equal in size, therefore the massing of the house is asymmetrical, a character-defining feature of Spanish Eclectic architecture. The back portion of the home has a flat roof with composition roofing material. In addition, large, arched picture windows, one on each wing, are centered below the gable roofs. A central, covered, and recessed porch area separates the two gable wings and serves as the main entryway. Two double hung wood windows are centered in the porch area. A shed roof clad with Mission tile covers the porch. A central concrete pathway with steps leads up to the front porch.

The exterior of the home is clad with stucco, including the chimney located on the northwest elevation. Fenestration throughout the home consists of double hung wood windows. The bottom portion of both picture windows has been replaced with louvered windows; however, the original wood window frame remains in the opening. A one-story, detached garage is located at the northwest corner of the property. This garage features a flat roof with Mission tile trim, exposed roof rafters, a stucco exterior, and wood garage door.

Alterations listed in the consultant report include the following: application of “pancake” stucco, replacement front door, replacement of Mission tiles on the roof, and the louvered windows in each of the front facing picture windows. The consultant report also indicates the stucco wall with semi-arched openings on the southeast side of the property is a major alteration. Staff does not agree that any of these alterations are significant or lower the material integrity of the house. All of the alterations are minor and do not detract from the qualities of the home that


reflect Spanish Eclectic architecture. The home retains its original footprint as indicated by the 1940 Sanborn Map, as well as the majority of its original windows. The house embodies distinctive characteristics of Spanish Eclectic architecture including the following: stucco wall cladding, gable roof with little eave overhang, arched openings at the principal windows, and asymmetrical massing. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the P.M. and Charlotte Peltier under Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS


Conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the P.M. and Charlotte A. Peltier House be designated under HRB Criterion C as an example of Spanish Eclectic style architecture retaining a high level of integrity. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Jennifer Hirsch
Senior Planner



Cathy Winterrowd
Senior Planner/Program Coordinator

JH/cw

Attachment(s): Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover