



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: January 15, 2010 REPORT NO. HRB-10-004

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of January 28th 2010

SUBJECT: **ITEM #11 – Della M. Ballard House**

APPLICANT: Andrew and Veece Bullock represented by Christianne Knoop

LOCATION: 4220 Arden Way, Uptown Community, Council District 2

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Della M. Ballard House located at 4220 Arden Way as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Della M. Ballard House located at 4220 Arden Way including specified interior elements as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies distinctive characteristics through retention of character defining features of the Prairie style with Mission elements, retaining integrity from its period of significance, the construction date of 1913. Specifically, character defining features of the Prairie style reflected in the building include a flat roof with wide overhanging eaves, a full length one story front porch with massive square porch supports, simplified detailing at the eaves and cornice, simple wood framed double-hung and casement windows, and an overall emphasis on horizontality. Character defining features of the Mission style include the tile porch roof, shaped porch parapet, and square porch supports. Interior features included in this designation include the living room bench seat and fireplace, the stairs, the archway between the living room and entryway, and the built-ins in the dining room.



City Planning & Community Investment
202 C Street, MS 5A • San Diego, CA 92101-3865
Tel (619) 235-5200 Fax (619) 533-5951

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board at the property owners request to have the property designated as a historical resource.

The subject property is located on the south side of Arden Way in the Mission Hills area of Uptown. The property consists of a two story house and detached garage.

No notice of completion was submitted; however announcements placed in Los Angeles Builder and Contractor and The Daily Transcript indicate that the permit was issued for the building of the house in 1913. While there is an address discrepancy, the announcements list the address as 4532 Arden Way rather than the current street address 4220 Arden Way, the lot description of lots 15 and 16 block 9 is a match. The announcements identify Della M. Ballard as the property owner and Rambo and Trepte as the builders. The sewer connection permit is dated 1914 and the residential building record supports this date. Additionally, the chain of title and deed from date of construction indicate that Della M. Ballard took title in August of 1914 and the City Directory listings identify Fred and Della Ballard as residents in 1914. The house was occupied by Della, her husband Fred Ballard, and their family for just over 30 years when Della sold the house after Fred's death. This information is sufficient to identify 1914 as the date of construction; and for staff to propose the name Della M. Ballard House as consistent with the HRB naming policy.

ANALYSIS

A historical nomination report was prepared by Christianne Knoop, which concludes that 4220 Arden Way is eligible for designation under HRB Criteria B, C and D. Staff disagrees that the property is significant under Criterion B or D, but concurs that it is significant under Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the adopted HRB Designation Criteria Guidelines as follows:

CRITERION B – Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history

The nomination report proposed designation of the property under HRB Criterion B for its association with Fred Ballard, who was a partner in the successful women's clothing store chain, Ballard & Brockett. The business was started by Fred Ballard and Irving Brockett in 1903 as a dry goods store on 5th Avenue between E and F Streets. In 1913 the store moved to a larger location at 5th Avenue and C Street. At this time, the store began specializing in women's clothing and the partners successfully grew the store into a thriving business. By 1947, three years after Fred Ballard's death, the store had 11 locations throughout San Diego County. The success of the Ballard & Brockett chain indicates that Fred Ballard and Irving Brockett were successful businessmen; however it does not indicate that Fred Ballard is a historically significant person who has made a specific contribution to history at the local, state or national level and therefore staff does not recommend designation of the property under Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

4220 Arden Way is an example of the Prairie architectural style, with some references to the Mission style. The Prairie style originated in Chicago and enjoyed popularity nationwide during the early 20th century. The style is identified by character defining features such as very low pitch hipped or flat rooflines; wide eave overhangs; front or side porches with large square porch supports; and emphasis on horizontality in detailing, massing and window placement.

Like the Prairie style, the Mission style was popular in the first part of the 20th century. The style originated in California and was widely popular in the Southwest through 1920. The style is characterized by shaped parapets, tile roofs with wide open eave overhangs, large square porch supports, and stucco exterior finish.

The subject house is two-story Prairie style house, with a modified square plan, a flat roof and stucco exterior finish. The wide eave overhang is boxed with bead board and decorative brackets are present at even intervals. A prominent cornice runs the perimeter of the eaveline, and a parapet roof is visible above. Below the eaveline a stucco beltcourse is present around the perimeter of the house and sets the height for the top of the windows and echoes the horizontal emphasis of the eaveline above. Windows throughout the house are wood framed double-hung or casement. Double-hung windows typically have single light upper and lower sashes, and are present in singles, pairs, or ribbons of three or four. Where casement windows are present, they are divided light, with a large lower panel and three smaller lights across the top.

The front porch spans the front façade and terminates into the porte cochere at the east end. This element contributes elements of the Mission style to the overall Prairie design. The porch and porte cochere are covered by a clay tile shed roof with open eaves and decorative bracket supports. A simple, square shaped parapet is present above the entry portion of the porch. The front porch is supported with large square columns. From the sidewalk the porch is accessed by a scored concrete path and three small steps. The steps and porch floor are finished in small square tiles. Very low stucco walls are present on either side of the steps, and half height walls span the length of the arches on either side. These walls are stucco with a vertical wood middle section. The entry exhibits high quality wood craftsmanship, including a wood entry door with unusual glass inlay in the upper portion, heavy door surrounds, and finished porch ceiling. A pair of original multi-light wood French doors lies to the right of the entry, to left of the entry is a fixed 4-over-1 light window flanked by 2-over-1 light casements.

Modifications to the house include application of a smooth stucco texture over a non-historic rough stucco texture, a restorative modification; alterations at the rear consisting of a rear deck and kitchen remodel, both relatively minor modifications that are not visible from the public right of way; non-historic front porch paving and scored concrete front walkway, both minor and reversible modifications; replacement of the historic clay mission tile porch roof with a new Italian style pan tile roof; and the replacement of the original wrought iron railing in the middle sections of the front porch half walls with vertical wood railing. While the replacement of the original wrought iron and replacement of the shed roof tile are not ideal, these modifications are not so adverse that they preclude eligibility for designation given the good architectural and

material integrity of the house overall. However, should the property be designated and the property owner apply for a Mills Act, staff would recommend restoration of the wrought iron railing and shed roof tile to their historically appropriate appearance.

The interior of the house exhibits intact original wood elements including the living room bench seat and fireplace, the stairs, the archway between the living room and entryway, and the built-ins in the dining room. These interior elements reflect superior craftsmanship and the simplicity of the Prairie style and are included in the nomination under Criterion C.

The house retains integrity of location, design, materials, workmanship, setting, and feeling; and since the property is not significant under Criterion B, the associative element of integrity is not applicable. In addition to retaining 5 out of 6 applicable elements of integrity, the house embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Prairie style such as a flat roof with wide overhanging eaves, a full length one story front porch with massive square porch supports, simplified detailing at the eaves and cornice, ribbons of simple wood framed double-hung and casement windows, and an overall emphasis on horizontality; and Mission influences in the tile porch roof, shaped porch parapet and square porch supports. Therefore the house is significant as an example of Prairie style architecture, and staff recommends designation of the property under Criterion C.

CRITERION D – Is representative of the notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject property was constructed by Moritz Trepte and Edward Rambo, and the nomination report recommends that the property be designated under Criterion D for this association. However, while several historically designated properties were built by Edward Rambo, Moritz Trepte, or one of Trepte's later construction companies; Edward Rambo and Moritz Trepte are not currently recognized as a Master Builders in the City of San Diego. Sufficient documentation and analysis to establish either builder as a Master was not provided in this nomination and so staff does not recommend that the property be designated under Criterion D.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Julia Wilson House be designated under HRB Criterion C as an example of Prairie style architecture with Mission style elements retaining integrity from its 1914 period of significance. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code;

flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Tricia Olsen
Associate Planner



Cathy Winterrowd
Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

TO/cw

- Attachment(s):
1. Interior nomination sketch map
 2. Historical Research Report prepared by Christianne Knoop under separate cover
 3. Draft Resolution

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 1/28/2010

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 1/28/2010, to consider the historical designation of the **Della M. Ballard House** (owned by Andrew & Veece Bullock, 4220 Arden Way, San Diego, CA 92103) located at **4220 Arden Way, San Diego, CA 92103**, APN: **443-421-15-00**, further described as Lots 15 & 16, Block 9, Mission Hills, in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/site, and any modifications to interior elements so designated shall be approved by the City; this includes painting, sanding, refinishing, repair or replacement of any interior features identified in finding (1) of this resolution.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Della M. Ballard House on the following finding:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics of the Prairie style with Mission elements, retaining integrity from its period of significance, the construction date of 1913. Specifically, character defining features of the Prairie style reflected in the building include a flat roof with wide overhanging eaves, a full length one story front porch with massive square porch supports, simplified detailing at the eaves and cornice, simple wood framed double-hung and casement windows, and an overall emphasis on horizontality. Character defining features of the Mission style include the tile porch roof, shaped porch parapet, and square porch supports. Interior features included in this designation include the living room bench seat and fireplace, the stairs, the archway between the living room and entryway, and the built-ins in the dining room.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel, exterior and designated interior elements of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
NINA FAIN
Deputy City Attorney

