

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: May 14, 2010 REPORT NO. HRB-10-022

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board

Agenda of May 27, 2010

SUBJECT: ITEM #8 – P.Z. Lund Spec. House #1

APPLICANT: Henry Desimas IV represented by IS Architecture

LOCATION: 4376 Proctor Place, Uptown Community, Council District 2

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the P.Z. Lund Spec. House #1, located at 4376

Proctor Place as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the P.Z. Lund Spec. House #1 located at 4376 Proctor Place as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1913 under HRB Criterion C. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

1. The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman Bungalow-style of architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1913 period of significance. Specifically, the house retains its low-pitched cross-gabled roof; wide and unenclosed eave overhangs; heavy projecting square beam ends; exposed rafters; wood shingle-siding; wood windows with wood trim and projecting sills; and a heavy, oversized wood front door with square glazing.















BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject property is located in the residential subdivision of University Heights in the Uptown Community. The adjoining properties remain single-family residences. The property consists of a one-story single family house built in 1913. It should be noted that the 1921 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map identified a second, one-story dwelling in the rear yard of the subject property which was demolished at an unspecified date in time.

The historic name of the resource, the P.Z. Lund Spec. House #1 has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and includes the names of the original owner listed on the Grant Deed of Trust when the house was constructed in 1913, who built the house as a speculation house.

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by IS Architecture which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and D. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C, but does not concur that the site is a significant resource under HRB Criterion D. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property was built in 1913 and rests on a low concrete foundation. The house features low-pitched, cross-gabled roofs; wide and unenclosed eave overhangs; heavy projecting square beam ends; exposed rafters; vertical wood slat attic vents in the gable ends; staggered wood shingle siding; a partial-width, front-gabled porch; square porch supports; pedestals and piers with battered sides and railings all constructed of painted brick masonry; a painted brick chimney; wood windows with wood trim and projecting sills; and a heavy, oversized wood front door with square glazing that reflects square glazing patterns found on the majority of windows throughout.

Alterations include new composite roofing material; three window replacements (two windows on the southwest side elevation and one window on the rear elevation); a back door replacement; and some wooden elements on the rear entry porch including the steps and wooden railing which appear to have been reconstructed in-kind. In addition, the brick elements, including the porch piers, half-height wall and chimney, have all been painted white. These modifications do not significantly impact the integrity of the building or impair its ability to convey significance as a structure which embodies the character defining features of the Craftsman Bungalow style.

The P.Z. Lund Spec. House #1 retains integrity from its 1913 period of significance and embodies many distinctive characteristics of the Craftsman Bungalow style of architecture. These character defining features include a low-pitched cross-gabled roof; wide and unenclosed eave overhangs; heavy projecting square beam ends; exposed rafters; wood shingle-siding; wood windows with wood trim and projecting sills; and a heavy, oversized wood front door with square glazing. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject house has been identified as having been designed by Henry L. Wilson. Wilson was a Los Angeles based architect who nicknamed himself, "The Bungalow Man." Throughout the 1910s and 1920s, he published numerous catalogues depicting Craftsman-style home designs (Refer to Attachment E.4 of the applicant's report). For ten dollars, he provided full sets of plans and specifications by mail order. The plans consisted of a foundation and cellar plan, floor plans, four elevations and all necessary details, as well as a complete set of specifications. Although the Craftsman Bungalow style residence at 4376 Proctor Place was constructed from plans and specifications designed by Henry L. Wilson through his catalogue, there is not enough supporting evidence that would indicate that Wilson should be established as a Master Architect. Further documentation evaluating Wilson's overall body of work, consistent with the Board's adopted Criteria Guidelines, is required in order to consider supporting Wilson as a Master Architect. The applicant could choose to return with that analysis at a later date. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under Criterion D at this time.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the P.Z. Lund Spec. House #1 be designated under HRB Criterion C as a resource which embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Craftsman Bungalow style of architecture retaining integrity from its 1913 period of significance. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.

Jeffrey E. Oakley

Associate Planner

Cathy Winterrowd

Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

JO/ks/cw

Attachment(s): Draft Resolution

Applicant's Historical Report by IS Architecture under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 05/27/2010

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 5/27/2010, to consider the historical designation of the **P.Z. Lund Spec. House #1** (owned by Henry J. Desimas IV, 4376 Proctor Place, San Diego, CA 92116) located at **4376 Proctor Place**, **San Diego**, **CA 92116**, APN: **444-250-06-00**, further described as VL 288 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as $\bf Site$ $\bf No. 0$, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the P.Z. Lund Spec. House #1 on the following finding:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman Bungalow-style of architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1913 period of significance. Specifically, the house retains its low-pitched cross-gabled roof; wide and unenclosed eave overhangs; heavy projecting square beam ends; exposed rafters; wood shingle-siding; wood windows with wood trim and projecting sills; and a heavy, oversized wood front door with square glazing. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0.**

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A	BY:
APPROVED AS TO FORM AND LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,	BY:
CITY ATTORNEY	NINA FAIN Deputy City Attorney