



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: May 14, 2010 REPORT NO. HRB-10-023

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of May 27, 2010

SUBJECT: **ITEM #9 – Leo and Rose Greenbaum House**

APPLICANT: Jill and Martial Bricnet

LOCATION: 3431 Vermont Street, Uptown Community, Council District 2

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Leo and Rose Greenbaum House, located at 3431 Vermont Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Leo and Rose Greenbaum House located at 3431 Vermont Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1925-1938 under HRB Criterion C. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

1. The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish-Eclectic style of architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1925-1938 period of significance. Specifically, the house retains its low-pitched red-tile roof with no eave overhang; gabled, hipped, shed and flat roof planes; a slightly textured stucco exterior; asymmetrical design; and arches above the central door and windows.



City Planning & Community Investment
202 C Street, MS 5A • San Diego, CA 92101-3865
Tel (619) 235-5200 Fax (619) 533-5951

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject property is located in the residential subdivision of Hampton Hills in the Uptown Community. The adjoining properties remain single-family residences. The house is a one and two-story single-family residence built in 1925 with the two-story portion to the rear of the structure built in 1938. There is also a one-story, two-car garage located at the southeast corner of the property adjacent to the alley.

The historic name of the resource, the Leo and Rose Greenbaum House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and includes the names of the original owners who are listed on the Grant Deed of Trust when the house was constructed in 1925.

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Kathleen Crawford, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and D. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C but does not concur that the site is a significant resource under HRB Criterion D. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property built in 1925 is a one and two-story, asymmetrical, irregular shaped house with a single barrel clay tile roof, stucco siding and a concrete foundation. Roof forms include hipped, gabled, shed and flat portions. The western elevation or front of the structure facing Vermont Street has a centered, recessed entrance with the original single wood door with raised panels and is located within a square section which projects forward from the main mass of the façade. This section has a flat roof and an arched portal area accessed by a concrete porch with two steps. The north portion of the front elevation contains a pair of rectangular shaped, wood framed, casement style multi-light windows with wood shutters flanking the windows. The south portion of the front elevation includes a pair of wood framed, multi-light, rectangular shaped French doors flanked by wood shutters. This portion of the elevation contains a non-historic painted wood trellis which was added to the structure at an unknown time. The stucco-over-brick chimney is present on the front elevation as well.

The southern elevation contains a large, wood-framed, multi-light, fixed-pane, arched window set in the section positioned under the gable. A small, circular vent is present above the window and below the peak of the side-gable roof. The western portion of the south elevation is a large, round section that projects forward from the main mass of the structure and contains five, rectangular-shaped wood-framed windows which go around the semi-circle of the projection. A wood-framed, multi-light, single French door leads from the house onto a recessed concrete porch with two steps.

The eastern elevation or rear of the structure contains the two-story section of the structure with the second floor being added to the original one-story portion in 1938 according to the

Residential Building Record for the subject property. The two-story portion is attached to the detached garage, which is located at the southeast corner of the property by a stucco wall and a wood trellis which sits atop the wall. The garage itself is a one-story, two-car garage with a stucco exterior and a flat roof as well as a metal garage door that is non-historic. The garage faces the alley and a stucco wall with a wood gate that extends along the property line is present.

Modifications to the house include the 1938 additions at the rear of the property which resulted in the only two-story element of the house. The additions were designed in the Spanish Eclectic style of the house and date to the Spanish Eclectic period. Due to the complementary nature of the addition and its construction within the Spanish Eclectic period, staff proposes to extend the period of significance to 1938 to include these additions. Other modifications not dating to the period of significance include the wood trellis elements and a wrought iron railing at the porch, which has been largely removed. These modifications do not significantly impact the integrity of the building or impair its ability to convey significance as a structure which embodies the character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style.

The Leo and Rose Greenbaum Residence/Hurlburt and Tifal House retains integrity from its 1925-1938 period of significance and embodies many distinctive characteristics of the Spanish Eclectic style of architecture. This includes its low-pitched, red-tile roof with no eave overhang; gabled, hipped, shed and flat roof planes; stucco exterior; asymmetrical in design; and arches above central door and windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

Ralph E. Hurlburt was born in 1888 in Utica, Nebraska. He was trained by his grandfather George in the construction trade. In 1916, he married Nettie Goodbrod and relocated to San Diego. Originally involved with real estate financing and law, Hurlburt shifted to architectural design. Early in his building career, Hurlburt partnered with builder Charles H. Tifal, a partnership that lasted until shortly before Hurlburt's death in 1942. Hurlburt was established by the HRB as a Master in 2001.

Charles Tifal was born in 1882 in Wisconsin and relocated to San Diego in approximately 1920. Beginning in the early 1920s, Hurlburt and Tifal designed and constructed structures, primarily high-end custom residences, in a myriad of styles including French Eclectic, Spanish Eclectic, Arts and Crafts, Tudor, Italian Renaissance and variants with North African and American Pueblo territorial design elements. In 1942 Tifal was no longer working with Hurlburt but was partnered with Scott King. The firm of Tifal & King installed the Alvarado Road Pump House, cottage and garage. Tifal died at age 86 in February of 1968. Tifal was established by the HRB as a Master in 2003.

Currently, there are four resources designated under Criterion D (Master Architect/Designer) for Ralph Hurlburt, five resources designated under Criterion D (Master Builder) for Charles H. Tifal and two resources designated under Criterion D for sites associated with both Hurlburt and Tifal. Although Hurlburt and Tifal have been established as Masters, there is not enough evidence or analysis provided in the report to suggest that the subject property is a notable work

of Hurlburt and Tifal. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under Criterion D as a notable work of Ralph E. Hurlburt and Charles Tifal.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS


If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Leo and Rose Greenbaum House be designated under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Spanish-Eclectic style of architecture retaining integrity from its 1925-1938 period of significance. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Jeffrey E. Oakley
Associate Planner



Cathy Winterrowd
Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

JO/ks/cw

Attachment(s): Draft Resolution
Applicant's Historical Report prepared by Kathleen Crawford under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 05/27/2010

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 5/27/2010, to consider the historical designation of the **Leo and Rose Greenbaum House** (owned by Martial and Jill O. Bricnet, 3431 Vermont Street, San Diego, CA 92103) located at **3434 Vermont Street, San Diego, CA 92103**, APN: **452-450-24-00**, further described as LOT 51 S 1/2 LOT 50 & in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Leo and Rose Greenbaum House on the following finding:

1. The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish-Eclectic style of architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1925-1938 period of significance. Specifically, the house retains its low-pitched red-tile roof with no eave overhang; gabled, hipped, shed and flat roof planes; stucco exterior; asymmetrical design; and arches above central door and windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
NINA FAIN
Deputy City Attorney