



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: July 15, 2010 REPORT NO. HRB-10-035

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of July 22, 2010

SUBJECT: **ITEM #9 – Thomas and Maud Brownrigg House**

APPLICANT: David W. Goldberg Trust

LOCATION: 3045 James Street, Peninsula Community, Council District 2

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Thomas and Maud Brownrigg House located at 3045 James Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Thomas and Maud Brownrigg House located at 3045 James Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1913 under HRB Criterion C. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman Bungalow style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1913 period of significance. Specifically, the house retains its medium pitch, cross-gabled roof and exposed rafters; wood shingles; front and side porches supported by elephantine, square columns; and varying styles of wood-framed windows including fixed, casement and double-hung.



City Planning & Community Investment
202 C Street, MS 5A • San Diego, CA 92101-3865
Tel (619) 235-5200 Fax (619) 533-5951

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject property is located on the southeast corner of James Street and Locust Street in the Loma Portal Neighborhood of the Peninsula Community. The building is one of the earliest homes in the Loma Portal Neighborhood and the adjoining properties remain single-family residences. The property consists of a one-story house and a detached garage.

The historic name of the resource, the Thomas J. and Maud B. Brownrigg House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and includes the name of Thomas and Maud Brownrigg, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by David W. Goldberg and compiled by Happy Hazard LLC, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property was built in 1913 and embodies the distinctive characteristics of the one-story Craftsman Bungalow style. In particular, the house features cross-gable roof lines with a horizontal emphasis; wide eaves and exposed rafter tails; a front porch with secondary gables; roof supports with heavy beams and brackets; massive porch piers and posts with the same size and decorative style as the chimney; wood clapboard and shingle siding. The structure also features wood-framed windows with stylized muntin patterns which include 3-over-1 and 2-over-1 divided light casement style windows facing Locust Street and double-hung and picture style windows elsewhere; a trellised, side porch; the original over-sized front door; and decorative wood attic vents throughout the house as well as above the detached, single-car garage. The house and detached garage are raised above street level with two sets of concrete stairs leading up to the front porch facing James Street and the side, trellised-covered porch facing Locust Street.

There are two modifications that were identified on the house which staff determined does not adversely affect the overall integrity of the structure. The rear or south elevation of the structure features an enclosed screen porch with sliding and double-hung, wood-framed windows currently used as a utility room. There are no building permits found for this enclosed porch however the wavy glass and old growth lumber used in the windows suggests the porch may have been enclosed shortly after the structure was built in 1913. There are also two large-framed, picture-style windows along the front elevation facing James Street which, based on the historic photo, appear to have originally been a large fixed pane with a divided lite upper pane. This

modification occurred within the original opening and does not impair the integrity of the building to the extent that it is no longer eligible for designation.

The Thomas and Maud Brownrigg House retains integrity and embodies many distinctive characteristics of the Craftsman Bungalow style architecture. This includes its medium pitch, cross-gabled roof and exposed rafters; wood shingles; front and side porches supported by elephantine, square columns; and varying styles of wood-framed windows including fixed, casement and double-hung. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Thomas and Maud Brownrigg House located at 3045 James Street be designated under HRB Criterion C as an example of the Craftsman Bungalow style architecture retaining integrity from its 1913 period of significance. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Jeffrey E. Oakley
Associate Planner



Cathy Winterrowd
Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

JO/ks/cw

Attachment(s): Draft Resolution

Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 7/22/2010

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 7/22/2010, to consider the historical designation of the **Thomas and Maud Brownrigg House** (owned by David W. Goldberg Trust 7-11-01, 3045 James Street, San Diego, CA 92106) located at **3045 James Street, San Diego, CA 92106**, APN: **450-346-09-00**, further described as BLK 298 LOT 12 NW 1/2 LOT 11 & ALL in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Thomas and Maud Brownrigg House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman Bungalow style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1913 period of significance. Specifically, the house retains its medium pitch, cross-gabled roof and exposed rafters; wood shingles; front and side porches supported by elephantine, square columns; and varying styles of wood framed windows including fixed, casement and double-hung. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
NINA FAIN
Deputy City Attorney