



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: October 14, 2010 REPORT NO. HRB-10-051

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of October 28, 2010

SUBJECT: **ITEM #8 – F. List and C. Bell McMechen House**

APPLICANT: Jonathan & Amanda Ohman represented by Archaeos

LOCATION: 3055 Palm Street, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the F. List and C. Bell McMechen House located at 3055 Palm Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the F. List and C. Bell McMechen House located at 3055 Palm Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of circa 1927 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the rear addition and the remodeled garage with an attached workshop. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its c. 1927 period of significance. Specifically, the resource embodies character defining features which include a red tiled roof, stucco finish, asymmetrical front façade with an arched focal window, original wood door and wood frame double hung windows.



BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The structure is located in the Gurwell Subdivision and was constructed as part of the second phase of North Park development.

The historic name of the resource, the F. List and C. Bell McMechen House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the names of the first occupants who constructed the house as their personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Ruth C. Alter, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

After analyzing the nomination report staff agrees the resource embodies character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style during its period of significance. The building is a one story, frame and stucco structure, with a concrete foundation. The roof planes vary, medium pitched, front gabled and flat. On the flat roof plane a crenellated parapet extends all the way around the edge. The east side of the front façade has a large bay window with a hipped tile roof which extends out over the bay projection. The roof is covered with red tile and it appears that it may have been replaced at an unknown date. A stucco chimney is located on the east wall. Triple ceramic downspouts are found in several locations directly below the flat roof plane.

The fenestration appears to be primarily original custom wood framed windows; one-over-one double hung, some decorated with multiple panes around the upper, side and lower portions and some only on the upper portion. On the front façade there are two large windows, the arched focal window located on the west is a fixed pane flanked by rectangular multi-lite double hung windows. On the east side of the front elevation is a bay window which has three multi-lite double hung windows.

A stamped walkway provides access from the sidewalk to the front entrance, leading up to three concrete steps, to a walled area with a stamped concrete floor. The large, recessed, wood front door is original; with arch patterns and an arched mirrored central upper pane.

Alterations have occurred over time primarily to ancillary structures and the rear portion of the house, not visible from the public right of way. The flat roofed addition to the rear does not appear to affect the overall integrity to the extent that the structure is no longer eligible for designation. The clear demarcation is shown by a slight variation from the historic elements with

the use of one-over-one vinyl double hung windows and very little detailing in the parapet. Adjacent to the rear addition is an added wood deck which is accessed at the rear of the building through two identical double French doors. On the west façade a side door was replaced with a single wood door towards the rear of the structure, which leads out to a small wood deck. The detached garage is located at the rear of the property and was recently remodeled in approximately 1992, at that time a workshop with a single wood door was added to the garage space. Due to the loss of integrity from the c.1927 period of significance the garage, workshop and rear addition will be excluded from the designation.

After analyzing the information provided in the nomination report and visiting the site, staff feels that the home embodies character defining features of a Spanish Eclectic style and has retained a good level of integrity from its c.1927 date of construction. Therefore, Staff recommends the property at 3055 Palm Street to be designated under Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the F. List and C. Bell McMechen House located at 3055 Palm Street be designated with a period of significance of c. 1927 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the garage, workshop and the rear addition due to loss of integrity. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Terra King
Planning Intern



Cathy Winterrowd
Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

TK/cw

Attachment(s): Draft Resolution
Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

DRAFT RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 10/28/10

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on **10/28/10**, to consider the historical designation of the **F. List and C. Bell Mcmechen House** (owned by Jonathan & Amanda Ohman) located at **3055 Palm Street, San Diego CA 92104**, APN: **453-651-18-00**, further described as BLK 2 LOTS 10 & 11 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the **F. List and C. Bell Mcmechen House** on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its circa 1927 period of significance. Specifically, the resource embodies character defining features which include a red tiled roof, stucco finish; asymmetrical front façade with an arched focal window, original wood door and wood frame double hung windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: XXX

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
NINA FAIN
Deputy City Attorney