



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: February 10, 2011 REPORT NO. HRB-11-011

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of February 24, 2011

SUBJECT: **ITEM #8 – Maxwell and Frances Manning House**

APPLICANT: Carrie C. and James E. Hasler represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

LOCATION: 4640 Biona Drive, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Maxwell and Frances Manning House located at 4640 Biona Drive as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Maxwell and Frances Manning House located at 4640 Biona Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1925 under HRB Criterion C. The designation shall exclude the shed connected to the detached garage. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character-defining features of Craftsman Bungalow style architecture with Neoclassical influences and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1925 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits the medium pitch, side gable roof; boxed eaves and cornice returns; horizontal wood clapboard siding; central porch with projecting gabled pediment with cornice returns supported on Tuscan columns; 6-over-1 wood, double-hung windows; ornate front door with a fixed central window surrounded by 18 sidelights separated by wood muntins and flanked by 16 divided lite panels; and the original brick chimney and original brick porch steps.



City Planning & Community Investment
202 C Street, MS 5A • San Diego, CA 92101-3865
Tel (619) 235-5200 Fax (619) 533-5951

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The property is located on the west side of Biona Drive south of Adams Avenue and north of Madison Avenue in a primarily single-family residential area within the Kensington Park Neighborhood of the Kensington-Talmadge Community.

The historic name of the resource, the Maxwell and Frances Manning House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and includes the name of the first occupants and owners of the subject house. A Notice of Completion was filed by Maxwell H. Manning on December 28, 1925 for the subject property and he identified himself as the builder.

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report dated November, 2008 was prepared by Legacy 106, Inc, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

Built in 1925, the subject property embodies many distinct characteristics of the Craftsman Bungalow style architecture with Neoclassical influences. The principal or front elevation is symmetrical with a medium pitch, side gable roof and horizontal wood clapboard siding. The front elevation features a centered porch covered by a projecting gabled pediment with cornice returns supported on Tuscan columns. The tympanum is defined in white with an arched vent with narrow horizontal louvers. Small, thin rain gutters drain along the sides of the porch. Three brick steps lead up to the brick porch floor. The oak front door is flanked by long and narrow multi-pane sidelights of 16 panes each separated by wood muntins. The front door exhibits a long, rectangular, central pane surrounded by 18 multiple smaller panes separated by wood muntins and a wood base. Flanking the porch are two pairs of wood 6-over-1 double-hung sash windows. The remaining fenestration consists of a varying-lite double hung and casement windows. The 8-pane wood casement windows are not original, but are believed to have been "in-kind" replacements.

The detached garage lies approximately eight feet off the southwest corner of the house. This front gable garage roof is consistent with the design of the house. To the right of the garage gable is a shed accessed by a white wooden door with a large square window. This shed was formerly a lath house and was added after the period of significance.

A few modifications to the original structure have occurred, although they do not affect the overall integrity to the extent that the building is no longer eligible for designation. A building permit was issued in 1991 for the family room addition at the rear of the house and in 1996 a building permit was issued for a new fireplace and chimney connected to this rear addition. In

2000, the existing attic was converted to a bedroom and new windows were added to the north and south ends of the gable.

The subject property embodies the character defining features of the Craftsman Bungalow style architecture with Neoclassical influences and retains integrity to its 1925 date of construction. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C. The designation shall exclude the shed connected to the detached garage.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Maxwell and Frances Manning House located at 4640 Biona Drive be designated under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character-defining features of Craftsman Bungalow style architecture with Neoclassical influences and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1925 period of significance. The designation shall exclude the shed connected to the detached garage. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Jeffrey E. Oakley
Associate Planner



Cathy Winterrowd
Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

JO/ks/cw

- Attachment(s): 1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 2/24/2011

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 2/24/2011, to consider the historical designation of the **Maxwell and Frances Manning House** (owned by the Hasler Family Trust, 4640 Biona Drive, San Diego, CA 92116) located at **4640 Biona Drive, San Diego, CA 92116**, APN: **465-346-08-00**, further described as BLK F LOT 8 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Maxwell and Frances Manning House on the following findings:

(1) The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Craftsman Bungalow style architecture with Neoclassical influences and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1925 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits the medium pitch, side gable roof; boxed eaves and cornice returns; horizontal wood clapboard siding; central porch with projecting gabled pediment with cornice returns supported on Tuscan columns; 6-over-1 wood, double-hung windows; ornate front door with a fixed central window surrounded by 18 sidelights separated by wood muntins and flanked by 16 divided lite panels; and the original brick chimney and original brick porch steps. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the one-story building with an attic converted to a bedroom and the detached garage as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**. The designation shall exclude the shed connected to the detached garage.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
NINA FAIN
Deputy City Attorney