



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: July 14, 2011 REPORT NO. HRB-11-044

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of July 28, 2011

SUBJECT: **ITEM #7 – Albert and Anna Kenyon/Archibald McCorkle House**

APPLICANT: Mathias J. Kill and Daniel L. Mosher represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

LOCATION: 2832 Granada Avenue, Golden Hill Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Albert and Anna Kenyon/Archibald McCorkle House located at 2832 Granada Avenue as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Albert and Anna Kenyon/Archibald McCorkle House located at 2832 Granada Avenue as a historical resource with a 1912-1913 period of significance under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation includes portions of the interior and excludes the first floor room addition at the rear of the structure constructed at an unspecified date and the 1984 detached garage, workshop and laundry room located in the rear of the property. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

1. The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Craftsman style architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1912-1913 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a low-pitch front gable roof with moderate eaves and knee brackets; narrow horizontal wood clapboard siding; fixed center pane windows topped by geometric panes and



Development Services Department
1222 First Avenue, MS 512 • San Diego, CA 92101-4155
Tel (619) 235-5200 Fax (619) 446-5499

separated by wood muntins flanked with wood double hung 1-over-1 sash windows; large brick chimney; and a large craftsman-style front door with a large rectangular beveled glass window. Interior elements included in the designation are the wood coffered ceiling set on plaster and lath in the living room and dining room; the green-tiled fireplace surround topped with a wood mantle; the two wood bench seats on either side of the fireplace; the twelve built-in bookshelves in the reading room adjacent to the staircase; the built-in buffet and china cabinet with leaded glass cabinet doors in the dining room; the wood sliding pocket doors between the dining room and living room; and the wooden China rail set on a dark-stained wood wainscoting that extends to the floor.

2. The resource is representative of a notable work of Master Builder Archibald McCorkle and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource is an example of McCorkle's work in the Craftsman style and reflects a high level of design and construction.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The property is located at 2832 Granada Avenue in the South Park Neighborhood of the Golden Hill Community. The house sits along Granada Avenue just south of Palm Avenue and a block east of Balboa Park, in a primarily single-family residential community.

The historic name of the resource, the Albert and Anna Kenyon/Archibald McCorkle House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the original owners, who had the house constructed as their personal residence by established Master Builder Archibald McCorkle.

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Legacy 106 Inc., which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C and D. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criteria C and D. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

This Craftsman style residence was built in 1912 and features a two-story, box-shape floor plan with clapboard siding. The east elevation or presentation side of the structure includes a front gable roof with composition shingle and overhanging eaves supported by wood knee brackets. The walls are fenestrated with wood frame and sash and double hung windows. The offset front porch is topped by a front gable set on corner piers on a clapboard sided balustrade. The architecturally defining Craftsman elements to the presentation side of the house include the front gable roof; offset front gable porch, the Craftsman style front door with a large rectangular beveled glass window; a large wood framed fixed porch window topped by nine rectangular

glass panes set in wood muntins and ten glass triangles at the top that fill-in the space between the nine top panes; and prairie style windows on the first and second floors that exhibit a fixed square center window topped by a geometric pattern separated by wood muntins. Fenestration on the rest of the structure consist of various sizes of wood framed double hung windows. The original brick chimney is located on the south elevation and spans the first and second floors. The west elevation or back of the structure contains a second floor room addition with a hipped roof eave which dates back to 1913 according to documentation provided in the report. Beneath the second floor addition is a later addition that fills in the entire space on the west elevation. The entire western elevation is covered with horizontal clapboard siding and at the northwest corner a concrete staircase with a wrought iron steel railing accesses an inset porch.

The owner has requested to have portions of the interior included in the designation which is indicated on the attached floor plan and photo key (Attachment 2). These include the wood coffered ceiling set on plaster and lath in the living room and dining room; the green-tiled fireplace surround topped with a wood mantle; the two wood bench seats on either side of the fireplace; the twelve built-in bookshelves in the reading room adjacent to the staircase; the built-in buffet and china cabinet with leaded glass cabinet doors in the dining room; the wood sliding pocket doors between the dining room and living room; and the wooden China rail set on a dark-stained wood wainscoting that extends to the floor.

Some modifications have occurred to this resource since the date of construction that include a second floor room addition in the rear of the structure which dates to 1913 and possibly constructed by Archibald McCorkle, according to the report. A first floor addition was constructed off the dining room and may have occurred prior to 1940. The Sanborn maps identify a detached garage and accessory structure in the rear yard of the subject property which were demolished at some point in time. A building permit was issued in 1984 for a detached garage, workshop, and laundry room located where the original garage and accessory structure once stood. This detached structure is modern and is excluded from the designation. Since there is not enough evidence regarding when the first floor addition in the rear of the structure was constructed, staff has excluded it from the designation as well.

The subject property embodies the character defining features of the Craftsman style and retains integrity to its 1912-1913 date of construction. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C. The designation shall include portions of the interior as stated above and exclude the first floor room addition at the rear of the structure constructed at an unspecified date and the 1984 detached garage, workshop and laundry room located in the rear of the property.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject property located at 2832 Granada Avenue is a notable example of the work of Master Builder Archibald McCorkle. Archibald McCorkle was born in 1854 in Missouri. He later moved to San Diego and along with his wife, Jennie Johnston, were both active in real estate and housing construction in Mission Hills and North Park. Although there is very little biographical information found about McCorkle, he was noted as a building contractor in all of the San Diego Directory listings. From the directory information, it is presumed that Archibald

McCorkle died around 1915. The Historical Resources Board established Archibald McCorkle as a Master Builder on September 28th, 2000 with the designation of the Cottee/McCorkle House (HRB Site #438) located at 3048 Laurel Street in the Greater North Park Community.

McCorkle is best known for the construction of early houses in the San Diego community of Burlingame in the South Park neighborhood (Blair's Highland Addition). According to the report, most of the houses built by McCorkle in the South Park Neighborhood have suffered substantial architectural integrity loss or have since been demolished. The subject property at 2832 Granada Avenue is one of the best surviving examples of McCorkle's work left in the community. Therefore, staff feels this resource is significant under HRB Criterion D, as representative of a notable work of Master Builder Archibald McCorkle.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Albert and Anna Kenyon/Archibald McCorkle House located at 2832 Granada Avenue be designated with a period of significance of 1912-1913 under HRB Criteria C and D for the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style and as a representative of a notable work of Master Builder Archibald McCorkle. The designation includes portions of the interior and excludes the first floor room addition at the rear of the structure constructed at an unspecified date and the 1984 detached garage, workshop and laundry room located in the rear of the property. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Jeffrey E. Oakley
Associate Planner



Cathy Winterrowd
Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

JO//ks/cw

Attachments: Draft Resolution
 Photo key of interior elements included in Designation
 Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 7/28/2011

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 7/28/2011, to consider the historical designation of the **Albert and Anna Kenyon/Archibald McCorkle House** (owned by Mathias J. Kill and Daniel L. Mosher, 2832 Granada Avenue, San Diego, CA 92104) located at **2832 Granada Avenue, San Diego, CA 92104**, APN: **453-631-21-00**, further described as BLK 5 LOTS 45 & 46 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Albert and Anna Kenyon/Archibald McCorkle House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Craftsman style architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1912-1913 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a low-pitch front gable roof with moderate eaves and knee brackets; narrow horizontal wood clapboard siding; fixed center pane windows topped by geometric panes and separated by wood muntins flanked with wood double hung 1-over-1 sash windows; large brick chimney; and a large craftsman-style front door with a large rectangular beveled glass window. Interior elements included in the designation are the wood coffered ceiling set on plaster and lath in the living room and dining room; the green-tiled fireplace surround topped with a wood mantle; the two wood bench seats on either side of the fireplace; the twelve built-in bookshelves in the reading room adjacent to the staircase; the built-in buffet and china cabinet with leaded glass cabinet doors in the dining room; the wood sliding doors between the dining room and living room set into the walls; and the wooden China rail set on a dark-stained wood wainscoting that extends to the floor. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

(2) The property is historically significant under CRITERION D as a notable work of Master Builder Archibald McCorkle and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource is an example of McCorkle's work in the Craftsman style and reflects a high level of design and construction. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel; exterior of the building; and portions of the interior as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**. The designation shall exclude the first floor room addition at the rear of the structure constructed at an unspecified date and the 1984 detached garage, workshop and laundry room located in the rear of the property.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
KEITH BAUERLE
Deputy City Attorney

2832 Granada Avenue Interior Elements Included in Designation

