



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: August 11, 2011 REPORT NO. HRB-11-054

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of August 25, 2011

SUBJECT: **ITEM #9 – The Louis H. and Charlotte L. Quayle House**

APPLICANT: Alan Edgerton and Craig Long represented by IS Architecture

LOCATION: 4773 Panorama Drive, 92116, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Louis H. and Charlotte L. Quayle House located at 4773 Panorama Drive as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Louis H. and Charlotte L. Quayle House located at 4773 Panorama Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 446 sq. ft. addition at the southwest corner of the house. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Colonial Revival style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1926 period of significance. Specifically, the resource retains its asymmetrical façade, flat roof with scalloped parapet, exterior stucco finish, and a centrally located front door in an arched opening beneath a small gable roof with barrel clay tile.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The property is a 1926 Spanish Colonial Revival style residence located in a single family neighborhood of University Heights.

The historic name of the resource, the Louis H. and Charlotte L. Quayle House has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of original owner who constructed the house as their personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by IS Architecture which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria A and C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C, but not HRB Criterion A. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

The applicant's report suggests that the property is significant under Criterion A, as an example of the unique development created by the University Heights Syndicate along the new San Diego Electric Railway trolley line extension down Adams Avenue. The applicant provides historical information on the development of the area, but does not provide a clear analysis of the resource and its contribution to the area's development. There is little to no discussion of the resource's eligibility under HRB Criterion A, particularly relating to how the resource reflects a special element that would be distinct from similar homes in the neighborhood with the same style and architectural period. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under Criterion A.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

Constructed in 1926 in Spanish Colonial Revival style, the house features a flat roof with a scalloped parapet and sand finish stucco exterior in a "C" shaped floor plan. The windows on the house are predominately replacement double hung wood windows spaced evenly on the plane. All the windows are 1/1 with the exception of the main focal window to the left of the main entrance which is a 12/12.

The front façade features a centrally located arched front door that is slightly recessed under a small gable roof sheathed with barrel clay tile. To the right of the front door above the pair of windows is a long narrow decorative vent for the attic space. Each corner of the front façade also features an abbreviated wing wall.

The south façade features a small patio area that is accessed via 3 pairs of 5-light wood French doors. The southwest corner features an addition with a stepped down parapet with windows on each façade. The north façade also features a section of the wall that steps out approximately 2'. A detached garage similar in style to the main house is also located in the rear yard.

When the report was initially submitted, staff had some concerns about the historicity of the scalloped parapet. Based on a 1946 aerial, it was difficult to determine if the parapet was original or if it had been added at a later date. IS Architecture proceeded to cut into the parapet and determined that the original stucco layer, original building paper, and the original full dimensioned lumber were all intact in the parapet framing.

There have been a few modifications to the property since construction; however they do not detract from the character-defining features. The fenestration on the house was replaced with wood dual pane double hung windows to match the original windows. An addition of 446 sq. ft. was added to the rear of the house in 2002, which is not readily visible from the front of the house. The most visible alterations occur at the front porch. The sidewalk and steps to the front porch were relocated and three small columns were added to delineate the porch area. Regardless of the modifications, staff recommends that the house is designated under Criterion C as a good example embodying distinctive characteristics of Spanish Colonial Revival style architecture.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Louis H. and Charlotte L. Quayle House located at 4773 Panorama Drive be designated with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criterion C. The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Colonial Revival style. Specifically, it retains its asymmetrical façade, flat roof with scalloped parapet, exterior stucco finish, and a centrally located front door in an arched opening beneath a small gable roof with barrel clay tile. The designation excludes the 446 SF addition at the southwest corner of the house. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Jodie Brown, AICP
Senior Planner



Cathy Winterrowd
Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

JB/cw

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 8/25/2011

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 8/25/2011, to consider the historical designation of the **Louis H. and Charlotte L. Quayle House** (owned by Alan M. Edgerton & Craig A. Long, 4773 Panorama Drive, San Diego, CA 92116) located at **4773 Panorama Drive, San Diego, CA 92116**, APN: **438-161-17-00**, further described as BLK P LOTS 26 & 27 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Louis H. and Charlotte L. Quayle House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Colonial Revival style with a period of significance of 1926. Specifically, it retains its asymmetrical façade, flat roof with scalloped parapet, exterior stucco finish, and a centrally located front door in an arched opening beneath a small gable roof with barrel clay tile. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**. The designation shall exclude the 446 sq. ft. addition at the southwest corner of the house.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
KEITH BAUERLE
Deputy City Attorney