



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: August 11, 2011 REPORT NO. HRB-11-055

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of August 25, 2011

SUBJECT: **ITEM #10 – Howard and Mabel Rohde House**

APPLICANT: Herrin Family Trust

LOCATION: 3519 Dumas Street, Peninsula Community, Council District 2

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Howard and Mabel Rohde House located at 3519 Dumas Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Howard and Mabel Rohde House located at 3519 Dumas Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 316 square foot rear lanai room and bathroom addition in 1959; the 94 square foot rear deck enclosure from c.1950s; the 333 square foot patio enclosure; and the 243 square foot sleeping porch enclosure. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic architectural style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1928 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a low pitched side gable roof with red clay Spanish tile; a two-story smooth stucco-walled finish on the exterior elevations; large casement windows with decorative iron balconies; solid wood paneled front door with original iron grillwork; and a thick stucco covered brick chimney projecting from the exterior and raised above the second-story roofline.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The building is a two-story house located in the Loma Portal Neighborhood within the Peninsula Community Planning Area.

The historic name of the resource, the Howard and Mabel Rohde House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the names of Howard and Mabel Rohde who constructed the house as their personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report and addendum were prepared by Robert Herrin, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property at 3519 Dumas Street is a two-story Spanish Eclectic home built in 1928 and features a low pitched side gable roof with a small hipped gable portion above the main living room and covered in red clay Spanish tile; a two-story smooth stucco-walled finish on the exterior elevations; large casement windows with decorative iron balconies; solid wood paneled front door with original iron grillwork; and a thick stucco covered brick chimney projecting from the exterior and raised above the second-story roofline. The eastern side of the front façade features a Spanish turned wood grill with decorative stucco, enclosing a casement window and is cantilevered from the front elevation of the kitchen. The single-story kitchen structure has an attached arched stucco wing wall projecting from the southeast corner towards the driveway. A small mission tile roof also covers the kitchen structure. On the main house above the kitchen roof is a large decorative metal grill, visible from the street attached to a window. A detached garage also constructed in 1928 is located at the southeast corner of the property.

Most of the modifications to the house are in the rear of the structure and not visible from the street. An addendum to the Historical Report was provided and documents the modifications to the rear of the structure based on an interview with the original owner's daughter, Lucille Rohde Vick. Above the rear portion of the kitchen a small deck was enclosed most likely in the 1950s. She stated the original deck had an access door from the upstairs sleeping porch and was surrounded by a low wall and railing. In the rear or southern elevation, a covered patio on the lower floor was enclosed in the 1930s, as can be seen in the historical picture on page 34 of the applicant's report. Two sliding doors were later installed in place of the hinged doors and windows, again most likely in the 1950s. Wood paneling enclosed the lower portion of the screened sleeping porch that Vick and her sisters used. At some later date the porch was enclosed with windows and some portions of the wood paneling was replaced with stucco on the south elevation. In 1959, a one-story lanai room and bathroom were added to the rear of the house. The overall appearance of the rear additions are lacking in the character-defining features and architectural integrity that is evident on the rest of the structure and were built outside the period of significance. It is for this reason that the rear additions are excluded from the designation.

The windows throughout the structure were replaced under the San Diego County Regional Airport Authority's "Quieter Home Program" (QHP) between 2007 and 2009. The evaluation conducted for the QHP at the time stated that the windows were a mix of metal fixed and casement windows as well as wood double-hung windows. All windows were replaced with historically appropriate wood windows.

The house embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Spanish Eclectic style as described above, and retains integrity to its 1928 date of construction. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C. The designation shall exclude the 316 square foot rear lanai room and bathroom addition in 1959; the 94 square foot rear deck enclosure from c.1950s; the 333 square foot patio enclosure; and the 243 square foot sleeping porch enclosure.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS


If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Howard and Mabel Rohde House located at 3519 Dumas Street be designated with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that exhibits the distinctive characteristics of the Spanish Eclectic style. The designation excludes the 316 square foot rear lanai room and bathroom addition in 1959; the 94 square foot rear deck enclosure from c.1950s; the 333 square foot patio enclosure; and the 243 square foot sleeping porch enclosure. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Jeffrey E. Oakley
Associate Planner



Cathy Winterrowd
Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

JO/ks/cw

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. QHP DPR Form
3. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 8/25/2011

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 8/25/2011, to consider the historical designation of the **Howard and Mabel Rohde House** (owned by Herrin Family Trust 06-24-10, 3519 Dumas Street, San Diego, CA 92106) located at **3519 Dumas Street, San Diego, CA 92106**, APN: **450-092-05-00**, further described as BLK 252 LOT 9 NW 1/2 LOT 8 & ALL in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Howard and Mabel Rohde House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Eclectic style architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1928 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a low pitched side gable roof with red clay Spanish tile; a two-story smooth stucco-walled finish on the exterior elevations; large casement windows with decorative iron balconies; solid wood paneled front door with original iron grillwork; and a thick stucco covered brick chimney projecting from the exterior and raised above the second-story roofline. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**. The designation shall exclude the 316 square foot rear lanai room and bathroom addition in 1959; the 94 square foot rear deck enclosure from c.1950s; the 333 square foot patio enclosure; and the 243 square foot sleeping porch enclosure.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
KEITH BAUERLE
Deputy City Attorney

State of California - The Resources Agency
 DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION
PRIMARY RECORD

Primary #
 HRI #
 Trinomial
 NRHP Status Code 3D

Other Listings
 Review Code

Reviewer

Date

Page 1 of 3

*Resource Name or #: 3519 Dumas Street

P1. Other Identifier: Map 3, Prop. #25

*P2. Location: Not for Publication Unrestricted

*a. County: San Diego

and (P2b and P2c. Attach a Location Map as necessary.)

*b. USGS 7.5' Quad: Point Loma

Date: 1975 T ; R ; 1/4 of 1/4 of Sec ; M.D.

c. Address: 3519 Dumas Street

City: San Diego

Zip: 92106

B.M.:

d. UTM: Zone: ; mE/ mN

e. Other Locational Data: (e.g., parcel #, directions to resource, elevation, etc., as appropriate)

Parcel Number: 4500920500

Lot 9-1/2 & 8, Block 252, Roseville Subdivision

*P3a. Description: (Describe resource and its major elements. Include design, materials, condition, alterations, size, setting, and boundaries)

The resource is a one-story, Spanish Eclectic, single-family residence. The side gabled roof is covered with red, Mission tile and there are no eaves. The exterior walls and the chimney are finished with stucco. Fenestrations include metal fixed and casement windows and wood double-hung windows. Some of the windows have metal grills. The main entry is recessed into the wall of the primary façade and features decorative plaster in a shell motif. A similar motif is featured at the large picture window on the primary façade. A flat-roof addition has been added to the tertiary façade. The garage is detached from the house. The resource includes a lawn with mature trees and bushes. The resource appears to be in good condition.

*P3b. Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes) HP02 Single Family Property

*P4. Resources Present: Building Structure Object Site District Element of District Other (Isolates, etc.)

P5a. Photo or Drawing (Photo required for buildings, structures, and objects.)



P5b. Description of Photo: (View, date, accession #)

Looking southwest. 05/15/07. 051507R\Dumas 3519

*P6. Date Constructed/Age and Sources:

1928 Building Record

Prehistoric Historic Both

*P7. Owner and Address:

Robert J. Herrin
 3519 Dumas Street
 San Diego, CA 92106

*P8. Recorded by: (Name, affiliation, and address)

Heritage Architecture & Planning
 625 Broadway, Suite 800
 San Diego, CA 92101

*P9. Date Recorded: 6/26/2007

*P10. Survey Type: (Describe)
 Intensive

*P11. Report Citation: (Cite survey report and othersources, or enter "none.")

San Diego County Regional Airport Authority Quieter Home Program Historic Resources Report, Phase 3, Report 3: Historic Properties

*Attachments: NONE Location Map Sketch Map Continuation Sheet Building, Structure, and Object Record
 Archaeological Record District Record Linear Feature Record Milling Station Record Rock Art Record
 Artifact Record Photograph Record Other (List):

State of California - The Resources Agency
DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION
CONTINUATION SHEET

Primary #
HRI #
Trinomial

Page 2 of 3

*NRHP Status Code 3D

*Resource Name or # (Assigned by recorder) 3519 Dumas Street

*Recorded by: Heritage Architecture & Planning
625 Broadway, Suite 800
San Diego, CA 92101

*Date: 6/26/2007

Continuation Update

Building History:

The Chain of Title for the undeveloped property states that the following individuals owned the property: The Estate of James W. Robinson (1890) and Sarah W. Robinson (1890). The property was sold to Cora E. Friss on May 22, 1903. Friss sold the property to J. Christensen on July 2, 1904. Christensen transferred the property to the Union Title & Trust Co. on May 3, 1910. The Union Title & Trust Co. transferred the property to So. Trust & Commerce Bank on October 1, 1917. The So. Trust & Commerce Bank transferred the property to the San Diego Securities Company on June 26, 1925. The property was transferred to August Sensenbrenner on July 3, 1926. August and K. Stensenbrenner sold the property to Edward and Mabel Rohde on March 31, 1928. A Notice of Completion was filed on October 16, 1928. In 1929, the San Diego City Directory listed Edward Rohde as the first owner and resident of the property. Mr. and Mrs. Rohde sold the property to Ariene R. Montgomery and Nancy C. Wessell on August 30, 1944. Ms. Montgomery transferred the title to Ms. Wessell on March 8, 1946, and on the same day the property was transferred to Mildred Bucher. Ms. Bucher sold the property to Joseph B. and Shandon A. Mullen on February 2, 1948. The property was transferred to the Anna Shandon Mullen (TR) on November 17, 1994. Mr. Joseph Bruce Mullen sold the property to Robert J. Herrin, the current owner, on February 23, 2001.

BUILDING, STRUCTURE, AND OBJECT RECORD

*Resource Name or # (Assigned by recorder) 3519 Dumas Street

B1. Historic Name: Edward & Mabel Rohde Residence

B2. Common Name: Robert J. Herrin Residence

B3. Original Use: Single Family Residence

B4. Present Use: Single Family Residence

*B5. Architectural Style: Spanish Eclectic

*B6. Construction History: (Construction date, alterations, and date of alterations)

1928 - Construction per Notice of Completion.

1959 - Lanai room and bathroom addition.

*B7. Moved? No Yes Unknown Date:

Original Location:

*B8. Related Features:

B9a. Architect: Unknown

b. Builder: American Building & Investment Corporation

*B10. Significance: Theme: Residential Development

Area: Loma Portal, San Diego, CA

Period of Significance: 1910-1960

Property Type: Single Family Residence

Applicable Criteria: (Discuss importance in terms of historical or architectural context as defined by theme, period, and geographical scope. Also address Integrity.)

The resource is located in the Loma Portal area of San Diego, originally part of the Mannasse and Schiller Subdivision, filed in 1869. The area was envisioned as an upscale residential neighborhood with every modern convenience. In anticipation of development, the San Diego-Point Loma electric rail line was completed in 1909. This rail line was instrumental to development because it provided a commuter link to San Diego. Infrastructure installed near the same time included decomposed granite streets, water and sewer lines, sidewalks and gutters. Distinctive street lights were added in 1912 and 1917. The first wave of Loma Portal development, which lasted from about 1910 through 1920, was initiated by the San Diego Securities Company. A second wave of development, encouraged by the same company, occurred during the 1920s and 1930s and gave rise to a mix of revival styles. The last major wave of construction took place during and following World War II as the result of the need for affordable housing for the military and defense industry in San Diego.

The house is significant under Criterion C as a good example of Spanish Eclectic style architecture during the second phase of Loma Portal development. The house embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, and method of construction within the Loma Portal community.

B11. Additional Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes) None

*B12. References:

Archaeos. Quieter Home Program Historic Resources Report for the Loma Portal and Uptown Neighborhoods.

McAlester, Virginia & Lee McAlester. A Field Guide to American Houses. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 2005

San Diego County Recorder, Residential Building Record for 3519 Dumas Street, San Diego, CA.; Notice of Completion, 1928.

San Diego City and County Directories.

B13. Remarks:

*B14. Evaluator:

Heritage Architecture & Planning

*Date of Evaluation: 6/26/2007

(This space reserved for official comments.):

