



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: January 12, 2012 REPORT NO. HRB-12-002

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of January 26, 2012

SUBJECT: **ITEM #8 – 7733 Ivanhoe East Avenue**

APPLICANT: Laurie C McGrath Trust represented by Scott A. Moomjian

LOCATION: 7733 Ivanhoe East Avenue, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the property located at 7733 Ivanhoe East Avenue as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate the property located at 7733 Ivanhoe East Avenue under any adopted HRB Criteria.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject house is a one and two story house constructed c. 1906 in the residential subdivision of La Jolla Park.

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Scott A. Moomjian, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C. Staff disagrees, and finds that the site is not a significant historical resource under any HRB Criteria, due to a lack of integrity. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property is a one and two story single family home originally constructed as a one story bungalow c. 1906. The house features a hipped roof with asphalt shingles and overhanging eaves; vertical channel plywood siding over wood frame construction; a brick chimney and a concrete foundation. Fenestration consists of a glass entry door with elongated pentagonal upper panes; as well as wood frame and sash double hung windows with the same elongated pentagonal upper panes.

Modifications to the house are extensive, and include the enclosure of the original recessed entry porch sometime after 1945, as evidenced by Sanborn Map documentation; covering or replacement of the original wood shingle siding with vertical plywood siding in 1971; addition of a new detached 2 car garage in 1981; one and two story additions at the rear of the house in 1983; as well as interior remodeling and window changes to the 1983 additions in 2007. The impact of these modifications on the integrity of the house is significant. The enclosure of the front porch was complete and utilized the historic windows, leaving no indication of the historic presence of a recessed corner porch. The concealment or replacement of the wood shingle siding with vertical plywood siding was not an in-kind replacement and significantly alters the character of the house. The 1983 additions doubled the square footage of the house, altering original elements at the rear and expanding the addition back and up utilizing a more contemporary design which overwhelms and distracts from the more modest massing of the original cottage. Lastly, it appears that modifications to the fenestration have occurred at the side of the house and at the entry door, as evidenced by the much thicker muntins.

The modifications described above have adversely impacted the design and materials aspects of integrity that are so critical to a resource's ability to convey significance as resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of a style, type or period of construction. While the building may have the feeling of an early 20th century Craftsman style cottage or bungalow, the design, layout, appearance and physical materials are not historically authentic to this house, having all occurred post-1945 and in most cases post-1971. Based on this lack of integrity, staff is unable to recommend designation under HRB Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the property located at 7733 Ivanhoe East Avenue not be designated under any criteria due to a lack of integrity. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability

of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner



Cathy Winterrowd
Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

KS/cw

Attachment:

1. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover