



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: May 10, 2012 REPORT NO. HRB-12-031

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of May 24, 2012

SUBJECT: **ITEM #5 – Fred W. Osburn House**

APPLICANT: NDD, Inc. represented by Marie Burke Lia
Velda Knox, property owner

LOCATION: 2430 Union Street, Uptown Community, Council District 2

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Fred W. Osburn House located at 2430 Union Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Fred W. Osburn House located at 2430 Union Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of c.1888 under HRB Criterion C. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Victorian Era Vernacular architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a moderately pitched, truncated hipped roof with front-facing cross-gable; slightly overhanging eaves with a smooth soffit and simple cornice; wide wood tongue-and-groove siding over wood frame construction; a partial-hipped roof porch on simple wood spindles; and fenestration consisting of tall 1-over-1 double hung wood frame and sash windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a preliminary review application by a potential buyer to determine whether or not the building is historically significant as part of a constraints analysis for future development. The building is a one story single family house located in the Middletown subdivision. The house is surrounded by single, family, multi-family and commercial development.

The historic name of the resource, the Fred W. Osburn House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the first owner, who constructed the house as their personal residence. This is substantiated by City Directory research from 1887-1888, which lists "Osburn F.W., contractor, office 862 Fourth, res cor Union and Kalmia" and 1897, which lists "Osburn, F.W., superintendent of streets, res Union bet Kalmia and Laurel".

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Kathleen Crawford of the Office of Marie Burke Lia, which concludes that the resource is not significant under any HRB Criteria. Staff disagrees, and finds that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject building located at 2430 Union Street is a one story Victorian Era Vernacular single family home constructed c.1888, and features an irregular plan (although it appears as gable-and-wing from the primary elevation); a moderately pitched, truncated hipped roof with front-facing cross gable and asphalt shingles; slightly overhanging eaves with a smooth soffit and simple cornice; wide wood tongue-and-groove siding over wood frame construction; and a wood pier foundation with mudsills. The primary elevation appears "L" shaped, with a front-facing gable at the north end of the façade, and a partial-hipped roof porch on simple wood spindles to the south. Fenestration consists of tall 1-over-1 double hung wood frame and sash windows. Modifications include replacement of the roof sheathing and roofing material on the porch cover; and alterations at the rear consisting of storage area additions, a porch addition, stairs, and window additions and replacements. The applicant's report indicates that the extent of the work at the porch cannot be verified; however, physical inspection of the porch reveals older wood construction at the porch posts and header, and there is no scarring on the siding to indicate that the profile or appearance of the roof was changed. It appears to have been an in-kind replacement. Additionally, the modifications at the rear are not visible from Union Street, do not impact any significant character defining features, and do not significantly impair the integrity of the house.

Vernacular architecture, present throughout all eras and styles, reflects local, non-architect designed interpretations of popular high-style architecture. In this instance, Osburn, a contractor, constructed a Vernacular interpretation of Victorian Era architecture, characterized by gable and hipped roof forms, wood siding in shiplap, tongue-and-groove, lap and shingle varieties, tall, double hung windows, and corner porches supported on posts and spindles. The house continues to convey the historic significance of Victorian Era Vernacular architecture by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style, including a truncated hipped roof with front-facing cross-gable; overhanging eaves with a smooth soffit and simple cornice; wider tongue-and-groove siding; a partial-width porch with simple wood spindles; and tall double hung wood frame windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Fred W. Osburn House located at 2430 Union Street be designated with a period of significance of c.1888 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of Victorian Era Vernacular architecture and retains integrity to the date of construction. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner



Cathy Winterrowd
Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

KS/cw

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 5/24/2012

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 5/24/2012, to consider the historical designation of the **Fred W. Osburn House** located at **2430 Union Street, San Diego, CA 92101**, APN: **533-062-05-00**, further described as BLK 72 LOT 9 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Fred W. Osburn House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C as a resource that embodies as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of Victorian Era Vernacular architecture and retains integrity to the c. 1888 date of construction and period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a moderately pitched, truncated hipped roof with front-facing cross gable; slightly overhanging eaves with a smooth soffit and simple cornice; wide wood tongue-and-groove siding over wood frame construction; a partial-hipped roof porch on simple wood spindles; and fenestration consisting of tall 1-over-1 double hung wood frame and sash windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
KEITH BAUERLE
Deputy City Attorney