

DATE: April 5, 2024

TO: Honorable Mayor Honorable Members of the City Council Honorable Members of the Audit Committee Charles Modica, Independent Budget Analyst

FROM: Andy Hanau, City Auditor

SUBJECT: Open Audit Recommendations where Departments Indicate Additional Resources are Necessary for Full Implementation

The purpose of the memorandum is to provide stakeholders with a summary of open audit recommendations where City departments have indicated to the Office of the City Auditor (OCA) that additional staff and/or budget resources may be necessary to fully implement recommendations. OCA is providing this summary information to facilitate discussion and decision-making as this year's budget process proceeds.

As you know, OCA conducts regular follow up with departments on the status of open audit recommendations that management has agreed to implement. In many instances, (34 in our most recent <u>Recommendation Follow-Up Report</u>), department management indicates that additional budget and/or staff resources are necessary to implement all elements of OCA's recommendation.

In the course of reviewing department updates, we assess the overall reasonableness of the responses. However, it is important to note that, in general, we do not take a position, nor do we assess the validity of management's stated need for additional resources in their responses. How departments implement agreed-upon recommendations is a management function, and audit standards preclude OCA's involvement in those decisions. Accordingly, we are providing this summary solely to aid in your decision-making and analysis in this challenging budget year. Questions on the specific resources needed and associated costs should be directed to the relevant departments.

The following sections provide a summary by department and include a brief summary of the associated audit report, the original audit recommendation, and the most current department response.

We hope that you find this information helpful as you make the difficult decisions ahead. We are available to answer your questions or provide additional information upon request.

Chief Compliance Officer

22-008 Performance Audit of Workplace Safety and Workers' Compensation

The <u>Performance Audit of Workplace Safety and Worker's Compensation</u> found that a more data-driven, coordinated approach is needed to reduce workplace injuries and their cost to the City. The audit found that workplace injuries could be costing the City more than \$200 million per year. As detailed below, the Compliance Department reported that a new software system and a new safety officer position are necessary to improve the City's identification of and response to workplace safety risks for City employees.

Recommendation 5

To ensure the City takes a data-driven approach to proactively identifying safety issues and preventing injuries from happening, Occupational Safety and Health program (OSH) should work with City departments to set department safety goals and establish department safety performance indicators that include:

- Leading safety indicators, such as the percentage of employees attending safety refresher trainings, average time to address safety issues, and percentage of monthly/ weekly safety inspections completed; and
- Lagging safety indicators, such as Incident Rate, Days Away, Restricted, or Transferred (DART) Rate, and injury frequency and severity.

The selection of department safety indicators should involve employees at all levels within the department/division. Safety performance results should be shared with all levels of the department/division.

OSH should periodically review departments' performance in achieving their safety goals, report this information in the annual Citywide safety report identified in Recommendation 1, and work with departments to update their IIPPs on a regular basis based on departments' safety performance.

In Process

This recommendation is in process. The department reported that Risk Management is taking the lead on procuring a software solution for their Claim System and is partnering with Compliance to find a software system that will also meet their safety data needs. An RFI will be drafted with input from all user groups. It is anticipated that an RFI will be out in the Spring of 2024. Once RFIs are received, the responses will be reviewed, and if appropriate, an RFP will be developed. It is anticipated that the RFP process, including the selection of a vendor, will take place during FY25. It is anticipated that a new system will be in place and functional by August 2026, which includes completing whatever additional steps may needed after the RFP responses come in, transitioning to the new system, and training for all users.

Recommendation 7

To ensure management and the Occupational Safety and Health program (OSH) have timely access to injury and illness information to evaluate and drive positive changes to the City's safety programs, OSH should implement a safety data collection process outlining the roles and responsibilities of OSH and operational departments. OSH should:

- Implement a data solution, such as a safety software system, that will enable the capture of recordable injuries and Supervisor's Injury/Illness Investigation Reports at the department level.
- Provide guidance and training to department safety personnel on how to analyze their department's data and how to report to department management as well as to OSH the number and type of incidents, common incident causes, corrective actions taken, trends in Incident Rates and Days Away, Restricted, or Transferred (DART) Rate, etc. OSH should perform such analysis for departments without safety personnel.
- Analyze records submitted by departments to identify and monitor Citywide trends and benchmark against comparable organizations or occupations to identify areas for improvement.
- Report the results of their analysis and coordinate with department directors to report department-specific analysis to the Safety and Risk Oversight Committee at least annually.

In Process

This recommendation is in process. The department reported that Risk Management is taking the lead on procuring a software solution for their Claim System and is partnering with Compliance to find a software system that will also meet their safety data needs. An RFI will be drafted with input from all user groups. It is anticipated that an RFI will be out in the Spring of 2024. Once RFIs are received, the responses will be reviewed, and if appropriate, an RFP will be developed. It is anticipated that the RFP process, including the selection of a vendor, will take place during FY25. It is anticipated that a new system will be in place and functional by August 2026, which includes completing whatever additional steps may needed after the RFP responses come in, transitioning to the new system, and training for all users.

Recommendation 9

To ensure supervisor incident investigations are properly documented, the Compliance Department's Occupational Safety and Health program (OSH) should:

- Update the Citywide Supervisor Injury/Illness Investigation form to include a description of the incident from eyewitnesses and employees with knowledge of the incident, identification of root cause(s), and corrective action(s) taken.
- Require all departments use the standard Citywide Supervisor Injury/Illness Investigation form. However, in cases where departments need to customize the form,

OSH should work with departments as needed to tailor their form to meet departmentspecific needs while also meeting the minimum requirements of the Citywide form.

In Process

This recommendation is in process. The department reported the following steps it will take with planned implementation dates.

Task 1: Compliance Department to request 1.00 Safety Officer position. Status: requested Jan. 2023, not included in Proposed Budget/Council Budget Priorities/May Revise/Adopted Budget. Compliance will request again for addition to the FY 2025 Proposed Budget.

Task 2: Fill position. Status: TBD depending upon completion of Task 1.

Task 3: Update Supervisor Incident Investigations form and work with Training Manager to develop a training program. Status: TBD depending upon completion of Task 1.

Task 4: Work with every department to train/review form updates. Status: TBD depending upon completion of Task 1.

Task 5: Provide refresher training on a cadence appropriate for department needs. Status: TBD depending upon completion of Task 1.

Chief Operating Officer

24-01 Performance Audit of the City's Brush Management on City-Owned Land

The <u>Performance Audit of the City's Brush Management on City-Owned Land</u> found that the City needs improved oversight and accountability over the City's brush management efforts, as well as better coordination within and between departments with brush management responsibilities. As noted below, departments indicate that additional staff resources are necessary to fully implement the audit recommendations.

Recommendation 1.1

To improve accountability for brush management on City-owned land, the Chief Operating Officer should adopt and implement an Administrative Regulation that:

- Requires the Fire-Rescue Department (Fire-Rescue) to identify and maintain information on the location of lands managed by City departments subject to brush management regulations, and to distribute this information to the relevant City departments; and
- Establishes policies and procedures (e.g., requiring the development of periodic workplans with relevant brush management goals, and submittal of these workplans to

Fire-Rescue) for Fire-Rescue to proactively monitor City-owned land for compliance with brush management regulations, evaluate the work performed, and provide a publiclyavailable report of the outcomes to City Council and the Chief Operating Officer.

In Process

This recommendation is in process. The department indicated the following steps were necessary to achieve full implementation.

Step 1: Adopt Administrative Regulation COO

Step 2: Identify and Maintain information on the location of lands managed by City departments subject to brush management regulations and distribute it to relevant City Departments. A Geotechnical Information Systems Technician under the direction of the Program Manager and Deputy Chief/Fire Marshal of San Diego Fire-Rescue will create a self-certification tool and portal for defensible space requirements in 2024.

In 2023, a general ArcGIS map was created to identify city-owned land, which is available on our website. Successfully implementing this new program will be contingent upon resources (budgeted positions). A concept was developed for the self-certification process, but it is ongoing.

The department hopes to have it completed mid FY25.

Step 3: Conduct a Resource Analysis

The resource analysis was completed. The analysis was focused on meeting the audit recommendations after a review of the Oakland and Santa Barbara Fire Department's programs.

Step 4: Hire and train new resources to oversee the program. The resources were identified in the Audit Response memo and incorporated into the FY25 budget adjustment.

Step 5: Establish Policies, Procedures, and work plans. Distribute information and evaluate work performed. Provide a publicly available report of outcomes. Program Manager and Wildfire Mitigation Specialists - The resources were identified in the Audit Response memo and incorporated into the FY25 budget adjustment.

The Fire-Rescue Department is utilizing the City-owned land GIS Map provided by the OCA team. The map and Brush Complaint Process were incorporated into our website: https://www.sandiego.gov/fire/services/brush. The Community Risk

Reduction Division just went live with our new Fire Inspection Software for inspecting buildings. We are now in discussions about a Defensible Space/Brush Management Self-Certification tool for city-owned land and private land. Information regarding brush management can be distributed through this system via a portal. See the attached email titled Examples of Brush Management Self-Certification Report.

For the Fire-Rescue Department to fulfill Recommendation 1.1b, it is contingent upon an adopted and Implemented Admin Regulation and resources. We do not have the staffing and resources to fulfill this recommendation. A Fire Battalion Chief (Program Manager), a Geo-Technical Information Systems Technician 2, and Wildfire Mitigation Specialists were part of the resource analysis to meet this recommendation.

We have already identified some points of contact for brush management of cityowned land. We will continue to update these in the event names change.

Target Implementation Date: Fiscal Year 2025 (contingent up-on resource allocation)

Recommendation 2.1

The Chief Operating Officer should direct the Parks and Recreation Department Open Space Division to incorporate paper streets which require brush management, and that are within or adjacent to land managed by the Open Space Division, into its brush management schedule and program. A Service Level Agreement, Internal Order, or similar re-imbursement mechanism should be established if/as appropriate.

In Process

This recommendation is in process. According to Parks and Recreation (P&R), it is meeting regularly with the Transportation department to discuss implementation of this recommendation to incorporate paper streets which require brush management, and that are within or adjacent to land managed by the OS Division, into its brush management schedule and program.

An analysis of the costs to incorporate paper streets in P&R OS Division's program has been completed. Staff estimates that an additional 83 acres would need to be brush managed annually to incorporate Transportation's acres in the existing program. P&R has made a preliminary request for funding for this activity as part of the Fiscal Year 2025 proposed budget development; however, it is not certain whether this request will be included in the Mayor's Proposed Fiscal Year 2025 Budget. This request would fund brush thinning for 360 acres on a bi-annual basis (or 180 acres annually) including 83 acres annually for Transportation and 97 acres annually for P&R developed parks. If the FY25 budget request isn't funded Transportation will continue with current level of service which is handling brush abatement fire referrals, but nothing proactive without referral.

A draft SLA is being prepared between P&R and Transportation should the proposed program become funded.

Recommendation 2.2

To ensure consistent and effective brush management across all City-owned land, the Chief Operating Officer should consider consolidating brush management responsibilities to the extent operationally and fiscally possible. OCA believes that the Parks and Recreation Department's Open Space Division is best positioned to expand its operations to achieve mandated brush management objectives. However, our assessment does not preclude other approaches that achieve the same objectives. A Service Level Agreement, Internal Order, or similar reimbursement mechanism should be established if/as appropriate.

In Process

This recommendation is in process. Parks and Recreation reported that it has begun to draft a Service Level Agreement between Parks and Rec and Transportation to consolidate brush management responsibilities to the extent operationally and fiscally possible. Additionally, Parks and Recreation reported that other departments with brush management responsibilities have determined that they will keep their brush thinning programs in-house.

20-010 Hotline Investigation of Gifts Received by a City Employee

The <u>Hotline Investigation of Gifts Received by a City Employee</u> found that, among other things, the Ethics Commission take steps to incorporate Classified Employees who file Statements of Economic Interests under the jurisdiction of the Ethics Commission for both education and enforcement purposes. The Ethics Commission has stated that additional resources are necessary to implement the recommendation.

Recommendation 1

We recommend that the Chief Operating Officer present a revision of SDMC §26.0413(a)(4) to the City Council to include Classified employees who file SEIs be under the jurisdiction of the Ethics Commission for both education and enforcement purposes.

In Process

This recommendation is in process. According to the department, in October 2023, the Ethics Commission sent a memo to the City's Chief Compliance Officer outlining potential actions that the Commission could take to expand their education, advice, and enforcement work to include City classified staff who file SEIs. The memorandum also included proposed resources to accomplish this expansion. City

executive management will review this proposal within the context of the FY2025 Proposed Budget process prior to rendering a decision on next steps.

Development Services Department

22-009 Performance Audit of Development Services Department's Code Enforcement Division

The <u>Performance Audit of Development Services Department's Code Enforcement Division</u> made several recommendations to improve Code Enforcement operations and manage inspector caseloads, including developing KPIs to better understand resource needs. DSD indicates the need for additional staff resources to implement the recommendations below.

Recommendation 1

To address the issue of new/active cases not receiving an initial inspection on time or any inspection at all, the Development Services Department should re-implement and update as needed its Voluntary Compliance Program, while also maintaining its current Alternative Compliance Program, to help reduce the total number of new cases that are assigned to investigators.

The Voluntary Compliance Program should allow for cases to go through the regular case progression if the complainant is not satisfied or if the violation persists. The Code Enforcement Division could use this procedure to respond to low-priority cases that involve the following case types:

- Fences/Walls
- Mobile Food Trucks
- Excessive Storage in Garage
- Outdoor Merchandise Displays
- Outdoor Storage
- Vehicle Repair
- Roosters

In Process

This recommendation is in process. According to the department, the following steps are necessary to achieve implementation.

Task 1: Hire Program Manager. Status: Not completed.

Task 2: Establish program guidelines and written procedures. Status: Not completed. Task 3: Update Accela to add Voluntary Compliance as a Status and create a report that tracks subsequent responses. Status: Not completed.

Task 4: Draft letters and obtain approval from the DSD Director. Status: Not completed.

Task 5: Train staff. Status: Not completed.

Task 6: Outreach and implementation. Status: Not completed.

DSD Building and Land Use Enforcement Division needs additional staff to create and implement a new program. Adding 1.00 Program Manager position and 1.00 Senior Planner – Code Enforcement Coordinator position will allow BLUE to develop the program, create a procedure, train staff, and provide outreach.

Currently, BLUE is being asked to reduce positions due to a projected budget shortage. The positions needed to create and implement a new program are not available at this time. BLUE will request staffing to implement this recommendation when possible.

Recommendation 2

To ascertain staffing needs discussed in both Finding 1 and Finding 2, and to better articulate resource needs and budget requests with evidentiary support, the Development Services Department (DSD) should:

Establish a Key Performance Indicator (KPI) for the optimal average caseload for the Code Enforcement Division's building and zoning investigators. DSD should report this KPI in its annual budget document.

In Process

This recommendation is in process. According to the department, the following steps are necessary to achieve implementation.

Task 1: Establish caseload targets for Zoning Investigators and Combination Building Inspectors.

Status: Not completed.

Task 2: Create a report with an explanation of the methodology. Status: Not completed. Task 3: Train Seniors and BOSS on tracking and reporting caseloads. Status: Not completed.

Task 4: Provide new KPI data. Status: Not completed.

DSD Building and Land Use Enforcement Division (BLUE) is working with DSD on developing new KPIs following the new City of San Diego parameters. Additionally, 1.00 Program Manager is needed to allow BLUE to create a procedure for Seniors to follow, effectively train staff, ensure accuracy, and create reports.

BLUE is being asked to reduce positions due to a projected budget shortage. The positions needed to create and implement a new program are currently unavailable. BLUE will request staffing to implement this recommendation when possible.

Recommendation 3

To help investigators and management better organize and analyze case data, the Development Services Department should create or expand fields for the following case information in Accela:

- Indication of a special project that does not follow the regular complaint procedure;
- Notice and Fine Detail; and
- Status (both Active and Closed). Add at least the following choices:
 - Status for Admin Hearing;
 - Awaiting Permit; and
 - Referred to City Attorney's Office

In Process

This recommendation is in process. According to the department, the following steps are necessary to achieve implementation.

Task 1: Hire Program Manager. Status: Not complete.

Task 2: Update Accela to add fields to track special projects and add additional Status fields.

Status: Not complete.

Task 3: Create a written procedure with instructions on case entry to include using existing notice fields and new fields for special projects and expanded statuses. Status: Not complete.

Task 4: Train staff to use new fields. Status: Not complete. DSD Building and Land Use Enforcement Division (BLUE) needs additional staff to identify and implement new Accela fields. Adding 1.00 Program Manager position will allow BLUE to identify needed fields, create a procedure, and train staff on usage.

BLUE is being asked to reduce positions due to a projected budget shortage. The positions needed to create and implement a new program are currently unavailable. BLUE will request staffing to implement this recommendation when possible.

Recommendation 4

After expanding Accela field options, to consistently analyze data on an aggregate level, the Development Services Department should create a data dictionary for Accela that clearly defines choices for at least the following fields:

- Types of Inspections (specify which ones contribute towards Re-Inspection Fees);
- Active Case Status; and
- Closed Case Result.

In Process

This recommendation is in process. According to the department, the following steps are necessary to achieve implementation.

Task 1: Hire Program Manager. Status: Not complete.

Task 2: Create a Data Dictionary. Status: Not complete.

Task 3: Train Staff and Implement. Status: Not complete.

DSD Building and Land Use Enforcement Division (BLUE) needs additional staff to create and implement a Data Dictionary. Adding 1.00 Program Manager position will allow BLUE to create a Data Dictionary and train staff on usage.

BLUE is being asked to reduce positions due to a projected budget shortage. The positions needed to create and implement a new program are currently unavailable. BLUE will request staffing to implement this recommendation when possible.

Recommendation 5

In order to maintain ongoing involvement in long-term cases, the Development Services Department should update Code Enforcement's Procedures Manual and Accela training materials to require all new or active cases to have a workflow task scheduled with target due date for next step in the case management process, and to require investigators to check the "My Tasks" dashboard in Accela daily. Examples of possible workflow tasks include:

- Estimated inspection date of initial inspection;
- Compliance inspection after issuance of a notice; and
- Estimated permit completion date.

In Process

This recommendation is in process. According to the department, the following steps are necessary to achieve implementation.

Task 1: Hire Program Manager. Status: Not complete.

Task 2: Establish a written procedure detailing accurate entry requirements in Accela. Status: Not complete.

Task 3: Establish a policy requiring daily monitoring of Accela Tasks by CED investigative staff. Status: Not complete.

Task 4: Train staff and implement. Status: Not complete.

DSD Building and Land Use Enforcement Division (BLUE) needs additional staff to establish a procedure to create new Accela entry requirements and develop a policy for monitoring Accela tasks. Adding 1.00 Program Manager position will allow BLUE to establish this procedure and implement a new policy.

BLUE is being asked to reduce positions due to a projected budget shortage. The positions needed to create and implement a new program are currently unavailable. BLUE will request staffing to implement this recommendation when possible.

Recommendation 6

In order for the Development Services Department (DSD) Code Enforcement Division's management to better track aggregate case data, DSD should update Code Enforcement's Procedures Manual and Accela training materials to include the following:

- Investigators should list all zoning/building violations in "Violation Table" in Accela; and
- Investigators should enter pertinent case information, such as Civil Penalty Notice and Order and Administrative Citation/Warning issuance date, compliance date, and fine/penalty amounts, into the Civil Penalty Notice and Order and Administrative Citation Warning fields in Accela.

In Process

This recommendation is in process. According to the department, the following steps are necessary to achieve implementation.

Task 1: Hire Program Manager. Status: Not complete.

Task 2: Establish a written procedure requiring entry in Accela of all observed violations and remedy details. Status: Not complete.

Task 3: Train staff and implement. Status: Not complete.

DSD Building and Land Use Enforcement Division (BLUE) needs additional staff to establish a procedure regarding new Accela entry requirements. Adding 1.00 Program Manager position will allow BLUE to establish this procedure and train staff on its usage.

BLUE is being asked to reduce positions due to a projected budget shortage. The positions needed to create and implement a new program are currently unavailable. BLUE will request staffing to implement this recommendation when possible.

Recommendation 7

To address Finding 1 and to give more information to supervisors and managers, the Development Services Department should develop and use tools such as Accela reports or online dashboards that include the following:

- New or active cases that do not have an initial inspection and the number of days from case open date;
- All cases with number of inspections and whether they have a re-inspection fee issued;
- All active cases open longer than 90 days without a notice issued;
- All active cases without an update in the last 90 days; and
- All active cases with most recent workflow task.

In Process

This recommendation is in process. According to the department, the following steps are necessary to achieve implementation.

Task 1: Hire Program Manager. Status: Not complete. Task 2: Update Accela to create reports that provide all recommended information. Status: Not complete.

Task 3: Perform UAT Testing. Status: Not complete.

Task 4: Establish a written procedure detailing how to run accurate reports. Status: Not complete.

Task 5: Train CED Seniors and implement. Status: Not complete.

DSD Building and Land Use Enforcement Division (BLUE) needs additional staff to work with DSD IT to create reports that provide all recommended information. Adding 1.00 Program Manager position will allow BLUE to create these reports, test efficacy, create a procedure on usage, and train staff on its usage.

BLUE is being asked to reduce positions due to a projected budget shortage. The positions needed to create and implement a new program are currently unavailable. BLUE will request staffing to implement this recommendation when possible.

Recommendation 8

To help Development Services Department (DSD) Code Enforcement Division's supervisors hold investigators accountable, DSD should update Code Enforcement's Procedures Manual to require Code Enforcement senior investigators to regularly review individual investigators' caseloads to identify and follow-up on cases that have had no updates in the past three months. DSD should consider the following:

- Supervisors should filter out cases that they do not expect investigators to actively work when reviewing individual investigators' caseloads to identify cases that have no updates for at least three months.
- During their review of individual investigators' caseloads, management should require supervisors to ensure that investigators provided a written notice to the property owner for all active cases with violations, as well as ensure cases with three or more follow-up inspections have had a re-inspection fee issued.

In Process

This recommendation is in process. According to the department, the following steps are necessary to achieve implementation.

Task 1: Hire Program Manager. Status: Not complete. Task 2: Add Senior positions to reduce team size. Status: Not complete.

Task 3: Establish a written policy requiring CED Seniors to run Accela reports regularly to review staff performance. Status: Not complete.

Task 4: Train CED Seniors and Implement new policy. Status: Not complete.

DSD Building and Land Use Enforcement Division (BLUE) needs additional staff to create a new policy on more thorough and frequent reports on staff performance and productivity. Adding 1.00 Program Manager position, 1.00 Senior Combination Inspector position, and 2.0 Senior Zoning Investigator positions will allow BLUE to create these reports, create a policy on usage, train staff on its usage, and create more time for Seniors to implement.

BLUE is being asked to reduce positions due to a projected budget shortage. The positions needed to create and implement a new program are currently unavailable. BLUE will request staffing to implement this recommendation when possible.

Recommendation 9

To address the misreporting of Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) and inaccurate tracking of response time, the Development Services Department (DSD) should create and use a report from Accela that accurately measures Code Enforcement 's initial response time. This report should include cases opened in the current fiscal year that:

- Have received an inspection; or that
- Have no inspection but are beyond the goal response time.

Additionally, the basis of DSD's annual KPI reporting should be this report pulled on a date at least eight months after the start of the reported fiscal year.

In Process

This recommendation is in process. According to the department, the following steps are necessary to achieve implementation.

Task 1: Update Accela to create reports accurately reflecting inspection activity, including cases without initial inspections. Status: Not complete.

Task 2: Run reports for KPIs based on periods of at least 8 months. Status: Not complete. DSD Building and Land Use Enforcement Division (BLUE) needs to implement other recommendations for this recommendation to be effective. Additional staff are needed to implement recommendations. Adding 1.00 Program Manager position, if not the other identified positions, will allow BLUE to implement a majority of the recommendations, create supporting policies and procedures, and provide effective training.

BLUE is being asked to reduce positions due to a projected budget shortage. The positions needed to create and implement a new program are currently unavailable. BLUE will request staffing to implement this recommendation when possible.

Recommendation 10

To address data reliability issues, the Development Services Department (DSD) should create a checklist for online case files, and Code Enforcement's Procedures Manual should require Code Enforcement management to conduct periodic audits of cases using this checklist. The checklist should require Code Enforcement to check for both accuracy and completeness of the Accela case file and should include at least:

- Date of First Inspection;
- Number and Type of Inspections;
- Number and Type of Violations;
- Number and Amount of Fines/Fees;
- Complaint Details;
- Completed Workflow and Activities; and
- Closed Status.

Based on the results of these audits, Code Enforcement's Procedures Manual should outline appropriate management response when issues with investigator performance are identified.

In Process

This recommendation is in process. According to the department, the following steps are necessary to achieve implementation.

Task 1: Hire Program Manager. Status: Not complete.

Task 2: Create a Case Closure Checklist. Status: Not complete.

Task 3: Train CED staff on the Checklist and Implement it. Status: Not complete.

Task 4: Establish a written policy requiring the CED Management Team to conduct periodic random audits of closed cases and detail appropriate responses to findings. Status: Not complete.

Task 5: Train the BLUE Management Team on the Audit Procedure and Implement it. Status: Not complete.

DSD Building and Land Use Enforcement Division (BLUE) needs additional staff to create a new case closure procedure using the recommended Checklist. Adding a 1.00 Program Manager position will allow BLUE to create a case closure checklist to ensure senior staff closely reviews all cases for confirmed inspection, appropriate remedy issuance, and application of required re-inspection fees. This position will also update procedures and train staff to use the checklist. Implementation will increase the workload of BLUE's senior staff and the addition of 1.00 Senior Combination Inspector position and 2.0 Senior Zoning Investigator positions is needed.

BLUE is being asked to reduce positions due to a projected budget shortage. The positions needed to create and implement a new program are currently unavailable. BLUE will request staffing to implement this recommendation when possible.

Fire-Rescue

24-01 Performance Audit of the City's Brush Management on City-Owned Land

The <u>Performance Audit of the City's Brush Management on City-Owned Land</u> found that the City needs improved oversight and accountability over the City's brush management efforts, as well as better coordination within and between departments with brush management responsibilities. As noted below, Fire-Rescue indicates that additional staff resources are necessary to fully implement the audit recommendations.

Recommendation 1.2

The Fire-Rescue Department (Fire-Rescue) should conduct a resource analysis to determine whether it needs additional resources to proactively monitor City-owned lands for compliance with defensible space regulations. Once the analysis is completed, Fire-Rescue should present it to appropriate Council bodies, such as the Public Safety Committee, and make a commensurate request for additional resources during the City's budget process.

In Process

This recommendation is in process. Fire-Rescue reported that the resource analysis was conducted in fiscal year 2024. They provided documentation showing the request for additional resources during the fiscal year 2025 budget process. The

department is scheduled to present its fiscal year 2025 budget to the budget committee in May.

Parks and Recreation Department

22-005 Performance Audit of Equity in Recreation Programming

The <u>Performance Audit of Equity in Recreation Programming</u> found that the City should take steps to improve equity of recreation programming and funding citywide. Parks and Recreation indicates that additional staff and budget resources are needed to implement the recommendations.

Recommendation 1

To ensure a formalized approach for obtaining recreation programming feedback from the community at-large, the Parks and Recreation Department should:

- Develop, document, and implement a process for conducting a community needs assessment that includes identifying the types of programs communities need, satisfaction levels, effectiveness, and recreation priorities, and demographic information such as race, income, education level, age, etc.; and
- Conduct this assessment at least every five years to reevaluate the data and update strategic plan efforts.

In Process

This recommendation is in process. According to the department, the following tasks are necessary in order to achieve fully implementation.

Task 1: Request budget for consultants and positions to develop and implement community survey. Parks and Recreation requested budget in FY2024 and FY2025 to cover the costs of hiring consultants to conduct a community needs assessment. In FY2024 \$50,000 was appropriated for recreation program equity audit expenses. The department requested \$114,500 as part of its FY2025 proposed budget submittal. The community needs assessment consultant costs are anticipated to range from \$150,000 to \$300,000.

Task 2: Acquire a consultant to develop, implement and summarize community needs assessment. The department developed a RFP with Purchasing and Contracting in 2023. The RFP is scheduled to be advertised in Planet Bids for one month beginning February 12, 2024. The department projects completion of the assessment around December 2025.

Task 3: Analyze community needs data and implement programming to meet community needs. Depending on receipt of the final community needs assessment report and staff ability to synthesize the data and request budget as part of the

proposed budget submittal (typically done in December) for FY2027, the department will do so. The requested budget would allow for for implementation of the programmatic and marketing recommendations. The department will also seek budget in FY2026 in anticipation of receiving the completed assessment in December 2025 to immediately begin implementing the report's recommendations.

Task 4: Conduct follow up community needs assessment in 2028. Will revise to 2030 to allow for a five-year span between assessments.

In Summary, Parks and Recreation requested NPE in budget year 2024 and 2025 to support efforts related to the Audit of Equity in Recreation Programming. The department has a reoccurring budget of \$50,000 in NPE, but lacks additional fund allocations to meet the full needs of responding to this audit and recommendation. The department will release a RFP in February 2024 to acquire a consultant to conduct the community needs assessment, even though funds remain short for the effort. Projected completion of the community needs assessment is December 2025.

Recommendation 4

To identify disparities in equitable funding, the Parks and Recreation Department should develop, document, and implement a resource allocation model that will evaluate resource equity between recreation facilities. The model should be based on:

- Community-specific criteria (e.g., health indicators, poverty, transportation access, etc.); and
- Site-specific criteria (e.g., size, frequency of visitors, amenities, etc.).

In Process

This recommendation is in process. The department has not provided an update since May 2023. OCA will continue to follow up during the next reporting period.

As of the prior reporting period, the had identified action steps and planned dates to implement this recommendation. Additionally, according to the department, this recommendation relies on additional resources, both staffing and consultants. While the department noted that it requested funding, the Fiscal Year 2024 budget does not include an allocation for the remaining five positions and funding to support staffing and consultants. The department also noted that it will endeavor to continue efforts in working toward completing the recommendation with existing resources and will continue to seek additional resources when they are available. Lastly, the department revised the target implementation date for this recommendation to November 2025.

Recommendation 5

To monitor the quality of staff-run and contractual programs, the Parks and Recreation Department should develop, document, and implement a comprehensive method for measuring the quality of all recreation programs. This should include training staff to conduct these program quality assessments in a way that is standardized and incorporates notes, observations, and interview data.

In Process

This recommendation is in process. The department has not provided an update since the November 2023 Audit Committee meeting, where the department noted that it was in the process of developing and implementing programmatic surveys and evaluations. The department noted that it has drafted instructions which it plans to route for legal review and meet and confer before training staff on the surveys and evaluations. Lastly, the department noted it plans to implement this recommendation before November 2024. OCA will continue to follow up during the next reporting period.

Recommendation 7

In order to increase and standardize marketing efforts, the Parks and Recreation Department (Parks & Rec) should hire a marketing professional to: Manage online (e.g., social media, websites) and physical (e.g., flyers, banners) content; coordinate marketing efforts across Parks & Rec; and lead strategic marketing initiatives for Parks & Rec (e.g., public relations, educational campaigns, etc.).

In Process

This recommendation is in process. The department has not provided an update since the November 2023 Audit Committee meeting. OCA will continue to follow up during the next reporting period. As of the prior reporting period, the department had noted that this recommendation relies on additional resources, both staffing and consultants, and while it requested funding, the FY2024 budget did not include an allocation for the remaining five positions and funding to support staffing and consultants. The Department will endeavor to continue efforts in working toward completing the recommendation with existing resources and will continue to seek additional resources when they are available. The updated target date for this recommendation is March 2025.

Recommendation 8

In order to effectively market recreation programs to all residents, the Parks and Recreation Department should:

• Direct individual recreation centers to collect demographic information on participants and the surrounding community, including age, gender, race, and other demographics;

- Use collected information to create a strategic marketing plan that:
- Sets goals and objectives for marketing efforts;
- Creates steps for Citywide marketing plans; and
- Develops policies for individual recreation center marketing plans; and
- Use demographic information to tailor marketing efforts towards specific segments of the population, with the goal of promoting engagement through awareness, access, and participation.

In Process

This recommendation is in process. The department has not provided an update since the November 2023 Audit Committee meeting, where Parks and Rec noted that this recommendation will be addressed in calendar year 2024 as it transitions to a new online registration platform. OCA will continue to follow up during the next reporting period.

Recommendation 9

To ensure that eligible program participants can receive the fee waiver, the Parks and Recreation Department should develop, document, and implement procedures that allow residents to:

- Apply fee waivers to all eligible programs on an annual basis; and
- Register for classes online while using the fee waiver.

In Process

This recommendation is in process. The Parks and Recreation Department provided the following information as it works toward implementing the recommendation.

Step 1: Update fee waiver process to allow applicants to apply once annually for entire family. In December 2022, Parks and Recreation established a revised Fee Waiver Application process that included an application in both English and Spanish, including instructions for submitting the fee waiver application. Under the new process, an applicant need only apply once every calendar year for their entire household and the approved fee waiver is good for all eligible programs in that calendar year at any location.

Step 2: Ability for fee waiver approved families to enroll for programs online. The department is still working on two items related to this recommendation that requires an extension to the completion date: 1) Allowing approved applicants to register online for any fee waiver eligible program. This functionality is not feasible using the City's existing registration software and will require a new online registration platform to accommodates this type of feature. The department identified a software that meets the needs identified in this audit and beyond. A piggyback contract was prepared in 2023 to streamline this transition. It was

discovered that the vendor does not use the mandated gateway provider set forth by the Treasurers Department. Therefore a RFP will need to be developed to procure a responsive vendor. This will take an additional one to two years to complete. New target date is February 2026. 2) Developing an application clearance electronically and securely through an online clearing house.

In December 2022 Parks and Recreation trained staff and implemented a new Fee Waiver Program that included an application with instructions in both English and Spanish. Staff are trained on the Fee Waiver program once per year, with several refreshers throughout each year. The new fee waiver meets all recommendations of this item. The Department is still working on establishing a method to apply fee waivers to customer accounts allowing them to enroll without having to travel to a facility. The current online registration software doesn't allow for this process. This function will be requested as part of the RFP for a new online registration provider. Depending on the timing and success of the RFP, the department anticipates the new software will be installed, trained and implemented in 2026.

Recommendation 15

To ensure the accuracy of key data fields in the Parks and Recreation Department's (Parks & Rec) recreation program management software, Parks & Rec should:

- Develop automated controls, where possible, to ensure that recreation staff enter program information in the recreation program management software consistently and accurately; and
- Develop policies and procedures that require Area Managers to regularly review program information captured in Parks & Rec's recreation program management software—such as dates, season, and class status, among others—for consistency and accuracy. These policies and procedures should specify how Area Managers should select data entries for review, require this review to be documented, and identify corrective actions where necessary.

In Process

This recommendation is in process. According to the department, the following tasks are necessary to achieve full implementation.

Task 1: Request budget for positions to monitor, maintain, develop policies and procedures and train staff on online registration software. In FY23 and FY24, the Department received five new positions out of ten to support on-going efforts to improve recreational program offerings.

Task 2: Develop, recruit, hire new positions to support this action. Over the past year, the Department has filled five positions to support this action, with the Information Systems Analyst II being the last to on-board in December 2023.

Task 3: Evaluate online registration software that best meets the departments goals and objectives. The Department identified a software that meets the needs identified in this audit and beyond. A piggyback contract was prepared in 2023 to streamline this transition. It was discovered that the vendor does not use the mandated gateway provider set forth by the Treasurers Department, therefore a RFP will need to be developed to procure a responsive vendor. This will take an additional one to two years to complete. New target date is February 2026.

Task 4: Formalize online registration and permitting software trainings into Department Instructions. In October 2022, the department updated the ActiveNet Online Registration and Permitting training, and made it mandatory for every employee to take the training prior to using the system as further outlined in recommendations 14 and 16. In addition, the department developed an annual refresher training that is mandatory for all supervisors using the system. The training on ActiveNet for supervisors identifies roles and responsibilities for entering, reviewing and approving content entered. The department is in the process of formalizing the roles and responsibilities for use of ActiveNet in a department Instruction. This target date was previously October 2023, but was extended to April 2024 as a result of limited staff time, and the department was looking into changing the registration and permitting platform to meet the audit recommendations. The DI is under internal review, followed by legal review, then it will go to meet and confer with an anticipated implementation of April 2024. Parks and Recreation established a new Citywide Recreation Services Division and hired five positions as of December 2023 to assist with improving recreational programs, training, marketing, and online registration and permitting software controls. Detailed training for the online software was established and mandated annually for all supervisors and employees using the online software beginning in October 2022. The training identifies roles, responsibilities, data entry and oversight procedures. The department has developed a draft Department Instruction (DI) formalizing the use of the online recreation software. The DI is under internal review and is expected to go to meet and confer in March 2024, with implementation taking place in April 2024. The department continues to explore online recreation software providers that meet the needs and city requirements. A RFP will developed to complete this process in an anticipated two-year time frame.

24-01 Performance Audit of the City's Brush Management on City-Owned Land

The <u>Performance Audit of the City's Brush Management on City-Owned Land</u> found that the City needs improved oversight and accountability over the City's brush management efforts, as well as better coordination within and between departments with brush management responsibilities. As noted below, departments indicate that additional staff resources are necessary to fully implement the audit recommendations.

Recommendation 2.3

Departments with significant brush management responsibilities, such as, but not limited to, the Parks and Recreation Department, Transportation Department, Public Utilities Department, and Fire-Rescue Department, should establish regular periodic meetings to help facilitate and coordinate brush management work and resources.

In Process

This recommendation is in process. The Parks and Recreation Department (P&R) began holding brush management meetings in December 2023. The agenda for the December 2023 meeting includes discussion topics pertaining to facilitation (i.e., creating a proactive brush management program) and coordination (i.e., department property ownership and points of contact) of brush management work and resources. The meeting also includes departments who have brush management responsibilities. Parks and Recreation intends to hold quarterly meetings in March, June, September, and December; it has scheduled the next upcoming meeting for March 2024. This recommendation will be implemented in September 2024, if the scheduled meetings are held.

Recommendation 2.5

The Parks and Recreation Department (Parks and Rec) should conduct a resource analysis to determine whether it needs additional resources to perform brush management activities on paper streets and potentially other lands managed by other departments. Once the resource analysis is completed, Parks and Rec should present it to the appropriate Council bodies, such as the Public Safety Committee, and make a commensurate request for additional resources during the City's budget process.

In Process

This recommendation is in process. The Parks and Recreation Department reported an analysis of the costs to incorporate paper streets in P&R OS Division's program has been completed.

Staff estimates that an additional 83 acres would need to be brush managed annually to incorporate Transportation's acres in the existing program.

P&R has made a preliminary request for funding for this activity as part of the Fiscal Year 2025 proposed budget development; however, it is not certain whether this request will be included in the Mayor's Proposed Fiscal Year 2025 Budget. This request would fund brush thinning for 360 acres on a bi-annual basis (or 180 acres annually) including 83 acres annually for Transportation and 97 acres annually for P&R developed parks.

If the FY25 budget request isn't funded Transportation will continue with current level of service which is handling brush abatement fire referrals, but nothing proactive without referral.

Performance & Analytics Department

23-004 Performance Audit of the City's Get It Done Application and Service Request Management

The <u>Performance Audit of the City's Get It Done Application and Service Request Management</u> found that the City could takes steps to improve consistency and clarity of communication to users of the Get It Done service request application. The Performance and Analytics Department indicates that additional staff resources are necessary to implement the recommendation.

Recommendation 2

To improve the Get It Done customer experience, the Performance and Analytics Department should review, identify, prioritize, and document which services could feasibly include progress updates to customers (i.e., "interim" steps). As part of this effort, PandA should also articulate a plan and timeline for developing progress updates to customers for these service request types.

In Process

This recommendation is in process. The department provided the following status update via the Recommendation Implementation Work Plan:

Step 1: Document to identify necessary resources to implement Recommendation #2.

Status: Completed June 2023

Draft Digital Customer Experience Strategy released which identifies Performance Coach needs. Solicited feedback from all council districts community planning groups in 2023.

Step 2: Develop a document with a matrix containing each Get It Done report type and prioritize / evaluate need for an increase in status updates. Status: Planned completion July 2025 Updated to July 2025 – created an initial draft prioritization matrix containing service evaluation criteria, indicating services with interim status updates. With the current staffing levels, we are able to comprehensively evaluate and improve services at a limited basis (1-2 services per year). To fully achieve this recommendation by the requested timeline, it would require additional resources described in the Digital Customer Experience Strategy.

Step 3: Provide an update on the Get It Done services that have been identified as candidates for additional progress updates.

Status: Planned completion July 2026

Updated to July 2026 – updates can be provided when analysis has been completed in prior step.

Recommendation 4

To ensure that operational staff are adequately trained on communication codes, the Performance and Analytics Department, in consultation with relevant departments/divisions for the most common service requests (i.e., Environmental Services Department, San Diego Police Department Neighborhood Policing Division, San Diego Police Department Parking Division, and Transportation Department Street Division) should provide updated training to staff that includes using the appropriate communication code.

In Process

This recommendation is in process. The department provided the following status update via the Recommendation Implementation Work Plan:

Step 1: Send cardstock print-outs of current communication codes per department via inter-office mail to all Get It Done functional area Points of Contact Status: Completed April 14, 2023

Step 2: Request two (2) Program Coordinator positions as part of FY25 budget development process. Status: Planned completion January 2025

Step 3: Receive two (2) Program Coordinator positions in FY25 budget.Status: Planned completion June 2025No new positions granted for FY25 due to budget constraints. Will revisit request for FY26 budget cycle.Status: Planned completion TBD

Steps 4-7 are contingent on receiving FY26 positions.

Step 4: Publish position roles and responsibilities for Get It Done training team. Status: Planned completion TBD

Step 5: Hire and onboard training staff. Status: Planned completion TBD

Step 6: Develop and publish department Get It Done training plans and materials. Status: Planned completion TBD

Step 7: Publish training schedule for all areas of Get It Done

Stormwater Department

18-023 Performance Audit of the Storm Water Division

The <u>Performance Audit of the Storm Water</u> Division found that, among other things, that the department should establish and implement a process to collect re-inspections fees associated with storm water management. The Storm Water Department indicated that additional resources are necessary to administer the program.

Recommendation 9

The Transportation and Storm Water Department Storm Water Division should establish a reinspection fee, and develop, document, and implement policies and procedures for when reinspection fees should be issued, consistent with the City of San Diego's Municipal Code.

In Process

This recommendation is in process. The Stormwater Department (Stormwater) state for Project Scoping, in 2019, the Stormwater Planning Division engaged a consultant to evaluate and develop a re-inspection fee for the Industrial and Commercial Inspections programs. This included extensive research into similar fees within the City and other jurisdictions, evaluation of legal avenues for imposing a fee, and development of a stakeholder outreach strategy. They also developed a Fee Implementation Schedule, documentation for the City approval process, and standard operating procedures related to the re-inspection fee. Status: Completed 2019-2021

Regarding Project Implementation, the department indicated that as a part of the scoping of the workflow and processes that would be needed to implement a cost-recovery program for stormwater re-inspections, the Planning Division identified the need for additional resources to administer the program. A budget request was submitted by the Stormwater Department (Department) as part of the FY24 budget request. However, the request was prioritized against other budgetary needs and was not selected for funding. The additional resources have been included in the

Fiscal Year 2025-2029 Five-Year Financial Outlook and have been included in the FY25 budget request. Status: On hold pending budget request approval.

Personnel

24-02 Performance Audit of the City's Classified Employee Hiring Process

The <u>Performance Audit of the City's Classified Employee Hiring Process</u> found that the Personnel Department should take several steps to improve the City's hiring processes. Personnel indicates that additional resources are necessary to implement the recommendations.

Recommendation 1.7

The Personnel Department should create a centralized bank of job analyses, job factors, and interview questions for all departments to access. The Personnel Department should obtain input from the City Administration on how to develop and maintain this bank so that it is useful to hiring departments.

In Process

This recommendation is in process. The department reported the following steps it will take to achieve implementation of the recommendation by December 2024.

Task 1: Request additional positions to create and maintain centralized item bank.

Task 2: Procure software license to create online item bank.

Task 3: Create procedures on how to populate the centralized item bank along with policies related to access by hiring departments.

This requirement was included as part of the Applicant Tracking System RFP that is currently being evaluated.

cc: Eric Dargan, Chief Operating Officer, Office of the Mayor Matt Vespi, Chief Financial Officer, Office of the Chief Financial Officer Alia Khouri, Deputy Chief Operating Officer, Office of the Mayor Kris McFAdden, Deputy Chief Operating Officer, Office of the Mayor Kristina Peralta, Deputy Chief Operating Officer, Office of the Mayor Casey Smith, Deputy Chief Operating Officer, Office of the Mayor Elyse Lowe, Director, Development Services Department Colin Stowell, Fire Chief, San Diego Fire-Rescue Department Andy Field, Director, Parks & Recreation Department Kirby Brady, Director, Performance & Analytics Department Todd Snyder, Director, Stormwater Department David Dalager, Interim Director, Personnel Department Christiana Gauger, Chief Compliance Officer, Compliance Department Jillian Andolina, Deputy Director, Independent Budget Analyst