

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	October 13, 2022	REPORT NO. HRB-22-040
HEARING DATE:	October 27, 2022	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #03 – Walter and Margaret Trepte House #2	
RESOURCE INFO:	California Historical Resources Inventory Data	<u>abase (CHRID) link</u>
APPLICANT:	Robin M Halliday; represented by Legacy 106	, Inc.
LOCATION:	1120 Hunter Street, Uptown Community, Cou APN 444-261-05-00	uncil District 3
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the Walter and N located at 1120 Hunter Street as a historical	0 1

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Walter and Margaret Trepte House #2 located at 1120 Hunter Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1922-1923 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the post-2015 front porch balustrade, the 1992 detached garage and the 1977-2020 attached rear additions/rear deck constructed outside of the period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of characterdefining features of the Craftsman style with Colonial Revival influences and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1922-1923 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a medium-pitched cross-gabled jerkinhead roof form (clipped gables), a moderate eave overhang with exposed rafter tails, horizontal wood siding, and wooden divided-lite double-hung sash and casement windows. Colonial Revival character-defining features include the accentuated front door with wooden surrounds and plain pilasters; and fanlight-style attic vents.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject resource is a one-and-a-half-story residence with a basement and a detached garage on a hillside lot in the Mission Hills neighborhood of the Uptown Community.

The property was identified in the <u>2016 Uptown Community Plan Area Historic Resources Survey Report</u> and given a Status Code of 5D3, "Appears to be a contributor to a district that appears eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation."

The historic name of the resource, the Walter and Margaret Trepte House #2, has been identified as consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Walter M. Trepte and Margaret Thearle Trepte, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

<u>ANALYSIS</u>

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Legacy 106, Inc., which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the <u>Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria</u>, as follows.

CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The subject resource was constructed in 1922 in the Craftsman style with Colonial Reveal influences. A front brick patio constructed in 1923 by the original builder effectively extends the period of significance to 1922-1923. The residence has a compound floor plan with an L-shaped cross-gabled form, featuring a medium-pitched cross-gabled jerkinhead roof (also known as clipped gables). The roof is covered in dimensional composition shingles and exhibits a moderate eave overhang. The building is clad in uniform horizontal wood siding, except for the basement level, which is sided in stucco. A driveway is present along the west elevation, leading to a 1992 detached garage in the rear yard.

The Historical Resource Research Report classifies the subject property as a Colonial Revival residence with Craftsman influences. Staff agrees that the property exhibits both Craftsman and Colonial Revival elements but finds the building more appropriately classified as a Craftsman cottage with Colonial Revival features. Elements like exposed rafters and horizontal wood siding are shared features between Craftsman and Colonial Revival styles. Colonial Revival characteristics of this building are present on the elaborated front entry. However, the cross-gabled one-and-a-half story form at street grade, the jerkinhead roof, and the use of casement windows on the primary façade suggest a principal Craftsman design.

The south, primary elevation is asymmetrical and includes a projecting single-story jerkinhead wing. The projecting wing contains a fanlight-style attic vent at the gable end. A centered, painted brick chimney is present above the ridge beam of the side-facing gable roof. A brick-paved walkway leads from the sidewalk to an uncovered raised brick porch where a recessed entry is present. The entry is designed in the Colonial Revival style, featuring an original multi-lite front door with sidelights. Operable louvered shutters shield the sidelights. The door molding is in a subdued Colonial Revival design, featuring plain pilasters and a wooden surround. Fenestration on the elevation is arranged in a symmetrical pattern — casement windows flank the front door and sidelights on each side, and a grouping of three casement windows are at the east the west extreme. All these windows have matching molding and sill designs. The west elevation features half of a gabled jerkinhead roof, which transitions into two shed roofs towards the north (rear) where an attic-level addition and a ground-level addition are oriented. Divided-lite double-hung windows are present, as are newer

sliding windows with differentiated molding. The east elevation features a double gable — the larger gable is clipped, and the smaller gable is typical. The smaller gabled massing projects eastward, creating a separate wall plane. An original attic-level sleeping room is located at the northernmost portion of this façade; a ribbon set of casement windows encloses it. Fenestration along this elevation contains double-hung windows, casement windows, and a garden window. The rear elevation contains an attic-level addition, a ground-level addition, and a finished basement. A deck with railing is situated above portions of the finished basement, providing access to the basement level with a set of stairs. Fenestration on this elevation consists of a variety of wood divided-lite double-hung windows, wood casement windows, and modern equivalents. Doors on this elevation are divided-lite French doors, some with glazed transom and sidelight.

Modifications to this property include the circa 1977 attic-level rear addition, the removal of front window shutters between 1961 and 1982, the post-2015 addition of front porch balustrades, and the 2020 street-grade rear elevation room extension approved by Historical Resources staff. Undated alteration includes a window replacement on the east elevation and the addition of modern gutters along multiple elevations. Overall, these modifications do not significantly impair the integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling as it relates to HRB Criterion C.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, which was born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman-style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

Following the Centennial Exposition of 1876 America experienced a rebirth of interest in its colonial past. Primarily popular from 1880 to 1955, Colonial Revival buildings reference the early English and Dutch homes of the Atlantic seaboard, particularly the Georgian and Federal styles. As with their prototypes, Colonial Revival structures generally have a symmetrical front façade with the principal areas of elaboration being entrances, windows and cornices. Roofs can be hipped, gable or gambrel and some variations feature a center gable projecting slightly from the primary façade. One-story side wings with flat roofs are common. Windows are typically double-hung sash with multi-pane glazing in one or both sashes and are commonly found in pairs, triples, or bay windows. Front-facing gambrel roofs were most common in earlier revival houses while side gambrels became popular in the 1920s and '30s.

<u>Significance Statement:</u> The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Craftsman style with Colonial Revival influences by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a medium-pitched cross-gabled jerkinhead roof form (clipped gables), a moderate eave overhang with exposed rafter tails, horizontal wood siding, and wooden divided-lite double-hung sash and casement windows. Colonial Revival character-defining features include the accentuated front door with wooden surrounds and plain pilasters; and fanlight-style attic vents.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or Craftsman.

The subject property at 1120 Hunter Street was designed and built by Walther M. Trepte. Trepte has not been established by the Historical Resources Board as a Master Architect, Designer or Builder, and there is insufficient information to designate him as such at this time. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion D.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Walter and Margaret Trepte House #2 located at 1120 Hunter Street be designated with a period of significance of 1922-1923 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of the Craftsman style with Colonial Revival influences. The designation excludes the post-2015 front porch balustrade, the 1992 detached garage and the 1977-2020 attached rear additions/rear deck constructed outside of the period of significance.

Alvin Lin Assistant Planner

Suzanne Segur

Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison Development Services Department

al/SS

Attachment(s):

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 10/27/2022

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 10/27/2022, to consider the historical designation of the **Walter and Margaret Trepte House #2** (owned by Robin M Halliday, 1120 Hunter Street, San Diego, CA 92103) located at **1120 Hunter Street**, **San Diego**, **CA 92103**, APN: **444-261-05-00**, further described as BLK 4 LOTS 9 THRU 12 E 36FT LOTS 7 & 8 & E 57 1/2 FT in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Walter and Margaret Trepte House #2 on the following findings:

The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style with Colonial Revival influences and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1922-1923 period of significance. Specifically, the resource Specifically, the resource features a medium-pitched cross-gabled jerkinhead roof form (clipped gables), a moderate eave overhang with exposed rafter tails, horizontal wood siding, and wooden divided-lite double-hung sash and casement windows. Colonial Revival character-defining features include the accentuated front door with wooden surrounds and plain pilasters; and fanlight-style attic vents. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the post-2015 front porch balustrade, the 1992 detached garage and the 1977-2020 attached rear additions/rear deck constructed outside of the period of significance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY: ____

TIM HUTTER, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT, CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _

LINDSEY SEBASTIAN, Deputy City Attorney RECORDING REQUESTED BY CITY OF SAN DIEGO DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT

WHEN RECORDED MAIL TO

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD ATTN: HRB SECRETARY 1222 FIRST AVENUE, MS 501 SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

SPACE ABOVE THIS LINE FOR RECORDER'S USE

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A

HISTORICAL DESIGNATION OF PROPERTY ON

1120 Hunter Street, San Diego, CA 92103

ASSESSOR PARCEL NUMBER 444-261-05-00

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD NUMBER 0

THIS PAGE ADDED TO PROVIDE ADEQUATE SPACE FOR RECORDING INFORMATION (Additional recording fee applies)