

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	November 2, 2022	REPORT NO. HRB-22-048
HEARING DATE:	November 17, 2022	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #07 – A. Frank Reed House	
RESOURCE INFO:	Historical Resources Inventory Database (CHR	RID) link
APPLICANT:	Timothy First & Lisa Fisher; represented by G Preservation Consulting	inger Weatherford Historic
LOCATION:	3044 29 th Street, North Park Community, Cou APN 453-582-2900	ncil District 3
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the A. Frank Ree Street as a historical resource.	d House located at 3044 29 th

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the A. Frank Reed House located at 3044 29th Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1912 under HRB Criterion C. The designation includes the original detached garage. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1912 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features wood shingle siding, a low pitched front gable roof with exposed rafter tails, inset half-walled porch with battered stucco column bases, decorative knee braces and wood windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject resource is a one-story, single family residence and garage constructed on the corner of Redwood and 29th Streets in the North Park Community Plan area.

The property was located within the boundary of the <u>2016 North Park Community Plan Area Historic</u> <u>Resources Survey</u>, but was not identified in the survey because it was not evaluated. The historic name of the resource, the A. Frank Reed House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of A Frank Reed, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

<u>ANALYSIS</u>

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Ginger Weatherford Historic Preservation Consulting, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria A and C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C but not HRB Criterion A. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

The subject resource as constructed in 1912 by Joseph McFadden and George Buxton, local real estate developers and builders. The property is located within the Blair's Highland Addition, an early twentieth century subdivision in the North Park Community. The success of subdivisions such as Blair's Highland Addition led to the expansion of streetcar lines to the area and contributed to the growth of North Park and the City in general. The subject resource is the only known property built by McFadden and Buxton within the Blair's Highland Addition.

In order to be eligible under Criterion A, a property must exemplify or reflect a special element of development. A special element refers to resources that are distinct among others of its kind or surpass the usual in significance. At this time, there is no information to conclude that the Blair's Highland Addition surpasses other North Park subdivisions in historic significance. Additionally, there is not enough information at this time to conclude that a McFadden and Buxton constructed property would surpass other properties within the Blair's Highland Addition subdivision as significant. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The subject resource is a one-story, single family residence and garage constructed in 1912 in the Craftsman style. The house is covered in wood shingle siding and features a low pitched, front facing gable roof with exposed rafters. The southeastern corner of the building features an inset, half-walled porch with concrete floors and wood shingle siding. The porch's columns have a battered stucco base with slender wooden columns above. Both the main roof structure and porch roof are supported by decorative wooden knee braces. The north façade features a brick chimney. Fenestration includes wooden windows in fixed, casement and double hung varieties. A wood shingle sided garage is located at the rear of the property and is accessed from Redwood Street. The property is surrounded by a wood fence with stucco columns.

There have been several modifications to the structure since its 1912 date of construction. In 1955 the property was re-roofed and covered with asbestos shingle siding. The brick chimney was reconstructed in-kind and extended to meet current safety requirements in 2008. The asbestos

siding was removed in 2014 to reveal the original wood siding below. Additionally, a previous property owner confirmed that when the asbestos shingles were removed from the porch the two front columns were revealed to be clad in stucco. A wooden fence with pergola and stucco battered piers was constructed in 2014 without permits; however, a 2015 Code Enforcement investigation revealed that a permit would not be required if the corner was modified to meet visibility requirements. Historical resources staff advised the current property owners to remove the pergola; which gave a false sense of history and impacted integrity of design, feeling and setting; from the fence. The pergola was removed by the property owner in the summer of 2022. Additionally, gutters were added to the property at an unknown date. These modifications do not impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling as it relates to HRB Criterion C.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. As a result, a flood of pattern books appeared, offering plans for Craftsman bungalows. One story vernacular examples are often called simply bungalows. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; decorative attic vents; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The resource continues to convey the historic significance of the Craftsman style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including wood shingle siding, a low pitched front gable roof with exposed rafter tails, inset half-walled porch with battered stucco column bases, decorative knee braces and wood windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject property at 3044 29th Street was built by Joseph McFadden & George Buxton. McFadden & Buxton have not been established by the Historical Resources Board as a Master Architects, Designers or Builders, and there is insufficient information to designate them as such at this time. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion D.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the A. Frank Reed House located at 3044 29th Street be designated with a period of significance of 1912 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of the Craftsman style. The designation includes the original detached garage.

Suzanne Segur Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison Development Services Department

ss/SS

Attachment(s):

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 11/17/2022

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 11/17/2022, to consider the historical designation of the A. Frank Reed House (owned by Timothy First, Lisa Fisher, 3044 29th Street, San Diego, CA 92104) located at **3044 29th Street**, **San Diego**, **CA 92104**, APN: **453-582-29-00**, further described as BLK 3 LOTS 47 & 48 E 87 FT in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the A. Frank Reed House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1912 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features wood shingle siding, a low pitched front gable roof with exposed rafter tails, inset half-walled porch with battered stucco column bases, decorative knee braces and wood windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall include the original detached garage.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY: _

TIM HUTTER, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT, CITY ATTORNEY

BY:

LINDSEY SEBASTIAN, Deputy City Attorney RECORDING REQUESTED BY CITY OF SAN DIEGO DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT

WHEN RECORDED MAIL TO

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD ATTN: HRB SECRETARY 1222 FIRST AVENUE, MS 501 SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

SPACE ABOVE THIS LINE FOR RECORDER'S USE

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A

HISTORICAL DESIGNATION OF PROPERTY ON

3044 29th Street, San Diego, CA 92104

ASSESSOR PARCEL NUMBER 453-582-29-00

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD NUMBER 0

THIS PAGE ADDED TO PROVIDE ADEQUATE SPACE FOR RECORDING INFORMATION (Additional recording fee applies)