CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF MARCH 24, 2016 NORTH TERRACE ROOMS, SAN DIEGO CONCOURSE 202 C STREET, SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:07PM

	Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
	Vice Chairperson	Gail Garbini	Present
	Boardmember	Michael Baksh	Present
	Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
	Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present arrived @ 1:11pm
	Boardmember	Tom Larimer	Present
	Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present
	Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present
Staff to the Board in Attendance		Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner Camille Pekarek, Associate Planner	
Legal Counsel in Attendance:		Corrine Neuffer, Deputy City Attorney	

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES for January 28, 2016 and February 25, 2016

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FOR JANUARY 28, 2016 AS WRITTEN

Seconded by Boardmember Berge	Vote: 7-0-0	Motion Passes
,		

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FOR FEBRUARY 25, 2016 AS WRITTEN

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 5-0-2 (Silvas, Larimer) **Motion Passes**

Historical Resources Board Minutes of March 24, 2016 Page 2 of 8

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

ABSENCES

None

• OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION

- ✓ Revised Resolutions for Items 7 and 9. The resolution for Item 7 was revised to correct the description of the attic vents, and the resolution for Item 9 was revised to include the date of the period of significance.
- ✓ Request for Continuance for Item 10 2750 4th Avenue
- ✓ HRB Criteria Guidelines
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

None

• EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

None

 FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- I am happy to announce that a new Deputy Director for the Environmental Resource & Policy Division of the Planning Department has been appointed. Alyssa Muto, formerly a Senior Project Manager with Recon, started in the position on March 14th. She will be overseeing the Historical Resources, Park Planning, MSCP and CEQA sections within the division. She was unable to attend the HRB Hearing today due to scheduling conflicts, but looks forward to introducing herself at a future hearing.
- I did receive an update from the Mayor's office regarding Board appointments. Based upon docketing timeframes, we are expecting appointments in May.
- A reminder that the Mills Act application period is currently open through Friday, April 1st, March 31st is a City holiday and we will be closed. Please keep in mind that all applications are first come first serve.
- An additional reminder that the City is currently accepting nominations for the 2016 Historic Preservation Awards through April 4th, and the Awards will be presented at the May 26th HRB Hearing. Nomination forms are available on the City's website.

Historical Resources Board Minutes of March 24, 2016 Page 3 of 8

The next regularly scheduled Design Assistance Subcommittee meeting will be held Wednesday, April 6, 2016 at 4:00pm in the Large Conference Room on the 6th floor of the Executive Complex. The next regularly scheduled Policy Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, April 11, 2016 at 3:00pm in the Large Conference Room on the 12th floor of the Executive Complex. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, May 9, 2016 at 4:00pm in the Large Conference Room on the 12th floor of the Executive Complex. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, May 9, 2016 at 4:00pm in the Large Conference Room on the 12th floor of the Executive Complex.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

The applicant for Item 10 - 2750 4th Avenue is requesting a 30-day continuance to the April 28, 2016 agenda.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO CONTINUE ITEM 10 – 2750 4th Avenue FOR 30-DAYS PER THE APPLICANT'S REQUEST

Seconded by Boardmember Larimer

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

- ITEM 5- 4318 Louisiana Street
- ITEM 6- 1678 National Avenue, 926 Sigsbee Street, and 928 Sigsbee Street
- ITEM 7– Frank and Frances Young House
- ITEM 8- John and Grace Danner House
- ITEM 9- Joseph Sr. and Therese Strasser House
- ITEM 12- W.G. Reinhardt Apartments
- ITEM 13– Casper Kundert/David O. Dryden Spec House #1
- ITEM 14- Lawrence and Dorothy Michel Spec House #1
- ITEM 15– Thomas Faulconer House
- ITEM 16– Thomas Russell House

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO APPROVE ITEMS 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 12, 13, 14, 15 AND 16 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – 4318 LOUISIANA STREET

Trailed from February 2016

<u>Applicant</u>: HP Investors represented by Scott A. Moomjian

<u>Owner</u>: Peter Anderson

Location: 4318 Louisiana Street, 92104, Greater North Park, Council District 3 (1269 4-D)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4318 Louisiana Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Do not designate the property located at 4318 Louisiana Street under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB 16-008

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 6 – 1678 NATIONAL AVENUE, 926 SIGSBEE STREET, AND 928 SIGSBEE STREET Trailed from February 2016

Applicant: Raquel C. Garcia Trust and Kamal Shamoo represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 1678 National Avenue, 926 Sigsbee Street, and 928 Sigsbee Street, 92113, Barrio Logan Community, Council District 8 (**1289 5-C**)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 1678 National Avenue, 926 Sigsbee Street, and 928 Sigsbee Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Do not designate the properties located at 1678 National Avenue, 926 Sigsbee Street, and 928 Sigsbee Street under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB 16-015

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 7 – FRANK AND FRANCES YOUNG HOUSE

Trailed from February 2016

Applicant: Martin Oliver represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 4476 Granger Street, 92107, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1287 1-J)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 4476 Granger Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Frank and Frances Young House located at 4476 Granger Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the 1964 laundry room addition to the detached garage.

Report Number: HRB 16-012

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 8 – JOHN AND GRACE DANNER HOUSE

Historical Resources Board Minutes of March 24, 2016 Page 5 of 8

Trailed from February 2016

Applicant: Michael R. and Grazyna M. Waters represented by Johnson & Johnson

Location: 4608 Vista Street, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9 (1269 3-H)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 4608 Vista Street as a historical resource.

- <u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.
- <u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the John and Grace Danner House located at 4608 Vista Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the predated single-room storage space that was relocated onsite behind the garage in 1956.

Report Number: HRB 16-013

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 9 – JOSEPH SR. AND THERESE STRASSER HOUSE

Trailed from February 2016

<u>Applicant</u>: Nadav Goldschmied and Inna Fishman represented by Archaeos

Location: 4416 Georgia Street, 92116, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 4-C**)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 4416 Georgia Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Joseph Sr. and Therese Strasser House located at 4416 Georgia Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1913 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the additions at the northwest and southwest corners.

Report Number: HRB 16-014

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 10 - THE SAN DIEGO COUNTY WATER AUTHORITY/ FRANK HOPE, SR. BUILDING

Applicant: Seamus and Patricia Garland represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 2750 4th Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (1269 7-A)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 2750 4th Avenue as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the San Diego County Water Authority/ Frank Hope, Sr. Building located at 2750

4th Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1956 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB 16-016

ITEM CONTINUED FOR 30 DAYS AT THE APPLICANT'S REQUEST

Historical Resources Board Minutes of March 24, 2016 Page 6 of 8

Location: 500 Hotel Circle North, 92108, Mission Valley Community, Council District 7 (1268 3-J; 4-J)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of The Le Baron Hotel Garden Ballroom and the larger Town & Country Hotel complex located at 500 Hotel Circle North as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate The Le Baron Hotel Garden Ballroom located at 500 Hotel Circle North as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1967 under HRB Criterion C. The designation is limited to The Le Baron Hotel Garden Ballroom located on APN 437-260-18-00, and excludes all other buildings on the parcel, as well as all other parcels on the Town & Country site.

Report Number: HRB 16-009

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Scott Moomjian, Todd Majcher. Trina Meiser, Gary Wood, Jeremy Hollins, Christian Dimeling, Debbie Dela Paz, Lori Meredith, Paul Robinson, Neil Hyytinen, Andy Pendoley, Jenny An, Rick Sarrett, Ron May

In Opposition: Bruce Coons, Amy Hayes, Dan Soderberg

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 11 – THE LE BARON HOTEL GARDEN BALLROOM PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 5-3-0 Motion Fails (Silvas, Woods, Garbini)

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 11 - THE TOWN AND COUNTY BUILDING COMPLEXES AS IDENTIFIED IN THE CONSULTANT'S REPORT AS BUILDING 3100 AND BUILDING 3200 ON PARCEL # 437-260-27-00, EXCLUDING OTHER BUILDINGS ON THAT PARCEL. DESIGNATION IS BASED UPON FINDINGS FOR CRITERION A FOR THE HISTORIC AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT OF MISSION VALLEY. AS THE FIRST HOTEL IN MISSION VALLEY, IT REALLY WAS THE FORERUNNER OF THE DEVELOPMENT IN MISSION VALLEY WITH HOTELS. THIS PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE WOULD BE 1953-1955. UNDER CRITERION C FOR RETAINING THE DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS/ELEMENTS OF THE RANCH STYLE OF ARCHITECTURE. IN PARTICULAR THESE ELEMENTS ARE IDENTIFIED IN THE CONSULTANT'S REPORT UNDER BUILDING COMPLEX 3100, THE PRIMARY: HORIZONTAL MASSING; SINGLE-STORY; LOW-SLOPED GABLED ROOF WITH DEEP OVERHANG; NATURAL FINISHES (WOOD SIDING AND SHINGLES). FOR BUILDING 3200, THE CHARACTER DEFINING FEATURES AS ITEMIZED IN THE CONSULTANT'S REPORT, THE PRIMARY: HORIZONTAL MASSING; SINGLE-STORY; LOW-SLOPED GABLED ROOF WITH DEEP OVERHANG; NATURAL FINISHES (WOOD SIDING AND ROOF SHINGLES; BRICK). ALSO INCLUDED ARE THE COVERED WALKWAYS, REFERRED TO AT TIMES AS TRELLISES THAT CONNECT THE BUILDINGS. UNDER CRITERION C THESE BUILDINGS RETAIN SUFFICIENT INTEGRITY AND CONTINUE TO CONVEY SIGNIFICANCE OF RANCH STYLE ARCHITECTURE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1953 FOR BUILDING 3100 AND 1955 FOR BUILDING 3200. UNDER CRITERION A THE BUILDINGS CONTAIN ENOUGH INTEGRITY TO CONVEY THEIR SIGNIFICANCE AS THE FIRST HOTEL IN MISSION VALLEY.

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 4-4-0 Motion Fails (Lemmo, Larimer, Silvas, Baksh)

ITEM 12 – W.G. REINHARDT APARTMENTS

Applicant: Episcopal Community Services represented by Maria Burke Lia

Historical Resources Board Minutes of March 24, 2016 Page 7 of 8

Location: 1425 and 1431 C Street, 92101, Downtown Community, Council District 3 (**1289 3-B**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1425 and 1431 C Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the W.G. Reinhardt Apartments located at 1425 and 1431 C Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1908 and 1912, respectively, under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB 16-020

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 13 - CASPER KUNDERT/DAVID O. DRYDEN SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Lewis and Elizabeth Vann represented by IS Architecture

Location: 3049 Palm Street, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (1269 7-E)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 3049 Palm Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Casper Kundert/David O. Dryden Spec House #1 located at 3049 Palm Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1912 under HRB Criteria C and D. Designation shall

exclude the 449 square foot 2002 rear room addition.

Report Number: HRB 16-017

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 14 – LAWRENCE AND DOROTHY MICHEL SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Angela Rock & Megan Humpal Revocable Trust represented by IS Architecture

Location: 4842 Biona Drive, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9 (**1269 3-H**)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 4842 Biona Drive as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Lawrence and Dorothy Michel Spec House #1 located at 4842 Biona Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1931 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the approximately 400 square foot rear addition constructed in 2014.

Report Number: HRB 16-018

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 15 – THOMAS FAULCONER HOUSE

<u>Applicant</u>: Jane Ligon Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 4152 Ibis Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (1268 5-J)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 4152 Ibis Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Thomas Faulconer House located at 4152 Ibis Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1910 and 1923-1926 under HRB Criteria B and C.

Report Number: HRB 16-019

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 16 – THOMAS RUSSELL HOUSE

<u>Applicant</u>: Marija Mikic and Nenad Medvidovic represented by Johnson & Johnson <u>Location</u>: 1611 Myrtle Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1269 6-C**)

Historical Resources Board Minutes of March 24, 2016 Page 8 of 8

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 1611 Myrtle Avenue as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Thomas Russell House located at 1611 Myrtle Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1925 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the rear-facing detached garage structure at the rear of the property.

Report Number: HRB 16-021

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

REMINDER:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE:

LOCATION:

Thursday, April 28, 2016 City Concourse Building,

North Terrace Rooms

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 2:56PM