

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF AUGUST 25, 2016
NORTH TERRACE ROOMS, SAN DIEGO CONCOURSE
202 C STREET, SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Coyle at 1:10PM

Chairperson	Courtney Ann Coyle	Present
Vice-Chairperson	Ann Woods	Present
2 nd Vice-Chairperson	David McCullough	Present
Boardmember	Mike Baksh	Absent
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Amy Harleman	Present
Boardmember	Tim Hutter	Present
Boardmember	Tom Larimer	Absent
Boardmember	Todd Pitman	Present
Boardmember	Mathew Winter	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance

Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner
Camille Pekarek, Associate Planner
Suzanne Segur, Assistant Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Corrine Neuffer, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR JULY 28, 2016

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FOR JULY 28, 2016 AS WRITTEN

Seconded by Boardmember Hutter

Vote: 7-0-1

Motion Passes

(Winter)

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

Amie Hayes is requesting two items be considered by the Policy Subcommittee: deficiencies in HRB Criterion B; and the supplemental regulations for the Community Plan Updates for Uptown, Golden Hill and North Park.

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

• **ABSENCES**

Boardmembers Baksh and Larimer notified Staff they would not be present at this month's meeting.

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**
 - ✓ Correspondence for Item 6
 - ✓ HRB Criteria Guidelines
 - ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation
- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None
- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None
- **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- Item 7 - Morena Reservoir Dam and Outlet Tower has been withdrawn at the request of the applicant
- As I announced at last month's meeting, historical resources staff members who are now part of the Development Services Department will be physically relocating to that department. The date has been set, and the move will occur next Tuesday, August 30th. Jodie, Camille, Suzanne and Shannon will be physically relocating to the Development Services Department building at 1222 First Avenue. Beginning August 31st, all historic resource nomination submittals, Mills Act applications, initial consultation and project review meetings with staff, and stamp transfers will occur at the Development Services building.
- The Planning Department will be hosting two public workshops to present the Draft San Diego Citywide LGBTQ Historic Context Statement and solicit input and feedback from the public. Staff will be presenting information on what a historic context statement is and how it will be used by the City; the themes that have been identified as important to the LGBTQ community as reflected in the built environment; and the property types that are associated with those themes. Specific properties that have been identified will also be presented. The first workshop will be held this evening at 6:00pm in the Balboa Park Club Ballroom, and the second workshop will be held on Saturday morning at 10:00am at the Balboa Park Recital Hall. Both workshops are open to all members of the public, and we encourage all interested members of the public to attend.
- The next regularly scheduled Design Assistance Subcommittee meeting will be held Wednesday, September 7, 2016 at 4:00pm in Conference Room 5C on the 5th floor of Development Services. The next regularly scheduled Policy Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, September 12, 2016 at 3:00pm in Conference Room 4C on the 4th floor of Development Services. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, November 14, 2016 at 4:00pm in Conference Room 4C on the 4th floor of Development Services.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

The applicant for Item 9 – 4343 Ridgeway Drive is requesting a 60-day continuance.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER PITMAN TO GRANT A 60-DAY CONTINUANCE FOR ITEM 9 – 4343 RIDGEWAY DRIVE

Seconded by Boardmember Hutter

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 8 – J.W. and Dora Fleming/Hurlburt and Tifal House

ITEM 11 – Approval of Special Meetings and Cancelation of Regular September 22, 2016 HRB Meeting

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE ITEMS 8 AND 11 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Pitman

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – ARTS & CRAFTS PRESS BUILDING

Applicant: CALFA Holdings Five LLC represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 3554-3590 Kettner Blvd, 1949 West Walnut Avenue and 3553-3595 California Street, 92101, Midway-Pacific Highway Community, Council District 2 **(1268 7-H)**

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3554-3590 Kettner Blvd, 1949 West Walnut Avenue and 3553-3595 California Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Arts & Crafts Press Building located at 3554-3590 Kettner Boulevard, 1949 West Walnut Avenue and 3553-3595 California Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1963 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 1982 addition within the lower level rear parking lot.

Report Number: HRB 16-049

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Jennifer Ayala, Marie Lia, Rosalie Merks, Rick Sutton, Brett Wray, Robin Cody

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCCULLOUGH TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 - 3554-3590 KETTNER BLVD, 1949 WEST WALNUT AVENUE AND 3553-3595 CALIFORNIA STREET PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Pitman

Vote: 4-4-0

Motion Fails
(Berge, Harleman, Hutter, Woods)

ITEM 6 – 2345 VIA SIENA

Applicant: Sonoca Corp represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 2345 Via Siena, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (**1227 6-H – 7-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2345 Via Siena as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 2345 Via Siena under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB 16-048

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Scott Moomjian, Brian Caneya, Michael Henry, Kevin Franklin, Sheldon Edgan, Derek Harms, Mathew Daniel, Tennyson Fuller, Kymberly Nelson, Chris DeCiergorio, Andrew Lessard, Carrie Ford

In Opposition: Diane Kane, Lewis Branscomb, David Goldberg, Kiley Wallace, Rebecca McManus, Heath Fox, Bruce Coons, Amie Hayes

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR COYLE TO RETURN THE REPORT AND ASK STAFF TO WORK WITH THE APPLICANT TO TAKE A LOOK AT CRITERION A AND THE SOCIAL, ECONOMICAL, HISTORICAL, AND CULTURAL DEVELOPMENT CONTEXT OF WOMEN IN ACADEMIA IN SAN DIEGO, THE DEVELOPMENT OF UCSD AND BIOTECH AS WELL AS THE ROLE OF WOMEN IN STEM AT UCSD AND WHAT LEGACY DR. MAYER MAY HAVE IN CONTRIBUTING TO THAT; AND SECONDARILY, TAKING ANOTHER LOOK UNDER CRITERION B AS TO WHETHER RECEIPT OF THE NOBEL PRIZE AWARD IN AND OF ITSELF IS SIGNIFICANT, HOW THE NOBLE PRIZE COMMITTEE DISTINGUISHES THEIR AWARDS BASED ON PRIOR WORK RELATIVE TO THE TIMING OF THE WORK, THE DATE(S) OF DR. MAYER'S RESEARCH AND HOW IT HAS BEEN USED BY HER OR OTHERS, AND WHETHER OR NOT BOTH DR. JOSEPH MAYER AND DR. MARIA GOEPPERT MAYER SHOULD BE CONSIDERED SIGNIFICANT FOR THEIR WORK OR ASSOCIATION WITH UCSD. THIS ITEM WILL BE RESCHEDULED FOR THE OCTOBER HRB AGENDA.

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 5-3-0

Motion Passes

(Winter, McCullough, Hutter)

ITEM 7 – MORENA RESERVOIR DAM AND OUTLET TOWER

WITHDRAWN PRIOR TO THE HEARING AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT

ITEM 8 – THE J.W. AND DORA FLEMING/HURLBURT AND TIFAL HOUSE

Applicant: Robert Macari and Julie Ferguson represented by IS Architecture

Location: 2925 Cedar Street, 92102, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 3 (**1289 2-E**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2925 Cedar Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the J.W. and Dora Fleming/Hurlburt and Tifal House located at 2925 Cedar Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1924 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB 16-052

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 9 – 4343 RIDGEWAY DRIVE

Applicant: Thomas Welch Living Trust and Donald LaMar represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 4343 Ridgeway Drive, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9 (**1269 2-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4343 Ridgeway Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 4343 Ridgeway Drive under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB 16-053

ITEM WAS CONTINUED FOR 60-DAYS AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT

ITEM 10 – ALBERTA SECURITY COMPANY/MARTIN V. MELHORN SPEC HOUSE #5

Applicant: Denton Living Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 4774 Panorama Drive, 92116, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 3-D**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4774 Panorama Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Alberta Security Company/Martin V. Melhorn Spec House #5 located at 4774 Panorama Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1920 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the rear addition constructed in 1948.

Report Number: HRB 16-054

Staff Report by Suzanne Segur

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Kiley Wallace, Ron May, Alexandra Wallace

In Opposition: None

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER Berge to designate Item 10 - Alberta Security Company/Martin V. Melhorn Spec House #5 per Staff's recommendation, excluding the garage from the designation.

Seconded by Boardmember Winter

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 11 – APPROVAL OF SPECIAL MEETINGS AND CANCELATION OF REGULAR SEPTEMBER 22, 2016 HRB MEETING

Applicant: City of San Diego

Location: City-wide

Description: Consider the cancellation of the standing Historical Resources Board meeting of September 22, 2016, and the scheduling of two special meetings of the Historical Resources Board on September 14, 2016 and September 20, 2016.

Today's Action: Cancel the standing Historical Resources Board meeting of September 22, 2016, or do not cancel; and schedule two special meetings of the Historical Resources Board on September 14, 2016 and September 20, 2016, or do not schedule.

Staff Recommendation: Cancel the standing Historical Resources Board meeting on September 22, 2016 and schedule two special meetings – the first on Wednesday, September 14, 2016 at 2:00pm to review and provide a recommendation on the North Park CPU and Golden Hill CPU; and a second meeting

on Tuesday, September 20th at 1:00pm to review and provide a recommendation on the Uptown CPU. All other items which would have been heard at the regular HRB meeting on September 22 will be heard at the special meeting on September 20th.

Report Number: Memo dated August 11, 2016

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 12 – CONSOLIDATION OF THE HRB POLICY AND ARCHAEOLOGY SUBCOMMITTEES

Applicant: City of San Diego

Location: City-wide

Description: Consider amending the Board’s procedures to consolidate the Policy Subcommittee and Archaeology Subcommittee into a single Policy and Archaeology Subcommittee.

Today’s Action: Amend the Board’s procedures to consolidate the Policy Subcommittee and Archaeology Subcommittee into a single Policy and Archaeology Subcommittee, or do not amend.

Staff Recommendation: Amend the Board’s procedures to consolidate the Policy Subcommittee and Archaeology Subcommittee into a single Policy and Archaeology Subcommittee.

Report Number: HRB-16-051

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Abel Silvas, Ron May, Diane Kane

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE FOR THE HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD TO CONTINUE TO HAVE TWO SEPARATE SUBCOMMITTEES FOR POLICY AND ARCHAEOLOGY AND THEREBY NOT TO AMEND THE BOARDS PROCEDURES

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 7-1-0 Motion Passes
(McCullough)

ITEM 13 – COMPOSITION OF THE HRB SUBCOMMITTEES

Applicant: City of San Diego

Location: City-wide

Description: Consider ratifying appointments to the Policy, Design Assistance, and Archaeology Subcommittees.

Today’s Action: Ratify the appointments to the Policy, Design Assistance, and Archaeology Subcommittees or do not ratify any or all of the appointments.

Staff Recommendation: Ratify the appointments to the Design Assistance Subcommittee. If during the consideration of Item 12 the Board votes to amend the Board’s procedures to consolidate the Policy Subcommittee and Archaeology Subcommittee into a single Policy and Archaeology Subcommittee, then do not ratify the appointments of the Policy Subcommittee and the Archaeology Subcommittee, and return the appointments to the Policy Subcommittee for revision based upon the new procedures. If the Board does not vote to amend the Board’s procedures and maintains the Policy Subcommittee and Archaeology Subcommittee as separate subcommittees, then ratify the appointments to the Policy Subcommittee and Archaeology Subcommittee.

Report Number: HRB-16-055

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: None

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR COYLE TO RATIFY THE APPOINTMENTS TO THE POLICY, ARCHAEOLOGY AND DESIGN ASSISTANCE SUBCOMMITTEES, AS LISTED BELOW:

Policy

Courtney Ann Coyle (Subcommittee Chair)
Priscilla Berge
Tim Hutter
Ann Woods

Archaeology

Michael Baksh (Subcommittee Chair)
Priscilla Berge
Courtney Ann Coyle

Design Assistance

Todd Pitman (Subcommittee Chair)
Tom Larimer
David McCullough
Matt Winter
Ann Woods

Seconded by Boardmember Winter

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

REMINDER:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE:

Tuesday, September 20, 2016

LOCATION:

City Concourse Building, Silver Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:48PM