CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 20, 2016 SILVER ROOM, SAN DIEGO CONCOURSE 202 C STREET, SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Coyle at 1:05PM

	Chairperson Vice-Chairperson 2 nd Vice-Chairperson Boardmember Boardmember Boardmember Boardmember Boardmember Boardmember Boardmember	Courtney Ann Coyle Ann Woods David McCullough Mike Baksh Priscilla Berge Amy Harleman Tim Hutter Tom Larimer Todd Pitman Mathew Winter	Present Present Present <i>left at 4:30PM</i> Present Absent Present Absent Present <i>arrived at 1:10PM</i> Present
Staff to the Boa	ard in Attendance	Shannon Anthony, Board Sect Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner Jodie Brown, Senior Planner Camille Pekarek, Associate Pla Suzanne Segur, Assistant Plan	anner
Legal Counsel i	n Attendance:	Corrine Neuffer, Deputy City A	Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR August 25, 2016 and September 14, 2016 - Special Meeting

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO CORRECTIONS	APPROVE THE MINUTES FOR AU	IGUST 25, 2016 WITH
Seconded by Vice-Chair Woods	Vote: 6-0-1 (Baksh)	Motion Passes
BOARD ACTION:		
MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO A	APPROVE THE MINUTES FOR THE S	EPTEMBER 14, 2016 –

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE	THE MIN	NUTES FOR	THE SEPTEMBER 14, 2016 –
SPECIAL MEETING WITH CORRECTIONS			
Seconded by Vice-Chair Woods	Vote:	6-0-1	Motion Passes
		(Baksh)	

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

Diane Kane and Amie Hayes - HRB Criterion B Thomas May - Community Plan Update Procedures

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

ABSENCES •

Boardmember Larimer notified Staff he would not be present at this month's meeting; and Boardmember Harleman may be late if she is able to attend.

OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION

- ✓ Requests for Continuances for Items 7 and 8
- ✓ Correspondence for Item 5
- ✓ Email from the Applicant for Item 14 waiving the 10-business day noticing requirement
- ✓ 2016 California Native American Day Flyer
- ✓ Preservation Element for Item 5
- Draft Minutes for the July and September-Special Meeting
- ✓ Re-Revised Agenda
- ✓ Staff Memo for Item 15
- ✓ HRB Criteria Guidelines
- Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

Boardmembers Hutter and Winter had a conflict of interest for Item 5- Uptown Community Plan Update and recused themselves from any discussion and vote.

Boardmember Pitman had a conflict of interest for Item 10 - Park + Market (1127-1137 G Street) - Centre City Planned Development Permit/Site Development Permit No. 2016-15 and recused himself from any discussion and vote.

EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

None

FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR **DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

Boardmembers Pitman and Winter were unable to do a site visit for item 12 and Boardmember Berge was unable to complete site visits for Items 11-14.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HUTTER TO INVOKE THE WAIVER PURSUANT TO CRITERIA 1 FOR BOARDMEMBERS PITMAN AND WINTER FOR ITEM 12 AND BOARDMEMBER BERGE FOR ITEMS 11-14

Seconded by Vice-Chair Woods

C. STAFF REPORT

- The City's Tribal Liaison, Myra Herrmann, is here to address Archaeology Month, which nearly upon us.
- The next regularly scheduled Design Assistance Subcommittee meeting will be held Wednesday, October 5, 2016 at 4:00pm in Conference Room 5C on the 5th floor of Development Services. The next regularly scheduled Policy Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, October 10, 2016 at 3:00pm in Conference Room 4C on the 4th floor of Development Services. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, November 14, 2016 at 4:00pm in Conference Room 4C on the 4th floor of Development Services.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

The applicant for Item 7 – 3430 Elliott Street is requesting a 60-day continuance.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO GRANT A 60-DAY CONTINUANCE FOR ITEM 7 – 3430 ELLIOTT STREET

Seconded by Vice-Chair Woods	Vote:	7-0-1	Motion Passes
		(Baksh)	

The applicant for Item 8 – 2740 Granada Avenue is requesting a 30-day continuance.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO GRANT A 30-DAY CONTINUANCE FOR ITEM 8 - 2740 GRANADA AVENUE

Seconded by Boardmember Hutter	Vote:	6-0-1	Motion Passes
		(Baksh)	

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 10 -Park + Market (1127-1137 G Street) - Centre City Planned Development Permit/Site Development Permit No. 2016-15

ITEM 11 - Gladys Benson House

ITEM 12 - Rodney Eales/Sim Bruce Richards House

ITEM 13 – John and Elsa Pearson/John Pearson Spec House #1

ITEM 15 – Policy Subcommittee Appointment

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER WINTER TO APPROVE ITEMS 11, 12, 13 AND 15 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Vice-Chair Woods	Vote:	7-0-1	Motion Passes
		(Baksh)	

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE ITEM 10 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Hutter Vote:	6-
--------------------------------------	----

Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – UPTOWN COMMUNITY PLAN UPDATE

Applicant: City of San Diego

Location: Uptown, Council District 3

<u>Description</u>: Review and consider the Uptown Community Plan Update as it relates to historical and cultural resources for the purposes of making a recommendation to the City Council.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Recommend to the City Council adoption of the Historic Survey, HPE, and PEIR or do not recommend adoption.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Recommend to the City Council adoption of the Uptown Community Plan Area Historic Resources Survey (Historic Survey); the Historic Preservation Element of the Uptown Community Plan update (HPE); and the final Program Environmental Impact Report (PEIR) related to Historical Resources.

Report Number: HRB 16-059

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

- In Favor: Hugh Largey, Laura Largey, Matt Wahlstrom, Leo Wilson, Bruce Coons, Amie Hayes, Ron May, Kiley Wallace
- In Opposition: Tom Story, Bob O'Connor, Cindy Eldred, Dianne Dunne, Tom May, Sharon Gehl, CJ Robinson, Scott Moomjian, Carol Jordon, Mercedes, Sheehan, John Bogucki, Marie Lia, Adrian Kwiatkowski, Elizabeth Robinson

BOARD ACTION:

Motion by Boardmember Berge to recommend to the City Council adoption of the Uptown Final Program Environmental Impact Report as it relates to historical resources, with the following amendments:

- Separate archaeological and tribal cultural resources into two separate classes of resources pursuant to AB 52 as follows:
 - HIST-6.7-2 Archaeological Resources and HIST-6.7-3 Tribal Cultural Resources.
 - Throughout the analysis, continue to track the updates pursuant to AB 52, such as "formal" to "dedicated" cemeteries.
- Under HIST 6.7-1 recommend to the City Council that the City commit funding to complete the nomination process of all identified potential historic districts within 5 years of the adoption of the CPU.

Seconded by Boardmember Pitman Vote: 5-1-0

(McCullough)

Motion Passes

Historical Resources Board Minutes of September 20, 2016 Page 5 of 8

BOARD ACTION:

Motion by Boardmember Woods to recommend to the City Council adoption of the Uptown Community Plan Area Historic Resources Survey and the Historic preservation Element of the Uptown Community Plan Update, per the staff recommendation, with the following revision to Policy HP-2.10:

Revise "...ensure adequate treatment and mitigation for significant archaeological sites with cultural and religious significance to the Native American Community..." to "...ensure adequate treatment and mitigation for significant archaeological sites **or sites** with cultural and religious significance to the Native American Community..."

Seconded by Boardmember PitmanVote:5-1-0Motion Passes(McCullough)

BOARD ACTION:

Motion by Boardmember Pitman to recommend that the City pursue additional incentives for historic preservation at the earliest feasible time, including exempting historic resources from FAR calculations on a property, and exempting historic resources from parking requirements.

Seconded by Boardmember Berge Vote: 6-0-0 Motion Passes

ITEM 6 – 1445 GRANADA AVENUE AND 2885 BEECH STREET

WITHDRAWN PRIOR TO THE HEARING AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT

ITEM 7 – 3430 ELLIOTT STREET

Continued from June 2016

<u>Applicant</u>: Peter Lucca Jr. represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 3430 Elliott Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1268 6-C)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 3430 Elliott Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Do not designate the property located at 3430 Elliott Street under any adopted HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: Staff memo dated September 8, 2016 and HRB 16-036

ITEM WAS CONTINUED FOR 60-DAYS AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT

ITEM 8 – 2740 GRANADA AVENUE

Continued from July 2016

<u>Applicant</u>: Dente Family Trust represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 2740 Granada Avenue, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (1269 7-E)

- <u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 2740 Granada Avenue as a historical resource.
- <u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.
- <u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Do not designate the property at 2740 Granada Avenue under any HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: HRB 16-041

ITEM WAS CONTINUED FOR 30-DAYS AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT

Historical Resources Board Minutes of September 20, 2016 Page 6 of 8

Item 9 was heard out of order; after Item 14 had concluded:

ITEM 9 – GATEWAY TRAVELODGE MOTEL

Applicant: TRI-LIN L B LLC represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 701 East San Ysidro Boulevard, 92173, San Ysidro Community, Council District 8 (1350 5-H)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 701 East San Ysidro Boulevard as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Gateway Travelodge Motel located at 701 East San Ysidro Boulevard as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1956 under HRB Criterion A. The designation excludes the 1975 second story addition over the office at the south end of the property.

Report Number: HRB 16-060

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Maria Lia, Benjamin Meza, Francis Lin

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR WOODS TO DESIGNATE ITEM 9 - GATEWAY TRAVELODGE MOTEL PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION, INCLUDING THE LANGUAGE "THE RESOURCE REFLECTS A SPECIAL ELEMENT" AND WITH THE PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1956

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 4-3-0 Motion Fails (Hutter, Winter, McCullough)

ITEM 10 –PARK + MARKET (1127-1137 G STREET) – CENTRE CITY PLANNED DEVELOPMENT PERMIT/SITE DEVELOPMENT PERMIT NO. 2016-15

<u>Applicant</u>: Holland Partner Group represented by Heritage Architecture & Planning <u>Owner</u>: City of San Diego

Location: 1127-1137 G Street, 92101, Downtown Community, Council District 3 (1289 3-B)

- <u>Description</u>: Review and make a recommendation to the appropriate decision-making authority on those aspects of the development permit pertaining to designated historical resources.
- <u>Today's Action</u>: Recommend to the Planning Commission adoption of the mitigation measures and findings associated with the site development permit as presented or recommend inclusion of additional permit conditions related to designated historical resources.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Recommend to the Planning Commission adoption of the permit findings and mitigation measures associated with the Site Development Permit for the relocation of the designated historical resource located at 1127-1137 G Street (HRB Site #426, the Remmen Building) as presented.

Report Number: HRB 16-061

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

Historical Resources Board Minutes of September 20, 2016 Page 7 of 8

ITEM 11 – GLADYS BENSON HOUSE

Applicant: Melvin Collins represented by Allen Hazard & Janet O'Dea

Location: 1617 West Montecito Way, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (1268 5-H)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 1617 West Montecito Way as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Gladys Benson House located at 1617 West Montecito Way as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1924 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB 16-056

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 12 – RODNEY EALES/SIM BRUCE RICHARDS HOUSE

Applicant: Adam Schwartz represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 391 Catalina Blvd, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1287 4-J)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 391 Catalina Blvd as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Rodney Eales/Sim Bruce Richards House as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1971-1983 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB 16-032

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 13 – JOHN AND ELSA PEARSON/JOHN PEARSON SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Christine Morales represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 3435-3435½ Texas Street, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 6-D**)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 3435-3435½ Texas Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the John and Elsa Pearson/John Pearson Spec House #1 located at 3435-3435½ Texas Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1925 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB 16-057

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

Historical Resources Board Minutes of September 20, 2016 Page 8 of 8

Item 14 was heard out of order; after Item 5 had concluded:

ITEM 14 – EDGAR AND CARRIE COLEMAN RESIDENCE

Applicant: Steve and Audrey Ross represented by IS Architecture

Location: 7510-7516 ½ Draper Avenue, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1227 7-E)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 7510-7516 ½ Draper Avenue as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Edgar and Carrie Coleman Residence located at 7510–7516½ Draper Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1946-1957 under HRB Criterion A.

Report Number: HRB 16-058

Staff Report by Suzanne Segur

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Maia, Dunea, Diane Kane, Aimee Hayes

In Opposition: Patrick Hattori

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 14 – EDGAR AND CARRIE COLEMAN RESIDENCE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION, DESIGNATION INCLUDES ALL THREE BUILDINGS.

Seconded by Chair Coyle

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 15 – POLICY SUBCOMMITTEE APPOINTMENT

Applicant: City of San Diego

Location: City-wide

<u>Description</u>: Consider ratifying the appointment of Boardmember Harleman to the Policy Subcommittee.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Ratify the appointment of Boardmember Harleman to the Policy Subcommittee or do not ratify the appointment.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Ratify the Policy Subcommittee's appointment of Boardmember Harleman to the Policy Subcommittee.

Report Number: Memo dated September 16, 2016

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

REMINDER:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE:

Thursday, October 27, 2016

LOCATION:

City Concourse Building, North Terrace Rooms

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:28PM