

INTRODUCTION

The Biennial Housing Element Report is in response to the California Department of Housing and Community Development (HCD) certification of the City's General Plan 2021-2029 Housing Element (Housing Element). After the City Council adopted the Housing Element on June 8, 2021, the Housing Element was submitted to HCD for certification, as required by state law. On September 10, 2021, HCD affirmed that the adopted Housing Element was in substantial compliance with state law. As part of the certification, HCD requested that the City provide additional reporting every two years on fair housing, the adequate sites inventory, and outreach and engagement (Attachment 1).

In response to the HCD certification request, the Biennial Housing Element Report includes information on affirmatively furthering fair housing through home permitting as well as the adoption and implementation of housing programs. It also provides an analysis of new home permitting in comparison with the Housing Element's Adequate Site Inventory. Finally, the Biennial Housing Element Report summarizes the City's outreach and engagement efforts since the Housing Element's adoption.

The Biennial Housing Element Report uses the data reported to HCD in the City's Housing Element Annual Progress Reports from 2021 and 2022. The Annual Progress Reports track the City's status and progress in implementing its Housing Element using data forms provided by HCD. To assist decision makers and the public, the City also prepares an Annual Report on Homes with easy-to-read information about housing permitting in the City each year. The Annual Report also documents how and where the City's housing programs are being implemented. The City has released the 2022 Annual Report on Homes in companion with the Biennial Housing Element Report.

A. Background

Housing Element

The General Plan Housing Element is the City's housing plan. The City is required to adequately plan to meet the housing needs of everyone in the community and to update the Housing Element every eight years. The Regional Housing Needs Assessment (RHNA) serves as the foundation for the Housing Element and is prepared by the San Diego Association of Governments (SANDAG). As part of this process, the RHNA provides the State's estimate for the region's housing needs across all income



groups for the upcoming eight years. SANDAG then determines how much of the region's total housing needs to be planned for and permitted by each city and county in the region. In the Housing Element, the City must identify enough potentially developable land zoned for residential use to meet the City's RHNA housing capacity target and must provide goals, objectives, policies, and programs to meet the housing needs of all San Diegans. The Housing Element also includes additional information, goals, and programs to affirmatively further fair housing.

The 2021-2029 Housing Element includes the following goals:

- 1. Facilitate the Construction of Quality Housing;
- 2. Improve the existing Housing Stock;
- 3. Provide New Affordable Housing;
- 4. Enhance Quality of Life;
- 5. Exemplify Sustainable Development and Growth; and
- 6. Publicize Housing Needs and Resources.

Each goal includes objectives and programs to assist with the implementation of the Housing Element. The City reports its progress with implementing Housing Element Programs as part of the Annual Progress Report submitted to HCD. The Housing Element includes an Adequate Sites Inventory that identifies sites zoned with the capacity to meet the RHNA housing capacity target. The Housing Element also includes an assessment of fair housing that serves as the foundation of the goals and programs intended to affirmatively further fair housing.

California Tax Credit Allocation Committee Opportunity Areas

To document efforts to affirmatively further fair housing, the City uses opportunity area maps prepared by the California Tax Credit Allocation Committee to identify which areas of the City have greater access to quality jobs, education, and fewer negative environmental impacts. The opportunity area maps are prepared by the California Tax Credit Allocation Committee using multiple data sources including socio-economic and demographic data from the U.S. Census, the State's CalEnviroScreen scores, and education metrics such as school test scores. Based on a combined score of each metric, the California Tax Credit Allocation Committee identifies each census tract in the State as either a highest, high, moderate, low, or high segregation and poverty resource opportunity area.

The California Tax Credit Allocation Committee opportunity area maps are useful for addressing fair housing because they identify which areas of the City have greater access to resources and opportunity as well as those that do not. To affirmatively further fair housing, more homes, particularly affordable homes, should be provided in highest and high opportunity areas. This should



occur simultaneously with the investment of additional resources in areas of the City with less access to opportunity.

Mobility Zones

To better connect housing, transit, and climate investments, the City adopted the Complete Communities Mobility Choices Program in December of 2020. This program includes the establishment of Mobility Zones based on relative amounts of vehicular travel. Areas with the lowest amount of relative vehicular travel are located within Mobility Zone 1, while areas with the highest amounts of relative vehicular travel are located within Mobility Zone 4.

Areas with lower vehicular travel, or vehicle miles travelled (VMT) efficient areas, are locations where investments will bring the City the greatest potential for VMT and greenhouse gas emission reductions as these areas are more accessible to both new and existing community members as well as jobs. These areas provide shorter commutes and enable greater walking, rolling, biking, and transit opportunities. Mobility Zone 1 is Downtown San Diego, while Mobility Zone 2 is the Sustainable Development Areas. The Sustainable Development Areas represents a ³/₄ or 1 mile walking distance from major transit stops. Mobility Zone 3 are areas with greater VMT efficiency per capita or for employees, and Mobility Zone 4 are areas with less VMT efficiency and more vehicular travel. By assessing where new home development occurs by Mobility Zone, the City can reduce vehicle miles traveled, increase walking, rolling, biking, and transit use, and meet the goals of the City's Climate Action Plan.

Biennial Housing Element Report

This report provides an analysis of existing housing trends in San Diego and is divided into the following four parts:

- 1. <u>Citywide Home Permit Trends</u> This section provides a general overview of home permitting trends within the City.
- <u>Affirmatively Furthering Fair Housing</u> This section assesses whether efforts to affirmatively further fair housing are demonstrated by housing development trends within California Tax Credit Allocation Committee resource areas.
- Adequate Sites Inventory Analysis
 This section reviews development occurring on sites identified in the 2021-2029 Housing
 Element's Adequate Sites Inventory.
- <u>Outreach and Engagement</u>
 This section reviews the City's ongoing outreach and engagement efforts to implement the 2021-2029 Housing Element.



1.0 - CITYWIDE HOME PERMIT TRENDS

Between 2021 and 2022, the City has issued building permits for 10,346 new homes of which 1,145 homes have been deed restricted as affordable for moderate-, low-, or very low-income households.

A. Regional Housing Needs Assessment Goals

The Housing Element includes goals, policies, and programs to assist meeting the RHNA target provided by SANDAG. The RHNA allocated 108,036 new homes for the City to permit between 2021 to 2029 in order to meet its share of the region's housing needs. Between 2021 and 2022, the City has permitted 9.5 percent of the homes allocated by the RHNA and will need to permit over 16,000 new homes annually to meet the 2029 RHNA target. The City will need to permit more than triple the number of homes it currently permits on average each year. Of all the homes permitted, almost 11 percent of the homes were deed restricted for very low-, low-, or moderate-income households. The remaining 89 percent of the homes were permitted at market rate.

Affordable home permitting is falling even further behind the City's RHNA goals. Between 2021 and 2022, a total of 1,145 very low-, low-, and moderate-income homes have been permitted, representing just 1.7 percent of the 64,199 affordable homes needed by 2029. Between 2021 and 2022, the City permitted 10,346 homes of which 9,201 were above moderate-income, as shown in Table 1. The City will need to permit another 97,690 homes, of which 60,054 will need to be very low-, low-, and moderate-income homes, to meet the City's RHNA goals.

HOUSEHOLD INCOME LEVEL (% OF AMI)	Homes Permitted In 2021 And 2022	2021-2029 RHNA Housing Goal	Additional Homes Needed to Meet RHNA Goal
Very Low (Less Than 40%)	645	27,549	26,904
Low (40 to 80%)	438	17,331	16,893
Moderate (80 to 120%)	62	19,319	19,257
Above Moderate (120+%)	9,201	43,837	34,636
Total	10,346	108,036	97,690

TABLE 1 – 2021-2022 HOMES PERMITTED AND 2021-2029 RHNA HOUSING GOALS



B. New Home Development Type

Between 2021 and 2022, most of the homes permitted within the City were multi-family homes. As shown in Table 2, 74.5 percent of the homes permitted were multi-family with 5 or more homes. During this period, 15 percent of the homes permitted were accessory dwelling unit homes (ADU homes). Almost all new homes for very low- and low-income households were in developments of 5 or more homes. Approximately, 61.3 percent of new homes for moderate-income households through the City's ADU homes. ADU homes deed restricted for moderate-income households through the City's ADU Home Density Bonus Program are required to be affordable for a minimum of 15 years. Townhome, duplex, triplex and four-plex commonly referred to as missing middle homes only made-up 3.1 percent of the total number of homes permitted between 2021 and 2022.

FOR HOMES PERMITTED BETWEEN 2021 AND 2022					
Ноте Туре	Very Low	Low	Moderate	Above Moderate	All Homes
Single-Family Detached	0.3%	0.0%	0.0%	8.6%	7.7%
Single-Family Attached (Townhome)	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.3%	0.2%
2 to 4 Units (Duplex, Triplex, Four-Plex)	0.2%	0.0%	1.6%	3.2%	2.9%
5+ Units (Multi-Family)	99.5%	100.0%	37.1%	71.8%	74.5%
ADU Homes	0.0%	0.0%	61.3%	16.1%	14.7%
TOTALS	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%

TABLE 2 – HOME AFFORDABILITY BY TYPE OR HOMES PERMITTED BETWEEN 2021 AND 2022



C. New Home Development by Mobility Zone

Between 2021 and 2022, over 84 percent of new homes permitted in the City were in Mobility Zones 1 and 2, as shown in Table 3. During this period, 96.3 percent of new homes for very low-, low-, and moderate-income households were in Mobility Zones 1 and 2 as well. Homes within Mobility Zones 1 and 2 have greater access to transit which supports the Climate Action Plan goals of increasing walking, rolling, biking, and using transit.

DETWEEN ZOZT AND ZOZZ					
Ноте Туре	Very Low	Low	Moderate	Above Moderate	All Homes
Mobility Zone 1	10.4%	10.3%	0.0%	17.1%	16.3%
Mobility Zone 2	86.2%	85.2%	100%	66.0%	68.3%
Mobility Zone 3	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.7%	0.6%
Mobility Zone 4 ¹	3.4%	4.6%	0.0%	16.2%	14.9%

TABLE 3 – HOME AFFORDABILITY BY MOBILITY ZONE FOR HOMES PERMITTED BETWEEN 2021 AND 2022

¹ Approximately 89.2% of all homes permitted in Mobility Zone 4 are located in High or Highest Resource areas.



D. Key Takeaways

Between 2021 and 2022:

- The City did not permit new homes at a rate sufficient to meet its RHNA allocations. To meet its RHNA goal of 108,036 new homes by 2029, the City will need to permit 16,000 homes annually. Additional programs and home capacity will be needed to increase the number of homes permitted to achieve the RHNA goal.
- Most permitted homes were market-rate homes for above moderate-income households.
 Additional programs will need to increase the number of homes for very low-, low-, and moderate-income households.
- Most homes permitted were multi-family developments with five or more homes. Additional
 programs will be needed to allow duplex, triplex and four-plex homes within single-family
 areas near transit to both maximize opportunities for more homes that meet the needs of San
 Diego's community members, and to affirmatively further fair housing.
- ADU homes accounted for nearly 15 percent of homes permitted in 2021 and 2022. ADU homes can play an important role in meeting the City's housing goals.
- A majority of homes permitted were located in areas with access to transit, Mobility Zones 1 and 2, which is consistent with the climate goals as set forth in the City's Climate Action Plan. Additional programs to increase the number of homes in Mobility Zones 1, 2, and 3 should be developed.



2.0 - AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHERING FAIR HOUSING

The State has adopted legislation defining fair housing and requiring cities and counties to affirmatively further fair housing in their housing elements and other planning documents. The City is committed to affirmatively furthering fair housing by developing and implementing new policies to encourage new homes of all affordability levels in all communities. This provides people with the opportunity to live in a neighborhood of their choice and replaces segregated living patterns.

This section evaluates the geographic distribution of the City's housing production, both affordable and market-rate, between 2021 and 2022 by California Tax Credit Allocation Committee Affirmatively furthering fair housing means taking meaningful actions that, taken together, address significant disparities in housing needs and in access to opportunity, replacing segregated living patterns with truly integrated and balanced living patterns, transforming racially and ethnically concentrated areas of poverty into areas of opportunity, and fostering and maintaining compliance with civil rights and fair housing laws.

California Government Code 8899.50

resource area. It also includes descriptions of both new and amended programs intended to affirmatively further fair housing.

A. California Tax Credit Allocation Committee Resource Area

Approximately 67 percent of the City is located in high and highest resource areas. High and highest resource areas represent the largest resource areas found within the City, as shown in Table 4. Only 1 percent of the City is designated as being within a high segregation and poverty resource area. The State of California updates this map annually and these areas can change based on the collection of new data. The table below is intended to provide the City of San Diego's most current designation.

BY CALIFORNIA TAX CREDIT ALLOCATION COMMITTEE RESOURCE AREA				
CTCAC Resource Area	2023			
Highest Resource	45%			
High Resource	22%			
Moderate Resource	15%			
Low Resource	16%			
High Segregation & Poverty	1%			

 TABLE 4 - PERCENT OF THE CITY

Source: 2023 California Tax Credit Allocation Committee Resource Area Map



Between 2021 and 2022, over 80 percent of the homes permitted within the City were located in moderate, high and highest resource areas as shown in Table 5. Approximately, 80.3 percent of above moderate-income market-rate homes were located in moderate, high, and highest resource areas. Just over 50 percent of very low-, low-, and moderate-income homes were located in moderate, high, or highest resource areas. As shown in Table 6, 89 percent of all homes permitted were market rate and 11 percent were deed-restrict affordable homes. Citywide, almost 20 percent of the homes permitted were located in low resource and high segregation and poverty areas. Almost half of very low-, low-, and moderate-income homes were located in low resource and high segregation and poverty areas.

DETWEEN 2021 AND 2022					
CTCAC Resource Area	Very Low	Low	Moderate ²	Above Moderate	All Homes
Highest Resource	26.8%	14.6%	0.0%	20.1%	20.1%
High Resource	30.4%	18.0%	32.3%	35.2%	34.1%
Moderate Resource	31.5%	52.1%	33.9%	25.0%	26.6%
Low Resource	11.2%	4.6%	6.5%	17.3%	16.3%
High Segregation & Poverty	0.2%	10.7%	27.4%	2.5%	2.9%
TOTALS	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%

TABLE 5 - PERMITTED HOMES BY CALIFORNIA TAX CREDIT ALLOCATION COMMITTEEOPPORTUNITY AREABETWEEN 2021 AND 2022

TABLE 6 - PERMITTED HOMES BY CALIFORNIA TAX CREDIT ALLOCATION COMMITTEE OPPORTUNITY AREA DETWIEEN 2021 AND 2022

BETWEEN 2021 AND 2022				
CTCAC Resource Area	Affordable Homes	Market-Rate Homes	All Homes	
Highest Resource	2.3%	17.8%	20.1%	
High Resource	2.9%	31.3%	34.1%	
Moderate Resource	0.9%	15.3%	26.6%	
Low Resource	4.4%	22.2%	16.3%	
High Segregation & Poverty	0.6%	2.2%	2.9%	
TOTALS	11.1%	88.9%	100.0%	

² Between 2021 and 2022, 62 permitted homes were deed restricted for moderate-income households.



B. Programs to Affirmatively Further Fair Housing

The City has adopted the following programs that aim to affirmatively further fair housing:

Sustainable Development Area (SDA): The City adopted the Sustainable Development Area in 2023 to ensure local home development incentive programs focus development in areas that have convenient access to high quality transit in alignment with the City's climate, equity and housing goals. The Sustainable Development Area uses 0.75-mile walking distance from a major transit stop as a qualifier and extends the walking distance to 1.0-mile in high and highest resource areas to further fair housing goals.

Affordable Housing in All Communities: The City adopted the Affordable Housing in All Communities program in 2022. The program allows for multi-home developments with 100 percent affordable housing to be built near major transit stops and in high and highest resource areas.

Inclusionary Housing Requirements: The City adopted Inclusionary Housing Requirements in 2020. The requirements apply to developments proposing 10 or more homes (five or more within the Coastal Zone) and to condo conversions of two or more homes. For rental developments, the requirements maintain that a minimum of 10 percent of the total rental homes be rented to very low-or low-income households. The requirements for for-sale residential developments maintain that a minimum of 10 percent of the units be affordable to median-income households or that a minimum of 15 percent of the units be affordable to moderate-income households. An in-lieu fee option is also available as an alternative form of compliance.

Density Bonus Programs: The City has adopted density bonus programs for affordable housing, senior housing, microunits, moderate-income homes, and foster youth, disabled veterans, and homelessness housing. Each of these programs provides development incentives for including deed-restricted affordable homes.

Complete Communities Housing Solutions and Mobility Choices: The adopted the Complete Communities Housing Solutions and Mobility Choices in 2020 to provide incentives to increase housing production and to improve the mobility network around existing transit and development. It removes regulatory barriers to producing housing while investing in neighborhood and mobility amenities, such as street trees, bicycle facilities, and promenades. These types of investments increase the quality of neighborhoods where new housing is proposed by creating more active, pedestrian-oriented spaces, which in turn helps the City meet its Climate Action Plan goals. Through the program, the City allows for density bonus and other development incentives in exchange for the



provision of affordable housing and neighborhood amenities. Additionally, through Mobility Choices, VMT-reducing amenities are required, with an active transportation in lieu fee in VMT-inefficient areas funding VMT reduction amenities in the City's most VMT-efficient areas, with prioritized investments in traditionally underserved communities.

Parks for All of Us and Build Better SD: In August 2021, the City adopted amendments to its General Plan Recreation Element. As part of the Parks for All of Us initiative, the amendments included a new Parks Master Plan and a new Citywide Park Development Impact Fee. Subsequently, in August of 2022, the City adopted Build Better SD, which included amendments to the General Plan Public Facilities Element and new Citywide Development Impact Fees for Mobility, Fire, and Library assets. With these initiatives, the City adopted clear policies committing to the prioritization of investments in parks, public spaces, and safe places for walking, rolling, and biking in underserved communities. In December of 2022, as an immediate follow up action to the adoption of Build Better SD, the City Council adopted comprehensive updates to its infrastructure prioritization policies to ensure that infrastructure is prioritized through the Capital Improvement Program process in areas with the greatest needs.

Housing Accessibility Program: The City adopted the Housing Accessibility Program in 2022 to encourages residential development to incorporate accessible design features to meet the needs of as many people as possible by offering incentives that facilitate accessible design. The program aims to increase the number of accessible homes in the City's housing supply.



C. Key Takeaways

Between 2021 and 2022:

- Approximately 60 percent of all homes permitted for above moderate-income households were located in high and moderate resource areas.
- Half of all permitted homes deed restricted for very low-, low-, and moderate-income households were permitted in high and highest resource areas. Additional programs are needed to increase the number of homes deed restricted for very low-, low-, and moderateincome households within high and highest resource areas, as these areas are the largest resource areas found within the City.
- 67 percent of the City is located within high and highest resource areas. The remaining 33 percent of the City is located in moderate resource, low resource, and high segregation and poverty areas. Almost half of homes permitted for very low-, low-, and moderate-income households were in moderate resource, low resource, and high segregation and poverty areas.
- The City needs to continue to permit homes for very low-, low-, and moderate-income households in high and highest resource areas to affirmatively further fair housing.
- The City has enacted new programs to affirmatively further fair housing. These programs incentivize new affordable homes in highest and high resource areas and encourage investment in areas of the City with less access to resources. Additional programs are still needed to continue to affirmatively further fair housing.



3.0 - ADEQUATE SITES INVENTORY ANALYSIS

The Housing Element identified adequate sites to meet Regional Housing Needs Assessment (RHNA) housing goals for very low-, low-, moderate-, and above moderate-income households needed to meet the RHNA target of 108,036 new homes by 2029, including 44,880 affordable new homes for lower-income households. The City can reasonably achieve these targets with its current land use plans and zoning regulations. The Adequate Sites Inventory identified sites for at least 174,678 new homes,

The 2021-2029 Housing Element Adequate Sites Inventory included sites for 174,678 homes, including 72,191 homes on sites for lowerincome homes.

Between 2021 and 2022, the City permitted 5,340 homes on adequate sites, providing 223 percent of the homes identified on those sites.

including 72,191 sites for affordable homes for lower-income households throughout the City.

A. Adequate Sites Efficiency Analysis

The Adequate Sites Efficiency is the percentage of permitted homes permitted to the number of net potential homes identified in the Adequate Sites Inventory. This compares how sites have been permitted between 2021 and 2022 with the anticipated homes identified in the adequate sites inventory. The Adequate Sites Affordable Homes Efficiency is the percent of permitted lower-income homes to the number of lower-income homes anticipated by the Adequate Sites Inventory. Both efficiencies were calculated whenever new homes were permitted on sites that were identified in the Adequate Sites Inventory.

Between 2021 and 2022, 5,340 homes were permitted on sites identified in the Adequate Sites Inventory, as shown in Table 7. This represents approximately 52 percent of the total homes permitted between 2021 and 2022. The percentage of permitted homes to net potential homes was 223 percent, indicating that 123 percent more homes were permitted on sites than anticipated in the adequate sites inventory.

TABLE 7 – SUMMARY OF HOMES PERMITTED ON SITES IN THE ADEQUATE SITES INVENTORY BETWEEN 2021 AND 2022

Homes Permitted on Sites in the Adequate Sites Inventory	Percent Share of Total Citywide Permitted Homes	Net Potential Homes in Adequate Sites Inventory	Percent Permitted Homes to Net Potential Homes
5,340	51.6%	2,391	223.3%



Between 2021 and 2022, the number of homes permitted in moderate, low, and very low resource areas exceeded the development anticipated in the Adequate Sites Inventory, as shown in Table 8. The mean Adequate Sites Efficiency was 208 percent for high segregation and poverty areas, 183 percent for low resource areas, and 243 percent for moderate resource areas. High and highest resource areas also exceeded expected home development. The Adequate Site Efficiency for high resource areas was 304 percent, the highest among all resource areas, and 106 percent for highest resource areas.

Net Potential				
CTCAC Resource Area	Homes Permitted on Adequate Sites	Homes in Adequate Sites Inventory	Mean Adequate Sites Efficiency	
Highest Resource	130	113	106.0%	
High Resource	2,420	1,174	303.6%	
Moderate Resource	1,142	459	242.5%	
Low Resource	1,521	593	183.3%	
High Segregation & Poverty	127	52	208.0%	
Total	5,340	2,391	240.5%	

TABLE 8 - PERMITTED HOMES ON ADEQUATE SITES INVENTORY AND EFFICIENCY BY CALIFORNIA TAX CREDIT ALLOCATION COMMITTEE RESOURCE AREA

Between 2021 and 2022, most of the permitted homes in the Adequate Sites Inventory were in Mobility Zones 1 and 2, areas prioritized by housing programs that feature higher density and floor area ratio bonuses, as show in in Table 9. Mobility Zone 1 had a mean Adequate Sites Efficiency of almost 500 percent, while Mobility Zone 2 had a mean efficiency of nearly 250 percent. Mobility Zones 3 and 4 were not as efficient.

TABLE 9 - PERMITTED HOMES ON ADEQUATE SITES AND EFFICIENCY BY MOBILITY ZONEBETWEEN 2021 AND 2022

Mobility Zone	Homes Permitted on Adequate Sites	Net Potential Homes in Adequate Sites Inventory	Mean Adequate Sites Efficiency
Mobility Zone 1	1,233	309	487.9%
Mobility Zone 2	3,636	1,635	250.1%
Mobility Zone 3	5	8	62.5%
Mobility Zone 4	466	439	61.2%
Total	5,340	2,391	240.5%



B. Non-Vacant Sites Analysis

Between 2021 and 2022, over 67 percent of homes permitted were on non-vacant sites as identified in the Adequate Sites Inventory. Approximately 32.8 percent of homes permitted were located on vacant land, including vacant land located within a Community Planning Area (CPA) where a community plan amendment was in progress, as shown on Table 10. Non-vacant sites had an Adequate Site Efficiency of 264 percent and an Affordable Efficiency of 148 percent.

	Porcont Of	Moon Adoquato Sitos	Moon Adaguata Site		
BETWEEN 2021 AND 2022					
TABLE	10 – PERMITTED HOMES A	AND EFFICIENCY BY VACANT A	NON-VACANT SITES		

Sites Category	Percent Of Permitted Homes	Mean Adequate Sites Efficiency	Mean Adequate Sites Affordable Efficiency
Non-Vacant	67.2%	263.8%	147.6%
Vacant	17.6%	155.9%	445.1%
Vacant (CPA In Progress)	15.2%	63.2%	84.4%

Most issued new home permits on sites identified as non-vacant in the Adequate Sites Inventory were in Mobility Zones 1 and 2. When combined, homes in Mobility Zones 1 and 2 account for 99 percent of all non-vacant sites, as shown in Table 11. High Adequate Sites Efficiency scores indicate that the permits issued on non-vacant sites identified within the Adequate Sites Inventory were in transit-rich areas which accounted for a majority of both market-rate and affordable homes.

TABLE 11 - PERMITTED HOMES AND EFFICIENCY OF NON-VACANT SITES BY MOBILITY ZONEBETWEEN 2021 AND 2022

Mobility Zone	Percent of Total Permitted Homes	Mean Adequate Sites Efficiency	Mean Adequate Sites Affordable Efficiency
Mobility Zone 1	34.4%	487.9%	518.3%
Mobility Zone 2	64.9%	268.3%	106.5%
Mobility Zone 3	0.1%	62.5%	0%
Mobility Zone 4	0.6%	45.0%	23.4%
Total	100.0%	263.8%	147.6%



C. Key Takeaways

Between 2021 and 2022:

- Almost 52 percent of homes permitted were on sites identified in the Adequate Sites Inventory and the City should continue to update community plans and zoning to increase capacity for additional sites to meet the City's housing goals.
- Approximately 123 percent more homes were permitted than were identified on sites in the Adequate Sites Inventory and all resource areas permitted more homes than the Adequate Sites Inventory identified.
- Approximately 91 percent of the homes that were identified on sites in the Adequate Sites Inventory were within Mobility Zones 1 and 2, which assists in meeting the City's Climate Action Plan goals. Approximately 99 percent of homes permitted on sites identified as non-vacant were also within Mobility Zone 1 or Mobility Zone 2.
- The Adequate Site Efficiency for non-vacant sites within Mobility Zone 1 was 488 percent. Downtown plays an important role in meeting the City's housing goals.
- The Adequate Site Efficiency for non-vacant sites near Mobility Zone 2 was 268.3 percent.
 Sites near major transit stops play an important role in meeting the City's housing goals.
 Additional programs should be considered to increase the amount of housing within walking distance of a major transit stop.
- The Adequate Site Efficiency was 304 percent for high resource areas and 106 percent for highest resource areas. The City will need to continue to identify incentives and amendments to further increase the number of permitted homes within high and highest resource areas.



4.0 – OUTREACH AND ENGAGEMENT

The City employs robust outreach and engagement that is centered upon fostering meaningful public dialogue and amplifying the voices of marginalized community members.

To implement the Housing Element, the City has engaged in several different types of outreach events. Almost all outreach events that implemented housing goals solicited community feedback on issues pertaining to fair housing. Planning efforts by the City often encompass more than one Housing Element Goal. The analysis of community outreach and engagement The City hosted **158 housing related outreach and engagement events** between 2021 and 2022, with a total of **6,151 participants** across all events.

The City's Build Better SD engagement efforts received an **award of excellence** for Public Outreach by the California Chapter of the American Planning Association.

reviews each Housing Element Goal and reviews what types of engagement were used for that goal.

Many of these outreach efforts touched on different Housing Element Goals, and there is considerable overlap between efforts. The City utilizes community plan updates to increase the capacity for affordable homes, improve access to parks and quality of life, and to promote the preservation and improvement of existing housing stock. Between 2021 and 2022, community meetings, public hearings and workshops for a single, specific, community plan update included issues pertaining to multiple Housing Element Goals. Multiple goals will share outreach event types in the analysis.

The City has received recognition by local and state planning organizations for innovative public outreach and engagement. The City was awarded the 2023 Award of Excellence for Public Outreach by the California Chapter of the American Planning Association for the program Build Better SD. Build Better SD is a citywide initiative to create a more effective and equitable development impact fee funding system for public facilities.

A. Housing Element Outreach

The City hosted a total of 158 outreach engagement events in 2021 and 2022, with a total of 6,155 participants across all events. The City utilized various outreach methods to engage the City's broad demographic, including community meetings, public comment periods, public hearings, surveys, stakeholder trainings, workshops, and other engagements. Each engagement event directly corresponded to one of the six Housing Element Goals as outlined in the Housing Element. The events provided participants an opportunity to learn or provide feedback on programs designed to meet one



or more of the six Housing Element Goals. The percentage of outreach by type for each housing element goal are shown in Table 12.

Across all engagement events conducted, surveys garnered the most participants, with a total of 5,141 respondents. Community meetings, which included community planning groups, community plan update subcommittees, and other subcommittees were the most common form of engagement conducted between 2021 and 2022. Over a period of two years, the City averaged almost six outreach events a month. City staff met with community members and local volunteer planning boards almost five times a month to discuss and solicit feedback on the implementation of the 2021-2029 Housing Element and fair housing issues. Although demographic data was not collected for these outreach events, the City is working to implement a new Inclusive Public Engagement Guide program to significantly improve the City's capabilities of reaching more diverse populations, increase turnout for events, and ensure that community input received is reflective of the City's population.

TABLE 12 - PERCENTAGE OF OUTREACH BY TYPE FOR EACH HOUSING ELEMENT GOAL						
Outreach Type	Goal 1	Goal 2	Goal 3	Goal 4	Goal 5	Goal 6
Community Meeting	47.4%	40.7%	41.9%	41.9%	48.1%	40.9%
Printed Materials	7.9%	5.1%	4.8%	4.8%	1.9%	6.8%
Public Comment	28.9%	16.9%	17.7%	17.7%	20.4%	25%
Public Hearing	7.9%	13.6%	12.9%	12.9%	14.8%	6.8%
Survey	0%	10.2%	9.7%	9.7%	1.9%	11.4%
Training	7.9%	13.6%	12.9%	12.9%	13.0%	9.1%
Workshop	7.9%	13.6%	12.9%	12.9%	13.0%	9.1%

TABLE 12 – PERCENTAGE OF OUTREACH BY TYPE FOR EACH HOUSING ELEMENT GOAL



B. Housing Element Goal 1

Housing Element Goal 1 is to facilitate the construction of quality housing. The City hosted 118 engagement events to address Housing Element Goal 1. Most of these engagement events were community meetings. The Hillcrest Focused Community Plan Amendment was one of the many programs for which engagement events were held that directly corresponded with Housing Element Goal 1.

The Hillcrest Focused Community Plan Amendment provided community members of the Hillcrest area an opportunity to provide feedback on the upcoming community plan update through the participation of an online survey that was available from March through April of 2022. This survey was promoted at community planning group meetings, tabling events, social media, and emailing lists. It focused on identifying community



priorities and recommendations for future housing needs, mobility options, parks, and public spaces within the planning area. 931 participants provided responses to the survey and the responses emphasized a need for additional affordable housing. As a result, the upcoming Hillcrest Focused Community Plan Amendment anticipates adding 19,000 more housing units in the Hillcrest area.

C. Housing Element Goal 2

Housing Element Goal 2 is to improve the existing housing stock. The City hosted 126 engagement events to address Housing Element Goal 2. These events included stakeholder trainings for fair housing during which housing providers, tenants, and award recipients of voucher programs were instructed on fair housing laws and tenants' rights. Approximately 10 stakeholder training events were hosted between 2021 and 2022, including monthly webinars, in-person workshops, and training sessions. Between 2021 and 2022, there were approximately 280 participants across all engagement events.

D. Housing Element Goal 3

Housing Element Goal 3 is to provide new affordable housing. The City hosted 128 engagement events to address Housing Element Goal 3, which included Housing Action Package 1.0. In February of 2022, Housing Action Package 1.0 included legislative amendments to the City's Land Development Code to implement state law related to housing development, encourage the development of affordable homes for San Diegans of all income levels, and affirmatively further fair housing. To provide



information and engagement opportunities with regard to the Housing Action Package, the City hosted a total of 8 outreach events that included two virtual workshops in August 2021, presented the proposal at the Community Planners Committee, utilized an online survey in August 2021 to receive the public's feedback, and received public comment from August 2021 until the legislation's adoption. The City also presented the Housing Action Package to the Planning Commission in December of 2021, the Land Use and Housing Committee in January 2022, and City Council in February 2022 when the Housing Action Package was adopted.

E. Housing Element Goal 4

Housing Element Goal 4 is to enhance the quality of life. The City hosted 150 engagement events to address Housing Element Goal 4. Notable engagement efforts included the Build Better SD initiative for which 10 engagement events were held in 2022. Build Better SD is an initiative to support the City of San Diego's equity, access, conservation, and sustainability goals by setting clear policies intended



to create more opportunities for public spaces in areas where needs are the greatest. In 2022, the City hosted several outreach events to engage on Build Better SD, which included a virtual workshop in March of 2022 and 9 outreach events at three high schools, the Ocean Discovery Institute, and two libraries. Participants at these events had the opportunity to learn about public spaces and provide input regarding equitable planning for public spaces in the City.

F. Housing Element Goal 5

Housing Element Goal 5 is to exemplify sustainable development and growth. The City hosted 140 engagement events in 2021 and 2022 to address Housing Element Goal 5, including engagement events for Climate Resilient SD, the City's comprehensive plan to prepare for and respond to climate change hazards. Several virtual workshops, online surveys, and in-person events were held for this program in 2021, with approximately 1,120 participants actively engaged or responding. These outreach methods were designed to both provide information on the Climate Resilient SD program, as well as receive input from the public about which climate and sustainability issues they would most like to see addressed by the City.



G. Housing Element Goal 6

Housing Element Goal 6 is to publicize housing needs and resources. 128 of the engagement events hosted by the City between 2021 and 2022 addressed Housing Element Goal 6. The most notable engagement conducted for programs related to Housing Element Goal 6 were stakeholder trainings for fair housing in which



housing providers, tenants, and award recipients of voucher programs were trained on fair housing law and tenants' rights. Approximately ten engagement events were hosted between 2021 and 2022, including monthly webinars, in-person workshops, and training sessions. Between 2021 and 2022, there were approximately 280 participants across all engagement events.

I. Key Takeaways

Between 2021 and 2022:

- The City hosted a variety of planning related outreach and engagement events to support the 2021-2029 Housing Element Goals.
- The City conducted a total of 158 outreach and engagement events.
- Engagement efforts supported a variety of projects including community plan updates, the development of new housing programs, and Build Better SD, which addresses the efficient and equitable delivery of infrastructure.
- The City reached a total of 6,155 participants through all outreach events.
- Feedback was received by the public on programs intended to meet one or more of the six Housing Element Goals, including 5,141 responses from surveys.
- The City received the 2023 Award of Excellence for Public Outreach by the California Chapter of the American Planning Association.



SUMMARY

The Biennial Housing Element Report provides information on the City's progress toward affirmatively furthering fair housing through both home permitting and the implementation of housing programs. It also compares home permitting with the Housing Element's Adequate Sites Inventory. Finally, the Biennial Housing Element Report provides an overview of the City's outreach and engagement efforts in 2021 and 2022 as related to the 2021-2029 Housing Element. The following summary details the key findings of the Biennial Housing Element Report as well as informed next steps to be taken by the City of San Diego:

Fair Housing

Key Takeaway

• High and highest resource areas compose 67 percent of the City. Almost 50 percent of homes permitted for very low-, low-, and moderate-income households were in moderate resource, low resource, and high segregation and poverty areas.

Next Steps

- Create programs to increase the number of homes permitted for very low-, low-, and moderate-income households in high and highest resource areas to affirmatively further fair housing.
- Continue to prioritize investments in areas with the greatest needs and improve access to resources in existing moderate resource, low resource, and high segregation and poverty areas.

Adequate Sites Inventory

Key Takeaway

• The City will need to permit an average of 16,000 homes annually to meet its RHNA target of 108,036 permitted homes by 2029. Additional programs and home capacity will be needed to increase the number of homes permitted to meet the RHNA target.

Next Steps

• Update community plans to increase capacity for additional sites to meet the City's housing goals.



- Create additional programs to increase the number of homes for very low-, low-, and moderate-income households.
- Create programs to allow additional duplex, triplex, and four-plex homes within single-family areas near transit.
- Create programs to increase the amount of housing within walking distance to a major transit stop.
- Create programs to increase the amount of housing within Downtown.
- Create programs to increase the number of ADU homes.
- Work with other agencies, community-based organizations, and the private sector to identify additional opportunities to overcome barriers to the production of new homes.

Outreach and Engagement

Key Takeaway

• The City conducted a total of 158 planning-related outreach and engagement events, engaged approximately 6,155 participants, and received around 5,141 responses from surveys that addressed one or more of the Housing Element Goals.

Next Steps

• Continue to conduct outreach activities for planning-related programs that address Housing Element Goals.

Attachments

1. September 10, 2021 Letter from HCD