

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

MEMORANDUM

DATE: November 14, 2023

TO: Historical Resources Board and Interested Parties

FROM: Shannon Anthony, Senior Planner, Heritage Preservation, City Planning Department

SUBJECT: ITEM 2 - 7236 Country Club Drive

The applicant for the property located at 7236 Country Club Drive has submitted an Addendum dated November 14, 2023, to provide an updated description of modifications to the property to address the errors and omissions from the Historical Resource Research Report (HRRR), which were then carried over to the Staff Report. The addendum provides further clarification that the only modifications to the north and northwest facades are the removal of the door and stairs on the first floor of the north façade.

Staff recognizes and agrees with the updated description of modifications to the north and northwest facades; however, staff still finds that the remaining modifications, including the enclosure of the second-story sleeping porch, new windows added to the primary façade, and the addition of modern pavers to the front porch and driveway, have significantly impaired the building's integrity of design, materials, workmanship and feeling. Staff continues to not recommend designation of the subject property located at 7236 Country Club Drive under any HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.

Shannon Anthony Senior Planner

SA/ss

Attachments:

1. Applicant's Addendum dated November 14, 2023

HISTORICAL RESOURCE RESEARCH REPORT ADDENDUM FOR THE EVELYN AND FREDERICK WALTER/HERBERT J. MANN AND THOMAS L. SHEPHERD HOUSE

7236 COUNTRY CLUB DRIVE LA JOLLA, CALIFORNIA 92037

Project No. 701653

Submitted to:

City of San Diego Development Services Department 1222 First Avenue, MS 301 San Diego, California 92101

Prepared for:

Christopher Huber and Kim Fanelii 7236 Country Club Drive La Jolla, California 92037

Prepared by:

BFSA Environmental Services, a Perennial Company 14010 Poway Road, Suite A Poway, California 92064

November 14, 2023



State of California — The Resources Agency DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION CONTINUATION SHEET

Primary # HRI # Trinomial

Page 1 of 1

*Resource Name or #: 7236 Country Club Drive

*Recorded by: BFSA Environmental Services, a Perennial Company *Date: 11/14/23 ■ Continuation □ Update

In October 2023, BFSA Environmental Services, a Perennial Company, submitted a revised Historical Resource Research Report (HRRR) for 7236 Country Club Drive to the City of San Diego in conjunction with a Single Discipline Preliminary Review application. The 7236 Country Club Drive building was constructed in 1928 as a Spanish Revival-style residence designed by City of San Diego-designated Master Architects Thomas L. Shepherd and Herbert J. Mann for Evelyn and Frederick Walter. The building was one of the first two buildings constructed in the La Jolla Country Club Heights subdivision and one of the few buildings in La Jolla designed by both Mann and Shepherd during their short partnership between 1927 and 1932. BFSA concluded the property exhibits all five character-defining features of the Spanish Revival style, as provided by McAlester (2015), and retains integrity of location, design, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association. Therefore, the residence qualifies for designation under City of San Diego Historical Resources Board (HRB) criteria A, C, and D.

After submittal of the document to the City, errors and omissions in the HRRR were noted that this addendum serves to correct.

The HRRR states stairs were added to the northwest terrace. Upon review of Sheet 5 of the original plans, it appears the stairs are original and no modification occurred at this location.

The HRRR also states a second-floor balcony and door on the north façade were removed. Sheet 5 of the original plans shows the north façade was designed with a window at the second floor and a door with stairs at the first floor. The window is still intact and the door was either removed at an unknown date or never executed despite appearing on the plans. No historic photographs or physical evidence on the building could be located indicating the door was ever built and/or removed.

For ease of review, a revised Site Plan With Footprint, Sheet 5 of the original plans, and a photograph of the north façade have been included as attachments to this addendum.

In addition, the HRRR failed to include any evidence as to why the building is considered a notable example of Mann and Shepherd's work. Other designated properties designed by both Mann and Shepherd include the Ada Black/Herbert Mann and Thomas Shepherd House (7781 Hillside Drive), the Lester Palmer/Herbert Mann-Thomas Shepherd House (6751 Muirlands Drive), the Philip Barber/Herbert Mann and Thomas Shepherd Spec House No. 1 (359 Sea Lane), and the Henry and Mary Turner/Herbert Mann-Thomas Shepherd House (391 Via del Norte). All of these residences were built between 1927 and 1928 and three of the four were designed in the Spanish Revival/Eclectic style. The Philip Barber/Herbert Mann and Thomas Shepherd Spec House No. 1 was designed in the Tudor style. Of the Spanish Revival/Eclectic buildings designed by Mann and Shepherd, all three buildings feature multiple low-pitched, gabled roof planes covered in red tile roofing, minimal eave overhangs, arched front entryways with heavy wood panel doors, balconies or balconettes with wrought iron railings, asymmetrical façades, smooth stucco, decorative chimneys, decorative window grilles, and irregular footprints consisting of multiple wings. The 7236 Country Club Drive residence exhibits the same noteworthy features as all three Mann and Shepherd-designed Spanish Revival/Eclectic residences discussed above.

Based upon this updated information, the 7236 Country Club Drive building still retains all original character-defining features of the Spanish Revival style and all original noteworthy design features it also shares with other Mann and Thomas designs. Therefore, BFSA continues to recommend the 7236 Country Club Drive building as eligible for designation under City of San Diego HRB criteria A, C, and D.

References

McAlester, Virginia Savage

A Field Guide to American Houses (Revised): The Definitive Guide to Identifying and Understanding America's Domestic Architecture. Alfred A. Knopf, New York.

DPR 523L (1/95) *Required information

APPENDIX A

Original Plans, Sheet 5



APPENDIX B

Site Plan With Footprint





Site Plan With Footprint

7236 Country Club Drive

APPENDIX C

Photographs





A Perennial Company

es

Plate 1
North Façade of the Central Block, Facing Southwest

7236 Country Club Drive



Henry and May Turner / Herbert Mann-Thomas Shepherd House



Lester Palmer / Herbert Mann-Thomas Shepherd House



Ada Black / Herbert Mann and Thomas Shepherd House



7236 Country Club Drive



Plate 2

Thomas Shepherd and Herbert Mann Residences Featuring Multiple, Low-Pitched Roof Planes Covered in Red Tile Roofing, Minimal Eave Overhangs, and Asymmetrical Façades

BFSA Environmental Services

A Perennial Company

7236 Country Club Drive