

HRB Meeting of January 25, 2024							
First Name	Last Name	Meeting Date	Agenda Item Number	Position	I would like to speak on the item during public testimony.	Comments	Attachments
Non-Agenda Comment							
Charles	Kaminski	1/25/2024	Non-Agenda Comment			How does Development Services/City Planning and the HRB track and monitor the required mitigation measures due to the demolition or other significant modifications of the City's designated historic resources ? is there a master list available for the public that indicates the resource and the mitigation measures required and if implemented? is there follow up to verify that the measures are still viable, in place and accessible if required?	
Charles	Kaminski	1/25/2024	<p>The staff to the HRB should schedule a working session for the HRB and public to inform them about the City Initiative "Preservation and Progress" . The web site certainly must have been in the development quite a lengthy time and the HRB and public should have been kept informed. I am concerned about some of the statements on the web site and in the January 18 2024 news release by the Mayor on the initiative that lack detailed back up and facts. Comments such as: "Our current regulations and processes therefore result in significant time and money invested in identifying what is not important rather than what is important and worthy of protection. It focuses on looking at things that may be old but that, in most instances, are not historically significant. This results in uncertainty and inefficiency for property owners and the public." and "The reactive nature of the Heritage Preservation Program also unnecessarily burdens projects on properties that do not have historical importance or value through added review requirements, processing times and uncertainties. Additionally, adaptive reuse and expansion of historic properties can be hindered by requirements that lack clarity for developers. The City continues to suffer from a lack of supply of homes affordable to people of all incomes, and more certainty is needed to allow for the building of more homes to combat this crisis. The Mayor’s Middle-Income Housing Working Group also identified these issues as a challenge for the development of new middle-income housing in San Diego." and "Evaluate the Mills Act program to ensure the program is equitable and incentivizes the protection and restoration of important places in a fiscally responsible manner." and "Adopt design standards for historical properties and districts to provide clear, objective requirements and by-right approval for additions and new development." The primary driver for this initiative appears to be "housing" and yet our City's focus on "climate change" appears nowhere. If one is to consider historic preservation, adaptive reuse, housing and equity, one must take into account the impact of climate change and the benefits of historic preservation. During a workshop to the HRB and public, staff should provide the facts demonstrating validity to these comments.</p>				<a href="https://www.sandiego.gov/system/files/webform/webform_994112/12976/2024-1-18%20Preservation%20and%20Progress%20Launch.pdf">https://www.sandiego.gov/system/files/webform/webform_994112/12976/2024-1-18%20Preservation%20and%20Progress%20Launch.pdf</a>  <a href="https://www.sandiego.gov/planning/work/historic-preservation-planning/preservation-and-progress">https://www.sandiego.gov/planning/work/historic-preservation-planning/preservation-and-progress</a>

ITEM 1							
Clint	Daniels	1/18/2024	1	In Opposition to Item	No	This property should not be designated historic. The historic designation process is broken, and this property is one of many that continues to be designated and accrue the benefits of designation (e.g., Mills Act) in the wealthiest San Diego neighborhoods.	
ITEM 2							
Clint	Daniels	1/18/2024	2	In Opposition to Item	No	This property should not be designated historic without consideration of other city priorities and needs. This property is within one block of an elementary school, along a major bike facility, and within three blocks of a high priority transit stop. Any consideration of historic designation of a single-family home in this type of educational-rich and transportation-rich environment should be considered in the context of the city's housing, transportation, and climate goals.	
ITEM 3							
Clint	Daniels	1/18/2024	3	In Opposition to Item	No	This property highlights the arbitrary nature by which modifications are considered as in-kind or detracting. Last fall, a change to the materials on a front porch in Bankers Hill was considered too egregious to warrant designation by staff, but today's item includes a similar porch change that does not detract from the property according to staff. The demolition was not even done to Interior standards. The report states, "The demolition of the original concrete stairs leading to the porch and the construction of new concrete stairs with an enlarged landing is not consistent with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards." If standards don't matter, then there are no standards.	

ITEM 4							
Diana	Meier	1/25/2024	4	In Support of Item		<p>I urge the Historical Resources Board to recommend Talmadge Park Estates Historic District to be nominated for the National Register. Talmadge Park Estates Historic District is a unique and special place in San Diego that embodies the era in which the housing was built. The majority of homes have not changed their exterior appearance and are maintained in a way that honors the history of the time when San Diego and Talmadge Park Estates in particular was on the forefront of the pre World War II economic era. Many of the houses were constructed near the end of the depression when the FHA was instrumental in encouraging the construction of single family homes of moderate size and affordability to working class families. Many of those same houses were financed through the efforts of the Federal Housing Authority which made a huge difference in the building of homes in the United States. It is important to preserve the neighborhoods that encompass the Talmadge Park Estates for posterity and history. The neighborhoods and families that reside here are diverse and are passionate about keeping the area historical in order to preserve a time in San Diego and in our country that valued the working person, dedication to the values upheld by being an American, and to the safety and security of a neighborhood that was and continues to be welcoming to all.</p>	
Jaclyn	Hermann	1/25/2024	4	In Support of Item	No	<p>Please support the below:  Recommend to the California State Office of Historic Preservation the listing of the Talmadge Park Estates Historic District with a period of significance of 1926-1951 at a local level of significance under National Register Criteria A and C, with proposed amendments to the discussion of the district boundary as specified in the Analysis section of the staff report, and a caveat that the proposed classifications of contributing and non- contributing resources has not been confirmed due to the limited time allotted for City review and the limited property-specific information and documentation required for National Register nominations.</p>	

Charles	Kaminski	1/25/2024	4	In Support of Item	Yes	As a resident of the proposed historic district with a contributing resource and as the co-author of the report for the designation in 2000 of the Talmadge Gates Historic District #422, I support the staff recommendation to the Historic Resources Board (HRB) that the HRB recommend to the California State Office of Historic Preservation the listing of the Talmadge Park Estates Historic District with a period of significance of 1926-1951 at a local level of significance under National Register Criteria A and C.	<a href="https://www.sandiego.gov/system/files/webform/webform_994112/12962/%20Talmadge%20Park%20District%20HRB%20January%2025%202024.pdf">https://www.sandiego.gov/system/files/webform/webform_994112/12962/%20Talmadge%20Park%20District%20HRB%20January%2025%202024.pdf</a>
David	Wagner	1/25/2024	4	In Support of Item	No	I support the National Register Nomination for Talmadge Park Estate Historic District as written by State Historic Preservation staff. Because National Registration nominations can always be amended once listed on the National Register, I ask that the city staff's recommended amendments be left off the nomination.	
Jeffrey	Oliver	1/25/2024	4	In Support of Item	No	I support the National Register Nomination for Talmadge Park Estate Historic District as written by State Historic Preservation staff. Because National Registration nominations can always be amended once listed on the National Register, I ask that the city staff's recommended amendments be left off the nomination.  Please see my attached letter of support that was recently sent to the State Historic Resource Commissioners.	<a href="https://www.sandiego.gov/system/files/webform/webform_994112/13264/RE_%20National%20Register%20of%20Historic%20Places%20Nomination%20for%20Talmadge%20Park%20Estates%20Historic%20District.pdf">https://www.sandiego.gov/system/files/webform/webform_994112/13264/RE_%20National%20Register%20of%20Historic%20Places%20Nomination%20for%20Talmadge%20Park%20Estates%20Historic%20District.pdf</a>
Mark	Gusmann	1/25/2024	4	In Support of Item	No	I support the National Register Nomination for Talmadge Park Estate Historic District as written by State Historic Preservation staff. Because National Registration nominations can always be amended once listed on the National Register, I ask that the city staff's recommended amendments be left off the nomination.  Please see my attached letter of support that was recently sent to the State Historic Resource Commissioners.	<a href="https://www.sandiego.gov/system/files/webform/webform_994112/13273/Gusmann%20Support%20Letter.pdf">https://www.sandiego.gov/system/files/webform/webform_994112/13273/Gusmann%20Support%20Letter.pdf</a>

Jan	Taylor	1/25/2024	4	In Support of Item	No	<p>Re: National Register of Historic Places Nomination for Talmadge Park Estates Historic District I oppose the amendments requested at this time as they can be changed if needed at a later time. I support the nomination of Talmadge Park Estates Historic District to be listed on the National Register of Historic Places. There are numerous reasons for wanting this prestigious designation. The following are most important to me: Dating back to the 1920s, silent screen actresses, Natalie, Norma and Constance Talmadge inspired our neighborhood. Over 70% of existing homes maintain their original character and charm. Many of the homes were designed by Master Architects and built by Master Builders. Every home is unique, unlike many of San Diego's "cookie cutter" tract homes. It's important to preserve and protect historic communities so future generations may have an understanding of how their pre-WWII ancestors lived. It's also important to preserve Talmadge's unique Great Depression era architecture. Talmadge is a walkable neighborhood that truly embodies the vibe of slower paced, simpler time. I think we not only owe the architects, builders and craftsmen the recognition and respect for our well built, well designed, homes and neighborhood; we also owe future generations the opportunity to live in a neighborhood from a bygone time. Thankfully, this commission exists to protect our historic communities. Please vote "yes" on this pending nomination. Best regards, Jan Taylor ~ Talmadge Resident</p>	
Jan	Taylor	1/25/2024	4	In Support of Item	No	<p>I support the National Register Nomination for Talmadge Park Estate Historic District as written by State Historic Preservation staff. Because National Registration nominations can always be amended once listed on the National Register, I ask that the city staff's recommended amendments be left off the nomination.</p>	
Ashley	Herrin	1/25/2024	4	In Support of Item	No	<p>I support the National Register Nomination for Talmadge Park Estate Historic District as written by State Historic Preservation staff. Because National Registration nominations can always be amended once listed on the National Register, I ask that the city staff's recommended amendments be left off the nomination. Please see my attached letter of support that was recently sent to the State Historic Resource Commissioners.</p>	<p><a href="https://www.sandiego.gov/system/files/webform/webform_994112/13327/Talmdge%20neighbors.pdf">https://www.sandiego.gov/system/files/webform/webform_994112/13327/Talmdge%20neighbors.pdf</a></p>

Ramona	Najimy	1/25/2024	4	In Support of Item	No	I support the National Register Nomination for Talmadge Park Estate Historic District as written by State Historic Preservation staff. Because National Registration nominations can always be amended once listed on the National Register, I ask that the city staff's recommended amendments be left off the nomination.	
David	Roth	1/25/2024	Item #4 - Talmadge Park Estates Historic District National Register Nomination	In Support of Item	No	Historic Kensington San Diego, a community organization dedicated to the preservation of San Diego's historic resources, restates its support of the nomination of Talmadge Park Estates Historic District to be listed on the National Register as submitted to the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO), without City of San Diego staff amendments. Although future research could lead to amendments to any Nationally listed Historic District, the nomination itself is not the format to call for future research. See the attached Historic Kensington letter to the California Historic Preservation Office.	<a href="https://www.sandiego.gov/system/files/webform/webform_994112/13396/Talmadge%20NHD%20Support%20Letter.pdf">https://www.sandiego.gov/system/files/webform/webform_994112/13396/Talmadge%20NHD%20Support%20Letter.pdf</a>
Cameron	Lindsay-Hewett	1/25/2024	4	In Support of Item	No	I support the National Register Nomination for Talmadge Park Estate Historic District as written by State Historic Preservation staff. Because National Registration nominations can always be amended once listed on the National Register, I ask that the city staff's recommended amendments be left off the nomination. <input type="checkbox"/> Please see my attached letter of support that was recently sent to the State Historic Resource Commissioners.	<a href="https://www.sandiego.gov/system/files/webform/webform_994112/13469/January%2010.pdf">https://www.sandiego.gov/system/files/webform/webform_994112/13469/January%2010.pdf</a>
Richard	Burritt	1/24/2024	4	In Support of Item	No	Talmadge Estates is a unique neighborhood that defines the character and charm of San Diego. A historic neighborhood designation would allow for its preservation and an opportunity for more thoughtful approaches to future development. I support the National Register Nomination for Talmadge Park Estate Historic District as written by State Historic Preservation staff. Because National Registration nominations can always be amended once listed on the National Register, I ask that the city staff's recommended amendments be left off the nomination.	

David	Swarens	1/25/2024	4 Talmadge	In Support of Item	No	<p>I am writing to support the nomination of the Talmadge Park Estates Historic District for listing on the National Register of Historic Places.</p> <p>The district is made up of a distinctive collection of architecture characteristic of this period of San Diego's development, including traditional and revival styles, as well as moderne and other progressive designs.</p> <p>And the distinctive infrastructure is widely recognized, especially the landmark ornamental gates, as well as original streetlights and hardscape features. The lighting and gates are not only intact, but they have been professionally restored in recent years to top notch condition.</p> <p>As the owner (and resident) of residential properties in two other local historic districts, I know first hand the benefits of historic designation in community revitalization and in attracting reinvestment, and most importantly its importance in acknowledging the significance of the historic and cultural resource.</p> <p>The Talmadge Park Estates district meets multiple criteria, and is clearly deserving of recognition by being listed on the National Register.</p> <p>Thanks for accepting my input on this important consideration. Yours, David Swarens. South Park Historic District (resident and property owner), Sherman Heights Historic District (property owner)</p>	
Allen	Hazard	1/25/2024	4	In Support of Item	No	<p>I enthusiastically support the nomination of Talmadge Parks Estate National Historic District to the California State Office of Historic Preservation. Having researched and submitted the Mission Hills Historic District with others 10 years ago, I recognize the dedication and hard work it takes. Having lived near Talmadge during my college years in the early 1980s, I have long admired the importance of the area's historic homes and unique identity to San Diego early to mid century architecture. This is an important neighborhood that deserves National Register status. Please support staff recommendation today</p>	

Annalisa	Berta	1/25/2024	4	In Support of Item	No	<p>I support the National Register Nomination for Talmadge Park Estate Historic District as written by State Historic Preservation staff. Because National Registration nominations can always be amended once listed on the National Register, I ask that the city staff’s recommended amendments be left off the nomination.</p> <p>Please see my attached letter of support that was recently sent to the State Historic Resource Commissioners.</p>	<a href="https://www.sandiego.gov/system/files/webform/webform_994112/13533/Letter%20Historical%20Preservation.pdf">https://www.sandiego.gov/system/files/webform/webform_994112/13533/Letter%20Historical%20Preservation.pdf</a>
Katy	Rose	1/25/2024	4	In Support of Item	No	<p>I support the National Register Nomination for Talmadge Park Estate Historic District as written by State Historic Preservation staff. Because National Registration nominations can always be amended once listed on the National Register, I ask that the city staff’s recommended amendments be left off the nomination.□</p>	
Clint	Daniels	1/18/2024	4	In Opposition to Item	No	<p>If staff cannot do the homework to confirm the adequacy of the applicants report, this item should not be before you today. The staff report says city staff has not done its homework to figure out which properties in Talmadge even warrant inclusion in the district, stating, “a caveat that the proposed classifications of contributing and non-contributing resources has not been confirmed due to the limited time allotted for City review and the limited property-specific information and documentation required for National Register nominations.”</p>	



Wesley	Morgan	1/25/2024	4	In Opposition to Item	Yes	<p>Please see attached letter. I am asking the Historic Resource Board (HRB) to respectfully deny the staff motion to recommend to the California State Office of Historic Preservation the listing of the Talmadge Park Estates Historic District. I am also asking the HRB to consider a countermotion stating that the board neither condones nor supports designation or further recognition of a Talmadge Park Estates Historic District for two primary reasons: 1) Talmadge Park Estates was founded on a basis of deliberately marketed racism and their submission does not adequately reflect a complete historical perspective of the inequities and segregation that have persisted in the area for the last 100 years. Not only will historical designation condone the racial undertones woven into the community, but it will stifle any further attempt to affirmatively further fair housing in this area. Racial covenants are widely recognized as discriminatory and unjust practices that perpetuated racial segregation and inequality, contributing to the systemic disparities and long-lasting negative effects on minority communities that persist in Talmadge Park Estates today. Talmadge Park Estates was named, financed, and marketed by those with a racist past to white homebuyers whose fear of minorities was reinforced by how Schneck (financer) and the Talmadge sisters portrayed them on screen. he developers successfully attracted those seeking spatial separation in a racially homogeneous neighborhood with restrictions that would protect property value and avoid what they perceived as undesirable demographic changes. The Talmadge Park Estates historical report makes no mention of redlining or unfair lending practices while the 1936 Home Owner's Loan Corporation described Talmadge as "No ratio of concentration; no threat of infiltration, restricted to the Caucasian race" while redlining persisted just outside the Talmadge gates. The City of San Diego's Assessment of Fair Housing in its 2021-2029 Housing Element notes Talmadge as one only of three "Racially Concentrated Areas of Affluence" while "Racially and Ethnically Concentrated Areas of Poverty" persist nearby just south of Monroe. The assessment conclusively draws connection from the redlining and covenants of the past to the inequities that have carried through to today including wealth disparities, property values, access to credit, educational disparities, health disparities, and community fragmentation. Today, The Talmadge Gates provide not just a physical boundary, but a socioeconomic divide where Talmadge Park Estates separates a 60% concentration of Caucasian population vs. neighboring Census Tracts with as little as 6%. The Talmadge census tract also boasts 4X Per Capita Income, 5X Median Household Income, and 1/4th of persons below the Poverty Line as those neighboring communities. 2024 California CTCAC / HCD maps identify "High-Poverty &amp; Segregated" areas just a block away. Historic designation will only perpetuate the impact of past discriminatory policies. We should stop celebrating, designating, and protecting our scarred history, and make every effort to be more inclusive with our historical reports, acting to no longer condone the mistakes of our past. 2) The information regarding contributing resources is incomplete, unconfirmed, and inconsistent with the level of due diligence required by this board.</p>	<p><a href="https://www.sandiego.gov/system/files/webform/webform_994112/13391/Talmadge%20Park%20Estates%20-%20Wesley%20Morgan%20Letter.pdf">https://www.sandiego.gov/system/files/webform/webform_994112/13391/Talmadge%20Park%20Estates%20-%20Wesley%20Morgan%20Letter.pdf</a></p>
--------	--------	-----------	---	-----------------------------	-----	--	--

Gail	Friedt	1/25/2024	#4	In Opposition to Item	No	<p>Deny designation. We need more homes in San Diego, not a way to block density and more housing.□</p> <p>□</p> <p>The Talmadge Park Estates Historical Report neglects its complete history, □ focusing on only certain historical narratives while excluding others. It paints a □ skewed representation of the past that reinforces existing racial biases, □ stereotypes, and existing inequalities in the City of San Diego. By supporting □ designation, the HRB will create a perception that the district is meant to □ preserve the history of a specific demographic while ignoring or marginalizing □ others. □</p> <p>□</p> <p>There is no civil rights event or victory to historically honor. For residents living in □ its proximity, the designation of Talmadge Park Estates would serve as a □ constant reminder of historical injustices, contributing to a continuing sense of □ inequality and marginalization.□</p> <p>□</p> <p>Historic designation imposes regulations on property use and modifications, □ limiting economic opportunities for property owners. This disproportionately □ affects individuals from marginalized backgrounds who may face barriers to □ participating in the preservation process.□</p> <p>□</p> <p>□</p>	
Ian	Crano	1/25/2024	4	In Opposition to Item	No	<p>I appreciate historic preservation however the quantity of homes seems like it will have long term impacts on the ability to build and create much needed housing in a desirable area, blocking out potential future residents.</p>	